Clearing Services for Global Markets

A Framework for the Future Development of the Clearing Industry

Tina P. Hasenpusch
# Table of contents

*List of figures*  
*List of abbreviations*  
*Acknowledgements*  
*Foreword*

## 1 Introduction
1.1 Problem definition  
1.2 Literature and research gap  
1.3 Purpose of study  
1.4 Focus area of research  
1.5 Structure of study

## 2 Setting the stage – definitions and industry setting
2.1 Definition of clearing  
2.1.1 Process view  
2.1.2 Functional view  
2.1.2.1 Basic clearing services  
2.1.2.1.1 Trade confirmation  
2.1.2.1.2 Transaction/position management  
2.1.2.1.3 Delivery management  
2.1.2.2 Value-added clearing services  
2.1.2.2.1 Unique CCP services  
2.1.2.2.1.1 Novation  
2.1.2.2.1.2 Netting  
2.1.2.2.1.3 Risk management  
2.1.2.2.2 Collateral management  
2.1.2.2.3 Cash management  
2.1.2.3 Complementary clearing services  
2.1.3 Structural view  
2.1.3.1 Alternative execution venues/exchanges as clearing service providers
## Table of contents

2.1.3.2 CSDs and ICSDs as clearing service providers 36  
2.1.3.3 CCPs as clearing service providers 37  
2.1.3.4 Banks/brokers as clearing service providers 38  
2.1.4 Institutional view 39  
2.2 Value-added of CCP clearing 41  
2.2.1 Microeconomic view 41  
2.2.2 Macroeconomic view 44  
2.2.2.1 Allocation of risk 45  
2.2.2.2 Allocation of capital 46  
2.2.2.3 Market liquidity 46  
2.2.3 Asset class view 47  
2.3 The Value Provision Network 50  
2.3.1 Structure of the Value Provision Network 50  
2.3.2 Clearing member types 52  
2.4 Stakeholders in clearing 57  
2.5 Current clearing industry structures 60  
2.5.1 Europe 62  
2.5.2 United States 66  
2.5.3 Comparing Europe and the United States 68  
2.6 Summary 70

### 3 Defining the core issues – efficiency and network strategies 73

3.1 Efficiency of derivatives clearing 73  
3.1.1 General efficiency criteria 74  
3.1.2 Operational efficiency and transaction cost theory 76  
3.2 Transaction costs of derivatives clearing 79  
3.2.1 Direct transaction costs 82  
3.2.1.1 Clearing house charges 84  
3.2.1.2 Service provider charges 86  
3.2.2 Indirect transaction costs 88  
3.2.2.1 Cost of capital 88  
3.2.2.2 Risk management costs 93  
3.2.2.3 Information technology costs 95  
3.2.2.4 Back-office costs 96  
3.3 Network strategies 99  
3.3.1 Classification of network strategies 100  
3.3.1.1 Cross-margining agreements 101  
3.3.1.2 Clearing links 103  
3.3.1.3 Mergers and acquisitions 110
### Table of contents

3.3.1.4 Single central counterparty 111  
3.3.2 Overview of network initiatives from 1973 to 2006 113  
3.4 Summary 117  

4 Collecting empirical insights – introduction to the empirical study 119  
4.1 Underlying data 119  
4.2 Method and process of data collection 124  
4.3 Structure of empirical study 126  
4.4 Data treatment and interpretation 128  
4.5 Quality of expert inquiry 130  
4.6 Summary on purpose and use of the empirical insights 131  

