Directory of EC Case Law on State Aids

By

René Barents
# Table of Contents

Foreword xxxiii

Abbreviations xxv

## Chapter 1

### Article 87 EC: Aims and Scope 1

1. **Aim of Article 87 EC** 1
   1.1 Undistorted Competition 1
   1.2 Free Trade between Member States 2

2. **State Aids and the Concepts of Discrimination and Distortion of Competition** 3
   2.1 Territorial Scope of State Aids 3
   2.2 Comparison to Other Undertakings in the Same Member State 4

3. **Scope of Article 87(1) EC** 5
   3.1 Wide Interpretation of Article 87(1) EC 5
      3.1.1 Aid in any form Whatsoever 5
      3.1.2 Article 87(1) EC and WTO-agreements 6
      3.1.3 Limits to the Scope of Article 87(1) EC 6
   3.2 State Measures 7
      3.2.1 Advantages Granted by Member States 7
      3.2.2 National State Aid Legislation 7
      3.2.3 Concept of a Member State 8
   3.3 Tax Measures 8

4. **Conditions for Categorizing a National Measure as State Aid** 8
   4.1 Conditions Required by Article 87(1) EC 8
   4.2 Cumulative Character 9
Table of Contents

5 Relation between Article 87 EC and Other Treaty Provisions 10
  5.1 General Principles 10
  5.2 Separable and Inseparable Elements of State Aid Measures 11
  5.3 Free Movement of Goods 12
    5.3.1 Articles 23 EC and 90 EC 12
    5.3.2 Articles 28 EC and 31 EC 15
  5.4 Common Agricultural Policy 15
    5.4.1 Scope of Articles 87-89 EC 15
    5.4.2 Existence of Common Market Organizations 16
    5.4.3 Regulation 26/62 17
  5.5 Competition Rules 17
    5.5.1 Articles 81 and 82 EC 17
    5.5.2 Article 86 EC 18
  5.6 Property Ownership (Article 295 EC) 19
  5.7 Internal Security (Article 296 EC) 20
  5.8 Other Treaty Articles 20

Chapter 2
The Prohibition of Article 87(1) EC 23

1 Nature and Effect of Article 87(1) EC 23
  1.1 Prohibition of Incompatible Aid 23
  1.2 Absence of Direct Effect 24
2 Application of Article 87(1) EC by the Commission 25
  2.1 Supervisory Task of the Commission 25
  2.2 Powers of the Commission 26
  2.3 Discretion of the Commission 27
  2.4 Limits 28
3 Court Review of the Application of Article 87(1) EC 29
  3.1 Comprehensive Review 29
  3.2 Limited Review 31
4 Member States and Article 87(1) EC 33
5 National Courts and Article 87(1) EC 34

Chapter 3
Concept of State Aid 37

1 Objective Nature of the Concept of State Aid 37
2 Economic Effects of State Aid 38
  2.1 Effects on Competition 38
  2.2 Irrelevance of Aims and Causes of State Aids 40
    2.2.1 Objectives of State Aids 40
    2.2.2 Economic Objectives 41
Table of Contents

2.2.3 Social Objectives 42
2.2.4 Environmental and Health Objectives 43
2.2.5 Existence of other Illegal State Aids 44

Chapter 4
Advantages for Undertakings 45

1 Undertaking 45
   1.1 Economic Activities 45
   1.2 Non-economic Activities 47
2 Beneficiary of the Advantage 47
   2.1 Direct and Indirect Beneficiaries 47
   2.2 Economic Units 48
3 Concept of an Advantage for Undertakings 50
   3.1 The Requirement of an Advantage for Undertakings 50
   3.2 Objective Nature 50
   3.3 Aids and Subsidies 51
4 Criteria to Establish an Advantage for Undertakings 53
   4.1 Constitutive Elements 53
   4.2 Mitigation of Charges Normally Included in the Undertaking’s Budget 54
      4.2.1 Costs Inherent to the Undertakings Activities 54
      4.2.2 The Criterion of Normal Market Conditions 55
5 State Measures not Entailing an Advantage for Undertakings 56

