

930 627 350

Institutional Premises for the Stabilization and Coordination of Fiscal Policies in Emerging Countries: The Case of Mercosur

Inauguraldissertation
zur
Erlangung des Doktorgrades
der
Wirtschafts- und Sozialwissenschaftlichen Fakultät
der
Universität zu Köln

2008

vorgelegt von

Nicolaus Heinen

aus

Hachenburg

A 256149

Referent:	Professor Dr. Federico Foders
Korreferent:	Professor Dr. Ralph Andereg
Tag der Promotion:	3. Dezember 2008

I. Table of Contents

<i>Meinen lieben Eltern</i>	I
I. Table of Contents	II
II. List of Abbreviations	VI
III. List of Tables	IX
IV. List of Figures	X
V. List of Boxes	XI
1 Introduction	1
2 Fiscal Sustainability in Mercosur	8
2.1 Macroeconomic Stability: Definitions and Concepts	13
2.1.1 Monetary and Fiscal Stability: Mutual Dependencies.....	13
2.1.2 Fiscal Dominance: Dominant in Emerging Countries.....	15
2.1.3 National Debt Dynamics: The Importance of Fiscal Stabilization.....	19
2.2 Mercosur as the Object of Investigation	21
2.2.1 The History of Mercosur	21
2.2.2 Legal Framework.....	24
2.2.3 Institutions	25
2.3 Economic Conditions	31
2.3.1 The Real Side of Integration: Openness and Trade	35
2.3.2 The Monetary Side of Integration: Monetary Policies and Exchange Rate Regimes ..	38
2.3.3 Public Finances: Far from Sustainable.....	44
2.3.4 Public Debt and Deficits: Explanatory Approaches	50
2.4 Debt and Deficits: Negative Spillovers impede Regional Integration	53
2.4.1 The National Perspective: Debt Dynamics and Currency Crises	53
2.4.1.1 Currency Crises: Some Explanatory Approaches	55
2.4.1.2 Excursus: Financial Crises	64
2.4.1.3 The Brazilian Crisis in 1998/9.....	65
2.4.1.4 The Argentinian Crisis in 2001/02	70
2.4.1.5 Debt Dynamics: Two Crises in Retrospect	76
2.4.2 The Cross-national Perspective: Negative Spillovers by Contagion.....	80
2.4.2.1 Contagion via Trade and Competition	81
2.4.2.2 Contagion via Financial Markets.....	82
2.4.2.3 Contagion by Changed Perception of Investors (<i>Wake up call</i>).....	82
2.4.2.4 Contagion Dynamics: Two Crises in Retrospect.....	83
2.4.3 The Situation until Today and the Commodities Boom	87
2.5 Limiting Negative Spillovers: Cross-national Coordination Schemes	92
2.5.1 Two Game Theoretic Approaches	95
2.5.2 Cross-national Cooperation in Macroeconomic Policies: The Prisoner's Dilemma....	97
2.5.3 Cross-national Coordination of Fiscal Policies: The Coordination Game	99
2.5.4 Both Models reviewed in the Context of Mercosur	103
2.5.5 Fiscal Coordination: Potential Threats	107

2.6 Monetary and Fiscal Coordination: A Short Review of Former Initiatives.....	108
2.6.1 Excursus: Initiatives on Exchange Rate Cooperation and a Monetary Union	112
2.7 Conclusion: Need for Fiscal Coordination in Mercosur	114
3 The Economics of Fiscal Institutions.....	119
3.1 New Institutional Economics	121
3.1.1 NIE and Neoclassical Theory.....	122
3.1.2 NIE and Public-Choice Theory.....	124
3.1.3 Institutions: An Attempt of a Definition.....	125
3.1.4 Former Institutional Economic Approaches.....	127
3.1.5 Scientific Interest and Behavioral Assumptions.....	129
3.1.6 Theory of Property Rights.....	131
3.1.7 Transaction Cost Economics.....	136
3.1.8 Agency Theory.....	142
3.2 Theory of Public Finance	153
3.3 Public Choice Theory	159
3.4 The Political Economy of Fiscal Rules	170
3.4.1 Independent Fiscal Authorities – Discretion Becomes the Rule.....	178
3.5 An Institutional Approach to analyze Fiscal Structures	183
3.5.1 The Application of NIE to Fiscal Systems.....	184
3.5.2 Property Rights Structures within the Fiscal Institutional Environment.....	188
3.5.2.1 The Application: Budgetary Institutions as Bearers of Property Rights	190
3.5.3 Transaction Cost Structures of Fiscal Governance Systems.....	200
3.5.3.1 The Application: The Budgetary Process as a Governance System	202
3.5.4 Agency Problems in Resource Allocation	210
3.5.4.1 National Application: Resource Allocation in Fiscal Federalism	213
3.5.4.1.1 Role of Subnational Units in the Fiscal Game	213
3.5.4.1.2 Transfers, Subnational Borrowing and Bailouts	217
3.5.4.2 Cross-national Application: Resource Allocation in Cross-national Fiscal Coordination Schemes.....	221
3.6 Conclusion and Methodology for Chapters Four and Five	225
4 National Fiscal Systems: Institutions and Politics.....	229
4.1 Argentina	230
4.1.1 The Economics of Property Rights in the Fiscal Institutional Environment.....	230
4.1.1.1 Executive.....	231
4.1.1.2 Legislature	234
4.1.1.3 Judiciary	236
4.1.2 The Argentinian Budget Process as a Governance System.....	238
4.1.2.1 Preparation	239
4.1.2.2 Approval.....	240
4.1.2.3 Execution.....	242
4.1.2.4 Control.....	242
4.1.3 Resource Allocation in Fiscal Federalism.....	246
4.1.3.1 Role of the Provinces in the Fiscal Game	246
4.1.3.2 Transfers, Subnational Borrowing and Bailouts	248
4.1.4 Fiscal Responsibility Law	254
4.2 Brazil	259
4.2.1 The Economics of Property Rights in the Fiscal Institutional Environment.....	259