5 Analysing costs of derivatives clearing – transaction cost studies 133  
5.1 Findings from empirical study 134  
5.1.1 Relevance of clearing costs to clearing members 135  
5.1.1.1 Cost awareness 136  
5.1.1.2 Monitoring of all-in costs 139  
5.1.1.3 Employment of a cost management system 140  
5.1.1.4 Ability to assess relevance of cost categories 140  
5.1.2 Direct versus indirect clearing costs 141  
5.1.2.1 Clearing members’ view 142  
5.1.2.2 Other interviewee groups’ views 145  
5.1.2.3 Conclusions from Figure 5.4 145  
5.1.3 Clearing members’ core cost drivers 145  
5.1.4 Cost categories revised 150  
5.1.4.1 Direct costs 150  
5.1.4.2 Cost of capital 151  
5.1.4.3 Risk management costs 153  
5.1.4.4 Information technology costs 154  
5.1.4.5 Back-office costs 156  
5.2 Transaction cost analyses 156  
5.2.1 Clearing house fees 157  
5.2.2 Clearing houses’ volume discount schemes 164  
5.2.3 Total European clearing industry costs in 2005 167  
5.2.4 Clearing members’ average direct and indirect costs 173  
5.2.5 Clearing members’ unit costs 175  
5.2.6 Derivatives clearing versus other market infrastructure costs 177  
5.2.7 Cost reduction scenarios for clearing members 180  
5.2.8 Non-clearing members’ perspectives 185
Table of contents

5.2.9 Cost reduction scenarios for non-clearing members 186
5.3 Summary of findings 190
5.3.1 Findings from empirical study 190
5.3.2 Transaction cost analyses – clearing members 191
5.3.3 Transaction cost analyses – non-clearing members 193

6 Exploring theoretical basics – scale effects in clearing 195
6.1 Demand-side scale effects 195
6.1.1 Network effects 197
6.1.1.1 First level (CCP level) network effects 202
6.1.1.1.1 First level network effects: product layer 202
6.1.1.2 First level network effects: system layer 207
6.1.1.2.1 Second level (GCM level) network effects 210
6.1.1.2.2 Second level network effects: product layer 210
6.1.1.2.3 Second level network effects: system layer 211
6.1.1.3 Interrelation between CCP and GCM level network effects 212
6.1.1.4 Spill-over effects of CCP and GCM level network effects 214
6.1.2 Network economic particularities 216
6.1.2.1 Compatibility 216
6.1.2.2 Installed base 218
6.1.2.3 Starting problem 218
6.1.2.4 Innovative ability and lock-in 219
6.2 Supply-side scale effects 220
6.2.1 Economies of scale 223
6.2.2 Economies of scope 226
6.2.3 Clearing houses’ cost structures 228
6.2.4 Cost implications of scale and scope enlargements 231
6.2.5 Preliminary conclusions 234
6.3 Summary of findings 235
6.3.1 Demand-side scale effects 235
6.3.2 Supply-side scale effects 237

7 What theory reveals – framework for efficiency analysis of network strategies 239
7.1 Scale Impact Matrix 242
7.1.1 Analysis of network strategies’ supply-side scale effects 243
7.1.2 Analysis of network strategies’ demand-side scale effects 246
7.1.2.1 Impact on CCP and GCM level network sizes 246
7.1.2.2 Network economic particularities 247
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>7.1.2.2.1</td>
<td>Installed base</td>
<td>248</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.1.2.2.2</td>
<td>Starting problem</td>
<td>249</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.1.2.2.3</td>
<td>Lock-in</td>
<td>251</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.1.2.2.4</td>
<td>Growth potential</td>
<td>253</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.1.2.3</td>
<td>Potential for network effects</td>
<td>254</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.1.2.4</td>
<td>Potential to internalise GCM level network effects</td>
<td>256</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.1.2.5</td>
<td>Net positive network effects</td>
<td>257</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2</td>
<td>Transaction Cost Impact Matrix and Efficiency Impact Matrix</td>
<td>258</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2.1.1</td>
<td>TCIM for regionally active clearing members</td>
<td>258</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2.1.2</td>
<td>TCIM for regionally-to-globally active clearing members</td>
<td>261</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2.1.3</td>
<td>TCIM for globally active clearing members</td>
<td>263</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2.2</td>
<td>Efficiency Impact Matrix</td>
<td>265</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.3</td>
<td>Business Model Impact Matrix (BMIM)</td>
<td>267</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.3.1</td>
<td>BMIM for regionally active clearing members</td>
<td>268</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.3.2</td>
<td>BMIM for regionally-to-globally active clearing members</td>
<td>269</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.3.3</td>
<td>BMIM for globally active clearing members</td>
<td>270</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.4</td>
<td>Preliminary findings – impact of network strategies on efficiency</td>
<td>271</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.4.1</td>
<td>Scale Impact Matrix</td>
<td>276</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.4.2</td>
<td>Transaction Cost Impact Matrix</td>
<td>276</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.4.3</td>
<td>Efficiency Impact Matrix</td>
<td>277</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.4.4</td>
<td>Business Model Impact Matrix</td>
<td>278</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.4.5</td>
<td>Summary of impact</td>
<td>279</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

