Örn B. Bodvarsson • Hendrik Van den Berg

The Economics of Immigration

Theory and Policy
Contents

1 Introduction to Immigration Economics ............................................. 1
  1.1 The Late Twentieth Century Immigration Explosion ......................... 2
    1.1.1 The Complexity of Immigration ........................................ 3
    1.1.2 Not Everyone Likes Immigrants ....................................... 4
    1.1.3 Economists' Perspective .............................................. 5
  1.2 The Determinants of Immigration ............................................. 6
    1.2.1 Many Factors Discourage Immigration ................................ 6
    1.2.2 Considering the Full Set of Push, Pull, Stay, and Stay Away Factors .................................. 9
    1.2.3 Recent Shifts in the Economic Forces that Influence Immigration ................................ 9
    1.2.4 Immigration is a Complex Phenomenon ................................ 10
  1.3 A Brief History of Immigration ............................................. 10
    1.3.1 Early Migrations .................................................... 11
    1.3.2 Recent Immigration .................................................. 12
  1.4 There are Many Types of Immigrants ..................................... 14
    1.4.1 Not All Immigrants are Permanent Settlers ......................... 14
    1.4.2 Forced Immigration .................................................. 15
    1.4.3 Some Immigrants are Difficult to Classify ........................ 16
  1.5 The Purpose and Organization of this Book ................................ 16
References ....................................................................................... 18

Part I Immigration Theory and Evidence

2 The Determinants of International Migration: Theory ....................... 27
  Chapter Overview ............................................................................ 27
  2.1 The Theory of Internal Migration ........................................... 29
    2.1.1 Pre-1960 Theory ...................................................... 29
    2.1.2 Ravenstein and Zipf .................................................. 30
    2.1.3 The Modern Theory of Internal Migration ......................... 31
    2.1.4 Further Influences on Internal Migration ......................... 37
  2.2 The Economic Theory of Immigration ...................................... 39
    2.2.1 The First Borjas Model ............................................ 39
    2.2.2 Borjas' 1991 Model .................................................. 46
3 Why People Immigrate: The Evidence .............................................. 59
Chapter Overview ................................................................. 59
3.1 Regression Models of Immigration ..................................... 60
  3.1.1 Empirical Models of Regional Migration ...................... 60
  3.1.2 The Gravity Model of International Migration ............. 61
  3.1.3 Some Econometric Problems Related to the Gravity Model .............................................. 64
3.2 The Choice of Variables in Statistical Models of Immigration .......... 65
  3.2.1 Three Examples .......................................................... 66
  3.2.2 Representing Income Differences ................................. 66
  3.2.3 Representing Migration Costs ....................................... 66
  3.2.4 Representing Source Country Development .................... 67
  3.2.5 Representing Immigration Restrictions ......................... 68
3.3 The Empirical Evidence on the Determinants of Migration .......... 69
  3.3.1 Evidence on Worldwide Migration ................................. 69
  3.3.2 Evidence on Migration to Groups of OECD Countries ...... 70
  3.3.3 Evidence on U.S. Immigration ...................................... 70
  3.3.4 Immigration to Other Countries ................................... 71
  3.3.5 Summarizing the Results ............................................ 72
3.4 Summary and Concluding Remarks ................................... 74
  3.4.1 The Power of Statistical Models .................................. 74
  3.4.2 The Way Forward ...................................................... 75
References .............................................................................. 76

4 Who Immigrates? Theory and Evidence ..................................... 79
Chapter Overview ................................................................. 79
4.1 Immigrant Selection: The Chiswick Vs. Borjas Debate ............... 81
  4.1.1 Some Unfortunate Terminology ................................... 82
  4.1.2 The Chiswick View ...................................................... 82
  4.1.3 The Borjas Model ........................................................ 84
  4.1.4 A More Detailed Look at the Borjas Model .................... 86
  4.1.5 Selection by Observed Characteristics ......................... 88
4.2 Extensions of the Borjas Model ......................................... 88
  4.2.1 Variable Migration Costs and Migrant Selection ............. 88
  4.2.2 Credit Constraints and Immigrant Selection .................. 90
  4.2.3 Family Migration and Selection Bias ............................ 91
4.3 The Empirical Evidence on Immigrant Selectivity .................... 93
5 The Effects of Immigration on the Destination Economy:
The Theory ........................................................................... 107