Chapter 5
The Test of a Private Operator in a Market Economy 59

1 Concept and Function 59
2 Comparison between Private and Public Investment Conduct 60
   2.1 Direct and Indirect Public Investments 60
   2.2 Differences between Public and Private Investors 61
   2.3 Context of the Investment 62
3 The Profile of the Hypothetical Private Investor 63
   3.1 Size of the Investment 63
   3.2 Type and Size of the Private Investor 63
   3.3 The Conduct of an Informed Private Investor 64
4 Considerations Relevant to the Hypothetical Private Investor 65
   4.1 Long Term-profitability 65
   4.2 The Criterion of a Return on Investments 67
      4.2.1 Justification 67
      4.2.2 The Use of an Average Return 67
      4.2.3 Analytical Function 68
4.2.4 Relevant and Irrelevant Factors for the Calculation of the Return on Investments 69
4.2.5 Temporary Difficulties 70

5 Position of the Beneficiary of the Public Investment 71
5.1 Financial Position 71
5.2 Assessment of the Financial Position 72
5.3 Restructuring Plan 73
5.4 Future Privatization 74

6 Investments not Satisfying the Private Investor Test 75
7 The Private Creditor Test 77
7.1 Concept and Function 77
7.2 Differences between Private and Public Creditors 78
7.3 The Conduct of a Hypothetical Private Creditor 79

8 Discretion of the Commission 81

Chapter 6
Requirement of Selectivity 83

1 Concept 83
1.1 Specific Measures 83
1.2 General Measures 85

2 Factors Irrelevant for the Application of the Condition of Selectivity 86
2.1 Objective of the Measure 86
2.2 Number of Undertakings Involved 86
2.3 Measures Concerning an Economic Sector 87

3 Discretionary Application of a General Measure 89
3.1 Discretionary Power of the Public Authorities 89
3.2 Tax Facilities and Debt Remissions 90

4 Selectivity and Infra-state Measures 91
4.1 Selectivity and the Territorial Scope of Infra-state Measures 91
4.2 Determination of the Reference Framework 92
4.3 Exercise of Sufficiently Autonomous Powers 93

5 Selective Measures as Part of a General System 94
5.1 Selective Measures Justified by the Nature and Overall Structure of a System 94
5.1.1 General Principles 94
5.1.2 Tax Exemptions 96
5.1.3 Burden of Proof 98
5.2 Selective Measures not justified by the Nature and Overall Structure of a System 98
5.2.1 Objective Criteria to Distinguish the Beneficiaries 98
5.2.2 Objective of the Measures 99
5.3 Environmental Taxes 101
# Chapter 7

**Aid Granted by the State or Through State Resources**

1. **Origin of the Aid**
   - 1.1 All Aid Financed from Public Resources 103
   - 1.2 Meaning of State Resources 104
   - 1.3 Degree of Control over State Resources 104
   - 1.4 Tax Measures 105

2. **The Distinction between Aid Granted by the State and Aid Granted Through State Resources**
   - 2.1 Public or Private Bodies Established by the State 106
   - 2.2 Bodies under Control of the State 108
   - 2.3 Degree of Autonomy 109

3. **Imputability of Aid to the State**
   - 3.1 Meaning of Imputability to the State 110
   - 3.2 Public Undertakings 111

4. **Measures not Financed from State Resources**
   - 4.1 Scope of Article 87(1) EC 113
   - 4.2 Purchase Obligations Imposed on Undertakings 113
   - 4.3 Price Fixing Measures 114
   - 4.4 Measures of Social Policy 114
   - 4.5 Community Measures 115

# Chapter 8

**Intra-community Trade and Competition**

1. **Aid Liable to Affect Trade and to Distort Competition**
   - 1.1 Concept 117
   - 1.2 Relation between Intra-Community Trade and Competition 117

