

KLUWER LAW INTERNATIONAL

BULLETIN OF COMPARATIVE LABOUR RELATIONS

New Developments in Employment Discrimination Law

Editor: Roger Blanpain

**Guest Editors: Hiroya Nakakubo and
Takashi Araki**

Contributors:

Catherine Barnard
Cing-Kae Chiao
Sung-Wook Lee
Risa L. Lieberwitz
Pascal Lokiec
Ryoko Sakuraba
Belinda Smith
Bernd Waas



Wolters Kluwer

Law & Business

AUSTIN BOSTON CHICAGO NEW YORK THE NETHERLANDS

Summary of Contents

Notes on Contributors	xv
Introduction	xvii
1. Employment Discrimination Law in the United States: On the Road to Equality? <i>Risa L. Lieberwitz</i>	1
2. New Developments in Employment Discrimination Law: The United Kingdom Report <i>Catherine Barnard</i>	39
3. New Developments in Employment Discrimination Law: Germany <i>Professor Dr Bernd Waas</i>	69
4. Discrimination Law in France <i>Pascal Lokiec</i>	95
5. Australian Anti-discrimination Laws: Framework, Development and Issues <i>Dr Belinda Smith</i>	115
6. New Developments in Employment Discrimination in Korea <i>Sung-Wook Lee</i>	147
7. Employment Discrimination in Taiwan <i>Cing-Kae Chiao</i>	175
8. Employment Discrimination Law in Japan: Human Rights or Employment Policy? <i>Ryoko Sakuraba</i>	233

Table of Contents

Notes on Contributors	xv
Introduction	xvii
<i>Hiroya Nakakubo and Takashi Araki</i>	
Chapter 1	
Employment Discrimination Law in the United States: On the Road to Equality?	1
<i>Risa L. Lieberwitz</i>	
I Introduction	1
II Common Law Background: Employment-At-Will	2
III Title VII Negative Rights Model: Formal Equality	5
IV Sexual Harassment: Defined as Disparate Treatment	9
V Recent Developments in Disparate Treatment Theory	12
VI Moving Beyond the Limits of 'Formal Equality'	14
A Required Gender Conformity as Disparate Treatment	15
B Intersectional Claims of Discrimination	17
C Group-Based Claims of Intentional Discrimination	18
1 Explicit Exclusion of a Protected Group	18
2 Pattern or Practice of Group-Based Exclusion	19
VII Disparate Impact Theory: Moving Towards Substantive Equality	20
A Problems of Proving Disparate Impact Claims	22
B The Limited Scope of Disparate Impact Claims	24
VIII Further Legal Issues of Substantive Equality	25
A Affirmative Action	25
B Mandatory Pre-employment Arbitration Agreements	26
IX The ADEA and the ADA: Formal Equality or Substantive Equality?	27
A Age Discrimination in the Employment Act	27
B The Americans with Disabilities Act	30

X	Employees Left Out in the Cold: The Contingent Workforce	32
XI	Conclusion	37
Chapter 2		
New Developments in Employment Discrimination Law: The United Kingdom Report		39
<i>Catherine Barnard</i>		
I	Introduction	39
II	General Description of Employment Discrimination Law	40
	A Historic Overview	40
	1 The Legislation	40
	2 Review	44
	B Typical Cases of Employment Discrimination	44
III	The Main Principles of Anti-discrimination Law: Direct and Indirect Discrimination	47
	A Direct Discrimination	47
	1 Defining Direct Discrimination	47
	2 GOQs/GORs	49
	3 Positive Action	50
	4 Harassment	51
	B Indirect Discrimination	52
	C Disability-Related Discrimination	54
	D Equal Pay	56
IV	Structure of Proof and Remedy of Employment Discrimination	56
	A Proof of Discrimination	56
	B Enforcement and Remedies	58
	1 Remedies under the Anti-discrimination Legislation	58
	2 Equal Pay Act	61
V	Relationship between Employment Discrimination Law and Employment Policy	62
VI	The Important Issues Facing Employment Discrimination Law Today	64
	A Introduction	64
Chapter 3		
New Developments in Employment Discrimination Law: Germany		69
<i>Professor Dr Bernd Waas</i>		
I	Introduction	69
II	Historic Overview	70
	A Employment Discrimination Law at the European Level	70
	B German Employment Discrimination Law	71
III	Current Law on Discrimination	72
	A German Constitution	72

