TRADE DISPUTES AND THE
DISPUTE SETTLEMENT
UNDERSTANDING OF THE
WTO: AN INTERDISCIPLINARY
ASSESSMENT

Edited by
James C. Hartigan

Department of Economics, University of Oklahoma,
Norman, OK, USA
## CONTENTS

### LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### INTRODUCTION

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>xv</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### PART I: A CRITICAL DISCUSSION OF THE PROCESS OF DISPUTE RESOLUTION AND APPEAL AT THE WTO

1

### CHAPTER 1 THE WTO DISPUTE SETTLEMENT SYSTEM 1995-2006: SOME DESCRIPTIVE STATISTICS

*Henrik Horn and Petros C. Mavroidis*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 Introduction</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Who are the complainants and respondents?</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Which agreements and provisions have been invoked?</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Winners and losers of legal claims</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Where do the panelists come from, who selected them, and how many panels have they served on?</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 The duration of the process</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 Instead of conclusions</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annex: List of abbreviations of agreements</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledgements</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reference</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### CHAPTER 2 ISSUES OF FAIRNESS IN DISPUTE SETTLEMENT

*Andrew G. Brown and Robert M. Stern*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 Introduction</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Fairness in trade relations</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Interpretation and application of the WTO rules</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1 Non-discrimination, national treatment, and fair competition</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2 Contingent trade remedy measures and WTO rules</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3 National preferences and WTO rules</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Compliance with DSB rulings and recommendations</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 The use of countermeasures</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
6 Conclusions 68
Acknowledgement 70
References 71

CHAPTER 3 LICENCE TO ADJUDICATE: A CRITICAL EVALUATION OF THE WORK OF THE WTO APPELLATE BODY SO FAR 73
Petros C. Mavroidis

1 Introductory remarks 73
2 The function of WTO adjudicating bodies 74
  2.1 Agents 74
  2.2 Required to interpret ... 75
  2.3 An incomplete contract ... 75
  2.4 Which suffers from ambiguity as well ... 76
  2.5 And compelled to use yet another incomplete contract in order to complete the original incomplete contract 77
  2.6 Being a WTO judge: not an enviable position to be in 78
3 Has the AB honoured its mandate? 78
  3.1 An agent (most of the time) 78
  3.2 Has the AB produced a convincing body of case law? 81
  3.3 Consistency across cases * 82
  3.4 Less litigation in the future 85
  3.5 Reaction by principals 87
  3.6 Influence on subsequent lawmaking 87
  3.7 A partial conclusion 87
4 Some suggestions (constructing the mold) 88
  Acknowledgements 89
  References 89

CHAPTER 4 THE EVOLUTION AND UTILIZATION OF THE GATT/WTO DISPUTE SETTLEMENT MECHANISM 91
Pao-Li Chang

1 Introduction 91
2 Evolution of the GATT/WTO dispute settlement mechanism 94
3 Theoretical setup 96
4 Theoretical model and implications 100
  4.1 Panel stage 101
  4.2 Consultation stage 105
5 Conclusion 114
  Appendix 114
  References 118
PART II: POLITICS AND TRADE DISPUTES

CHAPTER 5 IMPLEMENTING THE AGREEMENT: PARTISAN POLITICS AND WTO DISPUTE SETTLEMENT

David Epstein, Sharyn O'Bailor an and Amy L. Wids ten

1 Patterns of compliance 124
2 Partisanship, negotiation, and compliance 126
3 Data and results 130
4 Case study 135
5 Conclusion 137

References 137

CHAPTER 6 DISPUTE SETTLEMENT, COMPLIANCE AND DOMESTIC POLITICS

Leslie Johns and B. Peter Rosendorff

1 Introduction 140
2 Punishment and patience in the standard PD framework 141
  2.1 Standard PD theories of international cooperation 142
  2.2 Empirical contradictions of the standard PD theory 143
3 Domestic politics: driver of compliance and enforcement? 146
  3.1 Tolerated defection and the DSU: the flexibility theory 147
  3.2 Domestic politics and punishment for trade violations 154
4 Conclusions 159

References 160

PART III: POWER AND INEQUITIES IN ACCESS TO THE DSU

CHAPTER 7 DEVELOPING COUNTRY USE OF THE WTO DISPUTE SETTLEMENT SYSTEM: WHY IT MATTERS, THE BARRIERS POSED

Gregory Shaffer

1 Introduction 167
2 The judicialization of international trade dispute settlement 168
3 Why participation in WTO dispute settlement matters: tangible, systemic, and shadow effects 171
4 Some statistics on the system's use 175
5 Why smaller developing countries do not participate 182
6 Conclusions 185

Acknowledgements 186

References 187
### CHAPTER 8 WHY ARE SO MANY WTO DISPUTES ABANDONED?