8 Checking theory against reality – case studies of network strategies | 285 |
<p>| 8.1 | The clearing link study | 286 |
| 8.1.1 | Findings from the empirical study | 287 |
| 8.1.1.1 | Cross-margining agreements: general benefits and constraints | 287 |
| 8.1.1.2 | Clearing links: general benefits and constraints | 291 |
| 8.1.1.3 | Suitability of clearing links to integrate European clearing | 296 |
| 8.1.2 | Case study: Eurex Clearing and The Clearing Corporation | 300 |
| 8.1.2.1 | Profiles of the partnering clearing houses | 301 |
| 8.1.2.1.1 | Eurex Clearing | 301 |
| 8.1.2.1.2 | The Clearing Corporation | 303 |
| 8.1.2.2 | Background and objectives of the initiative | 306 |
| 8.1.2.3 | Concept and structure of the initiative | 310 |
| 8.1.2.4 | Status of the initiative | 312 |
| Part II: Analysis | 313 |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8.1.2.5 Interviewees' assessment of the case study</td>
<td>313</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.1.2.6 Scale Impact Matrix</td>
<td>315</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.1.2.6.1 Analysis of supply-side scale effects</td>
<td>316</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.1.2.6.2 Analysis of demand-side scale effects</td>
<td>319</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.1.2.6.2.1 Impact on network sizes</td>
<td>320</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.1.2.6.2.2 Network economic particularities</td>
<td>323</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.1.2.6.2.3 Network effects</td>
<td>325</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.1.2.6.2.4 Internalisation of GCM level network effects</td>
<td>327</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.1.2.6.2.5 Net positive network effects</td>
<td>328</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.1.2.6.3 Overview Scale Impact Matrix</td>
<td>328</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.1.2.7 Transaction Cost Impact Matrix and Efficiency Impact Matrix</td>
<td>330</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.1.2.7.1 TCIM for regionally active clearing members</td>
<td>331</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.1.2.7.2 TCIM for regionally-to-globally active clearing members</td>
<td>332</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.1.2.7.3 TCIM for globally active clearing members</td>
<td>334</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.1.2.7.4 Efficiency Impact Matrix</td>
<td>336</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.1.2.8 Business Model Impact Matrix</td>
<td>337</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.1.2.8.1 BMIM for regionally active clearing members</td>
<td>337</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.1.2.8.2 BMIM for regionally-to-globally active clearing members</td>
<td>338</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.1.2.8.3 BMIM for globally active clearing members</td>
<td>340</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.1.3 Summary of findings – impact of clearing links on efficiency</td>
<td>342</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.1.3.1 Scale Impact Matrix</td>
<td>343</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.1.3.2 Transaction Cost Impact Matrix</td>
<td>344</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.1.3.3 Efficiency Impact Matrix</td>
<td>344</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.1.3.4 Business Model Impact Matrix</td>
<td>344</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.2 The merger study</td>
<td>345</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.2.1 Case study: the London Clearing House and Clearnet</td>
<td>346</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part I: Introduction</td>
<td>347</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.2.1.1 Profile of the partnering clearing houses</td>
<td>347</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.2.1.1.1 The London Clearing House</td>
<td>347</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.2.1.1.2 Clearnet</td>
<td>349</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.2.1.2 Background and objectives of the initiative</td>
<td>351</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.2.1.3 Concept and structure of the initiative</td>
<td>354</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.2.1.4 Status of the initiative</td>
<td>359</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part II: Analysis</td>
<td>362</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.2.1.5 Interviewees' assessment of the case study</td>
<td>362</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.2.2 Summary of findings – impact of mergers and acquisitions on efficiency</td>
<td>370</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.2.2.1 Scale Impact Matrix – supply-side scale effects</td>
<td>370</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.2.2.2 Scale Impact Matrix – demand-side scale effects</td>
<td>371</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
8.2.2.3 Transaction Cost Impact Matrix 372
8.2.2.4 Efficiency Impact Matrix 373
8.2.2.5 Business Model Impact Matrix 373
8.3 The single central counterparty study 375
   Part I: Introduction 375
   Part II: Analysis 377
8.3.1 Background and objectives of the initiative 375
8.3.2 Findings from the empirical study 377
   8.3.2.1 Single European CCP: potential benefits and constraints 378
8.3.2.2 Suitability of a single CCP to integrate European clearing 383
8.3.3 Summary of findings — impact of a single CCP on efficiency 386
   8.3.3.1 Scale Impact Matrix — supply-side scale effects 386
   8.3.3.2 Scale Impact Matrix — demand-side scale effects 387
   8.3.3.3 Transaction Cost Impact Matrix 387
   8.3.3.4 Efficiency Impact Matrix 388
   8.3.3.5 Business Model Impact Matrix 388
8.4 Final assessment — impact of network strategies on efficiency 389
   8.4.1 Clearing links 389
   8.4.2 Mergers and acquisitions 390
   8.4.3 Single CCP 391

