New Developments in Employment Discrimination Law

Editor: Roger Blanpain

Guest Editors: Hiroya Nakakubo and Takashi Araki

Contributors:

Catherine Barnard
Cing-Kae Chiao
Sung-Wook Lee
Risa L. Lieberwitz
Pascal Lokiec
Ryoko Sakuraba
Belinda Smith
Bernd Waas
Summary of Contents

Notes on Contributors xv
Introduction xvii

1. Employment Discrimination Law in the United States:
   On the Road to Equality? 1
   Risa L. Lieberwitz

2. New Developments in Employment Discrimination Law:
   The United Kingdom Report 39
   Catherine Barnard

3. New Developments in Employment Discrimination Law: Germany 69
   Professor Dr Bernd Waas

4. Discrimination Law in France 95
   Pascal Lokiec

5. Australian Anti-discrimination Laws: Framework, Development
   and Issues 115
   Dr Belinda Smith

6. New Developments in Employment Discrimination in Korea 147
   Sung-Wook Lee

7. Employment Discrimination in Taiwan 175
   Cing-Kae Chiao

8. Employment Discrimination Law in Japan: Human Rights or
   Employment Policy? 233
   Ryoko Sakuraba
# Table of Contents

**Notes on Contributors** xv

**Introduction** xvii  
*Hiroya Nakakubo and Takashi Araki*

## Chapter 1  
Employment Discrimination Law in the United States:  
On the Road to Equality?  
*Risa L. Lieberwitz*

I  
Introduction 1

II  
Common Law Background: Employment-At-Will 2

III  
Title VII Negative Rights Model: Formal Equality 5

IV  
Sexual Harassment: Defined as Disparate Treatment 9

V  
Recent Developments in Disparate Treatment Theory 12

VI  
Moving Beyond the Limits of 'Formal Equality' 14  
A  
Required Gender Conformity as Disparate Treatment 15

B  
Intersectional Claims of Discrimination 17

C  
Group-Based Claims of Intentional Discrimination 18  
1  
Explicit Exclusion of a Protected Group 18  
2  
Pattern or Practice of Group-Based Exclusion 19

VII  
Disparate Impact Theory: Moving Towards Substantive Equality 20  
A  
Problems of Proving Disparate Impact Claims 22

B  
The Limited Scope of Disparate Impact Claims 24

VIII  
Further Legal Issues of Substantive Equality 25  
A  
Affirmative Action 25

B  
Mandatory Pre-employment Arbitration Agreements 26

IX  
The ADEA and the ADA: Formal Equality or Substantive Equality? 27  
A  
Age Discrimination in the Employment Act 27

B  
The Americans with Disabilities Act 30
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page</th>
<th>Section/Chapter/Content</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Table of Contents</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>X</td>
<td>Employees Left Out in the Cold: The Contingent Workforce 32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XI</td>
<td>Conclusion 37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Chapter 2</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>New Developments in Employment Discrimination Law: The United Kingdom Report 39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Catherine Barnard</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I</td>
<td>Introduction 39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II</td>
<td>General Description of Employment Discrimination Law 40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A Historic Overview</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1 The Legislation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2 Review</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B Typical Cases of Employment Discrimination</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III</td>
<td>The Main Principles of Anti-discrimination Law: Direct and Indirect Discrimination 47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A Direct Discrimination</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1 Defining Direct Discrimination</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2 GOQs/GORs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3 Positive Action</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4 Harassment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B Indirect Discrimination</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>C Disability-Related Discrimination</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>D Equal Pay</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV</td>
<td>Structure of Proof and Remedy of Employment Discrimination 56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A Proof of Discrimination</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B Enforcement and Remedies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1 Remedies under the Anti-discrimination Legislation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2 Equal Pay Act</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V</td>
<td>Relationship between Employment Discrimination Law and Employment Policy 62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI</td>
<td>The Important Issues Facing Employment Discrimination Law Today 64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A Introduction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Chapter 3</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>New Developments in Employment Discrimination Law: Germany 69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Professor Dr Bernd Waas</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I</td>
<td>Introduction 69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II</td>
<td>Historic Overview</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A Employment Discrimination Law at the European Level</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B German Employment Discrimination Law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III</td>
<td>Current Law on Discrimination</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A German Constitution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**Table of Contents**

### B Prohibitions of Discrimination on the Statutory Level

1. Prohibition of Discrimination with Regard to Part-Time Workers and Workers Employed under a Fixed-Term Contract 73
2. Principles of Equal Pay and Equal Treatment with Regard to Hired-Out Workers 74
3. Principle of Non-discrimination with Regard to Disabled Persons 75
4. The So-Called Labour Law Principle of Equal Treatment 75