*Kara M. Reynolds*

1 Introduction
2 WTO dispute settlement procedures
3 Literature review
4 WTO disputes, 1995-2004
5 Empirical model and data
6 Results
7 Conclusions

References

---

### CHAPTER 9 THE USAGE OF THE WTO DISPUTE SETTLEMENT SYSTEM: DO POWER CONSIDERATIONS MATTER?

*Sebastian Wilckens*

1 Introduction
2 Dispute settlement as a sequential game
   2.1 Setup of the game
   2.2 Strategies and Nash equilibria
3 Payoff proxies for the binary decision model
   3.1 General setup of the probit model
   3.2 Selection of payoff proxies
   3.3 Summary of hypotheses
4 Data and estimation
   4.1 Sample selection
   4.2 Data description
   4.3 Estimation and results
   4.4 Robustness
5 Excursus: a note on Guzman and Simmons (2005)
6 Concluding remarks

Acknowledgement
Appendix
A.1 Proof of Proposition 1
A.2 Included disputes
A. 3 Construction of a statistical sample selection criterion
References
PART IV: SPECIFIC ISSUES IN DISPUTE SETTLEMENT

CHAPTER 10 AGRICULTURAL TRADE DISPUTES IN THE WTO

Tim Josling

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 Introduction</td>
<td>245</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 An overview of agricultural trade disputes under the WTO</td>
<td>246</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Market access complaints in agriculture</td>
<td>253</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1 Bananas</td>
<td>253</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2 Beef hormones</td>
<td>260</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3 EC-GIs</td>
<td>264</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Agricultural subsidy cases</td>
<td>267</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1 The Canadian dairy case</td>
<td>267</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2 The US cotton case</td>
<td>269</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3 The EC sugar case</td>
<td>271</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Conclusion</td>
<td>274</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annex</td>
<td>277</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>References</td>
<td>281</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

CHAPTER 11 WTO DISPUTE CASES RELATING TO FOOD SAFETY ISSUES

Mitsuo Matsushita

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 WTO agreements relevant to food safety issues</td>
<td>283</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1 Major WTO agreements relevant to food safety issues</td>
<td>283</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2 The GATT 1994</td>
<td>284</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3 The SPS agreement</td>
<td>286</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.4 The TBT agreement</td>
<td>286</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 WTO dispute cases relating to food safety issues</td>
<td>287</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1 The EC Hormones case</td>
<td>288</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2 The EC/GMO case</td>
<td>290</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3 The relationship between the SPS and other principles of international law in the WTO dispute settlement procedure</td>
<td>292</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4 The EC approval procedure of GMO products and Annex A(1)oftheSPS</td>
<td>294</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5 National treatment in Annex C.I (a) of the SPS</td>
<td>295</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6 Burden of proof issues in the SPS</td>
<td>296</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Concluding remarks</td>
<td>300</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER 12 TRADE DISPUTE DIVERSION: THE ECONOMICS OF CONFLICTING DISPUTE SETTLEMENT PROCEDURES BETWEEN REGIONAL TRADE AGREEMENTS AND THE WTO

1 Introduction
2 The role of the DSP in shaping trade agreements
   2.1 The procedural mechanisms
   2.2 The self-enforcement underpinnings
3 The causes and consequences of differing DSPs
   3.1 Different rules for settling disputes
   3.2 The main differences and how they matter
4 "Choice of forum" and the link to the WTO
   4.1 The model
   4.2 The solution with and without renegotiation
   4.3 The impact of choice of forum
   4.4 Some preliminary evidence and indications
5 Summary and conclusions
References

CHAPTER 13 THE ADA AND THE DSU OF THE WTO

1 Introduction
2 A model
   2.1 Stage three: dispute resolution
   2.2 Stage two: compliance with the ADA
   2.3 Stage one: negotiation of the ADA
3 Conclusion
References

PART V: COMPLIANCE, ENFORCEMENT, AND REMEDIES

CHAPTER 14 TRADE AGREEMENTS AND DISPUTE SETTLEMENT IN THE WTO SYSTEM

1 Introduction
2 The model: economics
   2.1 International trade
CHAPTER 17 ENFORCING WTO COMPLIANCE THOUGH PUBLIC OPINION AND DIRECT EFFECT: TWO NEW PROPOSALS TO ENHANCE THE COMPLIANCE PERSPECTIVES FOR LEAST DEVELOPED WTO MEMBERS

Naboth van den Broek

1 Introduction 444
2 The WTO system of compliance enforcement 445
3 Dispute settlement and compliance enforcement for the WTO's poorest members 447
4 None of the existing proposals fully remedy the situation for the world's poorest 450
5 Two additional proposals 454
  5.1 Limited direct effect 454
  5.2 The force of public opinion 457
6 Conclusion 459
References 459

CHAPTER 18 UNINTENTIONAL BREACH IN THE DSU OF THE WTO: CONSULTATION IN THE SHADOW OF REMEDIES

Indranil Chakraborty and James C. Hartigan

1 Introduction 464
2 A simple model of a treaty 468
  2.1 The timeline 469
  2.2 Payoffs and penalties 470
3 The process of dispute resolution 471
  3.1 Consultation regarding implementation of a ruling 471
  3.2 The interpretation of the DSB 476
  3.3 The request for consultations 477
4 The negotiation of commitments 478
5 Conclusions 479
Acknowledgement 480
References 480

SUBJECT INDEX 483