


Law, Economics, and Morality

EYAL ZAMIR  BARAK MEDINA

OXFORD
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Contents

Acknowledgments xi

Introduction 1

PART ONE **Theory 9**

1. **The Consequentialist Nature of Economic Analysis 11**
 - A. General 11
 - B. Normative Economics 11
 - C. Consequentialism and Its Critique 18
 - D. Responses to the Lack-of-Constraints Critique 21
 1. Long-Term and Indirect Effects 22
 2. Rule-Consequentialism 24
 3. "Preferences for Constraints" 27
 4. Feelings of Virtue and Remorse 29
 5. An Improved Theory of the Good:
Ideal Preferences 30
 6. Summary 32
 - E. Responses to the Demandingness Objection 33
 - F. Conclusion 40
2. **Threshold Deontology and Its Critique 41**
 - A. Deontology 41
 - B. Critique of Deontology in General 49
 - C. Critique of Threshold Deontology 51
 - D. Concluding Remarks 56
3. **Private and Public Morality 57**
 - A. General 57
 - B. The Private/Public Distinction 58
 - C. Doing and Allowing 60

- D. Intending and Foreseeing 63
- E. Acting and Enacting 70
- F. Concluding Remarks 76

- 4. Constructing Threshold Functions 79
 - A. Introductory Remarks 79
 - B. General Structure of a Threshold Function 84
 - C. Relevant Types of Benefits and Costs 86
 - D. Shape and Size of the Threshold 93
 - E. Other Concerns 96
 - F. Threshold Options 98
 - G. Concluding Remarks 103

- 5. Addressing Possible Objections 105
 - A. Undermining the Normative Neutrality of Economic Analysis 105
 - B. Quantification and Monetization Difficulties 108
 - 1. General 108
 - 2. Anti-Commodification 111
 - 3. Incomparability 112
 - 4. Incommensurability 113
 - C. Setting Constraints Too Low 116
 - D. Incompatibility with the Expressive Role of Law 117
 - E. Conclusion 122

PART TWO Applications 125

- 6. The Fight Against Terrorism 127
 - A. Introduction 127
 - B. Economic Analysis of the Fight Against Terrorism 128
 - C. The Constraint Against Harming Persons and the Fight Against Terrorism 135
 - 1. General Considerations 135
 - 2. Harming Aggressors as a Constraint Infringement 136
 - D. Constrained Economic Analysis of Intended Harm 140
 - 1. General 140
 - 2. Goals of Anti-Terrorist Measures: Preemption, Retribution, Deterrence, and Pressure 140
 - 3. Basic Elements of the Threshold Function 145

4. The Net Benefit 147
 - (a) The Relevant Variables 147
 - (b) Marginal Net Benefit and Alternative Courses of Action 149
5. The Threshold 150
 - (a) General 150
 - (b) Probability of the Terrorist Attack 151
 - (c) The Aggressor's Culpability 160
 - (d) Summary 160
6. Torture 161
- E. Constrained Economic Analysis of Unintended Harm 166
 1. General 166
 2. Constructing the Threshold Function 169
 3. Killing Persons Who are Doomed 170
 4. Victims' Moral Responsibility and Nationality 171
- F. Measures Involving Both Intended and Unintended Harm 174
- G. Conclusion 175

7. Freedom of Speech 177
 - A. General 177
 - B. Doctrinal Background 178
 - C. Cost-Benefit Analysis of Free Speech and Its Critique 184
 - D. The Constraint Against Suppressing Free Speech 189
 - E. Constrained Cost-Benefit Analysis 195
 1. The Regulation's Net Benefit 195
 - (a) General 195
 - (b) Chronologically Remote Harms 196
 - (c) Low-Probability Harms 199
 - (d) Small Harms 201
 - (e) Harms Brought About Through Rational Persuasion 202
 - (f) Offensiveness 206
 - (g) Combining Excluders 210
 2. The Threshold 211
 - (a) General 211
 - (b) The Threshold's Shape 211
 - (c) Different Thresholds for Different Bases of Regulation 213

- (d) Different Thresholds for Different Categories of Speech 218
 - (e) Summary 221
 - 3. Choosing Among Permissible Courses of Action 222
 - F. Conclusion 224
- 8. Antidiscrimination Law 225
 - A. Introduction 225
 - B. Current Legal Norms 228
 - C. Motivations for Discrimination 231
 - D. Standard Normative Economic Analysis 234
 - E. Integrating Deontological Constraints with Economic Analysis 240
 - 1. The Constraint Against Discrimination and Its Incidence 240
 - 2. Moral Constraints and Redistributive Goals 246
 - 3. Integrating Threshold Constraints with Economic Analysis 251
 - F. Conclusion 255
- 9. Contract Law 257
 - A. Introduction 257
 - B. Economic Analysis of Contract Law 258
 - C. Deontological Constraints and Contract Law 260
 - 1. The Pertinent Constraints: An Overview 260
 - 2. The Economic Response and Its Critique 262
 - D. Constrained Economic Analysis of Mistake and Misrepresentation 267
 - 1. A Brief Doctrinal Background 267
 - 2. Standard Economic Analysis 269
 - 3. Deontology and Deception 274
 - 4. Constrained Economic Analysis 277
 - (a) Integrating Constraints 277
 - (b) Integrating Options 289
 - E. Remedies for Breach of Contract 292
 - 1. A Brief Doctrinal Background 292
 - 2. Standard Economic Analysis 294
 - 3. Deontology: Promises, Harms, and Contractual Obligations 298

4. Deontological Features of Contract Remedy Rules	301
5. Challenges Facing Constrained Economic Analysis of Remedy Rules	305
F. Conclusion	310
10. Legal Paternalism	313
A. General	313
B. Paternalism: Classifications and Prevalence	315
C. Normative Economic Analysis of Paternalism	318
1. The Compatibility of Efficiency and Paternalism	318
2. Possible Objections	327
3. A Simple Model	332
D. Incorporating Deontological Constraints	335
1. Deontological Perspectives on Paternalism	335
2. Size of the Threshold	339
3. Relevant Types of Benefits and Costs	342
4. Marginal Net Benefit and Alternative Measures	346
E. Conclusion	347
 Conclusion	 349
 Index	 353