Beyond Open Skies
A New Regime for International Aviation

Brian F. Havel
# Table of Contents

## About the Author vii

## Foreword ix

## Preface xiii

## Acknowledgements xv

## List of Abbreviations xxix

### Chapter 1

**Introduction: Preparing for a New Era in International Aviation** 1

I  **Replacing a Flawed Regulatory System** 1

II  **The 'Chicago System' and a Proposal for its Reform** 5

A  **An Overview of the Global Air Transport Industry: Passenger/Cargo Services** 6

B  **A Synoptic View of the 'Chicago System'** 8

C  **Open Skies: Seeking Flexibility within the Chicago System** 12

III  **A Summary of Core Principles for a Second Stage Plurilateral Treaty** 17

### Chapter 2

**Prelude to Change: A Synthesis of Transatlantic Aviation Relations 1993-2008** 23

I  **Introduction: An Epistemic Community Rises** 23

II  **Rethinking Bilateralism: The Open Skies Decade 1993-2003** 25

A  **Beyond Bilateralism: The Baliles Airline Commission** 25

B  **A Bridge to Multilateralism: The Strategic Implications of U.S. Open Skies** 29
Table of Contents

C The EC Responds to Open Skies: An Incomplete First ‘Mandate’ 34
D Webs of Influence: International Organizations and Academic Commentators 40
  1 Webs of Influence I: International Nongovernmental Organizations 40
  2 Webs of Influence II: International Governmental Organizations 43
  3 Webs of Influence III: Academic Commentators 46
E Glimmerings of Multilateralism: Some-Tentative U.S. Initiatives 52

III Fixing A New Horizon for Open Skies: U.S./EC Aviation Relations After 2003 55
A The Force of EC Nondiscrimination Law: The European Court Destabilizes the Nationality Rule 57
B Managing the Fallout: The Commission Secures A Second (Double) Mandate 61

IV The Trajectory of U.S./EC Air Services Negotiations 2003-2007 67
A Toward a U.S./EC Agreement I: Political Stalemate 67
B Toward a U.S./EC Agreement II: Breaking the Impasse 71

V An Executive Briefing on the 2007 U.S./EC Air Transport Agreement 78
A The 17 Keynote Ideas of the 2007 Agreement 79
B The Second Stage Agenda and Timetable 82
  1 The Second Stage Timetable 83
  2 A Threat of EU Member State Unilateralism 84
  3 The Second Stage Agenda: Toward an OAA? 85

VI Conclusion: Visionaries, Pragmatists, and the Shaping of a Post-Chicago Global Aviation Order 93

Chapter 3
Airspace Sovereignty: The Ontology of the Chicago System of International Air Transport Regulation 97

I Introduction: The Conceptual Framework of the Chicago System 97
II Airspace Sovereignty 99
III At the Heart of the Chicago System: The Freedoms of the Air and Bilateralism 103
A The Nine Freedoms 103
B Trading the Freedoms: The Rise of Bilateralism 109
  1 Ex Post Facto Flexibility: The Moderate Liberalism of Bermuda I 111
  2 Treaty-Based Rigidity: Bermuda II 116
### Table of Contents

#### IV The Venerable Doctrine of Cabotage

- A Principle of Exclusion                         119
- Cabotage in a Multilateral Airspace Environment 122
  1 Pooling Airspaces in the EC: Can Cabotage Be Traded Away?    123
  2 Cabotage and U.S. International Aviation Policy 126
    a The Legal Foundations of U.S. Cabotage                126
    b The Durability of U.S. Cabotage Restrictions      128

#### V Sovereignty and Citizenship Purity: The Nationality Rule

- The Substantial Ownership/Effective Control-Dyad 133
- Proscribing Multinational Airlines: The Nationality Rule in Domestic Law 135
  1 Case Studies in the Nationality Rule and the Unmaking of a U.S. Government Rulemaking 138
    a Airline Citizenship: Law and Policy in the United States 138
    b DHL/ASTAR and Virgin America: Citizenship as a Competitive Weapon 143
      i DHL/ASTAR 144
      ii Virgin America 150
    c The DOT's Noble Failure: The 2005/06 Rulemaking 155
- A Future Without the Nationality Rule? 162
  1 Alliances: From Code-Sharing to Contract 162
  2 Reforming the Nationality Rule in Domestic Law 164
  3 Liberalizing the U.S. Domestic Rules on Ownership and Control 167
- Conclusion: The Superior Norm of Nationality 171

#### VI Fetishizing Sovereignty: The Public Stake in Air Transport

- Public Airlines and Public Subsidy 172
- The Retreat of the State: The Age of Deregulation 178
  1 New Models of Airline Regulation in the United States and EC 178
  2 Airline Privatization in the EU 184

#### VII The Regulatory Reflex: Computer Reservations Systems and Airport Access

- CRS: From Regulation to Deregulation in 20 Years 189
- The Competitive Quandaries of Airport Access 194

