NON-DISCRIMINATION IN INTERNATIONAL TRADE IN SERVICES

‘Likeness’ in WTO/GATS

NICOLAS F. DIEBOLD
SUMMARY OF CONTENTS

Introduction page 1

PART I Foundations 13
1 Objective and forms of non-discrimination 15
2 Particularities of trade in services and GATS 23
3 Legal elements of non-discrimination obligations 32
4 Concluding summary: reconciling the three elements 94

PART II Framing the conceptual breadth of 'likeness' in GATS 101
5 'Likeness' in national treatment 103
6 'Likeness' in MFN treatment 127
7 Comparative analysis of 'likeness' 140
8 Concluding summary: economic standard 171

PART III GATS specific 'likeness' issues 175
9 The scope of GATS rules on non-discrimination 177
10 'Likeness' across 'services' and 'suppliers' 186
11 'Likeness' across 'methods' and 'modes' of supply 220
12 Concluding summary: merged test and crossover 'likeness' 238
PART IV  Methodology for the 'likeness'
analysis in GATS  243

13  The border tax adjustments framework  245
14  Applying market definition theories to 'likeness'  269
15  The PPM-problem in the GATS 'likeness' context  339
16  Concluding summary: substitutability framework  349

Summary of conclusions  351
CONTENTS

Foreword page xvii
Acknowledgements xix
Abbreviations xxi
List of cases xxiv
List of legal texts xxxv
List of documents xxxviii

Introduction 1

I The quest for an appropriate standard of ‘likeness’ in GATS 2
   A ‘Likeness’ linking trade liberalization and regulatory autonomy 2
   B Linkage between ‘likeness’ and progressive liberalization 5
   C ‘Likeness’ linking trade with other policy and legal disciplines 5
   D ‘Likeness’ linking legal and economic analysis 7

II Methodology, scope and structure 8

PART I Foundations 13

1 Objective and forms of non-discrimination 15
   I National treatment 17
   II Most-favoured-nation treatment 21

2 Particularities of trade in services and GATS 23
   I Modes and methods of service supply in GATS 23
   II The main GATS obligations in a nutshell 28
      A Most-favoured-nation and national treatment 28
CONTENTS

B Market access 29
C Schedule of commitments for market access and national treatment 29
D Domestic regulations 30
E Further obligations 31

3 Legal elements of non-discrimination obligations 32

I Less favourable treatment 33

A Basis and standard of ‘less favourable treatment’ 34
  1. De jure discrimination in trade 35
  2. De facto discrimination in trade 37
  3. Subjective theory of ‘less favourable treatment’ 45

B Typology of ‘less favourable treatment’ under GATT 46
  1. ‘Less favourable treatment’ through border measures 46
  2. ‘Less favourable treatment’ through internal measures 47

C Typology of ‘less favourable treatment’ under GATS 50
  1. Spillovers from border measures applying to products 50
  2. Quantitative restrictions 51
  3. Internal taxes, charges and fees 53
  4. Domestic regulations 53
     a. Nationality, residency and ownership requirements 54
     b. Registration/authorization and qualification/licensing requirements 55
     c. Restrictions on the purchase, lease and use of real estate 59
     d. Supplier and employment-related measures 59
     e. Other horizontal and sector-specific requirements 60
  5. Subsidies 62
  6. Exception: disadvantages inherent to foreign character 63

II Likeness 65

A Introduction to the concept of ‘likeness’ 65

B Tertium comparationis for ‘likeness’ in trade 69
  1. Economic standard of ‘likeness’ 71
     a. Broad marketplace standard of ‘likeness’ 71
     b. Narrow physical characteristics standard of ‘likeness’ 72
  2. Objective standard of ‘likeness’ 73
  3. Subjective standard of ‘likeness’ 73
CONTENTS

