Telecommunications Competition and Its Driving Force
A Comparative Study of Telecommunications Law of the EU, the US and China

DISSERTATION

der Rechtswissenschaftlichen Fakultät
der University Zurich
zur Erlangung der Würde eines Doktors der Rechtswissenschaft

vorgelegt von

JunWu
von
V.R. China

genehmigt auf Antrag von
Prof. Dr. Rolf H. Weber

Schulthess Juristische Medien AG, Zurich
Table of Contents

Abbreviations X
Bibliography XIV
EU Regulations, Directives and the Other Relevant Rules XX

I. Break-Up of the Telecommunications Monopolies 1
   A. Collapsing Legality of the Telecommunications Monopolies 1
      1. Natural Monopoly Besieged by Technological Development 2
         a) Monopoly of AT&T Gradually Eroded 2
         b) Stale Monopoly of Telecommunications in the EU
            Countries and China 6
      2. Competition in a Globalizing Market 7
         a) Operators in the EU and China Pressed by Outside
            Competitors 7
         b) The Information Society 8
         c) China's Task to Modernize Its Telecommunications
            Industry 9
   B. Approaches to Removing the Telecommunications Monopolies 9
      1. US Antitrust Mentality 9
         a) Judicially-Imposed Antitrust Remedies for AT&T's
            Monopoly 10
         b) The 1984 MFJ 11
         c) Comments on the 1984 MFJ 16
      2. Privatization of the Telecommunications Industry 16
         a) Liberalization of the Telecommunications Industry in the
            UK 16
         b) Liberalization of the Telecommunications Industry in
            Germany 17
      3. The 1987 Green Paper of the EC 19
         a) Abolition of Exclusive or 'Special Rights 20
         b) Harmonization Based on ON P 26
      4. Initiation of Telecommunications Liberalization in China 27
         a) Monopoly Gradually Lifted 27
         b) Overseas Listing of Major State-Owned
            Telecommunications Operators 33
         c) Further Liberalization 35

II. Telecommunications Regulatory Mechanisms 39
   A. Industry-specific Regulatory Model 39
      1. Industry-Specific Regulation 39
         a) Liberalization Entails the Industry-Specific Regulation 39
         b) Industry-Specific Regulation 40
         c) Provision of Telecommunications Services for Social
            Purpose 41
      2. Industry-Specific Regulation? 41
         a) Development of the New Zealand Model 41
         b) EU Framework Directive of 2002 42
Table of Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>c) From Oftel Era to Ofcom Era</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Relations between Regulatory and Competition Authorities</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a) Natural Monopoly or Not?</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b) Mixture of Competition Law and Regulation</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Sector-Specific Regulation in China</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Independence of the Telecommunications Regulatory Authority</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Establishment of Independent NRAs in EU Member States</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a) Legal Basis</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b) Regulatory Independence in the NRF</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Establishment of an Independent Regulatory Authority in China</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a) Establishment of the Min</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b) Establishment of the State-Owned Asset Regulatory Commission (SARC)</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. Telecommunications Equipment Market</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. The Most Competitive Telecommunications Market</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Liberalization Began in the EC</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a) Terminal Equipment Directive</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b) Non-Terminal Telecommunications Equipment</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Competition in the CPE Market of the US</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a) Restrictions Imposed on AT&amp;T</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b) Relevant Requirements Set by the 1984 MFJ</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c) 1996 Telecommunications Act</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Liberalized Telecommunications Equipment Market in China</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a) Network Access Licensing System</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b) Liberalization of the Telecommunications Equipment Market</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Convergence and its Implications</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. The Convergence Trend in Telecommunications Market</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. The EU’s Acknowledgment</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a) Convergence Green Paper</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b) The Information Society Approach</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. The US</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a) Computer I</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b) Computer II</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c) Computer III</td>
<td>67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Convergence in China</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. VoIP</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a) Three Models for VoIP and Its Regulatory Implications</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b) Regulatory Policies in the EU and the US</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c) SkyPe in China</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV. Network Access and Interconnection and Last-Mile Issue</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Local Loop Access Market</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Baby Bell’s teeth and the Restrictions Forced upon Them</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a) Shaky Business Line Restrictions</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b) 1996 Telecommunications Act</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Approaches to Regulate the Local Loop Market in the EU</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a) Logic behind Liberalization Initiated by the Commission</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b) Segment-by-Segment Liberalization</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
c) Pro-Competition Approach Adopted after the Liberalization 83

B. Network Access and Interconnection 83
1. Practices for the Application of the Theory 83
   a) "Essential facilities" in US Antitrust Law 83
   b) Development of the "Essential Facilities" Doctrine in EU Competition Law 85
2. Application of the Essential Facilities Doctrine in the Sector 87
   a) US Network Access and Interconnection Regime 88
   b) Application of the Essential Facilities Doctrine in the EU 96