B	Prohibitions of Discrimination on the Statutory Level	72
1	Prohibition of Discrimination with Regard to Part-Time Workers and Workers Employed under a Fixed-Term Contract	73
2	Principles of Equal Pay and Equal Treatment with Regard to Hired-Out Workers	74
3	Principle of Non-discrimination with Regard to Disabled Persons	75
4	The So-Called Labour Law Principle of Equal Treatment	75
C	In Particular: The New General Equal Treatment Act	75
1	Purpose of the Act	76
2	Personal and Material Area of Application	77
a	General Questions	77
b	Job Interviews and Discrimination	78
c	Discriminatory Dismissals	78
3	Possible Grounds of Discrimination	79
4	Forms of Discrimination	80
a	Direct Discrimination	80
b	Indirect Discrimination	80
5	Prohibition of Discrimination	81
6	Justification	82
a	Justification of Direct Discrimination	82
b	Exceptions to the Principle of Equal Pay	83
c	Justification of Discrimination in the Area of Unequal Treatment Based on Age	83
i	Content of Section 10 of the General Equal Treatment Act	83
ii	Recent Rulings of the European Court of Justice	84
iii	Major 'Problem Areas' in German Law with Regard to Age Discrimination	85
d	Positive Action	87
7	Obligations of the Employer	88
8	Legal Consequences of Discrimination	88
9	Burden of Proof	89
10	Procedural Requirements and Legal Protection	90
IV	General Questions	91
A	Merits and Demerits of the Legal Concept of 'Discrimination'	91
B	Discrimination Law and the Promotion of Employment of Specific Groups of Employees	93
C	Practical Questions and the Future Direction of Discrimination Law	94
V	Conclusion	94

Chapter 4	
Discrimination Law in France	95
<i>Pascal Lokiec</i>	
I The Prohibition of Discrimination	96
A The Main Discriminatory Grounds	96
1 Sex	97
a Contributions of EC Law to French Law	97
b In French Law	98
i Equality between Men and Women: First Step	98
ii Generalization of the System: Second Step	99
2 Race	99
3 Trade Union Membership	99
4 Sexual Orientation	100
5 Origin, Nation	100
6 Handicap	100
7 Health	101
8 Family Situation	101
9 Age	101
a Prohibition of Age Discrimination	101
b Prevention of Age Discrimination	102
B The Justification of Differences of Treatment	103
1 Justification of Indirect Discrimination	103
2 Justification of Direct Discrimination	104
C The Principle: Equal Work, Equal Pay	104
D Positive Action	105
II Proof and Remedies	105
A Proof	105
B Remedies	106
C Measures of Protection of Victims of Discrimination	106
1 Collective Protection	106
a Right of Alert	106
b Substitutive Action	106
2 Individual Protection	107
a Protection of Witnesses	107
b Protection of the Victim of Discrimination	107
c Work Inspectors	107
d The HALDE	107
III Discrimination and Employment	108
A Legal Provisions	108
1 Age and Hiring of Workers	108
2 Age and Dismissal	108
B Contracts of Employment	109
1 Favouring the Employment of the Elderly	109
2 Favouring the Employment of the Young	109

IV	Current Issues	110
A	Points of Focus	110
1	The Position of the HALDE	110
a	2007 Report	110
b	Proposals of the HALDE for 2008 (17 December 2007), Concerning Employment	111
2	The Anonymous CV	111
3	Fighting New Forms of Discrimination	112
4	The Role of Collective Actors	112
B	General Issue: Fundamental Rights and the Control of Power within the Company	113

Chapter 5

Australian Anti-discrimination Laws: Framework, Developments and Issues

115

Dr Belinda Smith

I	Introduction	115
II	Australian Anti-discrimination Laws: An Outline	117
III	Regulatory Framework: Discrimination Law Rights and Their Limits	120
A	Standard	121
B	Enforcement Rights and Dispute Resolution Processes	123
C	Sanction	125
IV	Conceptions of Equality, Definitions of Discrimination	126
A	Direct Discrimination	129
B	Indirect Discrimination	132
V	Affirmative Action	134
VI	Recent Developments: Innovations and Limitations	136
A	Age Discrimination	136
B	Disability Standards and Action Plans	138
C	Family Responsibilities	139
VII	Conclusion	141

Chapter 6

New Developments in Employment Discrimination in Korea

147

Sung-Wook Lee

I	Overall System of Employment Discrimination Law in Korea	147
A	Constitutional basis	147
II	The Overall Employment Discrimination Law	149
A	General Prohibition on Discrimination	149
B	Anti-discrimination Acts in Employment	151
III	The Ban on Sex Discrimination	153
A	The Law that Prohibits Sex Discrimination	153
B	The Definition of 'Discrimination'	154