2. **The Effect of Aid on Trade and Competition**
   - 2.1 Real or Potential Effect
     - 2.1.1 General Principles 118
     - 2.1.2 Irrelevance of Damages 119
     - 2.1.3 Lawful Aid 119
     - 2.1.4 Unlawful Aid 120
   - 2.2 Method of Assessment
     - 2.2.1 Contextual Approach 121
     - 2.2.2 Market Analysis 121
     - 2.2.3 Foreseeable Effects 122
     - 2.2.4 Relevant Market 123
     - 2.2.5 Tax Incidences 124

3. **Economic Effects of State Aid**
   - 3.1 Strengthening of the Competitive Position in Intra-Community Trade 124
Table of Contents

3.2 Reduction of Costs 126
3.3 Degree of Competition 127
3.4 Overcapacity 128
4 Involvement in Intra-Community Trade 129
4.1 Local or Regional Character of Trade 129
4.2 Potential Effect on Imports and Exports 130
5 Absence of Quantitative Thresholds 133
5.1 No Deminimis Rule 133
5.2 Power of the Commission to Apply De Minimis Rules 136

Chapter 9
Taxes for the Financing of State Aids 139

1 Relation between State Aids and their Financing 139
   1.1 General Principles 139
   1.2 Integral Assessment of State Aids and their Financing 139
2 The Concept of Taxes as an Integral Part of the Aid Measure 141
   2.1 The Requirement of a Hypothecation 141
   2.2 Tax Exemptions 142
3 Consequences of the Applicability of Article 87(1) EC 143
   3.1 Obligation to Notify 143
   3.2 Unlawful Taxes 143
   3.3 Unlawful Tax Exemptions and Payment of Taxes 144
4 Self Financed Aid Measures 145

Chapter 10
Forms of State Aid 147

1 Operating Aid 147
   1.1 Concept 147
   1.2 Position under Article 87 EC 148
   1.3 Aids having the Character of Operating Aid 149
      1.3.1 Rescue Aid 149
      1.3.2 Investment Aid 149
      1.3.3 Other forms of Operating Aid 150
   2 Subsidised Loans and Measures to Reduce Interest Charges 151
3 Public Guarantees 153
4 Public Investment in the Capital of Undertakings 153
5 Exemptions from Taxes and Levies 155
6 Preferential Tariffs 157
7 Purchasing Obligations 159
8 Sale of Land 160
9 Undertakings Placed under Special Administration 162
10 Measures Relating to Debts to Public Authorities 164
# Table of Contents

## Chapter 11

**Aid for the Financing of Public Services**

1. Relation between Article 86(2) EC and Articles 87 and 88 EC
   1.1 Article 86(2) EC and the Scope of Articles 87 and 88 EC
   1.2 Article 86(2) EC and the Compatibility of State Aids
   1.3 Discretion of the Commission

2. Aid for Public Services which is not Caught by Article 87(1) EC
   2.1 The Altmark Conditions
   2.2 The First Altmark Condition
     2.2.1 An Act of Public Authority Imposing the Public Service Obligation
     2.2.2 Discretion of Member States to Define a Service of General Economic Interest
     2.2.3 Limits
     2.2.4 Public Interest
     2.2.5 Concept of Universal Service
     2.2.6 Compulsory Nature
   2.3 The Second Altmark Condition
   2.4 The Third Altmark Condition
   2.5 The Fourth Altmark Condition
   2.6 Cumulative Character of the Altmark Conditions

## Chapter 12

**Compatible State Aids (Article 87(2) and (3) EC)**

1. General Principles
   1.1 Derogations from Article 87(1) EC
   1.2 Narrow Interpretation of Article 87(2) and (3) EC
   1.3 Article 87(2) and (3) EC and Other Provisions of the EC Treaty
   1.4 Duty of the Member States to Co-operate with the Commission

