

Örn B. Bodvarsson • Hendrik Van den Berg

The Economics of Immigration

Theory and Policy

 Springer

Contents

1 Introduction to Immigration Economics	1
1.1 The Late Twentieth Century Immigration Explosion	2
1.1.1 The Complexity of Immigration	3
1.1.2 Not Everyone Likes Immigrants	4
1.1.3 Economists' Perspective	5
1.2 The Determinants of Immigration	6
1.2.1 Many Factors Discourage Immigration	6
1.2.2 Considering the Full Set of Push, Pull, Stay, and Stay Away Factors	9
1.2.3 Recent Shifts in the Economic Forces that Influence Immigration	9
1.2.4 Immigration is a Complex Phenomenon	10
1.3 A Brief History of Immigration	10
1.3.1 Early Migrations	11
1.3.2 Recent Immigration	12
1.4 There are Many Types of Immigrants	14
1.4.1 Not All Immigrants are Permanent Settlers	14
1.4.2 Forced Immigration	15
1.4.3 Some Immigrants are Difficult to Classify	16
1.5 The Purpose and Organization of this Book	16
References	18

Part I Immigration Theory and Evidence

2 The Determinants of International Migration: Theory	27
Chapter Overview	27
2.1 The Theory of Internal Migration	29
2.1.1 Pre-1960 Theory	29
2.1.2 Ravenstein and Zipf	30
2.1.3 The Modern Theory of Internal Migration	31
2.1.4 Further Influences on Internal Migration	37
2.2 The Economic Theory of Immigration	39
2.2.1 The First Borjas Model	39
2.2.2 Borjas' 1991 Model	46

2.2.3	Recent Extensions of the Borjas Model	47
2.3	The Family or Household as the Decision-Making Unit	51
2.3.1	Conflicting Interests and the Family Migration Decision	52
2.3.2	Mincer's Model	52
2.3.3	Family Migration as a Portfolio Decision	53
2.4	Summary and Conclusions	53
References	54
3	Why People Immigrate: The Evidence	59
Chapter Overview	59
3.1	Regression Models of Immigration	60
3.1.1	Empirical Models of Regional Migration	60
3.1.2	The Gravity Model of International Migration	61
3.1.3	Some Econometric Problems Related to the Gravity Model	64
3.2	The Choice of Variables in Statistical Models of Immigration	65
3.2.1	Three Examples	66
3.2.2	Representing Income Differences	66
3.2.3	Representing Migration Costs	66
3.2.4	Representing Source Country Development	67
3.2.5	Representing Immigration Restrictions	68
3.3	The Empirical Evidence on the Determinants of Migration	69
3.3.1	Evidence on Worldwide Migration	69
3.3.2	Evidence on Migration to Groups of OECD Countries	70
3.3.3	Evidence on U.S. Immigration	70
3.3.4	Immigration to Other Countries	71
3.3.5	Summarizing the Results	72
3.4	Summary and Concluding Remarks	74
3.4.1	The Power of Statistical Models	74
3.4.2	The Way Forward	75
References	76
4	Who Immigrates? Theory and Evidence	79
Chapter Overview	79
4.1.	Immigrant Selection: The Chiswick Vs. Borjas Debate	81
4.1.1	Some Unfortunate Terminology	82
4.1.2	The Chiswick View	82
4.1.3	The Borjas Model	84
4.1.4	A More Detailed Look at the Borjas Model	86
4.1.5	Selection by Observed Characteristics	88
4.2	Extensions of the Borjas Model	88
4.2.1	Variable Migration Costs and Migrant Selection	88
4.2.2	Credit Constraints and Immigrant Selection	90
4.2.3	Family Migration and Selection Bias	91
4.3	The Empirical Evidence on Immigrant Selectivity	93

