Land Reform in Developing Countries
Property rights and property wrongs

Michael Lipton
Introducing Land Reform

(a) Why land reform matters  1
(b) Structure of the book: land reform goals, efficiency, types - and death?  5
(c) Land reform: past and future  8

1 Goals  11

   (i) Goals, intermediate aims, groups, aims and programmes  12
   (ii) Goals, power, options, procedures: outsiders, interested parties, governments  13
(b) The main goal - reducing poverty and gross inequality: links to liberty  16
   (i) Specific forms of poverty and inequality  16
   (ii) Overall land-based poverty and inequality  21
   (iii) Incumbents' legitimacy or beneficiaries' equal opportunity: property rights and property wrongs  26
   (iv) Types of equalisation goal in land reform: equality versus poverty reduction?  33
   (v) Land reform and 'rural tyrants': the crucial links connecting equality, inclusion and liberty  35
   (vi) Politics and distributive goals of land reform  37
   (vii) The snake in the grass  38

(c) Other relevant 'objective' goals  40
   (i) Output, efficiency and growth  40
   (ii) Environment, sustainability and land reform  40
   (iii) Stability  49
   (iv) Is a special goal for 'landless labourers' required?  52
Contents

(d) Goals of governments and donors: land reform to extract surpluses 56
(e) Goals of governments and donors: stopping revolution and keeping the peace 58
(f) Goals of beneficiaries: participation and land reform 60

2 Output, efficiency and growth goals: beyond the inverse relationship 65

(a) What the debate is about, and why it matters 65
(b) The inverse relationship in low-income countries: direct evidence 70
(c) The make-up of the IR, and the transaction-cost explanation 71
(d) Other explanations of the IR, and implications for land redistribution 75
   (i) Illusion? 75
   (ii) Unit transaction cost? 76
   (iii) Activity splitting? 76
   (iv) Area per worker? 76
   (v) Dualism? 77
   (vi) Household contribution versus search cost? 77
   (vii) Selective market failures? 77
   (viii) Risk and the IR 78
(e) Does smallness drive the IR? Family, isolation, land quality, management 79
   (i) 'Family-ness', subsistence, part-time 80
   (ii) Isolation 81
   (iii) Land quality 82
   (iv) Management quality 83
   v) Summary: missing variables do not explain away the IR 84
(f) Dynamics of the IR: interactions with Green Revolution, liberalisation and development 84
   (i) 'Development' versus the IR? 84
   (ii) Technical progress, green revolutions and the IR 85
   (iii) Liberalisation, globalisation and new market structures: impact on the IR 87
(g) 'If there's an IR, why aren't all farms small'? Chicago and Converse Chicago 91
(h) An aggregate IR? Land, overall inequality, non-farmers, economic performance 102
   (i) An macro-IR for farm output 103
   (ii) An IR between farm size and non-farm output? 105
   (iii) Farmland inequality and economic growth: a dynamic aggregate IR? 106
(iv) Can we trust the macro-IR? Possible link-breakers: surplus and stability 107

(i) If all these IRs are genuine, so what? 110

(j) Farm size, science and IRs: small farms or oilisation of agricultural development? 112

(i) The slowing Green Revolution and the distribution-growth goals of land reformers - Asia 114

(ii) Science, land reform and farm size in non-GR areas: oilisation? 117

(iii) Farm science, land reform and new growth needs 118

3 Land reforms: the types, and the classic paradigm 124

(a) Types of institutional environment and types of land reform 124

(i) Institutional environments 124

(ii) Types of proposed land reform and their environments 126

(b) Classic land reform ceilings, floors, distribution, and the Land Authority model 127

(i) Classic land reform: the paradigm of land reform 127

(ii) The Land Authority: top-down, here-there, participation and decentralisation 128

(iii) Compensation and repayment rules 129

(iv) Relation between compensation, reform cost, and level of the ceiling 129

(v) Levels and types of ceilings and floors 131

(vi) Ceilings and floors - levels, types, feasibility and justice: a Rajasthan example 135