	C Principle of Equal Pay for Equal Value of Work	156
	D Affirmative Action in Employment	157
	E Evaluations of the Equal Employment Opportunities Act	158
IV	Ban on Employment-Type Based Discrimination	159
	A Background of the Enactment of Acts to Protect Irregular Employees	159
	B Contents	161
	1 Qualification to Seek Remedies against Discriminatory Acts	162
	2 The Area of Prohibition on Discriminatory Acts	163
	3 Comparable Employees	163
	4 Unfavourable Treatments	164
	5 Justifiable Reasons	164
	6 Burdens of Proof	165
	7 Remedies	165
	C Responses from Labour Markets	165
V	Anti-discrimination in Employment on the Basis of Disability	166
	A Regulations to Ban Employment Discrimination on the Basis of Disability	166
	B Mandatory Employment of Disabilities Policy	167
	C Anti-discrimination against the Disabilities Act	168
	1 Contents	168
	2 Remedial Procedures	169
VI	Future Plans for Anti-discrimination in Employment Policy	171
	A Current Issues in Anti-discrimination in Employment Act	171
	B The Future of Employment Discrimination Law	173

Chapter 7

Employment Discrimination in Taiwan 175

Cing-Kae Chiao

I	Introduction	175
II	General Background about Employment Discrimination Issues in Taiwan	177
	A Gender Discrimination in Employment	177
	B Other Forms of Employment Discrimination	179
	C Emerging New Forms of Employment Discrimination	181
III	Legal Regime Governing Employment Discrimination in Taiwan	182
	A Legal Framework before the Passage of the Gender Equality in Employment Act of 2002	183
	B Major Provisions of the Gender Equality in Employment Act of 2002	184
	1 General Provisions	184
	2 Prohibition of Gender Discrimination	184
	3 Prevention and Correction of Sexual Harassment	184
	4 Measures for Promoting Equality in Employment	185

	5 Remedies and Appeals Procedures	185
	C Other Related Fair Employment Statutes	186
IV	Combating Employment Discrimination under the Employment Service Act	187
	A Composition and Organizational Structure of the Commissions on Employment Discrimination	188
	B Functions of the Commissions on Employment Discrimination	189
	C The Commissions on Employment Discrimination in Actual Practice	190
	D Enforcement of the Commissions' Decisions	191
V	Combating Gender Discrimination under the Gender Equality in Employment Act	193
	A Composition and Organizational Structure of the Commissions on Gender Equality in Employment	193
	B Functions of the Commissions on Gender Equality in Employment	195
	C The Commissions on Gender Equality in Employment in Actual Practice	196
	1 Operations of the Commissions on Gender Equality in Employment (or Employment Discrimination) of Local Governments	197
	2 Operations of the Commission on Gender Equality in Employment of the Council of Labor Affairs, Executive Yuan	197
	D Enforcement of the Commission's Decisions	199
VI	A Critical Assessment	200
	A Positive Aspects of Developments	200
	B Negative Aspects of Developments	205
	C Controversial Aspects of Developments	207
	D New Aspects of Developments	208
	E Suggestions for Further Reforms	211
VII	Conclusion	213
	References	214

Chapter 8

Employment Discrimination Law in Japan: Human Rights or Employment Policy?

233

Ryoko Sakuraba

I	Introduction	233
II	Constitutional Basis	234
III	Employment Discrimination Law during the Post-War Period	235
	A The Principle of Equal Treatment in the LSA	235
	B Concept of Discrimination: Cases of Wage Discrimination	236
	1 General Wage Systems	236

	2 Typical Forms of Discrimination	237
C	Scope of Application	238
	1 'Freedom of Contract' Supremacy	238
	2 Sex-Based Practices Other than Wage Discrimination	238
D	Forbidden Grounds	239
IV	The Gradual Development of Employment Discrimination Legislation	240
A	Sex Discrimination Law	240
	1 The Equality Act: From 'Duty to Endeavour' to Compulsory Duty	240
	2 Current Act: Conclusive Employment Discrimination Law	241
	3 Remaining Task: Indirect Discrimination	243
B	Improvement of Terms and Conditions for Part-Time Workers	245
	1 Legal Background	245
	2 Statutory Regulations: 'Duty to Endeavour'	246
	3 Current Act: Mixture of 'Duty to Endeavour' and Compulsory Duty	247
C	Stabilization of Employment for Older Persons	249
	1 Raise of Mandatory Retirement Age to the Age of 60	249
	2 Measures for Persons between the Ages of 60 and 65	250
	3 Reinforcement of Regulations on Age Limits for Hiring	251
D	Promotion of the Employment of Disabled Persons	253
V	Case Law	253
A	Age-Based Practices	254
	1 Older Persons-Targeted Redundancy	254
	2 Wage-Cuts	254
B	Protection from Dismissals against Disabled Persons	255
VI	Concluding Remarks	255