Rationality and Explanation in Economics

Maurice Lagueux
Contents

Preface and acknowledgements xvi

Introduction 1

What do rationality and the rationality principle mean? 2
Is the rationality principle a predicament for economics? 5
Why economic rationality is necessarily instrumental after all 7
Explanations and laws in economics 15
What about explanations in economics? 21
The content of the book 25

PART I
Rationality in the history of economic thought 29

1 Rationality in economics before the Second World War 31

The rationality principle in classical economics 32
Modelling rationality in early marginalism 37
Rationality under the rug of maximization 44

2 The hardly consistent story of rationality-consistency 48

Rationality or consistency 48
Economists and changing tastes 51
Rationality and changing tastes 56
Rationality under experimental scrutiny 61
PART II
Objections to the notion of minimal rationality 69

3  Can methodological individualism survive?
   Are Marx and Keynes holists or individualists?  73
   Methodological individualism is an anti-constructivist methodology 76
   Methodological individualism is an anti-reductionist methodology 77
   Can methodological individualism survive the fragility of the Self?  80
   The proliferation of selves in economics  84
   A more radical challenge to methodological individualism  87

4  Is still some room left for irrationality?
   Can any action whatsoever be rational?  92
   Ulysses and Horatius  94
   Inverting entomology's lessons and indulging in a pleasant activity 97
   But irrationality exists!  99
   Karl Popper and the rationality principle 103
   The meaning of rationality: Popper versus Mises 105
   The role of a minimal rationality principle 107

5  Minimal and maximal rationality: loosely defined concepts?
   An argument in favour of the idealization of rationality 111
   But when is rationality maximal?  113
   Idealized agency and rationality-maximization 115
   Idealized agency and rationality-consistency 118
   The 'moderately' rational agents of economic models 121

PART III
But is rationality really necessary in economics?  127

6  Why unrealism of assumptions remains a predicament
   A controversial thesis 131
   Three examples too quickly celebrated 135
   Was Friedman an instrumentalist?  143
   What should we conclude?  149
## Contents

### 7 Explaining in the absence of rationality

- *An atypical debate quickly aborted* 153
- *Can Becker's 'survival argument' survive?* 155
- *The real debate: rationality versus mechanism* 159
- *Why this charge against rationality?* 164
- *Intentional states and intentional stance* 168
- *A methodological divide* 175

### PART IV

#### Regarding economic explanations

### 8 Rationality and natural selection in economics

- *A highly contested while influential argument* 179
- *Invisible hand and natural selection* 185
- *Various types of selection* 187
- *Billiards experts and sunbathing leaves* 191
- *Incompatible modes of explanation?* 195

### 9 Theories of explanation applied to economics

- *Explanations in economics and explanations in physics* 200
- *Hempel's unified theory of explanation* 202
- *The role of rational explanations in social sciences* 205
- *Why rational explanations might qualify as 'scientific' explanations* 207
- *Hempel's theory challenged by Salmon: relevance versus expectation* 210
- *The role of causality* 217
- *Van Fraassen's pragmatic theory of explanation* 220
- *Solutions and objections* 225
- *Causality versus context-dependence* 232

### Epilogue

- *Theses summarily recapitulated* 235
- *Three kinds of contributions typical of contemporary economics* 237
- *Economics, rationality and rational explanations* 244

### Notes 246

### References 256

### Index 267