2. Aid Compatible with the Common Market (Article 87(2) EC)
   2.1 Aid having a Social Character Granted to Individual Consumers (Article 87(2)(a) EC)
   2.2 Aid to make good the Damage Caused by Natural Disasters or Exceptional Circumstances (Article 87(2)(b) EC)
   2.3 Aid in Relation to the Division of Germany (Article 87(2)(c) EC)

3. Aid Which may be Considered to be Compatible with the Common Market (Article 87(3) EC)
   3.1 General Principles
     3.1.1 Character as a Derogation from Article 87(1) EC
     3.1.2 Exhaustive Character
     3.1.3 Aid Notified and not Notified
     3.1.4 Proportionality Requirement
## Table of Contents

3.2 Application of Article 87(3) EC by the Commission 193  
3.2.1 Exclusive Competence of the Commission 193  
3.2.2 Discretion of the Commission 193  
3.2.3 Assessment in a Community Context 194  
3.2.4 Individual Approach 196  
3.2.5 Court Review 197  
3.2.6 General Criteria for the Assessment of the Compatibility of Aid 199  

3.3 Article 87(3)(a) EC: Abnormal Low Standard of Living or Serious Underemployment 200  
3.4 Article 87(3)(b) EC: Project of Common European Interest 201  
3.5 Article 87(3)(c) EC: Development of Certain Economic Activities or of Certain Economic Areas 203  

4 Regional Aids 204  
4.1 General Conditions 204  
4.2 Community Average and National Average 205  
4.3 Ad hoc Aid 206  
4.4 Sectoral Impact of Regional Aids 207  

5 Restructuring Aids 209  
5.1 Concept 209  
5.2 The Choice between Restructuring and Dismantling of a Company in Difficulties 209  
5.3 The Requirement of a Restructuring Plan 210  
5.4 The Viability Test 212  
5.5 The Criterion of Inducement 213  
5.6 Individual Character of Restructuring Plans 214  
5.7 Reduction of Capacity and Related Conditions 215  
5.8 The Amount of Restructuring Aid 216  

6 Other forms of Aid 218  
6.1 Sectoral Aids 218  
6.2 Operating Aid 218  
6.3 Investment Aid 220  
6.4 Environmental Aid 221  

7 Article 87(3)(e) EC: Derogation by the Council 222  
7.1 Scope of Derogating Rules Adopted under Article 87(3)(e) EC 222  
7.2 Narrow Interpretation of Derogating Rules Adopted under Article 87(3)(e) EC 223  

## Chapter 13  
Guidelines of the Commission 227  

1 Concept 227  
2 Power of the Commission to Issue and Apply Guidelines 228  
2.1 Issuing of Guidelines 228
# Table of Contents

2.2 Application of Guidelines 230
2.3 Obligation of the Commission to Apply its Guidelines 231
3 Rules of Interpretation 232
4 Court Review 234
4.1 Review of the Issuing of Guidelines 234
4.2 Review of the Application of Guidelines 234

## Chapter 14
Supervision of State Aids (Article 88 EC) 237

1 General Features 237
   1.1 Aim of the Procedure of Article 88 EC 237
   1.2 Legal Nature of the Procedure under Article 88 EC 238
   1.3 Council Regulation 659/1999 239

2 The Administrative Procedure 240
   2.1 Stages of the Administrative Procedure 240
   2.2 Parties Involved in the Administrative Procedure 242
      2.2.1 Member States 242
      2.2.2 Third Parties 242
      2.2.3 Position of the Recipient of State Aid 243
   2.3 Rights of Defence and other Principles 244

3 National Courts 246
   3.1 Division of Competences 246
   3.2 Classification as State Aid 247
   3.3 Compatibility of State Aids 248

## Chapter 15
Existing Aids and New Aids 251

1 Notion of Existing Aid and New Aid 251
   1.1 Aid Existing before the Entry into Force of the EC Treaty 251
   1.2 Authorized Aid 252
   1.3 Conversion of New Aid into Existing Aid 253
   1.4 Evolution of the Common Market 254
   1.5 Alterations to Existing Aid 256

