

115 939 2145

MAKING PEOPLE PAY

The Economic Sociology of Taxation

Sibichen K. Mathew

| | |
|--------------------------|--|
| Foreword | |
| A 'Judicial' view | |
| Before you read | |
| Acknowledgements | |

Chapter 1 Introduction

| | |
|---|-----------|
| Paying Taxes: Matter of Money or Mind? | 1 |
| Visible and invisible taxes | 2 |
| Visible and invisible benefits | 4 |
| What is income tax compliance? | 5 |
| Why should I pay? | 5 |
| What if I don't get any benefit? | 6 |
| If what I pay is siphoned off? | 7 |
| If what I pay is inefficiently applied? | 7 |
| What if it is such a hassle to follow the procedures? | 7 |
| Why should I, if it is so difficult for me to understand the legal intricacies? | 8 |
| Why should I, if it is so harassing to interact with the tax department? | 8 |
| Why should I, if I am unduly audited and investigated into? | 9 |
| What if it is too costly for me to comply? | 10 |
| What if the people around me don't pay? | 11 |
| What if my non-payment does not benefit society but only gives me gains? | 11 |
| Tax evasion? Is it a serious offence? | 12 |
| Is tax evasion immoral? | 12 |
| In search of answers | 13 |
| Matter of time | 14 |
| Matter of money | 14 |
| Matter of power | 15 |
| Matter of mind: Towards an economic-sociology of taxation | 16 |

Chapter 2 Matter of Time? The History of Taxation

| | |
|--|-----------|
| Global perspectives | 19 |
| Wars and the income tax | 22 |
| History and the tax revolts | 25 |
| Taxation and colonialism | 26 |
| Indian tax history | 27 |
| The dominant cultural and religious determinants | |

MAKING PEOPLE PAY

| | |
|--|----|
| System before the advent of the British | 28 |
| The exclusive colonial-economic orientation: | |
| Taxation during the British period | 33 |
| The predominant social dimensions: | |
| Taxation in post-independent India | 37 |
| Creating history | 38 |

Chapter 3 Matter of Money? The Economics of Taxation

| | |
|---|-----------|
| The Processual Dimensions | 42 |
| Mobilizing revenue in a dynamic economy | 42 |
| Emergence of market economy and issues in public goods delivery | 44 |
| Taxation as the instrument to resolve the resource crunch | 46 |
| Deadweight cost of taxation and optimal tax theory | 47 |
| Inability of Laffer Curve to explain tax behaviour | 48 |
| Do tax rates have an impact on tax revenue? | 49 |
| The tax revenue, GDP and the per-capita income | 51 |
| Tax reforms across the world | 53 |
| Tax reforms in India | 55 |
| The analytical dimensions | |
| Taxation and tax compliance: The economist explanation | 59 |
| Economic-criminological approach | 62 |
| Economic-behavioural approach | 64 |
| Deterrence factors | 65 |
| The tax compliance game: The agency models and general equilibrium models | 70 |
| Economic analysis of taxation-an appraisal | 71 |

Chapter 4 Matter of Power? The Politics of Taxation

| | |
|---|----|
| Ideologies of taxation | 74 |
| Politics, equity and taxation | 77 |
| Contractarian perspectives in taxation | 79 |
| Performance of the state and the tax compliance | 82 |
| Nature of political system and country-specific tax behaviour | 83 |
| Political context of tax policy | 84 |
| Political popularity | 85 |
| Tax incentives and pressure groups | 86 |
| Ideological conflict: Political ideology and economic necessity | 87 |
| Vote banks and cash banks | 87 |

CONTENTS

| | |
|---|----|
| Institutionalization of political financing | 88 |
| Anti-tax political parties | 92 |
| India - The budget and the tax proposals | 92 |
| The political context of taxation | 95 |

Chapter 5 Matter of Approach? The Sociology of Taxation

| | |
|--|-----|
| Sociological and social psychological orientations | 98 |
| Towards an appropriate research focus | 102 |
| Various research methods | 106 |
| Disadvantages of using secondary data | 106 |
| Shortcomings of surveys and questionnaires | 108 |
| Experimental studies | 109 |
| Other methods | 109 |
| Semi-structured interview and case study | 110 |
| Two empirical studies | 112 |

