EU ENERGY LAW AND POLICY ISSUES

ELRF Collection
1st Edition

Edited by

BRAM DELVAUX
MICHAEL HUNT
KIM TALUS

Euroconfidentiel
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

**Introduction**

1

**SECTION 1: CONSTITUTIONAL ISSUES IN THE ENERGY SECTOR**

**Chapter 1: Vertical Division of Competences in the Energy Field between The European Community and its Member States - Some Remarks on the Evolution of European Energy Law and Policy**

1. Introduction 9
2. The basic rules and principles of the vertical division of competences 10
   A. The principle of conferral of competences 10
   B. The pre-emption doctrine, the principle of loyal cooperation, subsidiarity and proportionality principle 10
3. The existence and the nature of the community competences 16
4. EU acquis in energy law and policy 17
   A. Current legal basis in the EC Treaty allowing Community action in the field of energy 20
   B. Future legal basis in the EC Treaty allowing Community action in the field of energy 26
5. Conclusion 29

**SECTION 2: LIBERALISATION OF THE ELECTRICITY & GAS MARKETS**

**Chapter 1: European Electricity and Gas Market Liberalisation. Background, Status, Developments.**

1. Introduction 33
2. Third Party Access
   A. Electricity transmission & distribution, gas transmission & distribution, LNG infrastructure 35
   B. Transit 37
   C. Gas storage 38
   D. Upstream gas pipelines 39
3. Unbundling 41
4. Regulatory authorities 44
5. Public service obligations 46
6. Derogations
   A. Electricity & gas: new infrastructure 50
   B. Electricity & gas: exemptions for small DSOs from legal and functional Unbundling 54
   C. Electricity & gas: PSOs 53
   D. Electricity: small isolated systems 53
   E. Gas: take-or-pay contracts 54
   F. Gas: isolated and emergent markets 54
7. Final remarks 55

**Chapter 2: Ownership Unbundling: the Main Legal Issues in a Controversial Debate**

1. Introduction 57
2. The creation of a European integrated energy market: the current picture
   A. The energy and climate change package 58
Table of Contents

B. The European Council action plan 61
C. The third energy package 62
3. The ownership unbundling debate 62
   A. Overview of latest developments 62
   B. Ownership unbundling and the proposed amendments to the gas and electricity Directives 64
4. Ownership unbundling from an economic perspective 65
5. Ownership unbundling from a legal perspective 70
   A. OU and issues of competence 70
   B. OU and ownership rights 71
   C. OU and its relationship with the free movement of capital and the freedom of establishment 73
      1. The relationship between the free movement of capital and freedom of establishment 75
      2. The relationship between both freedoms with regard to OU 81
      3. The justification of a breach of Articles 43 EC or 56 EC 85
         a) Non-discriminatory nature of the provision 85
         b) Existence of an overriding reason of public interest 86
         c) The proportionality test 87
6. Conclusion 88

Chapter 3: EC Antitrust Enforcement in the Aftermath of the Energy Sector Inquiry: a Focus on Long-term Supply Contracts in Electricity and Gas 91

1. Introduction 91
2. The energy sector inquiry 92
   A. General findings 92
      1. Market concentration/market power 92
      2. Vertical foreclosure 93
      3. Market integration 93
      4. Transparency 93
      5. Price formation 94
   B. Long-term contracts 94
      1. Long-term supply contracts and spot market deepening 94
      2. Long-term supply contracts and market foreclosure 95
3. The framework of analysis at the European Commission 96
4. Recent cases concerning long-term supply contracts: a new methodology to analyse foreclosure in liberalised energy markets 100
   A. Long-term supply contracts in the energy sector: anti-competitive effects and efficiencies 100
   B. Cases 101
      1. Elements external to the relationship 101
      2. Elements internal to the relationship 104
5. Conclusion 107

Chapter 4: The Nordic Electricity Market and the Regulation of the TSOs – Is There Need for a More Harmonised Regulatory Set-Up 109

1. Power generation in the Nordic countries 109
2. The Nordic power exchange 110
3. The transmission of electricity and the Nordic transmission operators 111
4. Relevant market area in wholesale and generation: Nordic or national? 113
5. Developing the Nordic power market 113
6. Regulation of Nordic transmission system operators 115
   A. Tariff regulation 116
   B. Investments 117
7. Conclusion 120
SECTION 3: SECURITY OF SUPPLY

