Evidence, Proof, and Fact-Finding in WTO Dispute Settlement

MICHELLE T. GRANDO

OXFORD UNIVERSITY PRESS
Contents—Summary

Table of Cases xvii
List of Abbreviations xxxiii

Introduction 1
1. Optimizing the Process of Fact-Finding 9
2. Basic Concepts 68
3. Functioning of the Burden of Proof 103
4. The Allocation of the Burden of Proof 151
5. The Main Actors in the Process of Fact-Finding and the Development of the Factual Record 231

Conclusion 354
Appendix: Understanding on Rules and Procedures Governing the Settlement of Disputes 365

Bibliography 387
Index 407
Contents

Table of Cases xvii
List of Abbreviations xxxiii

Introduction 1
I. Background 1
II. Outline of the Book 4

1 Optimizing the Process of Fact-Finding 9
Introduction 9
I. Legal Adjudication and the Process of Fact-Finding 10
A. The goals of legal adjudication 10
B. Optimization of goals 17
C. Managing uncertainty and the risk of error 19
II. The WTO Dispute Settlement System 21
A. A system of legal adjudication 21
B. The goals/values of the system 28
C. The institutional and procedural framework 42
Concluding Remarks 66

2 Basic Concepts 68
Introduction 68
I. The Concept of the Burden of Proof 70
A. General scope 70
B. Differences between the common law and the civil law systems 74
C. Proceedings before international courts and tribunals 80
D. Does the burden of proof shift? 83
II. Standard of Proof 86
A. General scope 86
B. Differences between common law and civil law systems 87
C. Proceedings before international courts and tribunals 89
III. Presumptions 93
A. General scope 93
B. International law including WTO law 96
Concluding Remarks 101

3 Functioning of the Burden of Proof 103
Introduction 103
I. The ‘Prima Facie Case’ or ‘Presumption’ Approach 105
## Contents

A. Exploring the meaning of 'prima facie case' 105  
B. The uses of a 'prima facie case' in WTO dispute settlement 108  
C. Concluding remarks on the meaning of 'prima facie case' 132  

II. The 'holistic' or 'weighing of all evidence' approach 132  
A. What is the holistic approach? 132  
B. The favoured approach for WTO dispute settlement 135  

III. The Standard of Proof for WTO Dispute Settlement 137  
A. The importance of setting a standard of proof 137  
B. Considerations when setting the standard of proof 138  
C. Is the prima facie case standard ever optimal? 142  

Concluding Remarks 149  

4 The Allocation of the Burden of Proof 151  

Introduction 151  

I. The Current Status of the WTO Rules 152  
A. The problem at issue 152  
B. The WTO jurisprudence 155  

II. Critique of the WTO Jurisprudence 168  
A. Have panels and the Appellate Body been consistent? 168  
B. Are the criteria relied upon effective? 179  

III. What are the Alternatives? 190  
A. A look at domestic and international law 190  
B. Can law and economics analysis help? 199  
C. What are the options for the WTO dispute settlement system? 202  
D. India—Additional Import Duties: a paradigm shift? 215  

IV. Allocation of the Burden of Proof in Article 21.5 of the DSU Compliance Cases 217  
A. 'Regular' Article 21.5 proceedings 218  
B. Post-suspension of concessions Article 21.5 proceedings 219  

Concluding Remarks 223  
Annex: Text of Relevant Provisions from WTO Agreements 225  

5 The Main Actors in the Process of Fact-Finding and the Development of the Factual Record 231  

Introduction 231  

I. The Panel as a Reviewer 233  
A. Trade remedies agreements 233  
B. SPS and TBT Agreements 239  
C. Final considerations 245  

II. The Panel as the Original-Trier-of-Facts 246  
A. Context: institutional and procedural framework 246  
B. The role of the disputing parties 250  
C. The role of the panel 304  

Concluding Remarks 351
Contents

Conclusion 354

The route to optimizing the process of fact-finding 354
Conceptual clarity 355
The prima facie case requirement 355
The standard of proof for WTO dispute settlement 356
Determining that the standard of proof is met 357
Allocation of the burden of proof 358
Burden of pleading 358
Avoiding decisions based on the burden of proof 359
Duty of cooperation 359
The role of the panel in promoting cooperation 360
Alternatives to managing asymmetries of information 361
Confidential information 362
Panel-controlled disclosure 363
Active panel 363
Final considerations and way forward 364

Appendix: Understanding on Rules and Procedures Governing the Settlement of Disputes 365

Bibliography 387
Index 407