III Protectionist regulatory purpose 73
   A Regulatory purpose under non-discrimination 74
      1. Regulatory purpose under 'likeness': aim and effects test 75
      2. Regulatory purpose under 'less favourable treatment' 80
      3. Regulatory purpose as a self-standing and substantive element 83
   B Regulatory purpose as justification 86
   C The legal challenges of regulatory purpose 87
      1. Determining the legitimacy of a purpose 87
      2. Means of proof and evidence 89
         a. Subjective determination with direct proof 89
         b. Objective determination with circumstantial evidence 90
      3. Allocating the burden of proof and setting a standard of review 91
         a. Burden of proof 91
         b. Standard of review 92
      4. Delimiting regulatory purpose with necessity or proportionality 92

4 Concluding summary: reconciling the three elements 94

PART II Framing the conceptual breadth of 'likeness' in GATS 101

5 'Likeness' in national treatment 103
   I GATT national treatment 104
      A Tax measures, Article III:2 GATT 105
      B Regulatory measures, Article III:4 GATT 111
   II GATS national treatment 117
      A Comparing national treatment in GATT and GATS 118
      B Interpreting 'likeness' in GATS national treatment 120

6 'Likeness' in MFN treatment 127
   I GATT most-favoured-nation treatment 128
   II GATS most-favoured-nation treatment 135
      A Comparing most-favoured-nation treatment in GATT and GATS 135
      B Interpreting 'likeness' in GATS most-favoured-nation treatment 136
CONTENTS

7 Comparative analysis of 'likeness' 140
   I 'Likeness' in the TBT and SPS Agreements 140
   II 'Like circumstances' in NAFTA rules on non-discrimination 143
      A 'Like-circumstanced' investors or suppliers: an economic standard 146
         1. Chapter 11 on investment 147
         2. Chapter 12 on cross-border services trade 149
      B 'Like-circumstanced' treatment: a subjective exception 150
      C The 'less favourable treatment' standard 154
      D Excursus: like 'circumstances' and 'situations' in BITs 156
   III 'Likeness' in WTO trade remedies 161
      A 'Like products' in trade remedy provisions 161
         1. Anti-dumping measures 161
         2. Countervailing measures and subsidies 162
            a. Countervailing measures 162
            b. Excursus: substantive rules on subsidies 163
         3. Safeguards 165
      B A variable interpretation of 'like products' for trade remedies 166

8 Concluding summary: economic standard 171

PART III GATS specific 'likeness' issues 175

9 The scope of GATS rules on non-discrimination 177
   I Reasons for including 'suppliers' in GATS rules on non-discrimination 177
   II Definition of 'service suppliers' 182

10 'Likeness' across 'services' and 'suppliers' 186
   I Are suppliers of 'like' services 'like' suppliers? 188
      A Mutually dependent determination in panel jurisprudence 188
         1. EC - Bananas III 188
         2. Canada - Autos 191
            a. Import duty exemption and GATS MFN 191
            b. Import duty exemption and GATS national treatment 193
CONTENTS

3. China – Publications and audiovisual products 194

B Critical appraisal of the jurisprudence 195
1. Text and negotiating history 197
2. Deficiencies of a mutually dependent determination of 'likeness' 198
   a. 'Different' suppliers of like services 198
   b. 'Similar' suppliers of like services 198
   c. Regulation of public services 199
   d. Method of service supply 201
   e. Inseparability of supplier and service 203

C Conclusion: individual determination 203

II Cumulative test: two separate and cumulative elements 204

III Alternative test: two separate and alternative elements 207

A Combined approach 209
B Disjunctive approach and determination of the comparators 210
   1. At the discretion of the complainant 211
   2. Based on the subject matter of the measure 211
      a. Measures applying neither to the service nor to the supplier (Mode 2) 212
      b. Measures applying to the supplier (Modes 3 and 4) 213
      c. Measures applying to the service (Modes 1, 3 and 4) 214
      d. Conclusions: deficiencies of the subject matter approach 214
   3. Based on modes of service supply 215
   4. Conclusion: a combined subject matter and modes of supply approach 217

