Sabina Nüesch

Voluntary Export Restraints in WTO and EU Law

Consumers, Trade Regulation and Competition Policy
Table of Contents

Preface ........................................................................................................... XIII
Abbreviations ............................................................................................... XV
Treaty of Lisbon: A Note on Terminology ................................................... XIX
Bibliography .................................................................................................. XXIII

CHAPTER I
Voluntary Export Restraints

1 Introduction ................................................................................................. 1
  1.1 A Word on the Concepts and the Notion of VERs ......................... 3
  1.2 Some Factual and Legal Observations ............................................ 6
  1.3 Outline of the Thesis ........................................................................ 10

2 The Political Economy of Voluntary Export Restraints ...................... 14
  2.1 The Economy of Voluntary Export Restraints ............................. 15
    2.1.1 The Impact of VERs on Price Levels ...................................... 16
    2.1.2 The Creation of Rent-Seeking Activities ............................... 19
    2.1.3 The Effect of VERs on Different Import Sources ............... 20
    2.1.4 The Impact of VERs on Domestic Output ............................ 22
    2.1.5 Summary ............................................................................. 23
  2.2 The Politics of Voluntary Export Restraints ................................. 24
    2.2.1 The Political Advantages of VERs for the Government and the Competitors of the Importing Country .......................... 24
    2.2.2 The Political Advantages for the Government and the Competitors in the Exporting Country ................................. 31

3 The History of Voluntary Export Restraints ........................................ 34
  3.1 The Emergence of VERs in the Trade Relations of the EC – The Example of Japan ................................................................. 37
    3.1.1 Japan's Accession to the GATT ............................................ 38
3.1.2 Recourse to GATT Article XXXV .......................... 40
3.1.3 The Replacement of the EC Member State Representations by the Community within the GATT ........... 44

3.2 Common Commercial Policy versus National Measures ...... 46
3.2.1 The Japanese VERs on Motor Cars ....................... 46
3.2.2 The EC – Japan VER on Video Cassette Recorders (VCRs) ........................................... 52
3.2.3 The EC’s Controversial Perception of VERs ............... 56

4 The Popularity of Voluntary Export Restraints and the Rarity of Case Law ........................................... 62
4.1 Understanding the Functioning and Popularity of VERs...... 62
4.2 The Rarity of Judicial Decisions on VERs ..................... 67
4.2.1 The EC’s Challenge of the U.S.-Japan Arrangement on Semi-Conductors ........................................ 71
   a) The Meaning of “Measures” Covered by GATT Article XI ............................................. 74
   b) The Degree of Government Involvement Necessary to Be Caught under GATT Article XI... 76
   c) Brief Analysis of the Conclusions of the Panel...... 79
4.2.2 The U.S. Consumers Union’s Challenge of the VERs on Steel ............................................ 82
   a) The Affirmative Findings of the Court of Appeals ......................................................... 83
   b) The Dissenting Opinion of Circuit Judge Leventhal ....................................................... 87

4.3 Preliminary Conclusion ........................................... 90

CHAPTER II
The Relationship of WTO Law and EU Law

1 The Status of International Agreements in the EU Legal Order ... 93
1.1 International Agreements as “Integral Part” of EU Law ...... 94
1.2 The Doctrine of Direct Effect ................................... 95
1.3 The Classification of International Agreements in the Hierarchy of Norms ........................................... 102
Table of Contents

1.4 The Judicial Application of International Agreements......103

2 The Domestic Legal Status of the WTO/GATT.................................107
2.1 The Approach of the EC Institutions
in the Case of the WTO/GATT........................................107
2.2 The Reluctance of the Court of Justice to
Grant Direct Effect to WTO Rules..................................110
  2.2.1 Flexibility – An Argument for any Occasion? ........111
  2.2.2 Reciprocity – The Imperfection
  of Mutual Commitments........................................115
  2.2.3 Dispute Settlement – Negotiation rather
  than Adjudication?..............................................118
2.3 The Situation after the Entry into Force of the WTO
Agreement and its Annexes...........................................119
  2.3.1 Cases on the Effect of WTO Provisions.............119
  2.3.2 Cases on the Effect of WTO
Dispute Settlement Body Decisions.............................131