Chapter 1: Security of Supply - An Increasingly Political Notion

1. Introduction
2. EU energy security discussion in the new millennium
3. Definitions of security of supply
4. Security of supply and energy market liberalisation
   A. Preliminary issue - security of gas, electricity and oil supply
   B. Market liberalisation as a threat to security of supply
5. Threats to the EU security of supply
   A. External security of supply - insecurity of gas sources
      1. Reserve depletion
      2. Investment in gas fields
      3. Insufficient diversification
      4. International competition over gas resources
   B. Source-related threats and their effect on EC energy law and practice
   C. Internal security of supply - sufficient investment
6. Conclusion

Chapter 2: The Relevance of a Triangular Approach to the Issue of Energy Security in Europe: Russian Case as an Example

1. Introduction
2. The first side of the triangle: economic relations
3. The second side of the triangle: development cooperation policy
4. The third side of the triangle: common foreign policy
5. Conclusion

Chapter 3: The Security of Electricity Supply and Infrastructure Directive: The Right Aims but the Wrong Means

1. Introduction
2. The objectives of the Directive
3. The means for promoting investments in electricity generation capacity
   A. Regulatory point of departure
   B. The obligation to define roles and responsibilities
   C. The obligation to facilitate a stable investment climate
      1. The need to promote investor certainty
      2. The establishment of liquid wholesale markets
      3. Transparent and stable regulatory framework
   D. Market intervention in the interests of security of supply
4. Conclusion

SECTION 4: CLIMATE CHANGE, RENEWABLES & ENERGY EFFICIENCY

Chapter 1: EU Climate Change Mitigation Law: Is it Adequate, is it Fair?

1. Introduction
2. Key elements of EU climate change policy
   A. The Target
3. The distribution of the burden
   A. Between the EU and the rest of the world
      1. Sharing the effort and the clean development mechanism
      2. The use of proceedings from auctioning
      3. The role of biofuels
   B. Between EU Member States

Table of Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section/Chapter</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>SECTION 3: SECURITY OF SUPPLY</td>
<td>123</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Introduction</td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. EU energy security discussion in the new millennium</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Definitions of security of supply</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Security of supply and energy market liberalisation</td>
<td>130</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Preliminary issue - security of gas, electricity and oil supply</td>
<td>130</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Market liberalisation as a threat to security of supply</td>
<td>132</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Threats to the EU security of supply</td>
<td>133</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. External security of supply - insecurity of gas sources</td>
<td>134</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Reserve depletion</td>
<td>134</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Investment in gas fields</td>
<td>136</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Insufficient diversification</td>
<td>137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. International competition over gas resources</td>
<td>138</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Source-related threats and their effect on EC energy law and practice</td>
<td>141</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Internal security of supply - sufficient investment</td>
<td>145</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Conclusion</td>
<td>149</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 2: The Relevance of a Triangular Approach to the Issue of Energy Security in Europe: Russian Case as an Example</td>
<td>151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Introduction</td>
<td>151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. The first side of the triangle: economic relations</td>
<td>152</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. The second side of the triangle: development cooperation policy</td>
<td>155</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. The third side of the triangle: common foreign policy</td>
<td>162</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Conclusion</td>
<td>170</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 3: The Security of Electricity Supply and Infrastructure Directive: The Right Aims but the Wrong Means</td>
<td>173</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Introduction</td>
<td>173</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. The objectives of the Directive</td>
<td>175</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. The means for promoting investments in electricity generation capacity</td>
<td>178</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Regulatory point of departure</td>
<td>178</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. The obligation to define roles and responsibilities</td>
<td>178</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. The obligation to facilitate a stable investment climate</td>
<td>181</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. The need to promote investor certainty</td>
<td>181</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. The establishment of liquid wholesale markets</td>
<td>183</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Transparent and stable regulatory framework</td>
<td>184</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Market intervention in the interests of security of supply</td>
<td>185</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Conclusion</td>
<td>187</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SECTION 4: CLIMATE CHANGE, RENEWABLES &amp; ENERGY EFFICIENCY</td>
<td>189</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 1: EU Climate Change Mitigation Law: Is it Adequate, is it Fair?</td>
<td>193</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Introduction</td>
<td>193</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Key elements of EU climate change policy</td>
<td>194</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. The Target</td>
<td>196</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. The distribution of the burden</td>
<td>196</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Between the EU and the rest of the world</td>
<td>196</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Sharing the effort and the clean development mechanism</td>
<td>196</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. The use of proceedings from auctioning</td>
<td>199</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. The role of biofuels</td>
<td>200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Between EU Member States</td>
<td>202</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
1. Burden sharing of emission reductions 202
2. Burden sharing in the promotion of renewable energy 204
3. Between economic sectors 205
4. The principle of proportionality as a tool to assess EU climate change policy 210
   A. The test of proportionality 210
      1. The test of appropriateness 211
      2. The test of necessity 212
      3. The test of proportionality stricto sensu 212
      4. The test of judicial review 213
   5. The application of the test in the context of environmental policy 213
   B. The principle of proportionality in the distribution of burdens 213
      1. The test 213
      2. The application of the test in the context of environmental policy 214
5. A brief analysis of EU climate change policy in the light of the triple test of proportionality 214
   A. In relation to the entire EU climate change policy 215
      1. The target and the test of proportionality 215
      2. EU climate change policy and the test of proportionality 215
   B. Individual measures in the light of the test of proportionality 216
6. The principles of proportionality and equality in the distribution of the effort from the perspective of European Courts 219
7. Conclusions 221

