

Telecommunications Competition and Its Driving Force

A Comparative Study of Telecommunications Law
of the EU, the US and China

DISSERTATION

der Rechtswissenschaftlichen Fakultät
der University Zurich
zur Erlangung der Würde eines Doktors der Rechtswissenschaft

vorgelegt von

; |
JunWu

von
V.R. China

genehmigt auf Antrag von
Prof. Dr. Rolf H. Weber

Schulthess Juristische Medien AG, Zurich

Table of Contents

Abbreviations	X
Bibliography	XIV
EU Regulations, Directives and the Other Relevant Rules	XX
I. Break-Up of the Telecommunications Monopolies	1
A. Cmmbling Legality of the Telecommunications Monopolies	1
1. Natural Monopoly Besieged by Technological Development	2
a) Monopoly of AT&T Gradually Eroded	2
b) Stale Monopoly of Telecommunications in the EU Countries and China	6
2. Competition in a Globalizing Market	7
a) Operators in the EU and China Pressed by Outside Competitors	7
b) The Information Society	8
c) China's Task to Modernize Its Telecommunications Industry	9
B. Approaches to Removing the Telecommunications Monopolies	9
1. US Antitrust Mentality	9
a) Judicially-Imposed Antitrust Remedies for AT&T's Monopoly	10
b) The 1984 MFJ	11
c) Comments on the 1984 MFJ	16
2. Privatization of the Telecommunications Industry	16
a) Liberalization of the Telecommunications Industry in the UK	16
b) Liberalization of the Telecommunications Industry in Germany	17
3. The 1987 Green Paper of the EC	19
a) Abolition of Exclusive or Special Rights	20
b) Harmonization Based on ON P	26
4. Initiation of Telecommunications Liberalization in China	27
a) Monopoly Gradually Lifted	27
b) Overseas Listing of Major State-Owned Telecommunications Operators	33
c) Further Liberalization	35
II. Telecommunications Regulatory Mechanisms	39
A. Industry-specific Regulatory Model	39
1. Industry-Specific Regulation	39
a) Liberalization Entails the Industry-Specific Regulation	39
b) Industry-Specific Regulation	40
c) Provision of Telecommunications Services for Social Puq^ose	41
2. Industry-Specific Regulation?	41
a) Development of the New Zealand Model	41
b) EU Framework Directive of 2002	42

Table of Contents

- c) From Ofel Era to Ofcom Era 44
 - 3. Relations between Regulatory and Competition Authorities 46
 - a) Natural Monopoly or Not? 46
 - b) Mixture of Competition Law and Regulation > 47
 - 4. Sector-Specific Regulation in China 49
- B. Independence of the Telecommunications Regulatory Authority 49
 - 1. Establishment of Independent NRAs in EU Member States 49
 - a) Legal Basis 49
 - b) Regulatory Independence in the NRF 51
 - 2. Establishment of an Independent Regulatory Authority in China 51
 - a) Establishment of the Mil • 51
 - b) Establishment of the State-Owned Asset Regulatory Commission (SARC) 52

III. Telecommunications Equipment Market 55

- A. The Most Competitive Telecommunications Market 55
 - 1. Liberalization Began in the EC 55
 - a) Terminal Equipment Directive 55
 - b) Non-Terminal Telecommunications Equipment 56
 - 2. Competition in the CPE Market of the US 56
 - a) Restrictions Imposed on AT&T 56
 - b) Relevant Requirements Set by the 1984 MFJ 56
 - c) 1996 Telecommunications Act 57
 - 3. Liberalized Telecommunications Equipment Market in China 58
 - a) Network Access Licensing System 59
 - b) Liberalization of the Telecommunications Equipment Market 61
- B. Convergence and its Implications 62
 - 1. The Convergence Trend in Telecommunications Market 62
 - 2. The EU's Acknowledgment 63
 - a) Convergence Green Paper 63
 - b) The Information Society Approach 64
 - 3. The US 64
 - a) Computer I 65
 - b) Computer II 66
 - c) Computer III 67
 - 4. Convergence in China 68
 - 5. VoIP 69
 - a) Three Models for VoIP and Its Regulatory Implications 69
 - b) Regulatory Policies in the EU and the US 70
 - c) Skype in China 75

IV. Network Access and Interconnection and Last-Mile Issue 77

- A. Local Loop Access Market 77
 - 1. Baby Bell's teeth and the Restrictions Forced upon Them 77
 - a) Shaky Business Line Restrictions 77
 - b) 1996 Telecommunications Act 78
 - 2. Approaches to Regulate the Local Loop Market in the EU 81
 - a) Logic behind Liberalization Initiated by the Commission 81
 - b) Segment-by-Segment Liberalization 82