IV Merged test: one merged element 217

11 'Likeness' across 'methods' and 'modes' of supply 220

I Cross-method 'likeness' in national treatment 220

A Natural person suppliers vs. company suppliers 221
B Domestic suppliers vs. mode 1 and 2 suppliers 222
C On-site supply vs. remote and electronic supply 223
I Legal analysis 226
  1. Likeness 226
  2. Less favourable treatment and asymmetric impact test 228
  3. Justification 232

II Mode-overreaching commitments in national treatment 233

III Cross-mode and cross-method ‘likeness’ in MFN 234
  A Symmetric modes: cross-method ‘likeness’ within identical modes 235
  B Asymmetric modes: cross-mode ‘likeness’ 235

12 Concluding summary: merged test and crossover ‘likeness’ 238

PART IV Methodology for the ‘likeness’ analysis in GATS 243

13 The border tax adjustments framework 245
  I Properties, nature and quality 247
    A WTO/GATT jurisprudence 248
    B Application to GATS 250
      1. Properties and nature of services 251
      2. Properties and nature of suppliers 253
      3. Quality of services and qualification of suppliers 257
  II End-uses 258
    A WTO/GATT jurisprudence 258
    B Application to GATS 260
  III Consumers’ tastes and habits 262
  IV Tariff and service classification 264
  V Conclusions 267

14 Applying market definition theories to ‘likeness’ 269
  I ‘Market definition’ in competition law 272
    A The concept of market definition in EU competition law 272
      1. Cartelistic behaviour (Art. 101 TFEU) 273
      2. Abuse of dominant positions (Art. 102 TFEU) 274
      3. Merger regulation 275
CONTENTS

B The concept of market definition in US antitrust law 276
  1. Cartels (Sherman Act § 1) 276
  2. Single firm conduct (Sherman Act § 2) 277
  3. Merger control (Clayton Act § 7) 278

II 'Likeness' and market definition compared 279
  A Protection of competitors vs. protection of consumer welfare 280
  B Competitive opportunities vs. market power 282
  C Broad 'likeness' in trade vs. narrow markets in competition law 286
  D Direct comparison in trade vs. relevant market in competition 290

III Market definition 292
  A Demand substitutability 293
    1. Competition law 293
    2. Application to trade non-discrimination 296
    3. Assessing demand substitutability: converging market definition and 'likeness' 299
      a. Price elasticity of demand and the SSNIP test 299
      b. Physical characteristics and end-use (objective element) 307
      c. Views of consumers, customers and competitors (subjective element) 308
      d. Price differences and price trends 311
      e. Evidence of substitution in the past 313
      f. Barriers to substitution 313
      g. Determination by national authorities 314
      h. Evidence from other markets 315
      i. Channels of distribution and points of sale 315
      j. Procedural issues of obtaining evidence 316
  B Supply substitutability 317
    1. Competition law 318
    2. Application to trade non-discrimination 320
      a. Supply substitutability and direct comparison: an issue of scope 321
      b. Supply substitutability and asymmetric impact: an issue of market definition 325
  C Potential and future competition 327
    1. Competition law: supply-side potential and future competition 328
    2. Application to trade non-discrimination 329
      a. Demand-side potential competition in a narrow sense 329
      b. Demand-side future competition 331
      c. Supply-side future competition 333
IV  Conclusions 334

15  The PPM-problem in the GATS 'likeness' context 339
   I  Analysis of PPM-measures in GATT 340
   II Analysis of SSM-measures in GATS 345

16  Concluding summary: substitutability framework 349

Summary of conclusions 351
   I  The underlying policy choice 351
   II  A methodology for 'likeness' in GATS 353
      A  The pragmatic approach: Border Tax Adjustments framework 353
      B  The doctrinal approach: substitutability framework 354

Bibliography 357
Index 382