

1 157 696 899 ✓

# **Using a Policy Mix to Combat Climate Change**

## **An Economic Evaluation of Policies in the German Electricity Sector**

**Dissertation**

zur Erlangung des Grades

Doktor der Wirtschaftswissenschaft (Dr. rer. pol.)

der Juristischen und Wirtschaftswissenschaftlichen Fakultät  
der Martin-Luther-Universität Halle-Wittenberg

vorgelegt von

**Dipl.-Kfm. Paul Lehmann**

**C 261287**

---

Gutachter: Prof. Bernd Hansjürgens  
Prof. Marlies Ahlert

Verteidigung am: 28. Januar 2010

## Brief Contents

<b>Figures</b> .....	<b>XIII</b>
<b>Tables</b> .....	<b>XIV</b>
<b>Abbreviations</b> .....	<b>XV</b>
<b>1 Introduction</b> .....	<b>1</b>
1.1 Policy Choices for Pollution Control: Policy Mix or Policy Mess?.....	1
1.2 Climate Change as a Major Problem of Pollution Control .....	3
1.3 Importance of the German Case Study.....	6
1.4 Research Objectives .....	7
1.5 Procedure and Structure.....	10
<b>2 Climate Policies in the German Electricity Sector</b> .....	<b>15</b>
2.1 Introduction .....	15
2.2 International and National Background of German Climate Policies.....	15
2.3 Presentation of German Climate Policies .....	22
2.4 Summary of the Main Characteristics of the German Policy Mix .....	53
<b>3 Rationales for Using a Policy Mix for Pollution Control</b> .....	<b>57</b>
3.1 Introduction .....	57
3.2 Analytical Framework .....	59
3.3 Using a Policy Mix to Cope with Multiple Failures of Private Governance Structures.....	73
3.4 Using a Policy Mix to Cope with High Transaction Costs of First-Best Single Policies .....	80
3.5 Summary and Avenues for Further Research .....	96
<b>4 Emissions Trading and Feed-in Tariffs for Renewable Electricity Generation</b> .....	<b>101</b>
4.1 Introduction .....	101
4.2 Applicability of Existing Theoretical Insight.....	102
4.3 Model.....	114
4.4 Summary, Discussion and Restrictions of Model Results .....	125
<b>5 Emissions Trading and Taxes on Emissions and Output</b> .....	<b>129</b>
5.1 Introduction .....	129
5.2 Applicability of Existing Theoretical Insight.....	130
5.3 Model with Emissions Not Depending on Output.....	135

---

5.4	Model with Emissions Depending on Output.....	163
5.5	Summary .....	178
<b>6</b>	<b>Evaluation of the Climate Policy Mix in the German Electricity Sector .....</b>	<b>183</b>
6.1	Introduction .....	183
6.2	ETS and Feed-in Tariffs for Renewable Electricity Generation .....	184
6.3	ETS and Electricity Tax.....	211
6.4	ETS and CHP Bonus .....	226
6.5	ETS and Low-Interest Loans for Technology Innovation and Diffusion.....	235
6.6	ETS and Eco-Design Standards.....	236
6.7	ETS and Energy Labelling for Household Appliances.....	239
6.8	ETS and Voluntary Agreement .....	243
6.9	Summary .....	247
<b>7</b>	<b>Conclusion: Major Results, Transferability and Avenues for Future Research.....</b>	<b>251</b>
7.1	Major Results.....	252
7.2	Transferability of Results to Other Policy Contexts .....	257
7.3	Avenues for Future Research .....	261
7.4	Outlook.....	265
<b>Annex</b>	<b>.....</b>	<b>267</b>
A.1	Activities and Installations Subject to the ETS According to Annex I TEHG.....	267
A.2	Emission Factors Applied under the ETS According to Annex 3 ZuG 2012 .....	270
A.3	Standard Utilization Factors Applied under the ETS.....	271
A.4	Indicators and Energy Efficiency Classes by Appliances Applied for Energy Labelling.....	273
A.5	Information Required for Labels, Fiches and Mail Order Catalogues by Appliances Applied for Energy Labelling .....	275
<b>References</b>	<b>.....</b>	<b>277</b>