c)	Pro-Competition Approach Adopted after the Liberalization	83
B.	Network Access and Interconnection	83
1.	Practices for the Application of the Theory	83
a)	"Essential facilities" in US Antitrust Law	83
b)	Development of the "Essential Facilities" Doctrine in EU Competition Law	85
2.	Application of the Essential Facilities Doctrine in the Sector	87
a)	US Network Access and Interconnection Regime	88
b)	Application of the Essential Facilities Doctrine in the EU	96
C.	Last-Mile Issue and Network Access and Interconnection Regime of China	105
1.	Last-Mile Issue in China	105
a)	Natural Monopoly?	105
b)	Intermodal Competition in China	106
c)	Trapped Incumbents and the Bounded Market	106
2.	Network Access and Interconnection in China	108
a)	Development of Network Access and Interconnection Regime in China	108
b)	Interconnection Obligation Imposed on Operators	109
c)	Non-Dominant Operators	110
d)	Dominant Operators	111
e)	Outstanding Issues	113
D.	Implications of Technological Developments	118
1.	Cable TV Network Operators	118
a)	Cable TV Networks Touched by the Liberalization	118
b)	Cable TV Networks in the US Telecommunications Market	120
2.	Development of Wireless Telecommunications Technologies	122
a)	Market Potential of Microwave Technologies	122
b)	Fixed Wireless Communications Technologies	122
c)	Mobile Telephony Business	123
3.	Response from the Telecommunications Regulatory Regime	124
a)	Deliberation by the EU	125
b)	Mixed Reflection by the FCC	126
4.	Number Portability, Selection of the Operator	127
a)	Number Portability	127
b)	Selection of Service Provider	128
5.	Conclusion	129
a)	Facilities-Based Competition	130
b)	Technological Neutrality	130
D.	Case Studies- SBC Merging with AT&T	131
1.	Background	131
2.	Analysis of the Local Telecommunications Market	132
a)	Product Market Definition	132
b)	Competition Analysis	134
3.	Comments	137

V. Right of Way	139
A. Right of Way in the EU and the US	139
1. Right of Way in the EU	139
a) Structural Separation	139
b) General Authorization	140
2. Right of Way in 1996 Telecommunications Act	140
a) Access to Right of Way of all LECs	140
b) Duty of an Utility to Provide the Right of Way	141
B. State-Owned Land System	142
1. Land-Use Right System in China	142
2. Authorized Land Use System	143
3. Right of Way in the Telecommunications Sector	144
a) Right of Way for Infrastructure Construction	145
b) Access to Right of Way of the Incumbents?	146
VI. Standards, Authorizations and 3G	147
A. Battle for Standards	147
1. Legal Implications of Telecommunications Standards	147
a) General Competition Law Concerns	148
b) Telecommunications Law Concern	150
2. CDMA, W-CDMA and TD-CDMA	152
3. Dominance of W-CDMA	153
a) General Standard Regime	153
b) 1998 UMTS Decision	155
4. China's 3G Standard Policy Options	156
a) 2G Standards in China and Their Implication for 3G	156
b) Feasibility of the Co-Application of the Three Standards Available	158
B. Competition Implications and Authorization of 3G Services	159
1. Implications of 3G for Convergence	159
a) 3G's Relations with 2G	160
b) Intermodal Competition with the Broadcasting Industry	160
c) Impact on the Market Definition?	160
2. More Competition Rules or More Regulatory Rules?	161
a) More Regulatory Problems	161
b) Competition Issues for 3G	162
3. 3G Licensing	164
a) Telecommunications Licensing System	164
b) EU Authorization System	165
c) Relevant Legal Systems in the US	171
d) Authorization and Spectrum Policy in China	176
4. 3G License Issuance	180
a) License Issuance Model in the US	180
b) 3G License Issuance Model in the EU	183
c) 3G License Issuance in China	191
5. Future of the 3G in China	193
a) Strict Division between Media and Telecommunications	193
b) Any Real Demand Under the Media Control Regime?	194
c) Further Restructuring is Needed	196

VII. Universal Service	197
A. Universal Service in the Monopoly Era	197
1. One Policy, One System, Universal Service	197
a) Cross-Subsidization	197
b) Post-Divestiture Universal Plan	198
2. State Monopoly for Universal Service in EU Member States	199
a) Universal Service as Public Service	199
b) Article 86 (2)	199
c) Obstruction of the Particular Public Remix	200
3. State Monopoly in China	201
B. Universal Service in the Competitive Environment	201
1. Impact on Competition	201
a) Economic Interest and Public Service	201
b) Incumbent and New Entrants	202
2. Universal Service Regime under 1996 Telecommunications Act	202
a) Federal-State Joint Board	202
b) Criteria to Assess the Scope of Universal Service	203
c) Financing of Universal Service	204
d) Price of Services and Access Charges	206
3. Universal Service Regime of the EU	209
a) Cream-Skimming and the Definition of Universal Service	209
b) Scope of Universal Service	210
c) Financing of Universal Service	214
4. Option for China to Establish a Universal Service Regime	218
a) Current Universal Service Regime	218
b) Urgent Need to Reform the Universal Service Regime in China	219
VIII. Conclusion	221
A. Competition or Regulation?	221
1. Regulation Evolving with Technological Developments	221
a) Total Natural Monopoly Era	221
b) Liberalization Driven by Technological Developments	221
c) Centralized Network	223
2. Distributed Network and Its Implications	223
B. Competition and State Holdings	225
C. Industrial Policy and Competition	225