(vii) Procedure in classic reform: big problems, big impact, incentive-compatibility 145

(viii) Critiques: does classic land reform still meet the definition? 147

4 Tenurial options: tenancy reform, titling, patrialisation 150

(a) Tenurialism: tenancy, title, patrialise, collectivise, decollectivise - reform or deform? 150

(b) Tenancy, tenancy regulation, land reform 151

(i) The reversing consensus 152

(ii) Types of tenancy, restrictions, effects 152

(iii) Tenancy reduction laws 153

(iv) Tenancy rebalancing laws 154

(v) Tenancy registration laws 158

(vi) Sharecropping: three underlying issues 159

(c) Titling private farmland rights, and other ways to increase land rights security 169
(i) Measures to formalise or individualise claims on farmland in common tenure 171
(ii) Titling in transition from state and collective farms via household responsibility to freehold 176
(iii) Private land systems: from informal to formal private rental 179
(iv) Does private land title after ceilings reforms enforce them or reverse them? 179
(v) Formalising and enforcing land dispensations after war or civil conflict 179

(d) Patrialisation of land 180

5 The terrible detour: collectivisation, decollectivisation 190

(a) Collectivisation: collective, State, and induced joint farming 190
(b) Decollectivisation: the Great Reversion from farm collectivism 203
(i) Processes: decollectivisation, privatisation, liberalisation, positive enablement 203
(ii) Aspects of reversion, types of reverting country 204
(iii) Types of national experience of reversion 206
(iv) Overarching issues 212

6 Alternatives, complements, diversions, 'new wave land reform' 237

(a) Consolidation 237
(b) Settlement schemes 244
(c) Tax reform and progressive land taxes 248
(i) Context 248
(ii) Progressive land tax 249
(iii) Taxing idle land 251
(iv) Tax rules and land transactions 251
(v) Tax reform and land reform 252
(d) Land reform: other paths and other substitutes? 253
(i) Removing distortions 253
(ii) Credit access 254
(iii) Growth and rural development: 'the real land reform'? 254
(iv) Agrotechnical progress 255
(v) Development, transition and land reform 256
(e) Sheep, ceremonies and arsenic: 'new wave'land reform 258
(i) Defining new-wave reform: it really land reform? 259
(ii) How does new-wave reform relate to classic land reform? 261
(iii) Sheep and arsenic: rewards and last resorts 267

Appendix: Supply-led versus demand-led NWLR - the role of N-land 269
7 The alleged death of land reform

(a) The gravediggers' case: land reform was always dead, or is dying now 274
   (i) Has not much land reform happened? Has it stopped happening? 274
   (ii) Is land reform dead or dying in Latin America? 275
   (iii) The life of land reform in transition economies 281
   (iv) The life of land reform in other developing countries 283
   (v) The life of land reform 296
(b) The opponents' case: land reform, even if not dead, ought to be 297
   (i) Why might land reform be a bad thing? 297
   (ii) Is access to land rights less unequal than it seems? 298
   (iii) Is land reform dying as urbanisation reduces priority for addressing farmland inequality? 310
   (iv) Does non-farm income reduce the poor's need for land rights and land reform? 312
   (v) Shifts from farming to farm labour, and the employment base for land reform choices 312
   (vi) Is land reform dead because it has failed the poor? 316
   (vii) Does farm science drive out the need for land reform? 317
   (viii) Is land reform 'dead to debate'? A: Normative discussion pointless as land reform 'endogenous'? 318
   (ix) Is land reform 'dead to debate'? B: Normative discussion pointless as land reform non-domestic? 320
   (x) The closing words 322

Appendix: Defining land reform 323

(a) Describing, prescribing, or agreeing about aims? 323
(b) Land reform in the context of changing meanings of 'reform' 325
   (i) Proto-reforms, redistributive reforms and market reforms 325
   (ii) Can one definition accommodate proto-, redistributive and market reforms? 326
(c) The need to define land reform narrowly: DDATYCDE 327
(d) The preferred definition 328

Glossary • 331
Notes ' 333
References 390
• Index 427