4.2.1.1	Executive	260
4.2.1.2	Legislature	262
4.2.1.3	Judiciary	264
4.2.2	The Brazilian Budget Process as a Governance System	266
4.2.2.1	Preparation	267
4.2.2.2	Approval	269
4.2.2.3	Execution	270
4.2.2.4	Control	271
4.2.3	Resource Allocation in Fiscal Federalisms	274
4.2.3.1	Role of States in the Federal Game	275
4.2.3.2	Transfers, subnational Borrowing and Bailouts	276
4.2.4	Fiscal Responsibility Law	280
4.2.4.1	The Provisions	281
4.2.4.2	The Fiscal Crimes Law	283
4.2.4.3	The FRL reviewed	284
4.3	Paraguay	285
4.3.1	The Economics of Property Rights in the Fiscal Institutional Environment	286
4.3.1.1	Executive	286
4.3.1.2	Legislature	289
4.3.1.3	Judiciary	291
4.3.2	The Paraguayan Budget Process as a Governance System	293
4.3.2.1	Preparation	294
4.3.2.2	Approval	296
4.3.2.3	Execution	297
4.3.2.4	Control	298
4.3.3	Vertical Resource Allocation as an Agency Problem	302
4.3.3.1	Role of the Department as actors in the Fiscal Game	302
4.3.3.2	Transfers, Subnational Borrowing and Bailouts	304
4.4	Uruguay	306
4.4.1	The Economics of Property Rights in the Fiscal Institutional Environment	307
4.4.1.1	Executive	307
4.4.1.2	Legislature	309
4.4.1.3	Judiciary	310
4.4.2	The Uruguayan Budget Process as a Governance System	312
4.4.2.1	Preparation	313
4.4.2.2	Approval	315
4.4.2.3	Execution	316
4.4.2.4	Control	317
4.4.3	Vertical Resource Allocation as an Agency Problem	321
4.4.3.1	The Role of the Departments as Actors in the Fiscal Game	321
4.4.3.2	Transfers, Subnational Borrowing and Bailouts	322
4.5	Conclusion and Comparison	326
4.5.1	Fiscal Institutional Environment	328
4.5.2	Fiscal Governance Systems	331
4.5.3	Resource Allocation in Fiscal Federalism	334
5	Cross-national Coordination of Fiscal Policies	340
5.1	Cyclical fluctuations and implications for fiscal coordination	343
5.1.1	Economic Growth Patterns in Mercosur	344
5.1.2	Cyclical Co-movements: Implications for Fiscal Coordination	345
5.1.3	Does the European Stability and Growth Pact serve as a Paradigm?	346

5.2	Former Initiatives: Lack of Specificity and Enforceability	348
5.3	Effective Fiscal Coordination: Specificity and Enforceability of Cross-national Rules	351
5.3.1	Policy Coordination by Mercosur Legislation	352
5.3.2	Specificity: The Incorporation of Mercosur Legislation into National Legal Orders	354
5.3.3	Enforceability: The Effectiveness of Mercosur Legislation	357
5.4	Solutions to Lacking Enforcement of Fiscal Coordination	361
5.4.1	Coordination Problems in Multiple Round Games	361
5.4.2	Contract and Convention: Agency Problems apply	363
5.4.3	Alignment of Interests: Solutions to Cross-national Agency Problems	364
5.4.4	Collaterals and Hostages: Incentives Matter	366
5.5	Supporting Enforceability with Self-enforcing Elements	368
5.5.1	The Extension of FOCEM: The <i>Collateral</i>	368
5.5.1.1	FOCEM: First Attempts in Regional Redistribution in Mercosur	369
5.5.1.2	FOCEM's potential role as Collateral	370
5.5.1.3	Effective Collateralization requires consistent Incentives	371
5.5.2	GDP-indexed Bonds: Capital Market based <i>Hands Tying</i>	373
5.5.2.1	GDP-indexed bonds - the Concept	375
5.5.2.2	GDP-indexed Bonds as Hands Tying: Two Models	377
5.5.2.3	Advantages and Opportunities	380
5.5.2.4	Risks and Caveats	382
5.5.2.5	Implementation of GDP-indexed Bonds as Hands Tying: The Context of Mercosur	385
5.5.2.6	Case Study: Argentina's GDP-indexed warrants	388
5.5.2.7	Effective <i>Hands Tying</i> requires Consistent Incentives	390
5.6	Hands Tying, Collateral and the Economic Cycle: Which Conclusion is to be drawn?	392
6	Concluding Remarks	398
6.1	Towards Fiscal Policy Coordination in Mercosur	398
6.2	Policy Recommendations: Fiscal Rules on the National Level... ..	403
6.3	...and an effective Cross-national Coordination of Enforcement	406
6.4	The Research Gap Reviewed Again	408
6.5	Outlook.....	409
VI.	References	410