4.3.1	Borjas' Empirical Results	93
4.3.2	Further Tests of Borjas' Model	94
4.3.3	Tests Based on Counterfactual Density Functions	95
4.4	The Asymmetric Information Model	96
4.4.1	Kwok and Leland's Model	96
4.4.2	Restoring Symmetric Information	98
4.5	The Theory of Immigrant Assimilation	98
4.5.1	The Chiswick Study of Assimilation	99
4.5.2	Potential Bias in Chiswick's Results	100
4.5.3	Borjas' Empirical Results	101
4.6	Addressing Borjas' Critique	102
4.7	Conclusions	104
	References	105
5	The Effects of Immigration on the Destination Economy:	
	The Theory	107
	Chapter Overview	107
5.1	The Macro Effects of Immigration	108
5.1.1	Homogeneous Labor with Fixed Capital	108
5.1.2	Homogeneous Labor with Variable Capital	112
5.1.3	Heterogeneous Labor	114
5.1.4	Heterogeneous Labor with Constant Capital	114
5.1.5	Heterogeneous Labor and Perfectly Elastic Capital Supply	115
5.1.6	How Big is the U.S. Immigrant Surplus?	115
5.2	Detailing the Distributional Effects of Immigration	116
5.2.1	The Johnson Model (1980)	116
5.2.2	The Altonji and Card Model (1991)	117
5.2.3	The Ottaviano and Peri Model	118
5.3	Long-Run Adjustment Processes	120
5.3.1	Internal Migration Responses	120
5.3.2	Multiple Goods	121
5.3.3	Choice of Technology	122
5.3.4	The Demand Effect of Immigration	122
5.4	The Demand Effect of Immigration	122
5.4.1	Say's Law of Immigration	123
5.4.2	Regional Migration and Local Demand	124
5.4.3	A Few Models of Immigrant Demand Effects	125
5.4.4	Bodvarsson and Van den Berg's Lexington Model	126
5.4.5	The More General Case	127
5.4.6	Further Models of Immigrant Demand Effects	127
5.5	Concluding Remarks	129
	References	130

6	How Immigration Impacts the Destination Economy: The Evidence	133
	Introduction	133
6.1	The Spatial Correlation Method	134
6.1.1	Cross Section Applications	135
6.1.2	Dealing with Simultaneity and Spurious Correlation	136
6.1.3	Recent Applications of the Spatial Correlation Method ...	139
6.1.4	Applications of the Unexpected Exogenous Supply Shock Method	141
6.1.5	The Mariel Boatlift	142
6.1.6	Russian Immigrants in Israel	144
6.1.7	Assessing the Spatial Correlation Method	146
6.2	The Production Function Method	146
6.2.1	Grossman's Pioneering Production Study	147
6.2.2	Gang and Rivera-Batiz	148
6.2.3	Assessing the Production Function Method	149
6.3	The Skill Cell Approach	150
6.3.1	Borjas' Use of National Data versus Regional Data	150
6.3.2	Ottaviano and Peri's Extension of Borjas' Skill Cell Model	152
6.3.3	Other Types of Labor Market Cells	154
6.4	Concluding Remarks	154
	References	155
7	Estimating Immigration's Impact: Accounting for all Adjustments	159
	Chapter Introduction	159
7.1	Does Immigration Trigger Internal Migration?	160
7.1.1	Evidence That Immigrants Drive out Natives	160
7.1.2	Evidence that Immigration has Little Effect on Native Migration	163
7.2	Migration Biases Estimates of Immigration's Wage Effect	164
7.3	Does Immigration Change Industry Structure?	166
7.4	Measuring the Demand Effects of Immigration	167
7.4.1	Hercowitz and Yashiv's Estimates	167
7.4.2	Bodvarsson and Van den Berg's Lexington, Nebraska, Study	169
7.4.3	Estimating the Demand Effect of the Mariel Boatlift	170
7.4.5	Additional Estimates of the Demand Effects of Immigration	172
7.6	The Costs of Government Services for Immigrants	173
7.6.1	Recent Studies for the United States	174
7.6.2	Are U.S. Immigrants More Costly Today than in the Past?	175
7.7	Immigration's External Effects	176
7.7.1	Economies of Scale	176

7.7.2	Are There Negative Externalities Associated with Immigration?	178
7.8	Concluding Remarks	179
	References	180
8	Immigration and the Source Country	183
8.1	Remittances and Demand Effects in the Source Country	184
8.1.1	Demand Effects	184
8.1.2	Immigrants and Remittances	185
8.1.3	A Two-Country View of Remittances	186
8.2	What We Know About Immigrant Remittances	188
8.2.1	The Growth of Immigrant Remittances	188
8.2.2	Remittances as a Percentage of Source Country GDP	189
8.2.3	The Reliability of Remittance Data	190
8.2.4	The Recent Data on the Growth of Immigrant Remittances	190
8.2.5	Policies to Encourage Remittances	191
8.2.6	How Remittances are used in the Source Countries	193
8.2.7	Remittances: Tentative Conclusions	195
8.3	Negative Externalities from Agglomeration	195
8.3.1	Economies of Scale, Agglomeration, and Source Countries	196
8.3.2	Agglomeration Causes the Source Countries to Shrink	197
8.4	Immigration and Technology Transfers, Investment, and Trade ..	198
8.4.1	Immigration and International Investment	199
8.4.2	Immigration and International Trade	200
8.4.3	Immigration and Services Trade	200
8.5	The Brain Drain	201
8.5.1	Human Capital of Immigrants	201
8.5.2	The Brain Drain as a Development Issue	202
8.5.3	How Big is the Brain Drain?	203
8.5.4	Why Human Capital Flees Capital-Scarce Countries	209
8.5.5	Brain Drain and Brain Waste	210
8.6	A Reassessment of the Brain Drain	210
8.6.1	Remittances Again	211
8.6.2	The Brain Drain as an Incentive to Seek Education	211
8.7	Conclusions	216
	References	217
9	Economic Growth and Immigration	221
9.1	The Early Models of Economic Growth	222
9.1.1	Adam Smith's Broad View of Growth	223
9.1.2	The Classics and Diminishing Returns	224
9.1.3	The Role of Immigration in the Classical Model	226
9.1.4	The Simplistic Harrod-Domar Growth Model	226