## Contents

<b>Figures</b> .....	<b>XIII</b>
<b>Tables</b> .....	<b>XIV</b>
<b>Abbreviations</b> .....	<b>XV</b>
<b>1 Introduction</b> .....	<b>1</b>
1.1 Policy Choices for Pollution Control: Policy Mix or Policy Mess? .....	1
1.2 Climate Change as a Major Problem of Pollution Control .....	3
1.3 Importance of the German Case Study .....	6
1.4 Research Objectives .....	7
1.5 Procedure and Structure .....	10
<b>2 Climate Policies in the German Electricity Sector</b> .....	<b>15</b>
2.1 Introduction .....	15
2.2 International and National Background of German Climate Policies .....	15
2.2.1 International Climate Strategy .....	15
2.2.2 European Climate Strategy .....	18
2.2.3 German Climate Strategy .....	21
2.3 Presentation of German Climate Policies .....	22
2.3.1 EU Emissions Trading Scheme .....	22
2.3.2 Feed-in Tariff for Electricity Generation from Renewable Energy Sources .....	29
2.3.3 Electricity Tax .....	35
2.3.4 Bonus for Combined Heat and Power Generation .....	38
2.3.5 Low-Interest Loans Promoting Technology Innovation and Diffusion .....	42
2.3.5.1 Environmental Innovation Programme .....	42
2.3.5.2 Environment and Energy Efficiency Programme .....	43
2.3.5.3 KfW Programme Renewable Energies .....	45
2.3.6 Eco-Design Standards .....	46
2.3.7 Energy Labelling for Household Appliances .....	48
2.3.8 Voluntary Agreement .....	51
2.4 Summary of the Main Characteristics of the German Policy Mix .....	53
<b>3 Rationales for Using a Policy Mix for Pollution Control</b> .....	<b>57</b>
3.1 Introduction .....	57
3.2 Analytical Framework .....	59

3.2.1	Efficiency Criterion .....	59
3.2.2	Neoclassical Rationale for Using Regulation .....	60
3.2.2.1	Market Failures.....	61
3.2.2.2	Policy Recommendations and Restrictions.....	64
3.2.3	Coase's Rationale for Using Regulation .....	67
3.2.4	Rationales for Using a Policy Mix .....	70
3.2.4.1	Multiple Failures of Private Governance Structures .....	70
3.2.4.2	High Transaction Costs of Regulation with Single First-Best Policies.....	72
3.3	Using a Policy Mix to Cope with Multiple Failures of Private Governance Structures.....	73
3.3.1	Pollution Externalities and Technological Spillovers .....	74
3.3.1.1	Inefficiency of Single Policies .....	74
3.3.1.2	Superiority of a Policy Mix.....	75
3.3.2	Pollution Externalities and Asymmetric Information .....	77
3.3.2.1	Inefficiency of Single Policies .....	77
3.3.2.2	Superiority of a Policy Mix.....	78
3.4	Using a Policy Mix to Cope with High Transaction Costs of First-Best Single Policies .....	80
3.4.1	Heterogeneity of Marginal Pollution Damages .....	81
3.4.1.1	Inefficiency of Single Policies .....	81
3.4.1.2	Superiority of a Policy Mix.....	83
3.4.2	Heterogeneity of Marginal Pollution Abatement Costs.....	85
3.4.2.1	Inefficiency of Single Policies .....	85
3.4.2.2	Superiority of a Policy Mix.....	87
3.4.3	Non-Compliance by Polluters .....	89
3.4.3.1	Inefficiency of Single Policies .....	89
3.4.3.2	Superiority of a Policy Mix.....	92
3.5	Summary and Avenues for Further Research .....	96
<b>4</b>	<b>Emissions Trading and Feed-in Tariffs for Renewable Electricity Generation.....</b>	<b>101</b>
4.1	Introduction .....	101
4.2	Applicability of Existing Theoretical Insight.....	102
4.2.1	Applicability of Rationales for Using a Policy Mix.....	103
4.2.1.1	Learning with Renewable Energy Technologies.....	103
4.2.1.2	Learning Spillovers with Renewable Energy Technologies.....	108
4.2.2	Applicability of the Policy Mix Design.....	110

