PERNILLA RENDAHL

Cross-Border Consumption Taxation of Digital Supplies

A Comparative Study of Double Taxation and Unintentional Non-Taxation of B2C E-Commerce

JONköPING INTERNATIONAL BUSINESS SCHOOL
JONköPING UNIVERSITY
Table of Contents

PART I - THE BASIS FOR CROSS-BORDER CONSUMPTION TAXATION

1 INTRODUCTION .................................................................................. 21
   1.1 THE SUBJECT .............................................................................. 21
   1.2 AIM OF THE STUDY ..................................................................... 25
   1.3 DELIMITATIONS ......................................................................... 26
   1.4 METHOD ..................................................................................... 29
   1.5 TERMINOLOGY ........................................................................... 34
      1.5.1 Initial Remarks ..................................................................... 34
      1.5.2 E-commerce ......................................................................... 34
      1.5.3 Digital Supplies ................................................................... 36
      1.5.4 Consumption Taxation ......................................................... 36
      1.5.5 Double Taxation .................................................................. 38
      1.5.6 Consumer or Non-Taxable Person ....................................... 39
      1.5.7 Bundled, Combined or Mixed Supplies ................................ 40
   1.6 PREVIOUS RESEARCH ................................................................. 41
   1.7 OUTLINE ..................................................................................... 43

2 LEGAL SOURCES AND METHODS OF INTERPRETATION ... 45
   2.1 INITIAL REMARKS ...................................................................... 45
   2.2 SOURCES OF EC LAW ................................................................. 46
      2.2.1 The Legislative Framework ................................................ 46
      2.2.2 Freedom to Provide and Receive Services ............................ 48
      2.2.3 The Relationship between EC Law and the National Law of the Member States ......................................................... 52
      2.2.4 The Legal Base for VAT ....................................................... 57
      2.2.5 Conclusions ......................................................................... 57
   2.3 SOURCES OF CANADIAN AND AUSTRALIAN LAW ............ 58
      2.3.1 The English Heritage .......................................................... 58
      2.3.2 The Relationship between Federal Law and Provincial/State Law ................................................................. 59
      2.3.3 The Legal Base for GST ....................................................... 60
      2.3.4 Conclusions ......................................................................... 61
   2.4 CASE LAW AND METHODS OF INTERPRETATION ............... 61
      2.4.1 Courts Primarily Dealing with Tax Cases ............................. 61
      2.4.2 Selection of Case Law .......................................................... 64
### 3 FORMING AN EVALUATION MODEL

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>Background: The Ottawa Taxation Framework Conditions...</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>Neutrality</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.1</td>
<td>Ottawa Taxation Framework Conditions</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.2</td>
<td>The EU</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.3</td>
<td>Canada and Australia</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.4</td>
<td>Aspects of Neutrality in Doctrine</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.5</td>
<td>Neutrality as Used in this Study</td>
<td>93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>Efficiency</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.1</td>
<td>Ottawa Taxation Framework Conditions</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.2</td>
<td>The EU</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.3</td>
<td>Canada and Australia</td>
<td>97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.4</td>
<td>Aspects of Efficiency in Doctrine</td>
<td>98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.5</td>
<td>Efficiency as Used in this Study</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>Certainty and Simplicity</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.1</td>
<td>Ottawa Taxation Framework Conditions</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.2</td>
<td>The EU</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.3</td>
<td>Canada and Australia</td>
<td>101</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.4</td>
<td>Aspects of Certainty and Simplicity in Doctrine</td>
<td>102</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.5</td>
<td>Certainty and Simplicity as Used in this Study</td>
<td>103</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>Effectiveness and Fairness</td>
<td>104</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5.1</td>
<td>Ottawa Taxation Framework Conditions</td>
<td>104</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5.2</td>
<td>The EU</td>
<td>104</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5.3</td>
<td>Canada and Australia</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5.4</td>
<td>Aspects of Effectiveness and Fairness in Doctrine</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5.5</td>
<td>Effectiveness and Fairness as Used in this Study</td>
<td>112</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6</td>
<td>Flexibility</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6.1</td>
<td>Ottawa Taxation Framework Conditions</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6.2</td>
<td>The EU</td>
<td>114</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6.3</td>
<td>Canada and Australia</td>
<td>114</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6.4</td>
<td>Aspects of Flexibility in Doctrine</td>
<td>114</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6.5</td>
<td>Flexibility as Used in this Study</td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.7</td>
<td>The Place of Consumption</td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.7.1</td>
<td>What is the Place of Consumption?</td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.7.2</td>
<td>The Use of Place of Consumption as an Evaluation Tool</td>
<td>118</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.8</td>
<td>The Model</td>
<td>118</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4 IMPOSITION OF VAT AND GST ........................................... 121

