Monetary Theory and Policy from Hume and Smith to Wicksell

Money, Credit, and the Economy

ARIE ARNON
Department of Economics,
Ben-Gurion University
of the Negev, Beer-Sheva, Israel
and
Head, Economics and Society Program,
Van Leer Jerusalem Institute

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
Contents

List of Illustrations \hspace{2cm} page xv
List of Tables \hspace{2cm} xvii
Preface \hspace{2cm} xix

Introduction \hspace{2cm} 1

PART ONE  ANALYTICAL AND HISTORICAL FOUNDATIONS

1  Monetary Theory circa 1750: David Hume
   Introduction \hspace{2cm} 9
   “Of Money” and Commodity-Money \hspace{2cm} 10
   The Price-Specie-Flow Mechanism \hspace{2cm} 17
   A Note on Noncommodity-Money \hspace{2cm} 21
   On the Rate of Interest \hspace{2cm} 23
   Summary \hspace{2cm} 24

2  Mid-Eighteenth-Century British Financial System \hspace{2cm} 26

3  Adam Smith: The Case for Laissez-Faire in Money and Banking
   Introduction \hspace{2cm} 33
   Money and the Division of Labor \hspace{2cm} 34
   Money, Banking, and the “Invisible Hand” \hspace{2cm} 36
   The Real Bills Doctrine \hspace{2cm} 40
   Smith and Hume \hspace{2cm} 45

4  “Monetary Theories of Credit” in Exchange
   Introduction \hspace{2cm} 50
   A Pure Commodity-Money System of Exchange \hspace{2cm} 54
   From Money to Credit in Exchange \hspace{2cm} 54
   Implications for the Quantity Theory \hspace{2cm} 58
PART TWO DEBATING MONETARY THEORY UNDER INCONVERTIBILITY

5 New Reality: The Restriction Period, 1797–1821
   The Restriction: An Inconvertible Monetary System 63

6 The Early Round of the Bullion Debate 1800–1802: Boyd versus Baring
   Introduction 73
   Boyd's 1796 Proposals 86
   Sir Francis Baring, 1801: A Defense of the Bank 88
   Boyd's Rebuttal: The Second Edition (1801b) 91
   Conclusion 95

7 Thornton on Inconvertibility and Central Banking: Ahead of His Time
   Introduction 96
   Paper Credit on the Contraction of the Circulation 101
   Paper Credit on the Expansion of the Circulation 106
   Thornton on Discretionary Policy 112
   Defending the Bank Directors 114
   A Brief Look Beyond 1802 119
   The Bullion Committee 122
   Thornton's Pioneering Monetary Ideas 125

8 Ricardo versus Bosanquet: The Famous Round of the Bullion Debate
   Ricardian Monetary Theory: 1809–1811 126
   The Bullion Committee 133
   Charles Bosanquet (1810): The Anti-Bullionist Position 134
   Ricardo's Reply to Mr. Bosanquet 143
   The Ingot Plan 144
   The Resumption 147
   Ricardo's Break from the Smithian Theory of Money – 1824 148
   Summary 151

9 "Credit Theories of Money" in Exchange and Intermediation
   Introduction 152
   An Accounting System of Exchange (ASE) 153
   Credit, Near-Credits, and Money 156
   The Rise of Near-Credits 156
   The Rise of Money 160
   Money and Credit in Intermediation 161
   Some Implications for the History of Monetary Theory 167
PART THREE  DEBATING: LAISSEZ-FAIRE, RULES, AND DISCRETION

10 From the Resumption to 1837: More Crises
   Introduction  173
   The 1825 Crisis  175
   The 1832 Committee and Palmer's Rule  178
   Appendix: More Data  180

11 The Currency School Trio: Loyd, Torrens, and Norman
   The Automatism of the Currency School  187
   Loyd's Early Formulations  190
   Loyd in the 1840s  197
   Torrens's (Mature) Monetary Position  200
   Norman: A Voice within the Bank  206

12 The Banking School Trio: Tooke, Fullarton, and Wilson
   Introduction  209
   Tooke's Early and Mature Positions  211
   An Early Critique of Ricardo  213
   The 1844 Text: A Banking School Manifesto  217
   Fullarton and the Law of Reflux  227
   Tooke on Other Mediums of Payment  230
   An Income Theory of Prices  231
   Banking, Monetary Policy, and the Economy: An Incomplete Analysis  234
   Tooke's Theory of Interest: Consistency in 1826 and 1844  235
   Monetary Policy and the Bank after 1844  240
   Wilson, the Economist, and the Public Debate  245
   Conclusion  246
   Appendix: A Note on J. S. Mill's Monetary Thinking  247

13 Neither Currency Nor Banking School: Joplin and the "Free Banking" Parnell
   Introduction  249
   Thomas Joplin (1790–1847)  249
   Parnell and the Free Banking School  259
   The Banking and Currency Schools on Laissez-Faire in Banking  270
   Summary  272

PART FOUR  THE ROAD TO DEFENSIVE CENTRAL BANKING

14 Bagehot and a New Conventional Wisdom
   Introduction  277
   The British Monetary Orthodoxy  280
Lombard Street: Addressing Intermediation 285
Lombard Street: One Reserve System 287
Lombard Street: Defensive Monetary Policy 290
The Government and the Bank 295
The Bank's Structure and Policy 298
Who Influenced Bagehot? 304
Lombard Street on Free Banking 306
Summary 307

15 Does Karl Marx Fit In?
Introduction 309
Marx's Thoughts on Money – 1857 310
Marx's Mature Formulation – 1859 315
Traces of Tooke in Marx's Developing Theory of Money 321
Summary 328

16 Marshall's (Oral) Monetary Tradition and Bimetallism
Introduction 330
The Oral Tradition 331
Monetary Policy 337

PART FIVE A NEW BEGINNING: TOWARDS ACTIVE CENTRAL BANKING

17 Wicksell's Innovative Monetary Theory and Policy
Introduction 343
The 1898 Geldzins und Guterpreise 344
Different Payment Arrangements and Intermediation 350
The Price Level, Interest Rates, and the Cumulative Phenomena 352
Wicksell on Monetary Policy 356
History of Monetary Policy in the Lectures 358
A Note on Wicksell's Independent Discovery 365
The Classical Dichotomy and Wicksell's Unorthodox Trichotomy 366

18 The Puzzling Slow Rise of a Theory of Central Banking: Between Lender of Last Resort, Defensive, and Active Monetary Policies
Introduction 370
Hume and Smith: Neither Defensive Nor Active Monetary Policy 375
Thornton: An Early Advocate of Active Central Banking 377
The Bullionists and the Currency School: Rules, Without Monetary Policy 381
The Banking School on Monetary Policy after 1844 384