---

4.3	Model.....	114
4.3.1	Model Assumptions.....	114
4.3.2	The Social Optimum.....	117
4.3.3	Emissions Price and Output Subsidy: The Optimal Policy Mix.....	118
4.3.4	Emissions Price and Feed-in Tariff.....	121
4.4	Summary, Discussion and Restrictions of Model Results.....	125
<b>5</b>	<b>Emissions Trading and Taxes on Emissions and Output.....</b>	<b>129</b>
5.1	Introduction.....	129
5.2	Applicability of Existing Theoretical Insight.....	130
5.3	Model with Emissions Not Depending on Output.....	135
5.3.1	Model Assumptions.....	136
5.3.2	The Social Optimum.....	137
5.3.3	Single Policies.....	138
5.3.3.1	Emissions Trading.....	138
5.3.3.2	Emissions Tax.....	140
5.3.4	Policy Mix A: Emissions Trading and Homogeneous Taxation of Emissions.....	144
5.3.4.1	Firms' Choices.....	144
5.3.4.2	The Policy Mix Compared with Emissions Trading.....	144
5.3.4.3	The Policy Mix Compared with an Emissions Tax.....	147
5.3.5	Policy Mix B: Emissions Trading and Heterogeneous Taxation of Emissions.....	148
5.3.5.1	Firms' Choices.....	148
5.3.5.2	The Policy Mix Compared with Emissions Trading.....	149
5.3.5.3	The Policy Mix Compared with an Emissions Tax.....	154
5.3.5.4	Overcoming Inefficiencies in the Policy Mix.....	158
5.4	Model with Emissions Depending on Output.....	163
5.4.1	Model Assumptions.....	164
5.4.2	The Social Optimum.....	165
5.4.3	Single Policies.....	166
5.4.3.1	Emissions Trading.....	166
5.4.3.2	Emissions Tax.....	166
5.4.3.3	Output Tax.....	167
5.4.4	Policy Mix A: Emissions Trading and Homogeneous Taxation of Emissions.....	168
5.4.4.1	Firms' Choices.....	168
5.4.4.2	The Policy Mix Compared with Emissions Trading.....	168

5.4.5	Policy Mix B: Emissions Trading and Heterogeneous Taxation of Emissions.....	169
5.4.5.1	Firms' Choices.....	169
5.4.5.2	The Policy Mix Compared with Emissions Trading.....	170
5.4.5.3	Implications of Output Market Interactions.....	171
5.4.6	Policy Mix C: Emissions Trading and Homogeneous Taxation of Output.....	174
5.4.6.1	Firms' Choices.....	174
5.4.6.2	The Policy Mix Compared with Emissions Trading.....	175
5.4.7	Policy Mix D: Emissions Trading and Heterogeneous Taxation of Output.....	176
5.4.7.1	Firms' Choices.....	176
5.4.7.2	The Policy Mix Compared with Emissions Trading.....	177
5.5	Summary.....	178
<b>6</b>	<b>Evaluation of the Climate Policy Mix in the German Electricity Sector.....</b>	<b>183</b>
6.1	Introduction.....	183
6.2	ETS and Feed-in Tariffs for Renewable Electricity Generation.....	184
6.2.1	Addressing Climate Change: Overcoming a Pollution Externality and Learning Spillovers.....	185
6.2.1.1	Theoretical Rationale for Using the Policy Mix.....	185
6.2.1.2	Issue 1: Recipients of the Feed-in Tariff.....	186
6.2.1.3	Issue 2: Scope of the Feed-in Tariff.....	188
6.2.1.4	Issue 3: Differentiation of the Feed-in Tariff with respect to Technologies.....	189
6.2.1.5	Issue 4: Degression of the Feed-in Tariff.....	190
6.2.1.6	Issue 5: Feed-in Tariff Irrespective of Electricity Price.....	190
6.2.1.7	Issue 6: Funding of the Feed-in Tariff Endogenous to the Electricity Sector.....	192
6.2.1.8	Issue 7: Partial Overlap of ETS and Feed-in Tariff.....	196
6.2.2	Addressing Climate Change: Overcoming a Pollution Externality and Other Barriers to Technological Change.....	202
6.2.3	Addressing Climate Change and Other Policy Objectives.....	205
6.2.4	Policy Recommendation.....	207
6.3	ETS and Electricity Tax.....	211
6.3.1	Addressing Climate Change: Overcoming a Pollution Externality.....	211
6.3.1.1	Issue 1: Heterogeneous Taxation of ETS Participants.....	212
6.3.1.2	Issue 2: Taxation of Output.....	217

