COMPARATIVE CORPORATE GOVERNANCE OF NON-PROFIT ORGANIZATIONS

Edited by
KLAUS J. HOPT AND
THOMAS VON HIPPEL



CONTENTS



List of contributors xxiv Preface XXXV Abbreviations xlix

PART I Economic findings and theories on nonprofit organizations

1 The nonprofit sector: introductory remarks What kind of nonprofit sector, what kind of society? Comparative policy reflections 3

HELMUT K. ANHEIER

- I Introduction
 - A Nonprofits as service providers
 - B Nonprofits and civil society
 - C Social accountability
- II Implications 11
- III Scenarios 13
 - A NPM scenario
 - B Social capital scenario
 - C Accountability scenario 14

 - D The corporate scenario
 - E The mellow weakness scenario 15
 - F Roles for the state
- IV Summary and conclusions 16
- Good and not so good governance of nonprofit organizations: factual observations from the USA and Europe

14

Good and not so good governance of nonprofit organizations: 2.1 factual observations from the USA

JOHN A. EDIE

I Introduction 21 vi CONTENTS

	II Media reports: examples of not so good governance 22	
	III Response to the media: who is pushing for change? 25	
	IV Four key events leading to improved good governance 27	
	A Senate finance committee's "white paper" 28	
	B Report of the Panel on the Nonprofit Sector 28	
	C US Senate Passage of S. 2020 29	
	D California legislation 29	
	V Examples of good governance 30	
	A Independent audit 31	
	B Independent audit committee 31	
	C Public access to audited financial statements 32	
	D Compensation of CEO approved by full board of directors	32
	E Conflict of interest policy 33	
	F Whistleblower policy 33	
	G Travel policy 34	
	VI Private sector pressure for good governance 35	
	A BBB Wise Giving Alliance (Arlington, Virginia) 35	
	B BoardSource (Washington, DC) 36	
	C Council on Foundations (Washington, DC) 36	
	D Forum of Regional Associations (Washington, DC) 37	
	VII Summary and conclusions 37	
2.2	Good and not so good governance of nonprofit organizations:	
	factual observations from foundations in Germany 39	
	CHRISTOPH MECKING	
	I Introduction 39	
	II Not so good foundation governance 42	
	A Problem cases 42	
	B A lack of publicity 47	
	III Good foundational governance 48	
	A Government monitoring 48	
	B Self-regulation 50	
	C Principles of good foundational practice 52	
	IV Summary and conclusions 59	
2	·	
3	Economic theories of nonprofit organizations	
3.1	The economics of nonprofit organizations 60	
	HENRY HANSMANN	
	I Introduction 60	
	II Structure and role 60	

CONTENTS vii

	iii Manageriai agency problems 63
	IV Entry and exit 65
	V Refining the nondistribution constraint: executive compensation 68
	· ·
	VI Cooperatives versus nonprofits 69
	VII Summary and conclusions 71
3.2	Principal–agent theory and nonprofit accountability 73
	RICHARD STEINBERG
	I Introduction 74
	II Principal–agent theory in economics 75
	A The problem defined 75
	B Types of principal–agent problems 76
	C Solving principal–agent problems 78
	D Shortcomings of agency theory 80
	III Applications: donors as principals, organizations as agents 83
	A Quantity problems 85
	C Excessive fundraising and administrative expenditures 89
	D Quality mismatch when donor-principals are homogeneous 92
	E Quality mismatch when donor-principals are heterogeneous 93
	IV Customers and clients as principals, nonprofit organizations as agents 96
	V Internal agency problems 99
	A Overview – interpreting empirical results 100
	B Excessive compensation 102
	C Financial incentive plans 105
	VI Summary and conclusions 113
	VI Sulfilliary and conclusions 113
	PART II The nonprofit sector: private law, trust law, tax law in selected countries 127
4	Anglo-American countries
4.1	Nonprofit organizations in the United States 129
	JAMES J. FISHMAN
	I Introduction 130
	II The nondistribution constraint 131
	III Public benefit and mutual benefit organizations 132
	IV Private law, trust law, and corporate law 133
	A Unincorporated associations 134
	•
	B The charitable trust 135

