Working Together

COLLECTIVE ACTION, THE COMMONS, AND MULTIPLE METHODS IN PRACTICE

Amy R. Poteete
Marco A. Janssen
Elinor Ostrom
## Contents

- List of Illustrations
  - xiii
- List of Tables
  - xv
- Acknowledgments
  - xvii
- Prologue
  - xxi

### PART ONE: Introduction

#### CHAPTER ONE

Overcoming Methodological Challenges
- Social Science Debates over the Superiority of Particular Methods
  - 7
- Multiple Methods: Promises and Challenges
  - 11
- Practical Challenges and Methodological Trade-Offs
  - 14
  - Technological Development and the Costs of Border Crossing
  - 15
  - Availability and Accessibility of Data
  - 17
- Career Incentives as Methodological Constraints
  - 18
  - Training
  - 19
  - Career Incentives and Specialization
  - 20

Our Substantive Focus
- Interactions between Theory and Methods
  - 23
- Multiple Methods and Collaborative Research
  - 23
- Practical Constraints on Methodological Choices
  - 23
- Career Incentives and Methodological Practice
  - 24

Outline of the Book
- 24

### PART TWO: Field Methods

#### CHAPTER TWO

Small-N Case Studies: Putting the Commons under a Magnifying Glass
- 31

The Conventional Theory of the Commons
- 31

The Case Study Method
- 33
  - Cases, Case Studies, and Case Study Research
  - 33
  - Analytical Strengths and Weaknesses
  - 34
  - Practical Considerations
  - 37

Synthesizing Challenges and Coordinating New Research Efforts
- 39

Contributions to the Study of the Commons
- 45
  - Property Rights and Tenure Security
  - 45
## Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Group Characteristics</td>
<td>52</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Resource Characteristics</td>
<td>57</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Case Studies as a Foundation</strong></td>
<td>60</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Chapter Three

- **Broadly Comparative Field-Based Research** 64
  - Methodological Practices over Fifteen Years of Research 65
  - Defining the Units of Analysis 66
  - Trading Geographic Scope for Numbers? 68
  - Theoretical Aspirations and Methodological Practices 74
- Practical Challenges to Broadly Comparative Field-Based Research 74
  - Costs of Data Collection 75
  - Research Design and Sampling 76
  - The Implications of Data Scarcity and Costliness 78
- Meta-Analysis: An Introduction 78
  - Weighing the Benefits and Costs of Meta-Analysis 81
  - Coding Strategies and Missing Data 81
  - Potential Sources of Sample Bias 83
- The Choice of Methodological Strategy: Weighing Costs against Control 86

### Chapter Four

- Meta-Analysis: Getting the Big Picture through Synthesis 89
  - Meta-Analysis: A Recapitulation 89
  - The Common-Pool Resource (CPR) Research Program 90
    - Defining Variables 92
    - Compensating for Gaps in Case Materials 93
    - Contributions 94
  - Overall Assessment 101
- NIIS: A Hybrid Approach 102
  - Adaptation of the CPR Protocols 103
  - Measurement and Sampling 104
  - Contributions 105
  - Overall Assessment 107
- Other Synthetic Studies 107
  - Additional Examples of Meta-Analysis 108
  - An Example of Narrative Synthesis 111
  - Progress and Continuing Challenges 113

### Chapter Five

- Collaborative Field Studies 115
  - Collaboration in Field-Based Research, 1990–2004 116
  - Two Research Partnerships 118
PART FOUR: Synthesis

CHAPTER NINE
Pushing the Frontiers of the Theory of Collective Action and the Commons

Synopsis of Research Developments Reviewed in Parts II and III

Toward a More General Behavioral Theory of Human Action

Assumptions of a Behavioral Theory

The Centrality of Trust

Unpacking the Concept of Context

The Microsituational Context

The Impact of Microsituational Variables on Cooperation

The Challenge of Linking Contextual Scales

The Broader Scale Affecting Collective Action

Ontological Frameworks

An Ontological Framework of Social-Ecological Systems

Predicting Self-Organization Drawing on the SES Framework

Diagnosing Institutional Change

Challenges for Future Research

Conclusion

APPENDIX 9.1: A Theoretical Puzzle: Why Do Some Resource Users Self-Organize and Others Do Not?
## Chapter Ten

Learning from Multiple Methods 248

- Interlocking Developments in Methods and Theory 249
- Methodological and Disciplinary Cross-Fertilization and Theoretical Innovation 251
- Sequential Movement between Methods and Disciplines 252
- Combining Multiple Methods and Disciplines in a Program of Research 255
- Spaces for Cross-Fertilization 257

### Practical Challenges 258

- Trade-Offs in Training and Research 258
- Professional Incentives 260

### Collaborative Research as a Collective-Action Problem 262

- Rewards to Individual and Collaborative Research 263
- Fragmentation of Academia 265
- Misunderstandings and Mistrust 266
- Long-Term Funding 269
- Responding to the Challenges 270

### Looking Forward 271

Notes 275

References 289

Index 339