6.3.1.3	Issue 3: Heterogeneous Taxation of Electricity Consumers .....	219
6.3.2	Addressing Climate Change: Overcoming a Pollution Externality and Barriers to Efficient Energy Generation and Consumption .....	220
6.3.3	Addressing Climate Change and Other Policy Objectives .....	221
6.3.4	Policy Recommendation .....	224
6.4	ETS and CHP Bonus .....	226
6.4.1	Addressing Climate Change: Overcoming a Pollution Externality and Learning Spillovers .....	227
6.4.1.1	Theoretical Rationale for Using the Policy Mix .....	227
6.4.1.2	Issue 1: Recipients of the CHP Bonus .....	228
6.4.1.3	Issue 2: Degression of the CHP Bonus .....	228
6.4.1.4	Issue 3: CHP Bonus Paid in Addition to Electricity Price .....	229
6.4.1.5	Issue 4: Funding of the CHP Bonus Endogenous to the Electricity Sector .....	229
6.4.1.6	Issue 5: Partial Overlap of ETS and CHP Bonus .....	230
6.4.2	Addressing Climate Change: Overcoming a Pollution Externality and Other Barriers to Technological Change .....	232
6.4.3	Addressing Climate Change and Other Policy Objectives .....	233
6.4.4	Policy Recommendation .....	234
6.5	ETS and Low-Interest Loans for Technology Innovation and Diffusion .....	235
6.5.1	Addressing Climate Change: Overcoming a Pollution Externality and Barriers to Technological Change .....	235
6.5.2	Policy Recommendation .....	236
6.6	ETS and Eco-Design Standards .....	236
6.6.1	Addressing Climate Change: Overcoming a Pollution Externality and Barriers to Using Energy-Efficient Appliances .....	236
6.6.2	Addressing Climate Change and Other Policy Objectives .....	238
6.6.3	Policy Recommendation .....	238
6.7	ETS and Energy Labelling for Household Appliances .....	239
6.7.1	Addressing Climate Change: Overcoming a Pollution Externality and Asymmetric Information .....	239
6.7.2	Addressing Climate Change and Other Policy Objectives .....	242
6.7.3	Policy Recommendation .....	242
6.8	ETS and Voluntary Agreement .....	243



---

6.8.1	Addressing Climate Change: Overcoming a Pollution Externality .....	243
6.8.2	Addressing Climate Change and Other Policy Objectives .....	246
6.8.3	Policy Recommendation .....	247
6.9	Summary .....	247
<b>7</b>	<b>Conclusion: Major Results, Transferability and Avenues for Future Research.....</b>	<b>251</b>
7.1	Major Results.....	252
7.1.1	Identification of Economic Rationales for Using a Policy Mix for Pollution Control .....	252
7.1.2	Integration of Design Complexity into Models of a Climate Policy Mix.....	254
7.1.3	Evaluation of the Climate Policy Mix in the German Electricity Sector.....	256
7.2	Transferability of Results to Other Policy Contexts .....	257
7.2.1	Identification of Economic Rationales for Using a Policy Mix for Pollution Control .....	257
7.2.2	Integration of Design Complexity into Models of a Climate Policy Mix.....	259
7.2.3	Evaluation of the Climate Policy Mix in the German Electricity Sector.....	260
7.3	Avenues for Future Research .....	261
7.4	Outlook.....	265
<b>Annex</b>	.....	<b>267</b>
A.1	Activities and Installations Subject to the ETS According to Annex I TEHG.....	267
A.2	Emission Factors Applied under the ETS According to Annex 3 ZuG 2012 .....	270
A.3	Standard Utilization Factors Applied under the ETS.....	271
A.4	Indicators and Energy Efficiency Classes by Appliances Applied for Energy Labelling.....	273
A.5	Information Required for Labels, Fiches and Mail Order Catalogues by Appliances Applied for Energy Labelling.....	275
<b>References</b>	.....	<b>277</b>