Finance Commissions and Fiscal Federalism in India

First Finance Commission to Thirteenth Finance Commission

Incorporating


By

M.M. Sury

INDIAN TAX FOUNDATION
New Delhi, India

in association with

New Century Publications
New Delhi, India
# CONTENTS IN BRIEF

## PART I: FISCAL FEDERALISM: CONCEPTUAL SETTINGS
1. Features and Problems of Multi-level Finance ........................................ 1-12

## PART II: EVOLUTION OF FISCAL FEDERALISM IN INDIA
2. Pre-Independence History of Fiscal Federalism .................................... 13-27
3. Post-Partition Financial Adjustments ................................................ 28-33
4. Fiscal Relations under the Constitution .................................................. 34-48
5. Centralisation of Revenues and the Need for and Mechanism of Transfers .................................................. 49-70

## PART III: LEVEL AND COMPOSITION OF TAXES IN INDIA
6. Trends in Combined (Centre and States) Tax Revenues ......................... 71-78
7. Level and Composition of Central Taxes .............................................. 79-84
8. Level and Composition of State Taxes .................................................. 85-92
9. Sales Tax and State Level VAT .......................................................... 93-118
10. Taxation of Agricultural Income ....................................................... 119-128

## PART IV: SYSTEM OF REVENUE SHARING THROUGH FINANCE COMMISSION
12. Constitution (Eightieth Amendment) Act, 2000 and the Sharing of Revenue from All Central Taxes .................................................. 149-156
13. Additional Duties of Excise in Lieu of Sales Tax ................................ 157-165
14. Grant in Lieu of Railway Passenger Fares Tax .................................... 166-169
15. Grants-in-aid of Revenues ................................................................. 170-174
16. Current Issues in Indian Fiscal Federalism ............................................ 175-194

## PART V: HIGHLIGHTS AND SUMMARY OF EACH FINANCE COMMISSION REPORT FROM I TO XIII FINANCE COMMISSION
17. First Finance Commission ................................................................. 195-210
18. Second Finance Commission .............................................................. 211-227
## PART VI: STATE-LOCAL FINANCIAL RELATIONS IN INDIA

30. State-Local Financial Relations in India ........................................ 427-446

## PART VII: APPENDICES

Appendix 1: Text of the Speech of Shri Pranab Mukherjee, Minister of Finance, while Presenting Budget for 2010-11 to the Parliament on February 26, 2010 ........................................ 447-479

Appendix 2: A Note on National Goods and Services Tax (GST) Scheduled to be Introduced from April 1, 2011 ........................................ 480-496

Appendix 3: Direct Taxes Code (DTC) Scheduled to be Introduced from April 1, 2011 ........................................ 497-500

## PART VIII: GLOSSARY OF FISCAL TERMS

501-524

## PART IX: TIME-SERIES PUBLIC FINANCE DATA ON INDIA

525-556

Select Bibliography ........................................ 557-562

Index ........................................ 563-570
CONTENTS IN DETAIL

About the Book ................................................................................................................................. v
Author's Profile ................................................................................................................................... vi
Indian Tax Foundation ......................................................................................................................... vii
Key to Numeration ............................................................................................................................... viii
List of Tables in the Text ..................................................................................................................... xxv-xxxii
Author's Note on the Book .................................................................................................................. xxxiii-xlii

PART I: FISCAL FEDERALISM: CONCEPTUAL SETTINGS

1. Features and Problems of Multi-level Finance ............................................................ 1-12
   1.1 Meaning and Features of a Federal Polity
      1.1.1 Dual Government
      1.1.2 Distribution of Powers
      1.1.3 Supremacy of the Constitution
      1.1.4 Authority of Courts
      1.1.5 Doctrine of Harmonious Construction
      1.1.6 Doctrine of Pith and Substance
      1.1.7 Rule of Repugnancy
   1.2 Economic Basis of Decentralisation
   1.3 Advantages of Decentralised Decision-making
      1.3.1 Tiebout Hypothesis
   1.4 Problems of Multi-level Finance: Vertical and Horizontal
      Fiscal Imbalances
   1.5 Financing Pattern
      1.5.1 Taxes
      1.5.2 Transfers
      1.5.3 Borrowings
   1.6 Earmarking of Revenue
      1.6.1 Conditions for Successful Earmarking

PART II: EVOLUTION OF FISCAL FEDERALISM IN INDIA

2. Pre-Independence History of Fiscal Federalism .................................................. 13-27
   2.1 Mayo Scheme, 1870
   2.2 Government of India Act, 1919
      2.2.1 Meston Settlement, 1920
Finance Commissions and Fiscal Federalism in India