Chapter Overview ................................................................. 107

5.1 The Macro Effects of Immigration ................................. 108
  5.1.1 Homogeneous Labor with Fixed Capital .................. 108
  5.1.2 Homogeneous Labor with Variable Capital ............. 112
  5.1.3 Heterogeneous Labor ........................................... 114
  5.1.4 Heterogeneous Labor with Constant Capital .......... 114
  5.1.5 Heterogeneous Labor and Perfectly Elastic Capital Supply ......................................................... 115
  5.1.6 How Big is the U.S. Immigrant Surplus? ................. 115

5.2 Detailing the Distributional Effects of Immigration .......... 116
  5.2.1 The Johnson Model (1980) .................................. 116
  5.2.2 The Altonji and Card Model (1991) ...................... 117
  5.2.3 The Ottaviano and Peri Model ............................... 118

5.3 Long-Run Adjustment Processes .................................. 120
  5.3.1 Internal Migration Responses .............................. 120
  5.3.2 Multiple Goods ................................................. 121
  5.3.3 Choice of Technology ....................................... 122
  5.3.4 The Demand Effect of Immigration ..................... 122

5.4 The Demand Effect of Immigration .............................. 122
  5.4.1 Say's Law of Immigration ................................... 123
  5.4.2 Regional Migration and Local Demand ................. 124
  5.4.3 A Few Models of Immigrant Demand Effects ........... 125
  5.4.4 Bodvarsson and Van den Berg’s Lexington Model .... 126
  5.4.5 The More General Case ...................................... 127
  5.4.6 Further Models of Immigrant Demand Effects ......... 127

5.5 Concluding Remarks ..................................................... 129

References .............................................................................. 130
6 How Immigration Impacts the Destination Economy:

The Evidence ................................................................. 133
Introduction ....................................................................... 133
6.1 The Spatial Correlation Method ..................................... 134
   6.1.1 Cross Section Applications ..................................... 135
   6.1.2 Dealing with Simultaneity and Spurious Correlation ..... 136
   6.1.3 Recent Applications of the Spatial Correlation Method .. 139
   6.1.4 Applications of the Unexpected Exogenous
   Supply Shock Method ..................................................... 141
   6.1.5 The Mariel Boatlift ................................................. 142
   6.1.6 Russian Immigrants in Israel ..................................... 144
   6.1.7 Assessing the Spatial Correlation Method .................. 146
6.2 The Production Function Method .................................... 146
   6.2.1 Grossman's Pioneering Production Study .................. 147
   6.2.2 Gang and Rivera-Batiz ........................................... 148
   6.2.3 Assessing the Production Function Method ............... 149
6.3 The Skill Cell Approach .............................................. 150
   6.3.1 Borjas' Use of National Data versus Regional Data ...... 150
   6.3.2 Ottaviano and Peri's Extension of Borjas' Skill Cell Model 152
   6.3.3 Other Types of Labor Market Cells ......................... 154
6.4 Concluding Remarks ................................................. 154
References ....................................................................... 155

7 Estimating Immigration's Impact: Accounting for all Adjustments 159
Chapter Introduction ....................................................... 159
7.1 Does Immigration Trigger Internal Migration? .................. 160
   7.1.1 Evidence That Immigrants Drive out Natives ............. 160
   7.1.2 Evidence that Immigration has Little Effect
   on Native Migration ..................................................... 163
7.2 Migration Biases Estimates of Immigration's Wage Effect .... 164
7.3 Does Immigration Change Industry Structure? .................. 166
7.4 Measuring the Demand Effects of Immigration .................. 167
   7.4.1 Hercowitz and Yashiv's Estimates ............................. 167
   7.4.2 Bodvarsson and Van den Berg's Lexington,
   Nebraska, Study .......................................................... 169
   7.5.3 Estimating the Demand Effect of the Mariel Boatlift .... 170
   7.4.5 Additional Estimates of the Demand Effects
   of Immigration ........................................................... 172
7.6 The Costs of Government Services for Immigrants .............. 173
   7.6.1 Recent Studies for the United States ......................... 174
   7.6.2 Are U.S. Immigrants More Costly Today
   than in the Past? ....................................................... 175
7.7 Immigration's External Effects ...................................... 176
   7.7.1 Economies of Scale ............................................... 176
7.7.2 Are There Negative Externalities Associated with Immigration? ........................................ 178
7.8 Concluding Remarks ........................................... 179
References ...................................................... 180