viii CONTENTS

	C Nonprofit corporations 136	
	V Tax law relating to nonprofits 139	
	A State tax exemption: regulation and enforcement 139	
	B Federal tax law 140	
	C The functions of federal tax law 141	
	D Federal tax taxonomy: the charitable non-charitable distinction 143	
	E The charitable nonprofits: section 501(c)(3) organizations	43
	F The public charity-private foundation distinction 144	
	G Restrictions on private foundations 146	
	H Evaluation of the private foundation restrictions 148	
	VI Fiduciary obligations 149	
	A Trust law: the duty of prudence 149	
	B Trust law: the duty of loyalty 150	
	C The nonprofit corporation: the board of directors 150	
	D Nonprofit corporate law: the duty of care 151	
	E The duty of loyalty 152	
	F Private law approaches 155	
	G State regulation of fiduciary and other obligations: the	
~	attorney general 155	
	H Federal regulation of fiduciary obligations 158	
	VII Charitable solicitation 161	
	A State regulation 161	
	B Federal regulation of charitable solicitation 165	
	VIII Summary and conclusions 166	
4.2	Harmonising nonprofit law in the European Union: an English	
	perspective and digest 170	
	HUBERT PICARDA	
	I Introduction 171	
	II General themes 173	
	A The contrast between the common law and civil law: reconciliation problems 173	
	B The impulse to codification and cross-border initiatives in Europe 175	
	C The comparable techniques of synthesis of views 176	
	D The need for a core vocabulary 177	
	E The flood of policy and statist agenda into the "third sector"	
	and the law in England 178	
	F Overview of the English Charities Act and its problem area	78

contents ix

	G	Specific cross-border European initiatives to preclude money laundering abuse by terrorists and criminals of charities and the third sector and for the development of the European association and other strategies 183
ш	Or	ganisational law 184
111		Trust 184
		Company 184
		Unincorporated association (volunteers) 185
		Industrial and provident societies: charitable housing
		associations 185
	Е	Charitable incorporated organisations (CIOs) 185
IV		ities of trustees and directors in relation to loyalty and duty
		care 186
	A	Duty of loyalty 187
	В	Keeping to the objects 187
	C	Duty to avoid or remedy conflict of interests 188
	D	Duty of care 191
V	En	forcement of those duties and the enforcers 192
	A	Enforcement of those duties 192
	В	Enforcers 192
	C	Methods of enforcement 194
VI	Su	mmary and conclusions 195
Ger	ma	nic countries
		ofit organizations in Germany 197
	_	AS VON HIPPEL
		roduction 200
1		The term "nonprofit organizations" 200
		Empirical information 200
11		stitutional law 200
11		Association 200
		Foundation 202
		Other legal forms for nonprofit organizations 203
TIT		x law 205
111		Status of a tax-exempt organization 205
		Tax benefits 208
TV.		luciary obligations of the board members 210
1 4		Duty of care 210
		•
		Duty of loyalty 211 Duty of prudence (investment of assets) 211
	$^{\circ}$	Duty of prudence (investment of assets) 211

X CONTENTS

D Duty of obedience 213	
V Governance and enforcement 214	
A Internal governance 214	
B State supervision 216	
C Rights of founders, donors, beneficiaries and third pa	rties 218
D Reporting, auditing and disclosure 219	
VI Charitable solicitation 220	
A Regulation for solicitation 220	
B Limitations for fundraising costs? 221	
VII Economic activities, enterprises and creditor protection	222
A Economic activities 222	
B Nonprofit organizations and enterprises 224	
C Creditor protection 224	
VIII Recent reforms, reform proposals, standards of best pract	tice 225
A Recent reforms 225	
B Recent reform proposals 225	
C Best practices 225	
IX Summary and conclusions 226	
A Strengthening of corporate governance 226	
B Reducing legal uncertainty 226	
5.2 Nonprofit organizations in the Netherlands 228	
TYMEN J. VAN DER PLOEG	
I Introduction 230	
A The term "nonprofit organizations" 230	
B Empirical information 230	
II Institutional law 231	
A Legal forms 231	
B The association 231	
C The foundation 233	
III Tax law relating to nonprofits 234	
IV Fiduciary obligations of the board members 236	
A Introduction 236	
B Duty of loyalty and duty of care 237	
C Duty of prudence (investment of assets) 239	
D Duty of obedience 241	
V Governance and enforcement 241	
A Internal governance 241	
B External supervision 248	