2.3 Indian Taxation Enquiry Committee, 1924-25
2.4 Indian Statutory Commission, 1930
2.5 Peel Committee I, 1931
2.6 Percy Committee, 1932
2.7 Peel Committee II, 1932
2.8 White Paper on Indian Constitutional Reforms, 1931
2.9 Joint Parliamentary Committee on Indian Constitutional Reforms, 1934
2.10 Government of India Act, 1935
2.10.1 Indian Financial Enquiry Report, 1936

3. Post-Partition Financial Adjustments.................................28-33
3.1 Deshmukh Award
3.1.1 Income Tax
3.1.2 Grants-in-aid in Lieu of Jute Export Duty
3.2 Expert Committee on Financial Provisions of the Constitution; 1947
3.3 Financial Integration of Princely States
3.4 Indian States Finances Enquiry Committee, 1948

4. Fiscal Relations under the Constitution...............................34-48
4.1 Nature of Indian Federation
4.2 Centrally Biased Constitution and its Justification
4.2.1 Supremacy of Union Legislative Power
4.2.2 Union Control over State Legislation
4.2.3 Emergency Provisions
4.2.4 Restrictions on Taxation Powers of the States
4.2.5 Restrictions on Borrowing Powers of the States
4.2.6 President’s Rule
4.3 Constitutional Provisions Pertaining to Taxes
4.3.1 Distribution of Taxation Powers
4.3.2 Restrictions on the Taxation Powers of the States
4.3.3 Rationale for Constitutional Arrangements
4.3.4 Sharing of Central Taxes
4.3.5 Philosophy of Articles 268 and 269
4.3.6 Taxes and Duties in the Union List not being Levied at Present
4.3.7 Freedom as to Payment of Taxes for Promotion of any Particular Religion
5. Centralisation of Revenues and the Need for and
   Mechanism of Transfers ........................................ 49-70
   5.1 Centralisation of Revenues
   5.2 Mechanism of Central Transfers to the States
   5.3 Transfer of Resources through the Finance Commission
       5.3.1 Finance Commission
       5.3.2 From Itemised Sharing to Global Sharing
   5.4 Transfer of Resources through the Planning Commission
       5.4.1 Establishment of the Planning Commission
       5.4.2 Establishment of National Development Council
       5.4.3 Objectives of Economic Planning in India
       5.4.4 Financing of the Plan
       5.4.5 Gadgil Formula
       5.4.6 Nature of Plan Transfers
   5.5 Centrally Sponsored Schemes
   5.6 Size and Pattern of Central Transfers
   5.7 Commission on Centre-State Relations, 1988

PART III: LEVEL AND COMPOSITION OF TAXES IN INDIA

6. Trends in Combined (Centre and States) Tax Revenues .............. 71-78
   6.1 Trends in Tax-GDP Ratio
   6.2 Trends in the Relative Significance of Direct and Indirect Taxes
       6.2.1 Reversal of Roles
       6.2.2 Equity Implications

7. Level and Composition of Central Taxes ................................ 79-84
   7.1 Central Taxes as Percent of GDP
   7.2 Direct and Indirect Taxes
   7.3 Composition of Direct Taxes
       7.3.1 Income Tax
       7.3.2 Wealth Tax
   7.4 Composition of Indirect Taxes
       7.4.1 Union Excise Duties
       7.4.2 Service Tax
       7.4.3 Customs Duties

8. Level and Composition of State Taxes .................................. 85-92
   8.1 State Taxes as Percent of GDP
8.2 Direct and Indirect Taxes
   8.2.1 Composition of Direct Taxes
   8.2.2 Composition of Indirect Taxes

8.3 Local Finance

9. Sales Tax and State Level VAT

9.1 Different Forms of Sales Tax
   9.1.1 Multi-point Sales Tax
   9.1.2 Single-point Sales Tax

9.2 Pre-Constitution Developments
   9.2.1 Initial Legal Hurdles
   9.2.2 Beggar-my-neighbour Policies

9.3 Constitution of India and the Provisions for the Regulation of Taxation of Inter-State Sales
   9.3.1 Consequences of Constitutional Restrictions on Sales Tax
   9.3.2 Essential Goods Act, 1952

