Integration Approaches to Group Taxation in the European Internal Market

Ioanna Mitroyanni
# Table of Contents

Acknowledgments xv
About the Author xvii

Introduction 1

Chapter 1
The Jurisprudence of the ECJ Relevant to Groups 5

I. The Principles 6
A. The Concepts of ‘Allocation’ and ‘Exercise’ 6
B. The Test for ‘Equal Treatment’ 8
1. Discrimination or Restriction? 8
2. The Origin and Host State 10
3. Grounds for Justification 11
4. Situations Engaging Third Countries 11

II. The Specific Areas 13
A. Distributions 13
1. The Rules in the Origin State 14
2. Outbound Dividend Distributions 17
   a. The Tax Position of the Distributing Subsidiary 18
   b. The Tax Position of the Recipient Company 19
B. Group Loss Relief 22
1. Domestic Group Losses in a Multinational Consortium Structure 22
2. Consideration of Foreign Group Losses: The M&S Litigation 23
   a. The Special Commissioners’ Decision 24
   b. The Opinion of the Advocate General 24
Table of Contents

C. The Judgment of the Court 26
   d. Commentary 28
      i. Is 'Allocation' of Taxing Jurisdiction Subjected to the Freedoms? 28
      ii. 'Coherence' and the 'Balanced Allocation of Taxing Power' 29

C. The Treatment of Permanent Establishments by the Host State 33

D. Intra-group Asset Transfers 35

E. Tax Avoidance
   1. The Concept of Abuse in Taxes 37
      a. Abuse and VAT: Halifax 38
      b. Abuse and CFC Legislation: Cadbury Schweppes 40
      c. Abuse and Thin Capitalization: Lankhorst and Thin Cap GLO 42
      d. Abuse and Exit Taxation 45
   2. Switch-Over Clauses 45

Chapter 2
Positive Integration Relevant to Groups 49
I. Unsuccessful Integration Efforts up to the Early 1990s 49
II. Successful Legislative Initiatives 53
   A. Parent-Subsidiary Directive 54
   B. EC Merger Directive 55
   C. EU Arbitration Convention and Soft Law on Transfer Pricing 56
   D. Interest and Royalties Directive 58
III. Future Developments 58

Chapter 3
Deriving Examples from Corporate Tax Systems at Sub-federal Level: Canada, Switzerland and the United States of America 61
I. Canada 62
   A. An Overview 62
   B. Fiscal Federalism in Corporation Tax 64
   C. Commentary 67
II. Switzerland 68
   A. An Overview 68
   B. Fiscal Federalism in Corporate Tax 69
   C. Commentary 72
III. The United States of America 74
   A. An Overview 74
Table of Contents

B. Fiscal Federalism in Corporate Tax 75
   1. The Commerce Clause 76
   2. The Due Process Clause 80
C. Commentary 81

Chapter 4
Policy Approaches to Corporation Taxes in Closely Integrated Markets 85
I. Is Regulation Necessary for Corporate Tax Coordination in the EIM? 86
II. Principles for an Efficient Setting for Groups of Companies in the EIM 88
   A. Challenges Presented by Closely Integrated Multi-jurisdictional Markets 89
   B. Neutrality as the Key Concept in Integrated Markets 91

Chapter 5
Entitlement to Membership of the Group 95
I. Systems of Entitlement to Group Membership 96
   A. Holding Percentage 97
      1. The Rule 97
      2. National Systems in Europe 97
      3. Commentary 99
   B. Control 100
      1. Introduction 100
      2. The United Kingdom 100
      3. France 102
      4. Germany 104
   C. Unitary Taxation 106
      1. Introduction 106
      2. The History 107
      3. Divergent Definitions: Jurisprudence and Theory 107
      4. Commentary 111
   D. Value-Added Tax Grouping 112
II. A Choice for the EIM 114
   A. The Interaction among Tests for Entitlement to Group Membership 114
   B. A Rule for Defining Group Membership in the EIM 116

Chapter 6
The Group Tax Base 121
I. Models of Tax Base Integration 122
   A. Clarification of Terms: Consolidation, Pooling, Loss Transfer, (Profit) Contribution 122
B. The Group Tax Base and Allocation Systems:
The Interrelation 126
1. Consolidation/Pooling and FA 126
2. Consolidation/Pooling and Separate Accounting 127

II. Harmonization versus Diversity 127
A. Computation of the Tax Base 128
B. Harmonization: Tax Base versus Tax Rates 130