CONTENTS xi

C Rights of third parties 254
D Reporting, auditing, and disclosure 256
VI Charitable solicitation 258
VII Economic activities, enterprises, and creditor protection 259
A Economic activities 259
B Nonprofit organizations and enterprises 259
C Creditor protection 260
VIII Recent reforms, reform proposals, standards of best practice 261
A Recent reforms 261
B Reform proposals 262
C Best practices 263
IX Summary and conclusions 263
Romanic countries
Nonprofit organizations in France 265
KATRIN DECKERT
I Introduction 268
A The term "nonprofit organization" 268
B Empirical information 268
C General remarks on the legal environment in France 269
II Institutional law 272
A Associations 272
B Foundations 280
III Tax law relating to nonprofits 285
IV Fiduciary obligations of board members 287
A Introduction 287
B Duty of loyalty 287
C Duty of prudence 288
D Duty of obedience 291
E System of civil liability in nonprofit organizations 293
V Governance and enforcement 293
A Internal governance 293
B State supervision 307
C Rights of third parties 312
D Reporting, auditing and disclosure 313
VI Charitable solicitation 319
VII Economic activities, enterprises and creditor protection 319
A Economic activities 319
B Creditor protection 322

6

xii

	VIII Recent reforms, reform proposals, standards of best practice IX Conclusion 324	323
7	Transformation countries	
7.1	Nonprofit organizations in Hungary 325	
	ZOLTÁN CSEHI	
	I Introduction 327	
	A The term "nonprofit organizations" 327	
	B Hungarian Nonprofit Act: special rules and benefits for registered charities 331	
	C Empirical information 333	
	II Institutional law 334	
	A Purpose and characteristics 334	
	B Requirements of the NPO Act 338	
	C Establishment 340	
	D Winding up 343	
	III Fiduciary obligations of the board members 345	
	A Introduction 345	
	B Duty of loyalty 348	
	C Duty of prudence 350	
	D Duty of obedience 351	
	E Incompatibility rules of registered NPOs 353	
	IV Governance and enforcement 355	
	A Internal governance 355	
	B State supervision 363	
	C Rights of third parties 367	
	D Reporting 369	
	V Economic activities, enterprises and creditor protection 37	4
	A Economic activities 374	
	B Creditor protection 375	
	VI Recent reforms, reform proposals, standards of best practice	376
	VII Summary and conclusions 377	
7.2	Nonprofit organizations in the Czech Republic 379	
	KATEŘINA RONOVSKÁ	
	I Introduction 381	
	A The term "nonprofit organisations" 381	
	B Empirical data 383	
	II Institutional law 383	
	A Legal forms 383	

CONTENTS xiii

B Associations 384
C The foundation, the endowment fund, the public benefit institution 388
III Tax law relating to nonprofits 396
A General 396
B Survey of tax privileges 397
IV Fiduciary obligations of the board members 398
A Introduction 398
B Duty of loyalty 398
C Investment of assets (duty of prudence) 400
D Duty of obedience 401
V Governance and enforcement 401
A Internal governance 401
B External supervision 407
C Rights of third parties 411
D Reporting, auditing, disclosure 413
VI Charitable solicitation 416
VII Economic activities, enterprises and creditor protection 417
A Economic activities 417
B NGOs and enterprises 418
C Creditors' protection 420
VIII Recent reforms, proposals, standards of best practice 421
A Recent reforms and proposals 421
B Best practice 425
IX Summary and conclusions 426
Nonprofit organizations in the People's Republic of China 428
THOMAS VON HIPPEL/KNUT B. PIBLER
I Introduction 431
A The term "nonprofit organizations" 431
B Empirical information 431
II Institutional law 432
A Foundations 434
B Social organizations (associations) 439
C Civil non-business institutions 442
D Charitable trusts 444
E Foreign nonprofit organizations 446
III Tax law relating to nonprofits 446
IV Fiduciary obligations of the board members 447