9 Quantifying the efficiency impact — European network strategies 393
9.1 Total European industry costs 393
   9.1.1 Efficiency impact of clearing links 394
   9.1.2 Efficiency impact of a single CCP 395
9.2 European clearing members’ average costs 398
   9.2.1 Efficiency impact of clearing links 399
   9.2.2 Efficiency impact of a single CCP 401
9.3 Summary 403
   9.3.1 Total European industry costs 403
   9.3.2 European clearing members’ average costs 404

10 Introducing the future network economy — development of the clearing industry 406
10.1 Future development of the European clearing industry 406
   10.1.1 Recommendation for European derivatives clearing 407
   10.1.2 Application of findings to cash equities clearing 413
   10.1.3 Competitive dynamics in the European clearing industry 414
   10.1.4 Reconcilability of findings with the Code of Conduct 416
### Table of contents

10.1.5 Who should link to whom 417
10.1.5.1 Zero concentration 419
10.1.5.2 Zone concentration 419
10.1.5.3 Lane concentration 419
10.1.6 Structural changes in the Value Provision Network 420
10.2 European clearing in a global context 423
10.3 Summary 424
10.3.1 Future development of the European clearing industry 424
10.3.2 European clearing in a global context 427

11 Summary, discussion and recommendations for future research 428
11.1 Summary of research results 428
11.1.1 Chapter 2 – Setting the stage – definitions and industry setting 428
11.1.2 Chapter 3 – Defining the core issues – efficiency and network strategies 429
11.1.3 Chapter 4 – Collecting empirical insights – introduction to the empirical study 430
11.1.4 Chapter 5 – Analysing costs of derivatives clearing – transaction cost studies 430
11.1.5 Chapter 6 – Exploring theoretical basics – scale effects in clearing 431
11.1.6 Chapter 7 – What theory reveals – framework for efficiency analysis of network strategies 432
11.1.7 Chapter 8 – Checking theory against reality – case studies of network strategies 433
11.1.8 Chapter 9 – Quantifying the efficiency impact – European network strategies 434
11.1.9 Chapter 10 – Introducing the future network economy – development of the clearing industry 435
11.2 Discussion and recommendations for future research 436

Appendices 441
Bibliography 500
Index 527