

Rationality and Explanation in Economics

Maurice Lagueux

Contents

<i>Preface and acknowledgements</i>	xviii
Introduction	1
<i>What do rationality and the rationality principle mean?</i>	2
<i>Is the rationality principle a predicament for economics?</i>	5
<i>Why economic rationality is necessarily instrumental after all</i>	7
<i>Explanations and laws in economics</i>	15
<i>What about explanations in economics?</i>	21
<i>The content of the book</i>	25
PART I	
Rationality in the history of economic thought	29
1 Rationality in economics before the Second World War	31
<i>The rationality principle in classical economics</i>	32
<i>Modelling rationality in early marginalism</i>	37
<i>Rationality under the rug of maximization</i>	44
2 The hardly consistent story of rationality-consistency	48
<i>Rationality or consistency</i>	48
<i>Economists and changing tastes</i>	51
<i>Rationality and changing tastes</i>	56
<i>Rationality under experimental scrutiny</i>	61

PART II

Objections to the notion of minimal rationality 69

3 Can methodological individualism survive? 71

Are Marx and Keynes holists or individualists? 73

Methodological individualism is an anti-constructivist methodology 76

Methodological individualism is an anti-reductionist methodology 77

Can methodological individualism survive the fragility of the Self? 80

The proliferation of selves in economics 84

A more radical challenge to methodological individualism 87

4 Is still some room left for irrationality? 92

Can any action whatsoever be rational? 92

Ulysses and Horatius 94

Inverting entomology's lessons and indulging in a pleasant activity 97

But irrationality exists! 99

Karl Popper and the rationality principle 103

The meaning of rationality: Popper versus Mises 105

The role of a minimal rationality principle 107

5 Minimal and maximal rationality: loosely defined concepts? 110

An argument in favour of the idealization of rationality 111

But when is rationality maximal? 113

Idealized agency and rationality-maximization 115

Idealized agency and rationality-consistency 118

The 'moderately' rational agents of economic models 121

PART III

But is rationality really necessary in economics? 127

6 Why unrealism of assumptions remains a predicament 129

A controversial thesis 131

Three examples too quickly celebrated 135

Was Friedman an instrumentalist? 143

What should we conclude? 149

7	Explaining in the absence of rationality	152
	<i>An atypical debate quickly aborted</i>	<i>153</i>
	<i>Can Becker's 'survival argument' survive?</i>	<i>155</i>
	<i>The real debate: rationality versus mechanism</i>	<i>159</i>
	<i>Why this charge against rationality?</i>	<i>164</i>
	<i>Intentional states and intentional stance</i>	<i>168</i>
	<i>A methodological divide</i>	<i>175</i>
PART IV		
	Regarding economic explanations	177
8	Rationality and natural selection in economics	179
	<i>A highly contested while influential argument</i>	<i>179</i>
	<i>Invisible hand and natural selection</i>	<i>185</i>
	<i>Various types of selection</i>	<i>187</i>
	<i>Billiards experts and sunbathing leaves</i>	<i>191</i>
	<i>Incompatible modes of explanation?</i>	<i>195</i>
9	Theories of explanation applied to economics	200
	<i>Explanations in economics and explanations in physics</i>	<i>200</i>
	<i>Hempel's unified theory of explanation</i>	<i>202</i>
	<i>The role of rational explanations in social sciences</i>	<i>205</i>
	<i>Why rational explanations might qualify as 'scientific' explanations</i>	<i>207</i>
	<i>Hempel's theory challenged by Salmon: relevance versus expectation</i>	<i>210</i>
	<i>The role of causality</i>	<i>217</i>
	<i>Van Fraassen's pragmatic theory of explanation</i>	<i>220</i>
	<i>Solutions and objections</i>	<i>225</i>
	<i>Causality versus context-dependence</i>	<i>232</i>
	Epilogue	235
	<i>Theses summarily recapitulated</i>	<i>235</i>
	<i>Three kinds of contributions typical of contemporary economics</i>	<i>237</i>
	<i>Economics, rationality and rational explanations</i>	<i>244</i>
	<i>Notes</i>	<i>246</i>
	<i>References</i>	<i>256</i>
	<i>Index</i>	<i>267</i>