2 The Regime for Existing Aids 258
   2.1 Constant Review 258
   2.2 Incompatibility Ex Nunc 259
   2.3 Powers of the Commission 260
   2.4 Guidelines of the Commission 261

3 The Classification as Existing Aid or as New Aid 263
   3.1 Classification According to Objective Criteria 263
   3.2 The Decision Opening the Formal Investigation Procedure 264
3.2.1 Legal Consequences 264
3.2.2 Provisional Nature of the Classification 265
3.2.3 Procedural Requirements 266
4 Misuse of Existing Aid 267
4.1 Concept 267
4.2 Powers of the Commission 268

Chapter 16
Aid Schemes 271

1 Concept 271
2 Position under Articles 87 and 88 EC 272
   2.1 Scope of Articles 87 and 88 EC 272
   2.2 Assessment by the Commission 272
3 Individual Aid Granted on the Basis of Approved Aid Schemes 274
   3.1 Absence of Notification 274
   3.2 Compatibility of Individual Aid with an Approved Aid Scheme 275

Chapter 17
Notification of Aid Plans 279

1 Aim of the Obligation to Notify 279
2 Notification by the Member State 280
   2.1 Obligation of the Member State 280
   2.2 Concept of Notification by the Member State 281
   2.3 Assessment of the Necessity to Notify Aid by the Member States and National Courts 282
3 Scope of the Obligation to Notify 283
   3.1 All Plans to Grant or to Alter State Aid 283
   3.2 Meaning of Plans to Grant or to Alter Aid 284
   3.3 The Final Version of the Aid Plan 285
   3.4 Method of Financing 285
   3.5 Derogations from the Obligation to Notify 286
4 Concept of Notification 287
   4.1 Complete Notification 287
   4.2 Requests for Additional Information 289
5 Consequences of Notification 290
   5.1 Suspension of the Implementation of Aid Plans 290
   5.2 Fixation of the Criteria for the Assessment of the Compatibility of Aid 290
   5.3 Start of the Two-month’s Period for the Preliminary Investigation Procedure 292
Chapter 18
The Preliminary Investigation Procedure

1 Aim 295
2 Rights and Obligations of Member States and Individuals 296
   2.1 Duty of Loyal Cooperation 296
   2.2 Rights of Individuals 297
      2.2.1 General Principle 297
      2.2.2 No Right to Communication of Documents 297
      2.2.3 No Right to be Heard 298
3 Duration of the Preliminary Investigation Procedure 299
   3.1 The Period of Two Months 299
   3.2 Un-notified Aid 301
   3.3 Start of the Two Month’s Period 301
   3.4 Delay to Initiate the Formal Investigation Procedure 302
   3.5 Extension of the Two Month’s Period 303
4 Expiry of the Two Months Period 304
   4.1 Decisions Taken after the Two Month’s Period 304
   4.2 Implementation of Notified Aid 304
   4.3 Prior Notice to the Commission 306
   4.4 Objections by the Commission within Fifteen Working Days 306
   4.5 Absence of Prior Notice 307
5 Result of the Preliminary Investigation Procedure 308
   5.1 Possible Results 308
   5.2 Decisions of the Commission not to Raise Objections 310
      5.2.1 Conditions 310
      5.2.2 Legal Effect 311
6 Initiation of the Formal Investigation Procedure 312
   6.1 Obligation to Initiate the Formal Investigation Procedure 312
   6.2 The Criterion of serious Difficulties 316
      6.2.1 Objective Character 316
      6.2.2 Assessment by the Commission 316
      6.2.3 Burden of Proof 317
      6.2.4 Court Review 318
   6.3 Factors Indicating the Existence of Serious Difficulties 319
   6.4 Factors Indicating the Absence of Serious Difficulties 322