Chapter 2: Carbon Capture and Storage: Becoming a Regulatory Reality in Europe 223

1. Introduction 223
2. Technical overview 224
3. Background policy initiatives 226
4. The new proposed Directive for CCS 228
   A. New provisions in the Commission’s proposed framework on CCS 229
      1. Selection of sites for storage 229
      2. Storage permit 230
      3. Monitoring and reporting 231
      4. Inspections 231
      5. Corrective measures 231
      6. Closure and transfer of responsibility 231
      7. Third party access 232
      8. Summation of new provisions on geological storage 232
   B. Provisions in the Commission’s proposed framework on CCS to amend the IPPC Directive 233
   C. Provisions in the Commission’s proposed framework on CCS to amend the EIA Directive 234
   D. CCS in the EIA and IPPC Directives 236
5. Proposed amendment to incorporate CCS in the EU ETS 236
6. Other legislative issues: barriers and alternative frameworks 238
   A. Waste legislation 238
   B. The Strategic Environmental Assessment (SEA) Directive 240
   C. International legislation 242
      2. Climate change policy and UNFCCC 243
7. Conclusions 243
# Table of Contents

Chapter 3: Recent Energy Efficiency Developments at EU Level  
1. Introduction  
2. End-use efficiency and energy services  
   A. Directive 2006/32/EC on the promotion of end-use efficiency and energy services  
      1. Introduction  
      2. Most important measures in the Energy Services Directive  
         a) National indicative targets  
         b) Scope of application  
         c) Role of the public sector  
         d) Deadlines  
         e) Concept of energy services  
         f) National Energy Efficiency Action Plans (NEEAPs)  
         g) Other specific measures  
3. Energy performance of buildings  
      1. Introduction  
      2. Most important measures in the EPB Directive  
         a) Calculation methodology for the energy performance of buildings  
         b) Minimum standards for the energy performance of buildings  
         c) Building certification  
         d) Air conditioner/boiler inspection  
   3. Specific remarks on the implementation of the EPB Directive  
   4. Future of the current EPB Directive  
   5. Initiatives towards an adapted version of the EPB Directive  
      a) Extension of the scope of application of the EPB Directive  
      b) EU minimum requirements  
      c) Approach towards very low energy or passive houses  
      d) Financing measures and incentives  
      e) Further EU harmonisation of EPB measures  
      f) Enforcement and monitoring  
3. Energy labelling and eco-design  
5. Concluding remarks  

Chapter 4: Take-or-Pay Contracts for Renewables: an Analysis of European Legal Issues  
1. Introduction  
2. Long-term take-or-pay contracts for renewables  
3. Transitional Regime  
   A. Framework  
   B. Legal issues  
   1. The framework of fundamental rights law  
      a) Introduction  
      b) Possessions  
      c) Which type of infringement  
         i) Deprivation  
         ii) Control of use  
         iii) Interference with peaceful enjoyment  
         iv) Conclusion on prima facie infringement  
      d) Justifiability of infringement and questions of compensation  
         i) Public interest/general interest  
         ii) Proportionality  
         iii) Compensation  
274
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2. Fundamental rights and the free movement of goods</td>
<td>284</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. EC State aid law</td>
<td>286</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Legal issues relating to the proposed new scheme</td>
<td>286</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. EC State aid law</td>
<td>287</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. State resources</td>
<td>288</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Notification and justification</td>
<td>288</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Antitrust law</td>
<td>290</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Restrictions upon a Member State’s activities</td>
<td>290</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Behaviour of undertakings under the scheme and under antitrust law</td>
<td>290</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a) Competition law does not actually apply at all</td>
<td>292</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b) Application of the EC block exemption Regulation on vertical agreements</td>
<td>293</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c) Application of the Article 81 (3) EC/s. 9 CA 1998 exemption</td>
<td>293</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Legal analysis of the proposed scheme – conclusions</td>
<td>296</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Conclusions</td>
<td>296</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>