xiv

CONTENTS

	A Duty of loyalty 447
	B Duty of prudence (investment of assets) 450
	C "Duty of obedience" 454
	V Governance and enforcement 455
	A Internal governance 456
	B State supervision (external supervision) 461
	C Rights of third parties 462
	D Reporting, auditing, and disclosure 465
	VI Charitable solicitation 468
	VII Economic activities, enterprises, and creditor protection 469
	A Economic activities 469
	B Nonprofit organizations and enterprises 470
	C Creditor protection 470
	VIII Recent reforms, reform proposals, standards of best practice 470
	A Recent reforms 470
	B Reform proposals 471
	C Best practice 473
	IX Conclusion 474
	A Growing significance of NPOs 474
	B Increased regulation 474
	C Skepticism regarding NPOs 475
	D Thoughts on liberalizing NPO regulations 475
	E Legal uncertainty 476
	PART III The board of nonprofit organizations 479
8	The board of nonprofit organizations: law and practice
8.1	The board of nonprofit organizations: puzzling through the gaps
	between law and practice – a view from the United States 483
	EVELYN BRODY
	I Introduction 482
	II Discussion 486
	A To whom (or what) are board duties owed? 486
	B Organizational type, organizational size 489
	C Inside the black box: board/management relations 491
	D Group authority, individual responsibility 506
	E Are charity members shareholder-subsitutes? 519
	F What really happens to a wayward charity fiduciary? 522
	III Summary and conclusions: how can practice be improved? 529
	111 Summary and conclusions, now can practice be improved: 329

CONTENTS XV

0.2	The least of control o
8.2	The board of nonprofit organizations: some corporate governance thoughts from Europe 531
	KLAUS J. HOPT I Nonprofit organizations and corporate governance: an
	introduction from a European perspective 532
	A The state of the discussion in Europe 532
	B Deficits of control in nonprofit organizations and ways out 534
	II The board of nonprofit organizations: what can be learned from the corporate governance discussion? 539
	A The board of nonprofit organizations: differences between
	the United States and Europe 539
	B The board of nonprofit organizations in Europe 540
	III Organization and functioning of the board of nonprofit organizations 543 *
	A One-tier/two-tier boards 543
	B Composition and size of the board 545
	C Board committees 549
	D Remuneration and audit in particular 550
	E Education, professionalization and evaluation 553
	IV Responsibility of the board of nonprofit organizations 554
	A Duties of the board of a nonprofit organization 554
	B Liability of the board of a nonprofit organization 557
	C Enforcement, legal and non-legal 559
9	The duty of obedience
9.1	Rediscovering the duty of obedience: toward a trinitarian theory of
	fiduciary duty 564
	ROB ATKINSON
	I Introduction 566
	II Identifying the duty of obedience 569
	A Locating the duty of obedience in the tripartite scheme of fiduciary duties 569
	B Locating the duty of obedience in four fiduciary contexts 578
	III Normative analysis: evaluating the duty of obedience 611
	A Normative analysis of the weak form of the duty of obedience 612

B Dead hand control in the law of charity

618

IV Summary and conclusions

614

xvi ' CONTENTS

9.2	Duty of obedience: the German perspective 619
	RAINER HÜTTEMANN I Introduction 619 II Law of foundations 620 A Dead-hand control 620 B Alteration of purpose under § 87 German Civil Code 624 C Other amendments of the articles of a foundation 625 D State laws 626 E Enforcement of the duty of obedience 627 F Current reform proposals 628 III Charitable associations and corporations 629 IV Duty of obedience and charitable giving 630 V Impacts of tax relief 631
	PART IV Good governance of nonprofit organizations: activities and regulatory problems 635
10 10.1	Fundraising The regulation of fund-raising by charities and voluntary organisations in England and Wales 637
	I Introduction 637 II Public charitable collections 641 III Fund-raising 653 IV Trading 657 V EU regulation 659 VI Self-regulation 660 VII Summary and conclusions 660
10.2	Comparing regulation of fundraising: self-regulation or governmental regulation? 662 WINO J. M. VAN VEEN I Introduction 663 II Governmental regulation 665 A Fundraising and legislation: general remarks 665
	B Legitimacy of government regulation of fundraising 668 C The instruments of government regulation 669 D Compliance and effectiveness of government regulation 675 III Self-regulation of fundraising 679 A Defining self-regulation 679