#### VIII The Late-Model Chicago System: Strategic Alliances and Code-Sharing

- Entrepreneurial Circumventions of the Nationality Rule 198
- Global Marketing Alliances 198
  1 Strategies for Alliance-Building 198
  2 KLM/Northwest and Its Progeny: The Immunity Artifice 203
C Code-Sharing as 'Pseudo-Cabotage' 208
  1 A Code-Share Taxonomy 208
  2 Does Code-Sharing Violate Cabotage? 213
  4 Code-Shares and the Consumer 220

IX MULTILATERALISM AND REGIONALISM IN THE CHICAGO SYSTEM 223

X THE CHICAGO SYSTEM ON THE CUSP OF REFORM 231

Chapter 4
Model Jurisdiction I: The United States 235
Airline Deregulation Within and Beyond a Unitary Airspace

I INTRODUCTION 235

II THE LEGAL AND HISTORICAL BACKGROUND 239
  A Prologue: An Apt Quotation 239
  B The Regulatory Era: The Kitty Hawk Irony 240
    1 CAB Route Authority: The ‘Grandfather’ Syndrome 242
    2 CAB Rate Authority: The ‘Pullman’ Effect 244
    3 CAB Antitrust Authority: Regulatory Omnipotence 246
  C Deregulation: The Intellectual Premises 248
  D Deregulation: A Political Act of Will 251
    1 CAB Route Deregulation: The Fruits of Dormancy 255
    2 CAB Fare Deregulation: Zones of Flexibility 258
    3 CAB Antitrust Deregulation: The Longest Sunset 259
    4 A Regulatory Vestige: The Essential Air Service Program 263
  E Scrambling the System: Alfred Kahn’s Regulated Deregulation 264

III EXPORTING DEREGULATION: PROBING THE LIMITS OF BILATERALISM 268
  A The Emergence of an Open Skies International Aviation Policy 268
  B The IATCA: An Ambivalent Challenge to Bilateralism 272
    1 The IATCA’s ‘Soft Law’ Approach to the Chicago System 274
    2 Protecting U.S. Carriers: The IATCA’s ‘Hard Law’ Approach 275
  C The IATCA and the Chicago System: Enduring Regulation 279
    1 International Designation: Public Franchises and Private Profits 279
    2 International Fares: Zonalism and Unilateralism 283
    3 International Antitrust Regulation: Wielding the Wand of Immunity 285
Table of Contents

**D Moving Beyond Open Skies: The Need to Reconceptualize U.S. International Aviation Strategy** 302

1 Open Skies and Retrenchment: U.S. Bilateral Relations 1978-92 302
2 U.S./Europe: A Continuing Story of Aeropolitical Discord 305
3 Resisting Open Skies: The U.S./Asia/Oceania Market 309
4 The U.S. Response: Aerodiplomacy Trumps Retaliation and Denunciation 312
5 A Reconceptualization of Open Skies – Some Preliminary Thoughts 318
   a IATCA and the 2007 U.S./EC Air Transport Agreement 322
   b The Risks of More Bilateralism 325

**IV A CRITIQUE OF U.S. FEDERAL AIRLINE DEREGULATION** 326

A Lessons from the U.S. Experience 326
B Securing Competition in a Deregulated Airline Industry 327
   1 The Structural Unpredictability of U.S. Deregulation 327
   2 An Enduring Business Model: Complex, Costly Hub-and-Spoke Networks 331
   3 CRS: Adjusting to a Post-Regulatory Environment 335
   4 Loyalty Programs and Slot/Gate Scarcity: Enduring Non-Price Entry Barriers 340
5 The Death and Life of A Merger Policy for the U.S. Airline Industry 347
   a Mergers in the Reagan Era: Laissez-Faire under CAB/DOT Review 348
   b After 1989: Stronger Surveillance by the Antitrust Division 352
   a The DOT Enters a Jurisprudential Minefield 357
   b The Rational Side of Predation 362
   c The DOT Abandons Regulatory a Priorism 365

C Portents of Reregulation: An Industry in Perpetual Transition 368
   1 The Lessons of the September 11, 2001 ‘Stabilization’ Package 368
## Table of Contents

### Chapter 5
**Model Jurisdiction II: The European Community**

*An Experiment in Multilateral Airline Liberalization*

### I Introduction: An Overview of the EU Air Transport Industry 381

#### II The Supranational Legal and Policy Foundations of EC Airline Deregulation 386

- **A General Principles of the Community Legal Order** 386
- **B The Community Institutions and EC Air Transport Liberalization** 388
  - 1 The Council of the European Union 388
  - 2 The European Commission 389
  - 3 The European Parliament 391
  - 4 The European Court of Justice 393
- **C The Legislative Foundations of the Single Aviation Market: A ‘Package’ Deal** 401
- **D The EC Treaty’s Competition Code: Still Leading from the Center** 410
  - 1 The Primary and Secondary Sources of EC Competition Law 411
    - a Regulating Private Action: Articles 81 and 82, Regulation 1 of 2003 411
    - b Applying Competition Law to the Airlines 416
    - c Merger Control in the EC 418
    - d Regulating Public Action: State Aids 422
- **E Toward Multilateralism: The EC’s External Aviation Relations** 424
  - 1 The Open Skies Rulings and the External Competence of the EC 424
  - 2 A Synthesis of the Community’s External Competence 432