Chapter 6 Matter of Mind?

| | |
|--|------------|
| Tax attitudes and tax behavioural perceptions in a developing country | 115 |
| Attitudes and its relation to behaviour | 116 |
| Tax attitudes | 118 |
| Statement specific responses indicating attitudes | 121 |
| Perceptions on the role of the state and role performance of the state | 123 |
| Perception of the rationale of taxation and perceived fairness of the state | 124 |
| The changing role of the state in the globalized world | 126 |
| Attitudes about tax compliance and evasion | 128 |
| Attitudes and perceptions regarding tax laws and tax administration fairness | 131 |
| Perception of reasons for low tax compliance | 134 |
| Respondents' ranking for the strategies to increase compliance | 135 |
| Perception of self- tax behaviour | 136 |
| Past experience with the Income Tax Department | 138 |
| The impact of scrutiny | 139 |
| Taxpayer service | 142 |
| Insights from the study | |
| Attitude and perception about the state and governance | 143 |
| Attitude and perception about the tax evasion of others | 146 |

MAKING PEOPLE PAY

| | |
|--|-----|
| Attitude towards the state and governance and respondents' perceived tax behaviour | 146 |
| Current tax behaviour of the respondents and their past tax experiences | 147 |
| Analysis with reference to background variables | 148 |
| Insights in brief | 152 |

Chapter 7 Matter of Stick?

| | |
|---|------------|
| Nabbing the evader: The trajectory of Indian income tax enforcement | 153 |
| The tax enforcement measures in India | 154 |
| The power of search and seizure | 155 |
| The Search and Seizure procedure as per Income Tax Act | 158 |
| The objectives and focus of the study | 162 |
| The conversational interview | 164 |
| Duration of search | 165 |
| Seizure of valuables | 168 |
| Interrogation, disclosure and retraction | 173 |
| Analysis of the perception of conduct of search | 175 |
| Behaviour of the search party | |
| Conduct of the search: What the officials say? | 183 |
| Confidentiality of the search action | 184 |
| Financial strains consequent to the search | 185 |
| Emotional disturbances consequent to the search | 187 |
| Post-search proceedings and appeals | 188 |
| Health disturbances consequent to the search | 193 |
| Familial and social support | 195 |
| Why was I searched? Perceived reasons for search | 196 |
| Why was I non-compliant? Perceived reasons for income suppression / tax non-compliance | 200 |
| Relationships after the search | 204 |
| Social exposure and activity before and after the search | 211 |
| Responses about the departmental proceedings after the search | 214 |
| Income Tax Department proximity before and after the search | 215 |
| Anxiety of tax matters after completion of all proceedings | 216 |
| Perceived impact of search on financial well-being, business management and fiscal compliance | 218 |
| Perceived pre-search tax awareness perception and post-search tax awareness | 223 |

Chapter 8 Tax Compliance and Tax Enforcement: Problems and Prospects

| | |
|---|-----|
| Procedural compliance and substantive compliance | 228 |
| The problem of enforcement | 229 |
| Taxpayer Tax authority game | 231 |
| Inter-group comparison and fairness perception | 232 |
| The framing and overflowing | 233 |
| Multiple determinants of tax attitudes and resultant cognitive dissonance | 235 |
| Endogenous and Exogenous Stimuli | 236 |
| The evasion-avoidance ambiguity | 237 |
| Reciprocity as a factor and perception of corruption | 238 |
| Nature of state and taxpayer behavioural response | 239 |
| Information on tax compliance in the public domain | 242 |

Chapter 9 Taxation in a Globalized World: Transitional and Transnational Challenges

| | |
|---|------------|
| Is globalization good for the tax systems? | 246 |
| Tax competition | 247 |
| Whither welfare state? | 248 |
| The need to see beyond tax rates | 249 |
| Relevance for a Global Tax Research and Analysis Organization | 250 |
| Varying degrees of tax compliance | 250 |
| Making people pay | 251 |
| Notes | 255 |
| Abbreviations | 266 |
| Appendix | 267 |
| References | 273 |
| Subject Index | 293 |