

# Challenging Health Economics

Gavin Mooney

**OXFORD**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

# Contents

|                         |      |
|-------------------------|------|
| <i>Acknowledgements</i> | xi   |
| <i>Preface</i>          | xiii |

## **PART I Background and Critique**

|   |    |
|---|----|
| 1 Why a New Paradigm?                                       | 3  |
| 1.1 Introduction  | 3  |
| 1.2 Some problems with the current paradigm                 | 4  |
| 1.3 A path through the book                                 | 11 |
| 2 Some Problems in Existing Health Economics                | 16 |
| 2.1 Introduction  | 16 |
| 2.2 Health economics in health care                         | 16 |
| 2.3 Health economics in health                              | 19 |
| 2.4 The commodity health care                               | 21 |
| 2.5 Two other issues  | 25 |
| 2.6 Health economics and health policy                      | 27 |
| 2.7 Conclusion  | 30 |
| 3 The Lack of a Comprehensive Paradigm                      | 34 |
| 3.1 Introduction  | 34 |
| 3.2 Market failure, but then what?                          | 35 |
| 3.3 Market failure—yes but . . .                            | 36 |
| 3.3.1 <i>Agency and uncertainty on the demand side</i>      | 36 |
| 3.3.2 <i>Externalities and public goods</i>                 | 39 |
| 3.4 Extra-welfarism's health maximand                       | 40 |
| 3.5 Consequentialism  | 45 |
| 3.6 Conclusion  | 49 |
| 4 The Need for a New Paradigm                               | 53 |
| 4.1 Introduction  | 53 |
| 4.2 Institutional economics, health care, and public health | 55 |

## Contents

---

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| 4.3 Individualism (with dignity as an example)           | 59  |
| 4.4 Varying perspectives                                 | 61  |
| 4.5 Public health  | 65  |
| 4.6 Compassion   | 67  |
| 4.7 Conclusion   | 69  |
| 5 Neo-liberalism and its Impact on Health                | 72  |
| 5.1 Introduction   | 72  |
| 5.2 Neo-liberalism, compassion, and institutions         | 74  |
| 5.3 International organisations                          | 79  |
| 5.4 Impact of neo-liberal globalisation                  | 89  |
| 5.4.1 <i>Impact on growth</i>                            | 89  |
| 5.4.2 <i>Impact on inequalities in income and health</i> | 91  |
| 5.4.3 <i>Impact on culture</i>                           | 93  |
| 5.5 Global public goods for health                       | 95  |
| 5.6 Conclusion   | 98  |
| <br>   |     |
| <b>PART II A New Paradigm</b>                            |     |
| 6 Building the Base for the New Paradigm                 | 105 |
| 6.1 Introduction, values, and a constitution             | 105 |
| 6.2 Building a constitution                              | 107 |
| 6.3 Anderson's expressive theory                         | 111 |
| 6.4 Reflective and group preferences                     | 118 |
| 6.5 Conclusion   | 121 |
| 7 Communitarianism                                       | 124 |
| 7.1 Introduction   | 124 |
| 7.2 Community and citizenship                            | 125 |
| 7.3 The essence of communitarianism                      | 126 |
| 7.4 An economist's approach to communitarianism          | 130 |
| 7.5 Communitarianism and liberalism                      | 131 |
| 7.6 Communitarianism, choice, and culture                | 138 |
| 7.7 Conclusion   | 141 |
| 8 Communitarian Claims                                   | 144 |
| 8.1 Introduction   | 144 |
| 8.2 The new paradigm                                     | 145 |
| 8.3 Levels of preference                                 | 148 |
| 8.4 Communitarian claims                                 | 153 |

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| 8.5 Communitarian claims and the objectives of health care                              | 156 |
| 8.6 Bases for communitarian claims beyond “simple” need                                 | 159 |
| 8.7 Conclusion  | 161 |
| 8.8 Epilogue  | 163 |
| <b>PART III Some implications of the new paradigm</b>                                   |     |
| 9 A Future Health Policy: Nationally and Internationally                                | 171 |
| 9.1 Introduction  | 171 |
| 9.2 Constitution in health  | 171 |
| 9.3 Valuing institutions  | 173 |
| 9.4 Mackintosh and Navarro on health care institutions                                  | 176 |
| 9.5 Global health economics   | 179 |
| 9.6 Conclusion  | 187 |
| A9.1 Appendix: Eliciting principles and claims  | 189 |
| A9.1.1 <i>Introduction</i>  | 189 |
| A9.1.2 <i>Two examples of eliciting principles and claims</i>                           | 191 |
| 10 Priority Setting Under the New Paradigm  | 199 |
| 10.1 Introduction   | 199 |
| 10.2 Some problems with PBMA  | 200 |
| 10.3 Communitarianism and priority setting  | 202 |
| 10.4 Community capabilities—and compassion  | 205 |
| 10.5 Whither priority setting?  | 207 |
| 11 Equity under the New Paradigm  | 210 |
| 11.1 Introduction   | 210 |
| 11.2 Defining equity with reference to cultures   | 210 |
| 11.3 Whose values for equity?   | 213 |
| 11.4 Cultural issues  | 216 |
| 11.4.1 <i>A case study</i>  | 216 |
| 11.4.2 <i>Other cultural issues</i>   | 222 |
| 11.5 Other cultures   | 223 |
| 11.6 Conclusion   | 225 |
| 12 Some Further Implications for Health Economics<br>and the Economics of Health Policy | 229 |
| 12.1 Introduction   | 229 |
| 12.2 Economic evaluation  | 229 |
| 12.3 The economics of health policy   | 233 |

## Contents

---

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| 12.4 Can the new paradigm work in practice? | 239 |
| 12.5 Conclusion                             | 240 |
| <br>  |     |
| <b>PART IV Conclusion</b>                   |     |
| 13 Conclusion                               | 245 |