CONTENTS xvii

	B Legitimacy of self-regulation 682
	C Instruments of self-regulation 684
	D Standards for fundraising 688
	E Self-regulation: concluding remarks 692
	IV Comparing government regulation and self-regulation 693
	A Authorization versus accreditation 693
	B Punitive versus preventive 694
	C Informing the public 695
	D The mechanisms: implementation and enforcement 696
	V Summary and conclusions: government regulation or self-regulation? 697
11	Asset management in nonprofit organizations
11.1	Asset management in nonprofit organizations 699
	CARSTEN CARSTENSEN '
	I Introduction 699
	II Economic aspects of asset management 700
	A The role of foundations 700
	B Fundamentals 701
	C Fulfilment of the foundation's purpose 701
	D Preservation of the foundation's capital 701
	E Disposition of the proceeds 703
	F Asset management 703
	III Asset management and the tax law 704
	A Payout in time 704
	B Asset management and economic activity 705
	C Asset management and securities transactions 705
	D Asset management and real estate 705
	E Asset management and alternative investments 706
	IV Special rules for the association 707
	A Membership fees and donations 707
	B Preservation of the association's capital 707
	C Trustee function of the association? 707
	V Summary and conclusions 708
11.2	Legal standards for capital investments by foundations in hedge funds according to German and American law 709
	MAXIMILIAN HAAG AND ANDREAS RICHTER
	I Introduction 710

xviii contents

12 12.1

II Specific characteristics and risks of capital investment in hedge funds 712
A Fund structure and management 712
B The fund's investment strategies 714
III Legal standards for investments by charitable organizations 715
A Founder's will and duty of loyalty 715
B Precept of secure and lucrative investment 718
C Precept of timely use of funds 726
D Prohibition of favoritism 729
E Additional restrictions in US tax law 731
F Liability of the foundation bodies for breaches of duty 735
IV Summary and conclusions 738
Nonprofit organizations and economic activities/enterprises Nonprofit organizations and economic activities/ enterprises 740
CARL HEMSTRÖM
I General background 741
II Foundations and nonprofit associations 746
A Background 746
B Introduction 747
C Management and economic activities 754
D Accounts and reports 759
E Auditing 763
F Liquidation 767
Nonprofit organizations and enterprises: the Danish foundation law as an example 770
SØREN FRIIS HANSEN
I Outline of Danish law on foundations 770
A General principles for nonprofit organizations in Danish law 770
B Foundations in Danish law 772
C Tax treatment of foundations under Danish law 777
II Corporate governance in Danish enterprise foundations 780
A The Danish management system 780
B Accounting and state supervision 782
III Financial performance of enterprises controlled by enterprise
foundations (the Studies by Thomsen et al.) 784
IV Summary and conclusions 786

CONTENTS xix

12.3	The protection of members and creditors of nonprofit organisations 789
	SUSANNE KALSS
	I Introduction 789
	II Protection of creditors 791
	A General 791
	B Limitation of activities of nonprofit organisations, in particular associations 792
	C Minimum capital requirements – principle of capital maintenance 798
	D Accounting, auditing, disclosure 800
	E Insolvency law 803
	F Liability of organs and members 804
	III Protection of members 806
	A Rights of voice 807
	B Right to entrance fees and membership fees 808 C Member protection under competition law 810
	C Member protection under competition law 810 IV Summary and conclusions 812
	PART V Good governance of nonprofit organizations: self-regulation, disclosure and supervision 813
13	Self-regulation
	Foundation governance in Switzerland 815
	THOMAS SPRECHER
	I From corporate governance to foundation governance 816
	A Corporate governance 816
	B Common points and differences 816
	C Foundation governance 817
	II Foundation governance in Switzerland 818
	A Basis 818
	B Self-regulation efforts 820 C The Swiss NPO Code 823
	D The Swiss Foundation Code 825
1.4	
14 14.1	Disclosure, reporting, auditing Financial reporting by nonprofit organizations:
17.1	United States developments 829
	STANLEY SIEGEL
	I Introduction 830