4.1 COMMON ISSUES ...................................................... 121
4.2 DISTINGUISHING SUPPLIES OF GOODS FROM SUPPLIES OF SERVICES .......................... 122
   4.2.1 The EU .......................................................... 122
   4.2.2 Canada .......................................................... 125
   4.2.3 Australia ....................................................... 127
   4.2.4 Conclusions ................................................. 130
4.3 COMBINED OR BUNDLED SUPPLIES .................................. 131
   4.3.1 The EU .......................................................... 131
   4.3.2 Canada .......................................................... 137
   4.3.3 Australia ....................................................... 143
   4.3.4 Conclusions ................................................. 145
4.4 FULFILLING THE BASIC CHARACTERISTICS OF TAXABLE SUPPLIES ......................... 145
   4.4.1 The EU .......................................................... 145
       4.4.1.1 Supplies of Services Effected for Consideration .......... 145
       4.4.1.2 Supplies of Services by a Taxable Person ................ 153
   4.4.2 Canada .......................................................... 155
   4.4.3 Australia ....................................................... 157
   4.4.4 Conclusions ................................................. 163
4.5 EFFECTS OF THE ISSUES RELATED TO IMPOSING VAT AND GST ON DIGITAL SUPPLIES ............. 164

PART II - CLASSIFICATION & PLACE OF SUPPLY

5 CLASSIFICATION OF DIGITAL SUPPLIES .................................. 167

5.1 THE PROBLEMS CONCERNING CLASSIFICATION .................................................. 167
5.2 THE EU .............................................................. 168
   5.2.1 Scope of Articles Affecting Digital Supplies .................................. 168
   5.2.2 Telecommunication Services .............................................. 172
   5.2.3 Electronically Supplied Services .............................................. 176
   5.2.4 Radio and Television Broadcasting Services ................................. 186
   5.2.5 Services Related to Immovable Property ...................................... 189
   5.2.6 Cultural and Similar Services ............................................... 191
   5.2.7 Supplies Covering Transfers and Assignments of Rights ................... 194
   5.2.8 Advertising Services .................................................. 195
   5.2.9 Services of Consultants, Data Processing and Information .................. 197
   5.2.10 Delimiting Financial Services from Electronically Supplied Services ....... 199
   5.2.11 Conclusions ................................................... 200
5.3 CANADA ............................................................ 202
   5.3.1 Scope of Articles affecting Digital Supplies .................................. 202
   5.3.2 Telecommunication Services .............................................. 203
   5.3.3 Intangible Personal Property ............................................... 209
   5.3.4 Services ....................................................... 215
5.3.5 Conclusions ................................................................. 217
5.4 AUSTRALIA .................................................................. 218
  5.4.1 The Scope of Articles Affecting Digital Supplies .......... 218
  5.4.2 Telecommunication Supply ........................................ 220
  5.4.3 Supplies of Anything Else ........................................... 221
  5.4.4 Conclusions ............................................................ 226
5.5 THE RESULTS FROM THE COMPARISON .................. 226

6 .................................................. DECIDING THE PLACE OF SUPPLY ........................................ 231
6.1 PRINCIPLES GOVERNING THE PLACE OF SUPPLY .......... 231
6.2 THE EU ................................................................. 233
  6.2.1 Telecommunication Services ...................................... 233
  6.2.2 Electronically supplied services ................................... 236
  6.2.3 Radio and Television Broadcasting Services ............... 237
  6.2.4 Traditional Services Delivered Digitally ..................... 239
  6.2.5 Fixed Establishment According to the ECJ .................... 242
  6.2.6 The One-Stop-Scheme .............................................. 248
  6.2.7 Conclusions .......................................................... 250
6.3 CANADA ............................................................ 252
  6.3.1 The Legislative Framework ....................................... 252
  6.3.2 Telecommunication Services ...................................... 254
  6.3.3 Intangible Personal Property ..................................... 255
  6.3.4 Services ............................................................... 260
  6.3.5 Carrying on Business in Canada ............................... 264
  6.3.6 Permanent Establishment ......................................... 273
  6.3.7 Conclusions .......................................................... 280
6.4 AUSTRALIA .......................................................... 281
  6.4.1 The Legislative Framework ....................................... 281
  6.4.2 Telecommunication Supply ...................................... 281
  6.4.3 Other Types of Supplies .......................................... 284
  6.4.4 Permanent Establishment ......................................... 292
  6.4.5 Conclusions .......................................................... 294
6.5 ADVANTAGES AND DISADVANTAGES WITH THE CURRENT RULES ............... 295

PART III - EVALUATION & CONCLUSIONS

7 .................................................. DOUBLE TAXATION AND UNINTENTIONAL NON-TAXATION ............................................. 299
7.1 FINDINGS FROM THE COMPARATIVE STUDY .................. 299
7.2 CASES OF DOUBLE TAXATION ....................................... 300
7.3 CASES OF UNINTENTIONAL NON-TAXATION .................... 305
7.4 A RATIONAL CONSUMPTION TAXATION OF DIGITAL SUPPLIES? 307