Chapter 19
The Formal Investigation Procedure

1 General Features 325
   1.1 Aim and Significance 325
   1.2 Notified Aid and Unlawful Aid 326
   1.3 Distinction from the Preliminary Investigation Procedure 327
   1.4 Procedure between the Commission and the Member State 328
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2. The Notice to the Parties Concerned to Submit their Comments</td>
<td>329</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1 Notion of Parties Concerned</td>
<td>329</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2 Obligation to Give Notice</td>
<td>332</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3 Purpose of the Notice to the Parties Concerned</td>
<td>333</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4 Form of the Notice the Parties Concerned</td>
<td>334</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4.1 Communication in the Official Journal</td>
<td>334</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4.2 Uninformed Parties</td>
<td>335</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Opening of the Formal Investigation Procedure</td>
<td>336</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1 The Decision Opening the Formal Investigation Procedure</td>
<td>336</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2 Contents of a Decision Opening the Formal Investigation Procedure</td>
<td>337</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.1 Enabling an Effective Participation</td>
<td>337</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.2 Responsibility of Parties Concerned to Inform the Commission</td>
<td>339</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.3 Deadlines for the Submission of Information</td>
<td>340</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3 Legal Effect of the Opening of the Formal Investigation Procedure</td>
<td>341</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4 Provisional Nature of the Assessments in the Opening Decision</td>
<td>343</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5 Court Review</td>
<td>345</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6 Consequences of Infringements of the Right to be Heard</td>
<td>345</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Position of Parties Concerned During the Formal Investigation Procedure</td>
<td>347</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Duration of the Formal Investigation Procedure</td>
<td>352</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Scope of the Investigation</td>
<td>355</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1 Information by the Member States</td>
<td>355</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.2 Previous Decisions on State Aid</td>
<td>356</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3 Involvement of Experts</td>
<td>357</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Closure of the Formal Investigation Procedure</td>
<td>358</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.1 Types and Addressee of the Decisions</td>
<td>358</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2 Conditional Decisions</td>
<td>359</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.3 Compliance</td>
<td>360</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Re-opening of the Formal Investigation Procedure</td>
<td>360</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Revocation of a Decision</td>
<td>362</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Chapter 20**  
**Unlawful Aid**  

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. The Prohibition to Implement Aid</td>
<td>363</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1 Aim and Significance</td>
<td>363</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2 Scope of the Prohibition</td>
<td>364</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2.1 Granting of State Aid</td>
<td>364</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2.2 All Forms of New State Aid</td>
<td>365</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2.3 Duration of the Prohibition</td>
<td>366</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Concept of Unlawful Aid</td>
<td>367</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1 Aid Granted in Infringement of Article 88(3) EC</td>
<td>367</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table of Contents

2.2 Unlawful Aid and Incompatible Aid 368
2.3 Unlawful Aid Declared Compatible 369
3 Investigation of Unlawful Aid by the Commission 369
3.1 Preliminary Investigation 369
  3.1.1 Non-applicability of the Two Months Period 369
  3.1.2 No Conversion into Existing Aid 370
  3.1.3 Parties Concerned 370
3.2 Formal Investigation Procedure 371
4 Powers of the Commission with Respect to Unlawful Aid 373
4.1 Decisions to Abolish or to Alter Incompatible Aid 373
4.2 Information Injunction 374
  4.2.1 Scope 374
  4.2.2 Failure to Comply with an Information Injunction 376
  4.2.3 Absence of an Information Injunction 378
4.3 Suspension Injunction 379
4.4 Provisional Recovery Injunctions 380
4.5 Reference to the Community Courts 380
5 Involvement of National Courts 381
5.1 Direct Effect of Article 88(3), Last Sentence, EC 381
5.2 Available Remedies 382
5.3 Division of Competences between the Commission and National Courts 383
  5.3.1 General Principles 383
  5.3.2 Assessment of the Compatibility of Aid 384
  5.3.3 Protection of the Rights of Persons Concerned 385
5.4 Duty of National Courts under Article 88(3), Last Sentence EC 386
  5.4.1 Duty to take all Necessary Measures 386
  5.4.2 Suspension and Recovery of Unlawful Aid 388
  5.4.3 Recovery of Unlawful Aid Declared Compatible 389
  5.4.4 Reimbursement of Illegal Taxes 390
  5.4.5 Compensation of Damages 391
  5.4.6 Interests to be taken into Account 391
6 Unlawful Aid and Legitimate Expectations 392
6.1 Non Compliance with the Procedure of Article 88 EC 392
6.2 Absence of Notification 393
6.3 Absence of Approval by the Commission 394
6.4 Actions for Annulment against a Decision Approving Aid 395