9.2	The Solow Growth Model	227
9.2.1	A Graphic Representation of the Solow Model	227
9.2.2	Immigration Similarly has no Long-Run Effects	229
9.2.3	How an Economy Achieves Permanent Growth	231
9.3	Immigration and Technological Progress	232
9.3.1	Immigration and Technological Progress	233
9.3.2	Joseph Schumpeter's Theory of Creative Destruction	233
9.3.3	A Graphic Schumpeterian Model	235
9.3.4	The Opportunity Costs of Innovation	236
9.3.5	The Gains from Innovation	238
9.3.6	The Equilibrium Level of R&D Activity	240
9.4	Immigration in the Schumpeterian Model	241
9.4.1	Immigrants as an Innovative Resource	241
9.4.2	Immigrants Increase the Returns to Innovation	243
9.4.3	Immigrants and Technology Transfers	243
9.5	Protectionism, Creative Destruction, and Immigration	246
9.5.1	Creation Requires Destruction	246
9.5.2	The Holmes and Schmitz Model	247
9.6	Growth Effects of Immigration in the Source Country	248
9.6.1	The Overall Growth Effect of Out-Migration	248
9.6.2	How Remittances are used in Source Countries	249
9.7	The Brain Drain Again	250
9.8	Summary and Conclusions	251
	Appendix: An Alternative Mathematical Schumpeterian Model	252
A.1	Innovation and Profit	253
A.2	The Equilibrium Level of Entrepreneurial Activity	254
A.3	The Equilibrium Rate of Technological Progress	254
	References	256

Part II Immigration Issues and Cases

10	Temporary Immigration, Involuntary Immigration, and Other Variations on the Standard Model	261
	Chapter Overview	261
10.1	Return Immigration	262
10.1.1	Return Immigration as a Response to Changing Circumstances	263
10.1.2	Correcting Mistakes in Judgement	264
10.1.3	Source Country Policies to Encourage Immigrants to Return	264
10.2	Temporary Immigration	264
10.2.1	The Multinational Corporation and Temporary Immigration	265