8 Immigration and the Source Country ........................................... 183
8.1 Remittances and Demand Effects in the Source Country ........ 184
  8.1.1 Demand Effects ................................................. 184
  8.1.2 Immigrants and Remittances ........................................ 185
  8.1.3 A Two-Country View of Remittances ................................ 186
8.2 What We Know About Immigrant Remittances .................. 188
  8.2.1 The Growth of Immigrant Remittances ....... 188
  8.2.2 Remittances as a Percentage of Source Country GDP ....... 189
  8.2.3 The Reliability of Remittance Data ................................ 190
  8.2.4 The Recent Data on the Growth of Immigrant Remittances .... 190
  8.2.5 Policies to Encourage Remittances ...................... 191
  8.2.6 How Remittances are used in the Source Countries ....... 193
  8.2.7 Remittances: Tentative Conclusions ...................... 195
8.3 Negative Externalities from Agglomeration .................. 195
  8.3.1 Economies of Scale, Agglomeration, and Source Countries .................................. 196
  8.3.2 Agglomeration Causes the Source Countries to Shrink ........ 197
8.4 Immigration and Technology Transfers, Investment, and Trade . 198
  8.4.1 Immigration and International Investment ........ 199
  8.4.2 Immigration and International Trade ...................... 200
  8.4.3 Immigration and Services Trade ...................... 200
8.5 The Brain Drain ............................................. 201
  8.5.1 Human Capital of Immigrants ............. 201
  8.5.2 The Brain Drain as a Development Issue ........ 202
  8.5.3 How Big is the Brain Drain? ............. 203
  8.5.4 Why Human Capital Flees Capital-Scarce Countries ........ 209
  8.5.5 Brain Drain and Brain Waste ...................... 210
8.6 A Reassessment of the Brain Drain ...................... 210
  8.6.1 Remittances Again ...................... 211
  8.6.2 The Brain Drain as an Incentive to Seek Education .......... 211
8.7 Conclusions ............................................. 216
References ...................................................... 217

9 Economic Growth and Immigration ........................................... 221
9.1 The Early Models of Economic Growth ...................... 222
  9.1.1 Adam Smith’s Broad View of Growth .......... 223
  9.1.2 The Classicals and Diminishing Returns ........ 224
  9.1.3 The Role of Immigration in the Classical Model ........ 226
  9.1.4 The Simplistic Harrod–Domar Growth Model ........ 226
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>9.2 The Solow Growth Model</td>
<td>227</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.2.1 A Graphic Representation of the Solow Model</td>
<td>227</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.2.2 Immigration Similarly has no Long-Run Effects</td>
<td>229</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.2.3 How an Economy Achieves Permanent Growth</td>
<td>231</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.3 Immigration and Technological Progress</td>
<td>232</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.3.1 Immigration and Technological Progress</td>
<td>233</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.3.2 Joseph Schumpeter’s Theory of Creative Destruction</td>
<td>233</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.3.3 A Graphic Schumpeterian Model</td>
<td>235</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.3.4 The Opportunity Costs of Innovation</td>
<td>236</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.3.5 The Gains from Innovation</td>
<td>238</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.3.6 The Equilibrium Level of R&amp;D Activity</td>
<td>240</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.4 Immigration in the Schumpeterian Model</td>
<td>241</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.4.1 Immigrants as an Innovative Resource</td>
<td>241</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.4.2 Immigrants Increase the Returns to Innovation</td>
<td>243</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.4.3 Immigrants and Technology Transfers</td>
<td>243</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.5 Protectionism, Creative Destruction, and Immigration</td>
<td>246</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.5.1 Creation Requires Destruction</td>
<td>246</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.5.2 The Holmes and Schmitz Model</td>
<td>247</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.6 Growth Effects of Immigration in the Source Country</td>
<td>248</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.6.1 The Overall Growth Effect of Out-Migration</td>
<td>248</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.6.2 How Remittances are used in Source Countries</td>
<td>249</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.7 The Brain Drain Again</td>
<td>250</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.8 Summary and Conclusions</td>
<td>251</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix: An Alternative Mathematical Schumpeterian Model</td>
<td>252</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A.1 Innovation and Profit</td>
<td>253</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A.2 The Equilibrium Level of Entrepreneurial Activity</td>
<td>254</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A.3 The Equilibrium Rate of Technological Progress</td>
<td>254</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>References</td>
<td>256</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Part II Immigration Issues and Cases

