Competition Problems in Liberalized Telecommunications

Regulatory Solutions to Promote Effective Competition
# Table of Contents

Acknowledgments \hspace{2cm} xiii

List of Acronyms \hspace{2cm} xv

Introduction \hspace{2cm} xvii

Chapter 1
The Over-Regulation Trend and Ways to Avoid It \hspace{2cm} 1
I. The Regulation of the EU Telecoms Sector \hspace{2cm} 2
1. Where Are We Coming From? Historical Overview \hspace{2cm} 2
2. The 2002 Common Regulatory Framework: Sector-Specific Regulation in Need of a Borderline? \hspace{2cm} 10
II. Safeguards against Over-Regulation \hspace{2cm} 27
1. Framework Directive Article Seven Consultation Mechanism \hspace{2cm} 27
2. Technological Neutrality Principle \hspace{2cm} 29
3. Proportionality Principle \hspace{2cm} 35
4. Emerging Markets \hspace{2cm} 37
III. Did the Framework Deliver the Right Mix between Regulation and Free Market? Examples. \hspace{2cm} 45
1. Asymmetric Regulation \hspace{2cm} 45
2. Imposition of Access Obligations \hspace{2cm} 49
3. Is There Replicability Obligation on Incumbents? \hspace{2cm} 52
3.1 Business Line Restrictions Imposed on Incumbents \hspace{2cm} 55
3.2 AGCOM Approach to Regulating Telecom Italia \hspace{2cm} 58
3.2.1 ‘Offerta Unico’ \hspace{2cm} 58
3.2.2 ‘Alice 20 Mega’ Offer \hspace{2cm} 60
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter 2</th>
<th>Relevance of the Essential Facility Doctrine as a Remedy of Anticompetitive Unilateral Refusal of Access</th>
<th>81</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I.</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II.</td>
<td>Regulatory or Competition-Law-Induced Obligation to Supply</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Historical Remarks</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Sector-Specific Regulation v. Competition Law</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III.</td>
<td>Legal Basis and Rationale of the Essential Facilities Doctrine</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV.</td>
<td>Relevant Essential Facilities Doctrine Standard</td>
<td>97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Market Definition</td>
<td>98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Finding of Dominance</td>
<td>103</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Finding of 'Essentiality'</td>
<td>105</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>Essentiality of an Asset</td>
<td>105</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>Essentiality of a Competitor: A Policy Decision to Limit or Extend the Scope of the Essential Facility Doctrine?</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Elimination of Competition Requirement</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Objective Justification as an Antitrust Defence</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V.</td>
<td>Is Competition between the Dominant Access Supplier and Its Competitor Downstream a Necessary Condition?</td>
<td>137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI.</td>
<td>Are There Essential Facilities in the Electronic Communications Sector? Attempted Examples</td>
<td>140</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>The Local Loop</td>
<td>140</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Interface Information</td>
<td>143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VII.</td>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>144</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter 3</th>
<th>Restrictions to Market Access and Refusal to Supply Resulting from Multifirm Conduct</th>
<th>147</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I.</td>
<td>Forms of Multifirm Conduct Having the Potential to Restrict Competition in the Electronic Communications Sector</td>
<td>147</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>147</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Types of Multifirm Restrictions Falling under Competition Law</td>
<td>149</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II.</td>
<td>Applying Article 81 of the Treaty to Cooperative Agreements between Electronic Communications Providers</td>
<td>153</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Evolution in the Goals Pursued by the Commission through Application of Article 81 (1) of the Treaty</td>
<td>153</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
2. General Principles for the Assessment of Contractual Clauses Falling under Article 81 of the Treaty 155
3. Types of Agreements Falling under Article 81 (1) of the Treaty 161
   3.1 Agreements between Telecommunications Operators That Join Resources for the Achievement of a Common Project 162
      3.1.1 Non-competition Clauses 165
      3.1.2 Clauses on Exchange of Information 168
      3.1.3 Exclusivity Arrangements 169
      3.1.4 Price Agreements 172
      3.1.5 Discriminatory Clauses 173
   3.2 Cooperation Agreements for (Essential) Facilities Sharing 174
   3.3 Agreements between Electronic Communication Provider and Contractor from Another Industry 180

III. Multifirm Restrictions of Competition Dealt with under Merger Control 182
   1. General Remarks 182
   2. Horizontal Mergers 186
   3. Non-horizontal Mergers 196
      3.1 Concentrations Involving (Creating) a Vertically Integrated Electronic Communications Operator 197
      3.2 Convergence-Driven Concentrations, Involving a Telecoms Company and a Company Active in an Industry Other than the Electronic Communications: Conglomerate Mergers 201

IV. Conduciveness of the Electronic Communications Sector to Collective Dominance 208
   1. Introduction 208
   2. The Notion of ‘Collective Dominance’ 210
   3. The Airtours Test Applied to the Electronic Communications Sector 220
      3.1 First Criterion: Transparency 220
      3.2 Second Criterion: Sustainability 227
      3.3 Third Criterion: Availability of Competitive Constraints 231
      3.4 The Airtours Test Specified? 236
      3.5 The ‘Alternative Explanation’ Element 238

Chapter 4
Prevention of Competition through Anti-Competitive Pricing: The Price Squeeze Abuse 241
I. Introduction 241
II. The Practice of Applying a Price Squeeze 243
Table of Contents

III. Regulatory and Competition Law Approaches towards the Price Squeeze Problem
   1. Definition of the Relevant Market 252
   2. Market Assessment 255
   3. Remedies to Prevent or Correct the Application of a Price Squeeze by Incumbents
      3.1 Regulatory Remedies 261
      3.2 Competition Law Remedies 272

IV. Conclusion 274

Chapter 5
Challenges Facing Regulation and Competition Law Enforcement in the Electronic Communications Sector in Bulgaria

I. Legislative and Institutional Problems to Coherent Regulatory and Competition Policies in the Electronic Communications Markets 279

II. Specifics in the Development of the Electronic Communications Sector in Bulgaria 284

III. Regulatory Tools to Promote the Development of the Electronic Communications Sector 286
   1. Market Definition 286
   2. Market Assessment 288
   3. Applying Remedies to Competition Problems 293
      3.1 Remedies for Market Power Leverage 298
      3.2 Remedies to Prevent Attempts to Defend the Dominant Position and Remedies to ‘Textbook Monopoly Behaviour’ 300

IV. The Role of Competition Policy for Providing Impetus to Regulatory-Driven Reform 300
   1. Rules Favouring Industry Restructuring 301
   2. Competition Law as a Safeguard of Effective Competition 304

V. Conclusion 308
   Final Conclusion 310

Bibliography 317

Index 327