10.2.2 Temporary Immigration as a Destination
Country Policy 266

10.2.3 The Diversity of Temporary Immigration 267

10.3 Analyzing Temporary Migration 268

10.3.1 A Simple Model: Culture Clash
versus Higher Income 268

10.3.2 Other Determinants of Temporary Immigration 270

10.3.3 The Role of International Trade 271

10.3.4 Further Issues Related to Temporary Immigration 272

10.3.5 Growth Implications of Temporary Immigration 273

10.3.6 Temporary Immigration and the Ageing Problem 274

10.4 Asylum Seekers and Refugees 276

10.4.1 Refugees 277

10.4.2 The UNHCR 278

10.4.3 Asylum Seekers 278

10.5 Involuntary Immigration 279

10.5.1 A Model of International Slavery 280

10.5.2 Other Oppressive Forms of Immigration 282

10.6 Summary and Conclusions 283

References 284

11 Unauthorized Immigration 287

Introduction 287

11.1 Estimating Unauthorized Immigration 289

11.1.1 The Residual Method 289

11.1.2 Other Methods for Estimating Unauthorized
Immigration 291

11.2 How Many Unauthorized Immigrants are There? 292

11.3 Some Characteristics of Unauthorized Immigrants 295

11.4 The Economic Analysis of Unauthorized Immigration 296

11.4.1 The Supply and Demand for Unauthorized Workers .. 297

11.4.2 Unauthorized Immigration as a Form of Labor Market
Discrimination 299

11.4.3 Oppression of Unauthorized Workers 301

11.4.4 Discussion of the Labor Segmentation Hypothesis 303

11.4.5 Close Variations on Illegality 304

11.4.6 Unauthorized Immigration can be Deadly 306

11.5 The Fiscal Costs and Benefits of Unauthorized Immigration ... 307

11.6 Unauthorized Immigration: Policy Options 309

11.6.1 Border Controls 309

11.6.2 Employer Sanctions 310

11.7 Conclusions 311

References 312

12	Hispanic Immigration to the United States	315
12.1	The Characteristics of Hispanic Immigration	317
12.2	Assimilation	320
12.2.1	Hispanics' Slow Assimilation	320
12.2.2	Further Reasons Why Hispanic Assimilation is Slow	325
12.2.3	Perhaps It Is All a Data Problem	327
12.2.4	Political Attitudes of Hispanic Immigrants	328
12.3	Geographic Diffusion	329
12.3.1	Networks and Herding	329
12.3.2	Towards the South and the Midwest	330
12.3.3	The Dispersal of Manufacturing Jobs and Immigrant Dispersal	332
12.4	Explaining Hispanic Immigration	334
12.4.1	The Welfare Effects on the Source Hispanic Countries	335
12.4.2	The Demand Effects of Hispanic Immigration	336
12.5	Future Hispanic Immigration	336
12.5.1	Will Hispanic Immigration Continue?	337
12.5.2	Temporary Immigration Programs	338
12.6	Conclusions	339
	References	340

Part III Immigration Policy: Introduction

13	Immigration Policy in the United States	349
	Chapter Overview	349
13.1	Early Immigration Policy	352
13.1.1	The Borders were not Entirely Open	353
13.1.2	Assessing the Early Policies	353
13.2	The Latter Half of the Nineteenth Century	354
13.2.1	Religion and Immigration	354
13.2.2	Growing Opposition to Immigration Spurs New Legislation	355
13.2.3	The Chinese Exclusion Act	356
13.2.4	Controlling the Border	357
13.2.5	Immigration Remained Mostly Open	358
13.2.6	Assessing the Early Policies	359
13.3	The Shift in Policy in the Early Twentieth Century	360
13.3.1	The First General Restrictions of Immigration	360
13.3.2	The Post-World War I Shift in Policy	361
13.3.3	Immigration During the Great Depression	362
13.3.4	Immigration Policy During the War	364
13.4	Post World War II Immigration Policy	364
13.4.1	Policy Immediately After the War	364

13.4.2	A New Immigration Law in 1965	365
13.4.3	The Economic Effects of the 1965 Act	366
13.4.4	The Growth of Unauthorized Immigration	367
13.5	Recent United States Immigration Policy	367
13.5.1	IRCA	368
13.5.2	After IRCA	369
13.5.3	Summarizing Recent U.S. Policy	370
13.6	Post 9/11 Immigration Policy	371
13.6.1	Reform of the Immigration Bureaucracy and Enforcement	371
13.6.2	Employment-Based Permanent Residency	372
13.6.3	Temporary Work Visas	374
13.6.4	Immigration Reform Stalls in 2006 and 2007	374
13.7	Summary and Conclusions	375
	References	377
14	Immigration Policy in Canada	379
	Chapter Overview	379
14.1	Overview of Immigration Policy in Canada	380
14.1.1	Overview of Immigration and Population Growth in Canada	380
14.1.2	The Early Years	382
14.1.3	Late Nineteenth Century Immigration	383
14.1.4	Summary of Nineteenth Century Canadian Immigration Policy	384
14.2	Canadian Immigration Policy in the Twentieth Century	385
14.2.1	The First Half of the Twentieth Century	385
14.2.2	After World War II	387
14.2.3	Comparing Immigration Legislation	388
14.3	Canada's Immigration Policy Today	389
14.3.1	The Canadian Point System	389
14.3.2	Should Policy Discriminate in Favor of Highly Educated Immigrants?	390
14.3.3	The Seven Questions in the Early Twenty First Century	392
14.4	Some Final Observations	393
	References	394
15	Immigration Policy in Europe	395
	Chapter Overview	395
15.1	European Migration During the Colonial Era	398
15.1.1	Colonial Regimes and Immigration	398
15.1.2	The Nineteenth Century	400
15.1.3	The Emigration Life Cycle	401
15.1.4	European Emigration After World War I	403

15.2	The Post-World War II Period	403
15.2.1	Guest Workers	404
15.2.2	The Post-Soviet Era	406
15.2.3	Recent EU Immigration Policy	407
15.3	The Interesting Case of Ireland	407
15.4	Recent Immigration Policy in Spain	410
15.6	Can Immigration Solve the Demographic Burden?	411
15.7	Conclusions	413
	References	413
16	Conclusions and Final Observations	415
	Chapter Overview	415
16.1	Immigration; A Fundamental Economic Phenomenon	416
16.2	We Must Think Outside our Little Boxes	418
16.3	An Appeal to Holism	420
16.3.1	Defining Holism	420
16.3.2	The Economics of Immigration Must Embrace Holism	421
16.3.3	The Holistic Approach to the Study of Immigration: An Example	422
16.4	Developing International Institutions for an International Phenomenon	425
16.4.1	The Global Commission on International Migration ...	425
16.4.2	What is the Optimal Flow of Immigrants?	426
16.4.3	Small Steps Towards Global Governance	427
16.5	Final Comment	428
	References	428