III. The Consolidation of the Tax Base 132
A. Revenues Qualifying as Part of the Group Tax Base 132
B. The Treatment of Intra-group Transactions in a Setting of Consolidation 135
1. Sales of Goods 137
2. Transfers of Assets 138
3. Payments of Dividends, Interest, Royalties and Rents 138
C. The Treatment of Losses 139
D. Hidden Reserves and Transfers of Assets 140

Chapter 7
International Aspects 143
I. The Territorial Scope of the Group 144
A. How a Territorial Definition of the Combined Group Evolved in the United States 144
1. Historical Development 145
2. The Post-Barclays State of Affairs 148
3. A Critical Approach to the Conflict Generated by Worldwide Combination 149
B. A Policy Choice for the EIM 151
1. ‘Water’s Edge’ for the EC 151
2. Tests for Determining Participation in ‘Water’s Edge’ 153
   a. The US 153
   b. The Draft Proposal of the European Commission for a CCCTB Group 154
II. The Impact on Double Tax Conventions 155
A. Income Inflows 156
1. Double Tax Conventions between Member States and Third Countries 156
   a. The Rules Proposed by the European Commission for the CCCTB Scheme 157
   b. Possible Clashes between the Rules for Relief and DTCs 158
   c. The Need for Common Definitions 159
   d. The Apportionment of Credit 159
Table of Contents

2. Double Tax Conventions between Member States 161
   a. The Rules Proposed by the European Commission for the CCCTB Scheme 161
   b. The Applicable DTCs 161
3. Double Tax Conventions between Opting-Out and Opting-In Member States in a Framework of Enhanced Cooperation 162

B. Income Outflows 163
   1. Double Tax Conventions between Member States and Third Countries 163
      a. The DTC-Related Implications of Consolidating Income from PEs Owned by Entities Located in a Third Country 164
      b. The Treatment of Withholding Taxes Charged on Outbound Payments by Consolidated Group Members 167
   2. Double Tax Conventions between Member States 168
   3. Double Tax Conventions between Opting-Out and Opting-In Member States in a Context of Enhanced Cooperation 168

III. Anti-avoidance Measures Relevant to the International Aspects of Consolidation 169
   A. The Key Features of Tax Anti-avoidance Measures 170
      1. Protecting the Consolidated Tax Base against Income Shifted towards Third Countries 170
      2. Protecting the Consolidated Tax Base against Income Shifted towards other Member States 172
   B. CFC Legislation 173
   C. Thin Capitalization 174

Chapter 8
Formulary Apportionment 179
I. Methods for Allocating Profits within a Corporate Group: Arm's Length Separate Accounting versus FA 180
   A. Separate Accounting 181
   B. Formulary Apportionment 181
   C. A Comparison 182
      1. Allocation of Taxable Profit within MNEs 183
      2. The Requirement for an Integrated Internal Market 185
   II. FA in the US, Canada, Switzerland and Germany 185
      A. The United States of America 186
      B. Canada 188
      C. Switzerland 189
      D. Germany 190
Table of Contents

III. FA in the EC Group Taxation Initiative
   A. Uniform FA for the EC? 190
   B. The Factors 192
      2. Industry-Specific Formulae 193
      3. Defining the Factors 194
         a. Financial Accounts versus Tax Accounts 195
      4. The VAT-based FA

Chapter 9
Administrative Issues 199
I. Administrative Procedures 200
   A. Registration/Notification 200
      1. The Procedure for Group Registration 200
      2. The Term of the Group and the Timing Aspects of the Right to Consolidate 201
   B. Tax Return Filings 203
   C. Exchange of Information 205
   D. Tax Audits 208
   U. Dispute Resolution 209
      A. Disputes between Member States 209
         1. Common Rules for Legal Certainty 210
         2. Resolution of Disputes through the Ordinary Court Procedure 211
         3. Settlement of Disputes through Negotiation and Arbitration 212
      B. Disputes between Taxpayers and Tax Authorities 215
         1. Settlement at the Level of the Administration or the Judiciary? 216
         2. Establishing Jurisdiction of the National Courts 216
         3. Taxpayers’ Standing to Appeal Directly to the ECJ 217

Chapter 10
Bringing Together the Elements of the Scheme 219
I. The Elements of the Scheme 220
   A. Entitlement to Group Membership 220
   B. The Group Tax Base 221
   C. The International Aspects 222
   D. Formulary Apportionment 223
   E. Administrative Matters 224
II. Evaluation of the Prospects for Implementation and Future Potential 224
Table of Contents

Bibliography xiii

Legislation 227

EC Policy Documents 249

List of Cases 253

List of Cases 257