Chapter 21
Recovery of Incompatible Aid 397

1 Aim 397
  1.1 Elimination of the Distortion of Competition 397
  1.2 Re-establishment of the Previous Situation 398
2 Decisions of the Commission to Recover Incompatible Aid 401
  2.1 Powers of the Commission 401
Table of Contents

2.2 Discretion of the Commission
2.3 Compatibility with the Principle of Proportionality

3 The Obligation to Recover Incompatible Aid
3.1 Unconditional Nature of Recovery Decisions
3.2 Implementation by National Authorities
3.3 General Conditions for the Implementation of Recovery Decisions
3.4 Implementation According to National Law
3.5 The Principles of Equality and Effectiveness
3.6 Involvement of National Courts

4 Determination of the Amount to be Recovered
4.1 Duties of the Commission and the Member State
4.2 Recovery of the Full Amount of the Unlawful Aid
4.3 The Taking into Account of Tax Implications
4.4 Recovery of Interest
4.4.1 Obligation to Recover Interest
4.4.2 Interest Advantages
4.4.3 Period to be taken into Account
4.5 Measures to Obtain Recovery of Illegal Aid
4.5.1 Capital Contributions and Loans
4.5.2 Tax Reductions
4.5.3 Other forms than Cash Payments
4.5.4 Preferential Prices

5 Recovery of Incompatible Aid and the Recipient
5.1 Recovery from the Actual Recipient of the Aid
5.1.1 Condition of Actual Use
5.1.2 Sale of Companies having benefited from State Aid
5.1.3 Measures to Circumvent Recovery
5.2 Irrelevance of Possible Consequences for the Recipient of Illegal Aid
5.3 Absence of Legitimate Expectations
5.3.1 General Principles
5.3.2 Exceptional Circumstances
5.3.3 Irrelevant Circumstances
5.3.4 Legitimate Expectations Invoked by the Member State

6 Non Compliance with a Decision to Recover State Aid
6.1 Reference to the Court
6.2 Absolute Impossibility
6.2.1 Concept
6.2.2 Absence of Absolute Impossibility
6.2.3 Duty of Loyal Cooperation with the Commission

7 Limitation
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter 22</th>
<th>Statement of Reasons of State Aid Decisions</th>
<th>443</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>General Principles</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1</td>
<td>Concept and Significance</td>
<td>443</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>Statement of Reasons and Operative Part of the Decision</td>
<td>447</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>Distinction between Statement of Reasons and Substantive Legality</td>
<td>448</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Extent of the Duty to State Reasons</td>
<td>450</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>Interests of Third Parties</td>
<td>450</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>Degree of Precision</td>
<td>451</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>The Commission's Decision-making Practice</td>
<td>453</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4</td>
<td>Explanations Given Ex Post Facto</td>
<td>455</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>Professional Secrecy</td>
<td>456</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6</td>
<td>Consequences of Insufficient Reasoning</td>
<td>456</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Statement of Reasons and Article 87 EC</td>
<td>457</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>Existence of State Aid</td>
<td>457</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>Trade and Competition</td>
<td>458</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>Compatible and Incompatible Aid</td>
<td>460</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>Existing Aid</td>
<td>461</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Decisions Relating to the Formal Investigation Procedure</td>
<td>461</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>Decisions not to Initiate the Formal Investigation Procedure</td>
<td>461</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>Decisions to Initiate the Formal Investigation Procedure</td>
<td>462</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>Decisions Closing the Formal Investigation Procedure</td>
<td>463</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4</td>
<td>Decisions to Reject a Complaint</td>
<td>463</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5</td>
<td>Decisions Ordering the Recovery of Incompatible Aid</td>
<td>464</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter 23</th>
<th>Proceedings Brought by the Commission Against a Member State</th>
<th>467</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Relation between Articles 226-227 EC and Article 88(2) EC</td>
<td>467</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Time Limits</td>
<td>468</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Burden of Proof</td>
<td>469</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Defence Available to a Member State</td>
<td>469</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Conservatory Measures</td>
<td>472</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter 24</th>
<th>Judicial Protection: General Issues</th>
<th>473</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Reviewable Acts</td>
<td>473</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1</td>
<td>Acts not Producing Legal Effects</td>
<td>473</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>Decisions of the Commission not to Initiate the Formal Investigation Procedure</td>
<td>474</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Table of Contents