### C In Particular: The New General Equal Treatment Act

1. Purpose of the Act 76
2. Personal and Material Area of Application 77
   a. General Questions 77
   b. Job Interviews and Discrimination 78
   c. Discriminatory Dismissals 78
3. Possible Grounds of Discrimination 79
4. Forms of Discrimination 80
   a. Direct Discrimination 80
   b. Indirect Discrimination 80
5. Prohibition of Discrimination 81
6. Justification 82
   a. Justification of Direct Discrimination 82
   b. Exceptions to the Principle of Equal Pay 83
   c. Justification of Discrimination in the Area of Unequal Treatment Based on Age 83
      i. Content of Section 10 of the General Equal Treatment Act 83
      ii. Recent Rulings of the European Court of Justice 84
      iii. Major ‘Problem Areas’ in German Law with Regard to Age Discrimination 85
   d. Positive Action 87
7. Obligations of the Employer 88
8. Legal Consequences of Discrimination 88
9. Burden of Proof 89
10. Procedural Requirements and Legal Protection 90

### IV General Questions

A. Merits and Demerits of the Legal Concept of ‘Discrimination’ 91
B. Discrimination Law and the Promotion of Employment of Specific Groups of Employees 93
C. Practical Questions and the Future Direction of Discrimination Law 94

### V Conclusion 94
# Chapter 4

## Discrimination Law in France

*Pascal Lokiec*

### I The Prohibition of Discrimination

#### A The Main Discriminatory Grounds

1. **Sex**
   - Contributions of EC Law to French Law
   - In French Law
     - Equality between Men and Women: First Step
     - Generalization of the System: Second Step
   - Race
2. **Trade Union Membership**
3. **Sexual Orientation**
4. **Origin, Nation**
5. **Handicap**
6. **Health**
7. **Family Situation**
8. **Age**
   - Prohibition of Age Discrimination
   - Prevention of Age Discrimination

#### B The Justification of Differences of Treatment

1. **Justification of Indirect Discrimination**
2. **Justification of Direct Discrimination**

#### C The Principle: Equal Work, Equal Pay

#### D Positive Action

### II Proof and Remedies

#### A Proof

#### B Remedies

#### C Measures of Protection of Victims of Discrimination

1. **Collective Protection**
   - Right of Alert
   - Substitutive Action
2. **Individual Protection**
   - Protection of Witnesses
   - Protection of the Victim of Discrimination
   - Work Inspectors
   - The HALDE

### III Discrimination and Employment

#### A Legal Provisions

1. **Age and Hiring of Workers**
2. **Age and Dismissal**

#### B Contracts of Employment

1. **Favouring the Employment of the Elderly**
2. **Favouring the Employment of the Young**
# Table of Contents

## IV  Current Issues

A  Points of Focus

1  The Position of the HALDE
   a  2007 Report
   b  Proposals of the HALDE for 2008 (17 December 2007), Concerning Employment

2  The Anonymous CV

3  Fighting New Forms of Discrimination

4  The Role of Collective Actors

B  General Issue: Fundamental Rights and the Control of Power within the Company

## Chapter 5

### Australian Anti-discrimination Laws:

#### Framework, Developments and Issues

**Dr Belinda Smith**

I  Introduction

II  Australian Anti-discrimination Laws: An Outline

III  Regulatory Framework: Discrimination Law Rights and Their Limits

   A  Standard
   B  Enforcement Rights and Dispute Resolution Processes
   C  Sanction

IV  Conceptions of Equality, Definitions of Discrimination

   A  Direct Discrimination
   B  Indirect Discrimination

V  Affirmative Action

VI  Recent Developments: Innovations and Limitations

   A  Age Discrimination
   B  Disability Standards and Action Plans
   C  Family Responsibilities

VII  Conclusion

## Chapter 6

### New Developments in Employment Discrimination in Korea

**Sung-Wook Lee**

I  Overall System of Employment Discrimination Law in Korea

   A  Constitutional basis

II  The Overall Employment Discrimination Law

   A  General Prohibition on Discrimination
   B  Anti-discrimination Acts in Employment

III  The Ban on Sex Discrimination

   A  The Law that Prohibits Sex Discrimination
   B  The Definition of ‘Discrimination’
Table of Contents

C Principle of Equal Pay for Equal Value of Work 156
D Affirmative Action in Employment 157
E Evaluations of the Equal Employment Opportunities Act 158

IV Ban on Employment-Type Based Discrimination 159
A Background of the Enactment of Acts to Protect
Irregular Employees 159
B Contents 161
1 Qualification to Seek Remedies against Discriminatory Acts 162
2 The Area of Prohibition on Discriminatory Acts 163
3 Comparable Employees 163
4 Unfavourable Treatments 164
5 Justifiable Reasons 164
6 Burdens of Proof 165
7 Remedies 165
C Responses from Labour Markets 165