9.4 Constitution (Sixth Amendment) Act, 1956

9.5 Central Sales Tax (CST) Act, 1956
   9.5.1 Main Provisions of CST Act
   9.5.2 Working of CST Act

9.6 Additional Duties of Excise (Goods of Special Importance) Act, 1957

9.7 Constitution (Forty-sixth Amendment) Act, 1982 and Consignment Tax
   9.7.1 Issues Related to Consignment Tax

9.8 Present Nature of Sales Tax

9.9 Problems Created by Sales Tax

9.10 Alternative Remedies
   9.10.1 Sales Tax as Central Levy
   9.10.2 Complete Substitution of Sales Tax by Excise Duty
   9.10.3 Partial Substitution of Sales Tax by Excise Duty
   9.10.4 Minimum Rate Agreement among States
   9.10.5 Single-Point VAT
   9.10.6 Agreement of November 1999
   9.10.7 Empowered Committee of State Finance Ministers, 2001
   9.10.8 Agreement of January 23, 2002
   9.10.9 Task Force on Indirect Taxes, 2002
   9.10.10 Agreement of June 2004
9.10.11 Salient Features of the State-level VAT Design
9.10.12 Progress of VAT Implementation
9.10.13 Towards National Goods and Services Tax (GST)

10. Taxation of Agricultural Income ......................................................... 119-128
10.1 Constitutional Provisions
10.2 Committee on Taxation of Agricultural Wealth and Income, 1972
   10.2.1 Views of the State Governments
10.3 Tax Reforms Committee, 1991
10.4 Task Force on Direct Taxes, 2002
   10.4.1 Critical Comments

PART IV: SYSTEM OF REVENUE SHARING THROUGH FINANCE COMMISSION

11.1 Sharing of Income Tax Revenue
   11.1.1 Determination of the Share of States
   11.1.2 Distribution of the Share of States Inter Se
   11.1.3 Controversies over Distribution of Income Tax Revenue
11.2 Sharing of Excise Revenue
   11.2.1 Nature of Revenue Sharing
   11.2.2 Determination of the Share of States
   11.2.3 Distribution of the Share of States Inter Se
   11.2.4 Varying Emphasis on Criteria Adopted
   11.2.5 Areas of Controversy

12. Constitution (Eightieth Amendment) Act, 2000 and the Sharing of Revenue from All Central Taxes ................................. 149-156
12.1 History of Constitution (Eightieth Amendment) Act, 2000
12.2 The Constitution (Eightieth Amendment) Act, 2000
12.3 Eleventh Finance Commission: New Tasks
   12.3.1 Impact of Constitution (Eightieth Amendment) Act, 2000
   12.3.2 Impact of Seventy-third and Seventy-fourth Amendments to the Constitution
12.3.3 Share of States
12.4 Share of States Determined by Twelfth Finance Commission
12.5 Share of States Determined by Thirteenth Finance Commission

13. Additional Duties of Excise in Lieu of Sales Tax.................157-165
13.1 Rationale of the Scheme
13.2 Views of the State Governments
13.3 Decisions of the National Development Council
13.4 Role of the Finance Commission
   13.4.1 Guaranteed Amount
   13.4.2 Procedure for Guaranteed Amount
   13.4.3 Basis of Distribution
13.5 Expert Committee on Replacement of Sales Tax by Additional Excise Duty, 1983
13.6 Present Position

14. Grant in Lieu of Railway Passenger Fares Tax......................166-169
14.1 History of Railway Passenger Fares Tax
14.2 Recommendations of Successive Finance Commissions
14.3 Constitution (Eightieth Amendment) Act, 2000 and Changes in Article 269

15. Grants-in-aid of Revenues.............................................170-174
15.1 Principles of Grants-in-aid of Revenues
   15.1.1 Budgetary Needs
   15.1.2 Tax Effort
   15.1.3 Economy in Expenditure
   15.1.4 Standard of Social Services
   15.1.5 Special Obligations
   15.1.6 Broad Purposes of National Importance
15.2 Approach of Various Finance Commissions

16. Current Issues in Indian Fiscal Federalism.........................175-194
16.1 Centralisation of Revenues and Certain State Functions
   16.1.1 Centralisation of Revenues
   16.1.2 Centralisation of Certain State Functions
16.2 Inter-regional Inequalities and Transfers
16.3 Public Borrowings and Indebtedness of States
16.3.1 Instruments of Government Borrowings
16.3.2 Constitutional Provisions Pertaining to Public Borrowings
16.3.3 Indebtedness of States
16.4 Taxation of Services
16.4.1 Constitutional Provisions
16.5 Constitution (Forty-sixth Amendment) Act, 1982 and the Consignment Tax
16.6 Financial Autonomy for States
16.7 Towards Co-operative Federalism