1.3 Decisions of the Commission to Open the Formal Investigation Procedure 474
1.4 Decisions of the Commission Closing the Formal Investigation Procedure 476
1.5 Refusal by the Commission to Bring Proceedings before the Court 477
1.6 Refusal by the Commission to Propose Appropriate Measures 478

2 The Requirement of a Vested and Present Interest 479
3 Time Limits 481
4 Direct and Individual Concern 483
   4.1 General Principles 483
   4.2 Actual or Potential Recipient of the Aid 484
   4.3 Public Bodies Granting Aid 486
5 Locus Standi of Trade Associations 486
   5.1 Entitlement to Bring an Action 486
   5.2 A Trade Association Acting in Place of its Members 487
      5.2.1 Members having Locus Standi 487
      5.2.2 Members not having Locus Standi 489
   5.3 Conditions for Having Specific Locus Standi 490
      5.3.1 Normal Exercise of Procedural Rights 490
      5.3.2 Status as a Negotiator of the State Aid Measure 492

6 Trade Unions and Their Members 493
7 Individual Actions against Decisions Concerning Aid Schemes 494
8 Article 230 EC and Article 234 EC 496
9 Assessment of the Legality of State Aid Decisions 499
   9.1 Information Available at the Time of Adoption 499
   9.2 Failure to Provide Information 500
   9.3 Legal Pleas 503

## Chapter 25
### Judicial Protection of Competitors 505

1 Decisions Taken after the Preliminary Investigation Procedure 505
   1.1 The Requirement of Individual Concern 505
   1.2 The Status of a ‘Party Concerned’ 506
      1.2.1 Competing Undertakings Affected in their Competitive Position 506
      1.2.2 Burden of Proof 507
      1.2.3 Absence of a Competitive Relationship 508
      1.2.4 Tax Exemptions 508
   1.3 Purpose of the Action 509
      1.3.1 Compliance with the Procedural Guarantees of Article 88(2) EC 509
      1.3.2 Challenging the Merits of the Decision of the Commission 511
Table of Contents

2 Decisions Closing the Formal Investigation Procedure 512
   2.1 The Requirement of Individual Concern 512
   2.2 The Requirement of a Special Competitive Relationship 514
      2.2.1 A Distinctive Competitive Situation 514
      2.2.2 Meaning of 'Substantially Affected' 515
   2.3 Participation in the Administrative Procedure 517
   2.4 Non Participation in the Administrative Procedure 519
3 The Requirement of Direct Concern 520

Chapter 26
Complaints on State Aid 521

1 Treatment of Complaints 521
   1.1 Diligent and Impartial Examination 521
   1.2 Duration 522
2 Judicial Protection 525
   2.1 Reviewable Acts 525
   2.2 Admissibility of Actions against Decisions Rejecting a Complaint 525

Chapter 27
Derogations by the Council From Article 87 EC 529

1 Scope of the Council’s Power under Article 88(2) EC 529
2 Nature of the Council’s Power under Article 88(2) EC 529
3 Limits to the Council’s Power under Article 88(2) EC 530

Annexes

1 Articles 87 - 89 EC 533