10 Temporary Immigration, Involuntary Immigration, and Other Variations on the Standard Model ........................................ 261

Chapter Overview ........................................................................ 261

10.1 Return Immigration ................................................................ 262

10.1.1 Return Immigration as a Response to Changing Circumstances . . . 263

10.1.2 Correcting Mistakes in Judgement ..................................... 264

10.1.3 Source Country Policies to Encourage Immigrants to Return . . 264

10.2 Temporary Immigration .......................................................... 264

10.2.1 The Multinational Corporation and Temporary Immigration . . . 265
Contents

10.2.2 Temporary Immigration as a Destination
   Country Policy ........................................ 266
10.2.3 The Diversity of Temporary Immigration ......... 267
10.3 Analyzing Temporary Migration .......................... 268
  10.3.1 A Simple Model: Culture Clash
         versus Higher Income ................................. 268
  10.3.2 Other Determinants of Temporary Immigration .... 270
  10.3.3 The Role of International Trade ..................... 271
  10.3.4 Further Issues Related to Temporary Immigration ... 272
  10.3.5 Growth Implications of Temporary Immigration .... 273
  10.3.6 Temporary Immigration and the Ageing Problem ... 274
10.4 Asylum Seekers and Refugees .............................. 276
  10.4.1 Refugees ........................................ 277
  10.4.2 The UNHCR ..................................... 278
  10.4.3 Asylum Seekers .................................. 278
10.5 Involuntary Immigration ................................... 279
  10.5.1 A Model of International Slavery .................... 280
  10.5.2 Other Oppressive Forms of Immigration .............. 282
10.6 Summary and Conclusions ................................ 283
References .................................................. 284

11 Unauthorized Immigration .................................. 287
Introduction ................................................ 287
  11.1 Estimating Unauthorized Immigration .................. 289
      11.1.1 The Residual Method ............................ 289
      11.1.2 Other Methods for Estimating Unauthorized
            Immigration ..................................... 291
  11.2 How Many Unauthorized Immigrants are There? ........... 292
  11.3 Some Characteristics of Unauthorized Immigrants ....... 295
  11.4 The Economic Analysis of Unauthorized Immigration .... 296
      11.4.1 The Supply and Demand for Unauthorized Workers .. 297
      11.4.2 Unauthorized Immigration as a Form of Labor Market
            Discrimination ..................................... 299
      11.4.3 Oppression of Unauthorized Workers ................ 301
      11.4.4 Discussion of the Labor Segmentation Hypothesis ... 303
      11.4.5 Close Variations on Illegality .................... 304
      11.4.6 Unauthorized Immigration can be Deadly ............ 306
  11.5 The Fiscal Costs and Benefits of Unauthorized Immigration .. 307
  11.6 Unauthorized Immigration: Policy Options ............... 309
      11.6.1 Border Controls .................................. 309
      11.6.2 Employer Sanctions .............................. 310
  11.7 Conclusions ........................................... 311
References .................................................. 312
12 Hispanic Immigration to the United States