C. Last-Mile Issue and Network Access and Interconnection Regime of China 105
1. Last-Mile Issue in China 105
   a) Natural Monopoly? 105
   b) Intermodal Competition in China 106
   c) Trapped Incumbents and the Bounded Market 106
2. Network Access and Interconnection in China 108
   a) Development of Network Access and Interconnection Regime in China 108
   b) Interconnection Obligation Imposed on Operators 109
   c) Non-Dominant Operators 110
   d) Dominant Operators 111
   e) Outstanding Issues 113

D. Implications of Technological Developments 118
1. Cable TV Network Operators 118
   a) Cable TV Networks Touched by the Liberalization 118
   b) Cable TV Networks in the US Telecommunications Market 120
2. Development of Wireless Telecommunications Technologies 122
   a) Market Potential of Microwave Technologies 122
   b) Fixed Wireless Communications Technologies 122
   c) Mobile Telephony Business 123
3. Response from the Telecommunications Regulatory Regime 124
   a) Deliberation by the EU 125
   b) Mixed Reflection by the FCC 126
4. Number Portability, Selection of the Operator 127
   a) Number Portability 127
   b) Selection of Service Provider 128
5. Conclusion 129
   a) Facilities-Based Competition 130
   b) Technological Neutrality 130

D. Case Studies- SBC Merging with AT&T 131
1. Background 131
2. Analysis of the Local Telecommunications Market 132
   a) Product Market Definition 132
   b) Competition Analysis 134
3. Comments 137
V. Right of Way 139
   A. Right of Way in the EU and the US 139
      1. Right of Way in the EU 139
         a) Structural Separation 139
         b) General Authorization 140
      2. Right of Way in 1996 Telecommunications Act 140
         a) Access to Right of Way of all LECs 140
         b) Duty of an Utility to Provide the Right of Way 141
   B. State-Owned Land System 142
      1. Land-Use Right System in China 142
      2. Authorized Land Use System 143
      3. Right of Way in the Telecommunications Sector 144
         a) Right of Way for Infrastructure Construction 145
         b) Access to Right of Way of the Incumbents? 146

VI. Standards, Authorizations and 3G 147
   A. Battle for Standards 147
      1. Legal Implications of Telecommunications Standards 147
         a) General Competition Law Concerns 148
         b) Telecommunications Law Concern 150
      2. CDMA, W-CDMA and TD-CDMA 152
      3. Dominance of W-CDMA 153
         a) General Standard Regime 153
         b) 1998 UMTS Decision 155
         a) 2G Standards in China and Their Implication for 3G 156
         b) Feasibility of the Co-Application of the Three Standards Available 158
   B. Competition Implications and Authorization of 3G Services 159
      1. Implications of 3G for Convergence 159
         a) 3G's Relations with 2G 160
         b) Intermodal Competition with the Broadcasting Industry 160
         c) Impact on the Market Definition? 160
         a) More Regulatory Problems 161
         b) Competition Issues for 3G 162
      3. 3G Licensing 164
         a) Telecommunications Licensing System 164
         b) EU Authorization System 165
         c) Relevant Legal Systems in the US 171
         d) Authorization and Spectrum Policy in China 176
      4. 3G License Issuance 180
         a) License Issuance Model in the US 180
         b) 3G License Issuance Model in the EU 183
         c) 3G License Issuance in China 191
      5. Future of the 3G in China 193
         a) Strict Division between Media and Telecommunications 193
         b) Any Real Demand Under the Media Control Regime? 194
         c) Further Restructuring is Needed 196
# VII. Universal Service

## A. Universal Service in the Monopoly Era

1. One Policy, One System, Universal Service
   - a) Cross-Subsidization
   - b) Post-Divestiture Universal Plan

2. State Monopoly for Universal Service in EU Member States
   - a) Universal Service as Public Service
   - b) Article 86 (2)
   - c) Obstruction of the Particular Public Remix

3. State Monopoly in China

## B. Universal Service in the Competitive Environment

1. Impact on Competition
   - a) Economic Interest and Public Service
   - b) Incumbent and New Entrants

2. Universal Service Regime under 1996 Telecommunications Act
   - a) Federal-State Joint Board
   - b) Criteria to Assess the Scope of Universal Service
   - c) Financing of Universal Service
   - d) Price of Services and Access Charges

3. Universal Service Regime of the EU
   - a) Cream-Skimming and the Definition of Universal Service
   - b) Scope of Universal Service
   - c) Financing of Universal Service

4. Option for China to Establish a Universal Service Regime
   - a) Current Universal Service Regime
   - b) Urgent Need to Reform the Universal Service Regime in China

# VIII. Conclusion

## A. Competition or Regulation?

1. Regulation Evolving with Technological Developments
   - a) Total Natural Monopoly Era
   - b) Liberalization Driven by Technological Developments
   - c) Centralized Network

2. Distributed Network and Its Implications

## B. Competition and State Holdings

## C. Industrial Policy and Competition