V Anti-discrimination in Employment on the Basis of Disability 166
A Regulations to Ban Employment Discrimination on the
Basis of Disability 166
B Mandatory Employment of Disabilities Policy 167
C Anti-discrimination against the Disabilities Act 168
1 Contents 168
2 Remedial Procedures 169

VI Future Plans for Anti-discrimination in Employment Policy 171
A Current Issues in Anti-discrimination in Employment Act 171
B The Future of Employment Discrimination Law 173

Chapter 7
Employment Discrimination in Taiwan 175
Cing-Kae Chiao

I Introduction 175

II General Background about Employment Discrimination Issues
in Taiwan 177
A Gender Discrimination in Employment 177
B Other Forms of Employment Discrimination 179
C Emerging New Forms of Employment Discrimination 181

III Legal Regime Governing Employment Discrimination in Taiwan 182
A Legal Framework before the Passage of the Gender Equality
in Employment Act of 2002 183
B Major Provisions of the Gender Equality in Employment
Act of 2002 184
1 General Provisions 184
2 Prohibition of Gender Discrimination 184
3 Prevention and Correction of Sexual Harassment 184
4 Measures for Promoting Equality in Employment 185
Table of Contents

5 Remedies and Appeals Procedures 185
C Other Related Fair Employment Statutes 186
IV Combating Employment Discrimination under the Employment Service Act 187
A Composition and Organizational Structure of the Commissions on Employment Discrimination 188
B Functions of the Commissions on Employment Discrimination 189
C The Commissions on Employment Discrimination in Actual Practice 190
D Enforcement of the Commissions’ Decisions 191
V Combating Gender Discrimination under the Gender Equality in Employment Act 193
A Composition and Organizational Structure of the Commissions on Gender Equality in Employment 193
B Functions of the Commissions on Gender Equality in Employment 195
C The Commissions on Gender Equality in Employment in Actual Practice 196
1 Operations of the Commissions on Gender Equality in Employment (or Employment Discrimination) of Local Governments 197
2 Operations of the Commission on Gender Equality in Employment of the Council of Labor Affairs, Executive Yuan 197
D Enforcement of the Commission’s Decisions 199
VI A Critical Assessment 200
A Positive Aspects of Developments 200
B Negative Aspects of Developments 205
C Controversial Aspects of Developments 207
D New Aspects of Developments 208
E Suggestions for Further Reforms 211
VII Conclusion 213
References 214

Chapter 8
Employment Discrimination Law in Japan: Human Rights or Employment Policy? 233
Ryoko Sakuraba
I Introduction 233
II Constitutional Basis 234
III Employment Discrimination Law during the Post-War Period 235
A The Principle of Equal Treatment in the LSA 235
B Concept of Discrimination: Cases of Wage Discrimination 236
1 General Wage Systems 236
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Typical Forms of Discrimination</td>
<td>237</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>Scope of Application</td>
<td>238</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>'Freedom of Contract' Supremacy</td>
<td>238</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Sex-Based Practices Other than Wage Discrimination</td>
<td>238</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D</td>
<td>Forbidden Grounds</td>
<td>239</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV</td>
<td>The Gradual Development of Employment Discrimination Legislation</td>
<td>240</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>Sex Discrimination Law</td>
<td>240</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>The Equality Act: From 'Duty to Endeavour' to Compulsory Duty</td>
<td>240</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Current Act: Conclusive Employment Discrimination Law</td>
<td>241</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Remaining Task: Indirect Discrimination</td>
<td>243</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>Improvement of Terms and Conditions for Part-Time Workers</td>
<td>245</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Legal Background</td>
<td>245</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Statutory Regulations: 'Duty to Endeavour'</td>
<td>246</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Current Act: Mixture of 'Duty to Endeavour' and Compulsory Duty</td>
<td>247</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>Stabilization of Employment for Older Persons</td>
<td>249</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Raise of Mandatory Retirement Age to the Age of 60</td>
<td>249</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Measures for Persons between the Ages of 60 and 65</td>
<td>250</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Reinforcement of Regulations on Age Limits for Hiring</td>
<td>251</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D</td>
<td>Promotion of the Employment of Disabled Persons</td>
<td>253</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V</td>
<td>Case Law</td>
<td>253</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>Age-Based Practices</td>
<td>254</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Older Persons-Targeted Redundancy</td>
<td>254</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Wage-Cuts</td>
<td>254</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>Protection from Dismissals against Disabled Persons</td>
<td>255</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI</td>
<td>Concluding Remarks</td>
<td>255</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>