12.1 The Characteristics of Hispanic Immigration

12.2 Assimilation

12.2.1 Hispanics’ Slow Assimilation

12.2.2 Further Reasons Why Hispanic Assimilation is Slow

12.2.3 Perhaps It Is All a Data Problem

12.2.4 Political Attitudes of Hispanic Immigrants

12.3 Geographic Diffusion

12.3.1 Networks and Herding

12.3.2 Towards the South and the Midwest

12.3.3 The Dispersal of Manufacturing Jobs and Immigrant Dispersal

12.4 Explaining Hispanic Immigration

12.4.1 The Welfare Effects on the Source Hispanic Countries

12.4.2 The Demand Effects of Hispanic Immigration

12.5 Future Hispanic Immigration

12.5.1 Will Hispanic Immigration Continue?

12.5.2 Temporary Immigration Programs

12.6 Conclusions

References

Part III Immigration Policy: Introduction

13 Immigration Policy in the United States

Chapter Overview

13.1 Early Immigration Policy

13.1.1 The Borders were not Entirely Open

13.1.2 Assessing the Early Policies

13.2 The Latter Half of the Nineteenth Century

13.2.1 Religion and Immigration

13.2.2 Growing Opposition to Immigration Spurs New Legislation

13.2.3 The Chinese Exclusion Act

13.2.4 Controlling the Border

13.2.5 Immigration Remained Mostly Open

13.2.6 Assessing the Early Policies

13.3 The Shift in Policy in the Early Twentieth Century

13.3.1 The First General Restrictions of Immigration

13.3.2 The Post-World War I Shift in Policy

13.3.3 Immigration During the Great Depression

13.3.4 Immigration Policy During the War

13.4 Post World War II Immigration Policy

13.4.1 Policy Immediately After the War
13.4.2 A New Immigration Law in 1965 .......................... 365
13.4.3 The Economic Effects of the 1965 Act .................. 366
13.4.4 The Growth of Unauthorized Immigration .......... 367
13.5 Recent United States Immigration Policy .................. 367
13.5.1 IRCA ............................................. 368
13.5.2 After IRCA ...................................... 369
13.5.3 Summarizing Recent U.S. Policy ....................... 370
13.6 Post 9/11 Immigration Policy ................................ 371
13.6.1 Reform of the Immigration Bureaucracy and Enforcement ............. 371
13.6.2 Employment-Based Permanent Residency .............. 372
13.6.3 Temporary Work Visas ................................ 374
13.6.4 Immigration Reform Stalls in 2006 and 2007 ........... 374
13.7 Summary and Conclusions ................................... 375
References ................................................. 377

14 Immigration Policy in Canada .................................. 379
Chapter Overview ............................................. 379
14.1 Overview of Immigration Policy in Canada ................. 380
14.1.1 Overview of Immigration and Population Growth in Canada .................. 380
14.1.2 The Early Years ................................... 382
14.1.3 Late Nineteenth Century Immigration .................. 383
14.1.4 Summary of Nineteenth Century Canadian Immigration Policy ............ 384
14.2 Canadian Immigration Policy in the Twentieth Century .... 385
14.2.1 The First Half of the Twentieth Century ............... 385
14.2.2 After World War II ................................... 387
14.2.3 Comparing Immigration Legislation ..................... 388
14.3 Canada’s Immigration Policy Today ........................ 389
14.3.1 The Canadian Point System ............................ 389
14.3.2 Should Policy Discriminate in Favor of Highly Educated Immigrants? ... 390
14.3.3 The Seven Questions in the Early Twenty First Century ...................... 392
14.4 Some Final Observations ................................... 393
References ................................................. 394

15 Immigration Policy in Europe .................................. 395
Chapter Overview ............................................. 395
15.1 European Migration During the Colonial Era ............... 398
15.1.1 Colonial Regimes and Immigration ...................... 398
15.1.2 The Nineteenth Century ................................ 400
15.1.3 The Emigration Life Cycle ............................. 401
15.1.4 European Emigration After World War I .................. 403
15.2 The Post-World War II Period ........................................... 403
15.2.1 Guest Workers ......................................................... 404
15.2.2 The Post-Soviet Era ................................................... 406
15.2.3 Recent EU Immigration Policy ....................................... 407
15.3 The Interesting Case of Ireland ......................................... 407
15.4 Recent Immigration Policy in Spain ..................................... 410
15.6 Can Immigration Solve the Demographic Burden? ................. 411
15.7 Conclusions .............................................................. 413
References ........................................................................... 413

16 Conclusions and Final Observations ...................................... 415
Chapter Overview .................................................................... 415
16.1 Immigration; A Fundamental Economic Phenomenon .............. 416
16.2 We Must Think Outside our Little Boxes .............................. 418
16.3 An Appeal to Holism ........................................................ 420
16.3.1 Defining Holism .......................................................... 420
16.3.2 The Economics of Immigration Must Embrace Holism ........ 421
16.3.3 The Holistic Approach to the Study of Immigration: An Example ................................................... 422
16.4 Developing International Institutions for an International Phenomenon ................................................... 425
16.4.1 The Global Commission on International Migration ........ 425
16.4.2 What is the Optimal Flow of Immigrants? ....................... 426
16.4.3 Small Steps Towards Global Governance ....................... 427
16.5 Final Comment .................................................................. 428
References ........................................................................... 428