PART V: HIGHLIGHTS AND SUMMARY OF EACH FINANCE COMMISSION REPORT FROM FIRST TO THIRTEENTH FINANCE COMMISSION

17. First Finance Commission .................................................................195-210
17.1 Financial Assistance to States
17.2 Distribution of Income Tax
   17.2.1 Determination of the Share of States
   17.2.2 Distribution of the Share of States Inter Se
17.3 Division of Union Excises
   17.3.1 Determination of the Share of States
   17.3.2 Distribution of the Share of States Inter Se
17.4 Grants-in-aid in Lieu of Export Duty on Jute
17.5 Grants-in-aid of Revenues
17.6 Permanent Secretariat for the Finance Commission

18. Second Finance Commission .............................................................211-227
18.1 Distribution of Income Tax
18.2 Division of Union Excises
18.3 Grants-in-aid in Lieu of Export Duty on Jute
18.4 Grants-in-aid of Revenues
18.5 Distribution of Estate Duty
18.6 Union Loans to States
   18.6.1 Loans for Rehabilitation of Displaced Persons
   18.6.2 Interest-free Loans
18.7 Distribution of Additional Duties of Excise
18.8 Distribution of Tax on Railway Passenger Fares
18.9 Miscellaneous

19. Third Finance Commission ......................................................... 228-243
19.1 Determination of the Budgetary Needs of the States
19.2 Distribution of Assigned Taxes
   19.2.1 Estate Duty
   19.2.2 Grant in Lieu of Tax on Railway Passenger Fares
19.3 Devolution of Union Taxes/Duties
   19.3.1 Income Tax
   19.3.2 Union Excise Duties
19.4 Distribution of Additional Duties of Excise
19.5 Grants-in-aid of Revenues
19.6 Finance Commission versus Planning Commission

20. Fourth Finance Commission ....................................................... 244-264
20.1 Views of the Commission on Taxation Provisions
    in the Constitution
20.2 Plan versus Non-Plan Expenditure
20.3 Estate Duty
20.4 Grant in Lieu of Tax on Railway Passenger Fares
20.5 Income Tax
20.6 Union Excise Duties
20.7 Additional Duties of Excise in Lieu of Sales Tax
20.8 Principles Governing Grants-in-aid of Revenues

21. Fifth Finance Commission .......................................................... 265-279
21.1 Income Tax
21.2 Union Excise Duties
21.3 Additional Duties of Excise in Lieu of Sales Tax
21.4 Grants-in-aid of Revenues under Article 275 of the Constitution
21.5 Taxes and Duties under Article 269 of the Constitution
   21.5.1 Duties in Respect of Succession to Property other than
         Agricultural Land
   21.5.2 Terminal Taxes on Goods or Passengers Carried by
         Railway, Sea or Air
   21.5.3 Taxes on Railway Fares and Freights
   21.5.4 Taxes other than Stamp Duties on Transactions in Stock
         Exchanges and Future Markets
21.5.5 Taxes on the Sale or Purchase of Newspapers and on Advertisements Published Therein

22. Sixth Finance Commission ........................................280-300
22.1 Income Tax
22.2 Union Excise Duties
22.3 Additional Duties of Excise
22.4 Grant in Lieu of Tax on Railway Passenger Fares
22.5 Estate Duty
22.6 Grant on Account of Wealth Tax on Agricultural Property
22.7 Financing of Relief Expenditure
22.8 Grants-in-aid of Revenues
22.9 Rescheduling of Central Loans

23. Seventh Finance Commission ........................................301-317
23.1 Financing of Relief Expenditure
23.2 Estate Duty
23.3 Additional Duties of Excise
23.4 Grant in Lieu of Tax on Railway Passenger Fares
23.5 Grant on Account of Wealth Tax on Agricultural Property
23.6 Sharing of Income Tax
23.7 Sharing of Union Excise Duties
23.8 Upgradation of Standards of Administration
23.9 Non-Plan Capital Gap of States

24. Eighth Finance Commission ..........................................318-334
24.1 Approach of the Commission on Financial Transfers
24.2 Reassessment of the Revenue and Expenditure Forecasts
24.3 Sharing of Income Tax Revenue
24.4 Sharing of Union Excise Duties
24.5 Additional Duties of Excise
24.6 Estate Duty in Respect of Property other than Agricultural Land
24.7 Grant in Lieu of Tax on Railway Passenger Fares
24.8 Grant on Account of Wealth Tax on Agricultural Property
24.9 Financing of Relief Expenditure
24.10 Upgradation of Standards of Administration
24.11 Grants-in-aid of Revenues
24.12 Non-Plan Capital Gap of the States
24.13 Taxes and Duties Mentioned in Articles 268 and 269 of the Constitution
24.14 General Observations

