WHY PLANNING DOES NOT WORK?

Land-Use Planning and Residents’ Rights in Tanzania

Mkuki na Nyota Publishers
P. O. Box 4246
Dar es Salaam
www.mkukinanyota.com
## Contents

**Preface**  
List of Figures  
List of Plates  

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td><strong>The Moshi Master Plan</strong></td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Urban and Regional Development Strategy in the 1970s</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Preparation of the Master Plan</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Presentation of the Draft Plan and the Actors</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Assumptions, Objectives and Policies</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Approval of the Plan and Early Doubts on Its Efficacy</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Summary</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td><strong>Adoption of the Plan</strong></td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Expansion of the Town Administrative Boundary</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Protests by the Excluded Stakeholders</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The First Major Drawback</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Summary</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td><strong>For the Sake of a Good Plan</strong></td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Msaranga Settlement</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Residents’ Meaning of Land</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Preparation of the Plan</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Survey of Plots</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Efforts to Discontinue Survey of Plots</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Summary</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td><strong>Protests against the “Good Plan”</strong></td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Establishment of Residents’ Committee</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Seeking Legal Advice</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Political-Administrative Persuasion 86
Summary 94

Chapter 6 The Council is Charged with Trespass 95
The Complaint 96
Hearing and Ruling of the Application for Court Injunction 101
Summary 106

Chapter 7 Suppression of Conflicts 109
Impeachment of the Msaranga Chairman 109
A New Strategy to Facilitate the Stalled Plots Survey 112
Banned from Leadership for Sixty Months 113
Help Is Sought from the President 117
Hearing of the Main Legal Suit against the Council 120
Adding Salt to a Wound: Valuation for Property Tax 123
Quest for Survey Permission 126
Departure of the Plaintiff's Counsel 128
Summary 130

Chapter 8 Retreat to the Lawful Planning Area 133
Attempt to Regularize Miembeni and Mji Mpya Settlements 133
Response to Chaos Caused by Creation of Plots 142
Summary 146

Chapter 9 A Strategy to Safeguard Land Rights 151
Longuo Settlement 152
Invitation to Planners 160
The Councilor's First Agenda 167
Planning without Planners 169
Summary 175

Chapter 10 The Planners' Response 177
Planning without Residents 177
Approval of the Planners' Plan 185
The "Cynic Planner" 192
Summary 197

Chapter 11 Rationalization of Change of Use 201
Moves to Expropriate Land 201
Expropriation of Land for a Psychiatric Institution 203
The Villagers 'Eye' the Land 205
Custodians Surrender the Land to Themselves 206
Objection, Counter-Objection and Lobbying 210
Ratification of the Expropriation Plan 215
Summary 218

Chapter 12 Sharing Expropriated Land 221
Attempt to Protect Public Interest 221
The Winner Takes All: Allocation of Plots before Plan Approval 225
"The Little Child": "Vigogo Wapora Ardhi ya Vichaa" 229
Re-writing History: It Was Zoned for a Regional Hospital 231
Summary 233

Chapter 13 In the Name of Employment Creation 237
Revocation of Land Rights of a Public Institution 238
Ratification of the Change of Use and Reallocation 240
Objection by the First Holder 243
The Planner in a Dilemma 248
Approval of the Change of Use 249
Summary 250

Chapter 14 Guilty of Illegal Practice 253
Changed Political Context 253
Eight Years Later: The Suit Was Wrongly Filed in the High Court 257
Agreeing on the Issue to Be Determined 261
Was the Boundary Expansion Lawful or Unlawful? 265
Was the Master Plan Lawful or Unlawful? 269
Planners Denounce the Master Planning Approach 270
Summary 272

Chapter 15 Making Planning Work 275
The Sustainable Cities Programme 276
The Sustainable Moshi Programme 279
Improving Information 282
Prioritization of Issues, Negotiation of Strategies, Formulation and Implementation of Action Plans 283
Summary 288

Chapter 16 Exclusion, Insensitivity to Land Rights and Land Value as Sources of Ineffectiveness of Planning 291
Planning as a Platform for Power Struggles Over the Disregarded Land Value 294
Defective Land Policy and Legislation as the Context for Insensitive Planning 301
Exclusion of the Residents in Disregard of the Law 306
Rational Comprehensive and Technocratic Planning Model 309
Strong Civil Society as a Pillar of Democracy 313

Notes and References 317