XX ' CONTENTS

	A Fundamental issues concerning the character, objectives,	
	reliability and availability of nonprofit financial reporting	831
	B An overview of pre-1990 financial reporting by nonprofits	834
II	The current accounting principles governing nonprofit financial reporting – the business enterprise model extended	835
	A The FASB takes over regulation of nonbusiness financial accounting 835	
	B The present GAAP framework applicable to nonprofit 8	36
III	Financial disclosure under the federal income tax laws: Form 990 and Guidestar 842	
	A Form 990: the Internal Revenue Service administers public financial disclosure by nonprofits 842	
	B Analyzing the Form 990 disclosures: relevance, reliability and disclosure standards 843	
IV	Possible future directions – mandatory audit and public reporting, "social accounting" – costs, benefits and questions	845
	A Arguments for and against mandatory disclosure on the SEC model 845	
	B "Social accounting" for the nonprofit organization 846	
	rity Commission regulation of the charity sector in Engla Wales: the key role of charity audit regulation 849	nd
GRE	YHAM DAWES	
I	Key features of the registered charity sector in England and Wales 850	
II	How the Charity Commission monitors and regulates the sector 851	
	A 'Proportionality' and the 'risk-based' approach 851	
	B 'Cause for concern' criteria for regulatory intervention by the Commission 852	
	C The basic information return for all registered charities	853
	D Summary Information Returns (SIR) – simple basic public domain data 855	
	E Regulatory uses of charities' filed annual reports and audited accounts 856	
	F Regulatory compliance – a policy of persuasion before enforcement 857	
	G Charity inquiries summarised on the Commission's website 858	
Ш	Regulating the quality of charity audit reports 859	
	A The framework of professional audit regulation 859	

CONTENTS XXI

	В	The auditing Practices Board and its charity auditing standard (PN11) 865
	С	Auditors' 'whistle-blowing' obligations to the regulator 868
		'Non-standard' audit reports – a regulatory 'trigger' 869
		The Charity Commission's 'directions to independent examiners' 876
	F	Additional requirements for accruals accounts 877
	G	Charities subject to statutory audit 878
	Н	Special requirements for accruals accounts 879
IV		omoting best practice in charity 'governance' for f-regulation 879
	A	The problem: charity trustees are normally all or mostly non-executives (volunteers) 880
	В	The solution: delegation to agents and (for larger charities) to paid executives 880
	С	The 'voluntary' principle of charity trusteeship 881
	D	Conflict-of-interests: 'staff-trustees'; 'user-trustees' 882
	E	Trustee-appointment/removal powers 884
	F	Delegation of trustee-powers: the charity law 'duty of care' 884
	G	'Internal controls' as an aspect of governance 885
	Η	Further developments: impact of corporate and other governance codes 885
	I	Best-practice 'hallmarks' for benchmarking charities 888
		SORP-Compliance Guides for special needs 890
	K	The 'charity membership' issue 890
V	Fu	ture developments 891
		pendix: the Public Oversight Board, the Audit Inspection it and Professional Audit Regulation 892
Enfo	orc	ement by state supervision and tax authorities
The	Cł	harity Commission for England and Wales 896
		RD FRIES
		rerview 896
		igins of the Charity Commission 898
		e Charity Commission and regulation 899
		e status of the Charity Commission 900
		emposition of the Commission 901
		rategy and objectives of the Charity Commission 903
VII		nctions and powers of the Charity Commission 904
	A	Registration 904

xxii ' CONTENTS

	B Political activity and campaigning 906
	C Supervision 907
	D Support and guidance 907
	E Investigation 908
	F Limits on the powers of the Commission 908
	VIII Accountability of the Charity Commission 909
	IX Conclusion 910
	X Annex – Scotland and Northern Ireland 912
15.2	Internal Revenue Service and States Revenue Department
	oversight of nonprofit organizations in the United States 914
	JOHN D. COLOMBO
	I Background 915
	II Federal procedural oversight 916
	A Inception 916
	B Lifetime 917
	C End of life 920
	III Federal substantive issues 920
	A Charitable purpose 920
	B Limitations on exempt status 921
	C Special rules applicable to private foundations 929
	IV State revenue department procedural oversight 930
	V State revenue department substantive issues 931
	VI Overlap between tax oversight and state attorney general oversight 932
	VII Future policy questions 934
	A A central organizing principle? 934
	B Commercial activities and exemption 936
	C The role of disclosure and Form 990 937
	D The general role of tax authorities in charitable oversight 938
15.3	Tax law as an instrument to strengthen the corporate governance o
	the nonprofit sector 940
	THOMAS VON HIPPEL AND W. RAINER WALZ
	I Introduction: Tax cobbler, stick to your last 941
	II Tax review 941
	A Procedure of tax review 941
	B Issues of tax review 942
	III The impact of tax law concepts on corporate governance issues 943
	IV Corporate government policy via tax law 944
	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·

CONTENTS XXIII

A Foreign experiences with tax law 944
B The slow ways of civil law reform in Germany 944
C Justifying tax law as a useful policy tool 946
D Practical evidence of reform efficiency 948
VI Identifying useful tax law concepts 948
A Current German tax law 949
B Reform suggestions 951

Index 956