25. Ninth Finance Commission ................................................................. 335-360
25.1 Normative Approach
25.2 Alternative Terms of Reference
25.3 First Report (for the year 1989-90)
   25.3.1 Sharing of Income Tax
   25.3.2 Sharing of Union Excise Duties
   25.3.3 Additional Duties of Excise in Lieu of Sales Tax
   25.3.4 Grant in Lieu of Tax on Railway Passenger Fares
   25.3.5 Financing of Relief Expenditure
   25.3.6 Special Problems of Debt Relief
   25.3.7 Grants-in-aid of Revenues
25.4 Second Report (for the years 1990-91 to 1994-95)
   25.4.1 Sharing of Income Tax
   25.4.2 Distribution of Additional Excise Duties in Lieu of Sales Tax
   25.4.3 Grant in Lieu of Tax on Railway Passenger Fares
   25.4.4 Union Excise Duties
   25.4.5 Financing of Relief Expenditure
   25.4.6 Grants-in-aid of Revenues
   25.4.7 Debt Relief

26. Tenth Finance Commission ............................................................. 361-376
26.1 Alternative Formula of Devolution
26.2 Sharing of Income tax
26.3 Sharing of Union Excise Duties
26.4 Distribution of Divisible Amounts
26.5 Distribution of Additional Duties of Excise
26.6 Grants in Lieu of Tax on Railway Passenger Fares
26.7 Upgradation Grants
26.8 Financing of Relief Expenditure
26.9 Grants for Local Bodies
26.10 Grants-in-aid of Revenues
26.11 Debt Relief
26.12 National Security
27. Eleventh Finance Commission.........................................................377-395
27.1 Devolution of Central Taxes/Duties to the States
   27.1.1 Share of States
   27.1.2 Distribution of the Share of States Inter Se
27.2 Grants-in-aid of Revenues of States
   27.2.1 Grants-in-aid to Cover Non-Plan Gap on
       Revenue Account
   27.2.2 Grants-in-aid for Upgradation of Standards of
       Administration and Special Problems of States
   27.2.3 Grants to States for Financing Local Bodies
27.3 Financing of Calamity Relief Expenditure
   27.3.1 National Calamity Contingency Fund
27.4 Debt Relief to States
27.5 Ceiling on Total Revenue Account Transfers

28. Twelfth Finance Commission.........................................................396-409
28.1 Sharing of Union Tax Revenues
   28.1.1 Vertical Sharing
   28.1.2 Horizontal Sharing
28.2 Local Bodies
28.3 Calamity Relief
28.4 Grants-in-aid to States
28.5 Debt Relief and Corrective Measures
28.6 Restructuring Public Finances
28.7 Permanent Secretariat for the Finance Commission

29. Thirteenth Finance Commission.....................................................410-426
29.1 Terms of Reference of the Commission
29.2 Sharing of Union Tax Revenues
29.3 Criteria and Weights for Determining Inter Se
    Shares of States
29.4 Grants-in-aid to States
29.5 Disaster Relief
29.6 Roadmap for Fiscal Consolidation
29.7 Goods and Services Tax (GST)
29.8 Local Bodies
29.9 Summary of Recommendations
PART VI: STATE-LOCAL FINANCIAL RELATIONS IN INDIA

30. State-Local Financial Relations in India.................................427-446
30.1 Functions of Local Bodies
   30.1.1 Essential Civic Functions
   30.1.2 Regulatory Functions
   30.1.3 Agency Functions
30.2 Financing of Local Bodies
30.3 Constitutional Provisions
30.4 Decentralisation Initiative, 1992
30.5 Constitution (Seventy-fourth Amendment) Act, 1992
   30.5.1 Salient Features:
   30.5.2 New Status of Municipalities
   30.5.3 Desirability and Feasibility of Uniformity in Municipal Functions
30.6 Municipal Commercial Borrowings
   30.6.1 Rationale for Municipal Commercial Borrowings
   30.6.2 Limitations
   30.6.3 Factors Determining Success of Municipal Bonds
30.7 Privatisation of Municipal Services
30.8 Tenth Finance Commission on Local Bodies
30.9 Eleventh Finance Commission on Local Bodies
30.10 Twelfth Finance Commission on Local Bodies
30.11 Thirteenth Finance Commission on Local Bodies

PART VII: APPENDICES

Appendix 1: Text of the Speech of Shri Pranab Mukherjee, Minister of Finance, while Presenting Budget for 2010-11 to the Parliament on February 26, 2010.................................447-479

Appendix 2: A Note on National Goods and Services Tax (GST) Scheduled to be Introduced from April 1, 2011.................................480-496

Appendix 3: Direct Taxes Code (DTC) Scheduled to be Introduced from April 1, 2011.................................497-500