### III An Appraisal of Multilateral Airline Deregulation in the EC: Guideposts for the Era Beyond Open Skies 434

- **A The Demonstration Effect of the European Experiment** 434
- **B Reprising the U.S. Experience: Protecting Competition in a Deregulated Era** 435
  - 1 Europe’s FTC: The Shifting Role of the European Commission 435
# Table of Contents

2 Two Case Studies in Supranational Trusteeship:
   The Article 82 'Dominance' Factor
   a An Early Example: British Midland v. Aer Lingus
   b Focusing on the Competitive Structure: The Travel Agency Incentives Case

3 Airline Mergers and Alliances: A New Commission Activism
   a Europe's Airline Culture: Cooperation Trumps Merger
   b Case Studies in the Commission's Scrutiny of Transatlantic Alliances
   i The Nebulous World of Transnational EU Mergers: Air France-KLM
   ii A Case Study in Community Merger Policy: The easyJet Challenge to Air France-KLM
   c Conclusion: When the Mergers Come

C Regulatory Challenges of Multilateral Airline Liberalization I: Issues Common to the U.S. Experience
   1 Computer Reservations Systems in Europe
   2 The Infrastructure Challenge
   3 Passenger Rights: Overexuberant Regulation?

D Regulatory Challenges of Multilateral Airline Liberalization II: Issues Beyond the U.S. Experience
   1 Building the Community's External Aviation Policy I: The Chicago Bilateral System After the ECJ Open Skies Rulings
   2 Building the Community's External Aviation Policy II: More Verticality and a European Common Aviation Area
   3 A Concluding Note on the Community's External Aviation Policy

E A Conceptual Conflict: The Community Licensing System and the Right of Establishment

F Dipping into the Well of Public Subsidy: The Battle Against 'State Aids'
   1 Two Flag Carriers Under Scrutiny: Olympic and Alitalia
   2 A New State Aids Challenge: Airport Subsidies
   3 Should State Aids Be a Transitional Phenomenon?

G Conclusion: Some Counterpoints to the EC Deregulation Experiment
   1 Two General Counterpoints
      a The Commission's 'Industrial Policy'
      b A Partial Deregulation of the 'Aviation' Industry
Chapter 6

Conclusion: A Proposal for a Second Stage U.S./EC Air Transport Agreement

I

INTRODUCTION: THE CHANGE IMPERATIVE

II

THE IMPERATIVES OF LIBERALIZATION AND GLOBALIZATION

A The Global Regulatory Backdrop to Airline Deregulation

B A Constitutional Symmetry: U.S./EC Airline Deregulation

III

THE FOUNDATIONS OF A NEW PLURALISTATIONAL AIRSPACE

A Introduction: The Narrowsness of Open Skies

B Visualizing a Multilateral Air Transport Regime

C GATS Gradualism: A Search for the Highest Common Denominator

1 Introduction

2 Applying the GATS Framework Principles to Global Air Transport

a The GATS Trade Principles

b Most-Favored-Nation

c National Treatment

d Market Access

3 A Critique of the GATS Approach to Multilateralism

4 Conclusion: Politics and the GATS

D A Plurilateral Reconceptualization of the U.S./EC Second Stage Negotiations

E Some Guiding Principles for the Negotiators

1 Principle 1: The End of Managed Trade

2 Principle 2: The End of Cabotage and Chicago’s Contrivance of ‘Freedoms’

3 Principle 3: A New Doctrine of ‘Regulatory’ Nationality

4 Principle 4: An End to Pricing Controls

5 Principle 5: A ‘Deep Integration’ Program of Regulatory Convergence

a Convergence in Air Transport Competition Law and Policy

i Introduction: Globalizing Trends in Competition Law Enforcement

ii A Proposal for Competition Surveillance of the Airlines

(a) Shaping a Common Body of Competition Law

(b) A Rule of Abstention for Competition Enforcement Agencies

iii Conclusion
Table of Contents

b The End of Operating Aid for Failing Carriers 562
c Resetting the Tempo of Regulation: Abstention and Convergence 564
  i A Code for Airport Constraints 566
  ii Labor Rights in a Plurilateral Setting 567
6 Principle 6: A Mandatory Supranational Dispute Settlement/Appellate Mechanism 570
  a Introduction 570
  b A Sector-Specific Supranational Tribunal 572
  c Advancing to Private Supranational Dispute Settlement 576
  d Private Supranational Dispute Settlement: A Constitutional Possibility? 578
  e Conclusion 580
7 Principle 7: Adopting the EC ‘Community Designation Clause’ for Countries outside the Second Stage Plurilateral 581

IV BEYOND OPEN SKIES: THE POLITICAL CHALLENGE OF AUTHENTIC LIBERALIZATION 583

Appendix I
Department of Transportation Statement of United States International Air Transportation Policy May 3, 1995 589

Appendix II
Model U.S. Open Skies Agreement 601

Appendix III
2007 U.S./EC Air Transport Agreement 615

Tables of Cases and Administrative Proceedings 659

Select Bibliography 669

Index 695