3 Invocability of Directly Effective WTO Provisions .................139
3.1 Locus Standi under Article 263 TFEU
(ex Article 230 EC Treaty)........................................141
3.2 Reference for a Preliminary Ruling under
Article 267 TFEU (ex Article 234 EC Treaty).....................147
3.3 A Short Comment on Liability ....................................149

4 Preliminary Conclusion......................................................154

CHAPTER III
The Boundaries of Challenging Voluntary Export Restraints
within the EU Legal Order

1 Reliance on the Agreement on Safeguards before the Courts .....161
1.1 The Implementation of the Agreement
on Safeguards in the EU Legal Order...............................162
  1.1.1 Relationship between the Agreement
  on Safeguards and GATT Article XIX..........................165
  1.1.2 The Regional Application of Safeguard Measures....173
1.1.3 The Conduct of an Investigation ............................................. 182
1.1.4 The Legal Prerequisites of Safeguard Measures .......... 188
   a) Increased Quantities and Conditions of Import .... 188
   b) The Determination of “Serious Injury”
      or Threat thereof ......................................................... 190
   c) The Causal Link between Imports and Injury ...... 194
   d) The Notion of “Like
      or Directly Competitive Products” ......................... 197
      aa) The “Two-Step Approach” versus the
         “Aim and Effects Test”
         in the Differentiation of Products ......................... 199
      bb) The Determination of “Like Products” .......... 204
      cc) The Determination of
         “Directly Competitive” Products ......................... 209
      dd) Lessons for Safeguard Investigations ............ 213
1.2 Evaluation under the “Implementation Principle” .................. 220
   1.2.1 Clear Reference to the Agreement on Safeguards? ... 221
   1.2.2 Intention to Implement the Agreement
      on Safeguards? .......................................................... 223
1.3 Preliminary Conclusion .......................................................... 226
2 Challenging Practices Inconsistent with the Agreement on
Safeguards under the Trade Barriers Regulation (TBR) .................. 227
2.1 The Position of Private Parties
under the Trade Barriers Regulation ........................................ 231
2.2 The Court of First Instance Ruling on the Trade Barriers
Regulation in FICF et al. v. Commission .................................. 236
   2.2.1 Findings on Substantive Matters ......................... 238
      a) The Definition of “Obstacle to Trade” .............. 238
      b) The Interpretation of “Adverse Trade Effects” .... 240
      c) The Requirement of “Community Interests” .... 241
   2.2.2 Findings on Procedural Matters ......................... 244
      a) The Right to a Fair Hearing ......................... 244
      b) The Non-Binding Nature of Time-Limits ............ 245
2.3 Preliminary Conclusion .......................................................... 246
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>3</th>
<th>Applicability of EU Competition Law to VERs</th>
<th>248</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>The Commission’s Approach to Privately Negotiated VERs and Other Restrictions on Trade</td>
<td>248</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>The Approach of the European Courts Regarding Immunity from Competition Liability due to Government Involvement</td>
<td>254</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>Preliminary Conclusion</td>
<td>270</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### CHAPTER IV
The Boundaries of Challenging Voluntary Export Restraints within the WTO Dispute Settlement System

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1</th>
<th>Government Involvement</th>
<th>275</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.1</td>
<td>The Concept of “Governmental” Measure</td>
<td>275</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>The Degree of Government Involvement Required for there to be “Encouragement” or “Support” under Article 11:3 Agreement on Safeguards</td>
<td>277</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>The Application of Domestic Competition Laws versus “Effects on Competition”-Test</td>
<td>280</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3.1</td>
<td>The Nature and Effect of Export Cartels</td>
<td>284</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3.2</td>
<td>The Limitations of Positive Comity</td>
<td>286</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3.3</td>
<td>Advocating an “Effects on Competition”-Test under the Agreement on Safeguards</td>
<td>292</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>2</th>
<th>The Application of “Non-violation” Complaints to Competition Law Matters</th>
<th>296</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>“Measure” as Practice Tolerated or Required by Domestic Regulations</td>
<td>298</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>Different Terms – Similar Meanings</td>
<td>303</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Preliminary Conclusion</td>
<td>304</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>