

Friedrich Heinemann • Philipp Mohl
Steffen Osterloh

Reform Options for the EU Own Resources System

Physica-Verlag
A Springer Company

ZEW
Zentrum für Europäische
Wirtschaftsforschung GmbH

Table of Contents

- 1 Introduction..... 1**
- 2 Criteria for a Fair and Efficient Own Resources System..... 3**
- 3 Assessing the Status Quo..... 11**
 - 3.1 Introduction..... 11
 - 3.2 Key Institutional Features of the System 11
 - 3.2.1 The Budgetary Process in Brief 13
 - 3.2.2 Discussion of Institutional Reforms to Be Implemented 15
 - 3.3 The Financing of the EU Budget 16
 - 3.3.1 Explaining the System’s Evolution..... 16
 - 3.3.2 The Current Financing of the EU..... 20
 - 3.4 The Financial Perspective 2007-2013..... 23
 - 3.5 Incentives of Important Actors in the System..... 26
 - 3.5.1 The Role of Incentives 26
 - 3.5.2 The Common Pool Problem in General 27
 - 3.5.3 The Relevance of the Common Pool Problem in the
EU Budget Process 29
 - 3.5.4 Advantages and Disadvantages of the Status Quo 35
 - 3.5.5 Findings for a Reform Perspective..... 36
 - 3.6 The Drivers of Redistribution 37
 - 3.6.1 Introduction..... 37
 - 3.6.2 The Simulation Model 37
 - 3.6.3 Expenditure Side Versus Revenue Side Redistribution 40
 - 3.6.4 The Redistributive Effects of Different Own Resources..... 43
 - 3.6.5 Conclusions for the Reform Debate..... 45
 - 3.7 Detail Problems of Own Resources Items 47
 - 3.7.1 GNI Resource 47
 - 3.7.2 VAT Resource 48
 - 3.7.3 Traditional Own Resources..... 49
 - 3.7.4 UK Correction..... 50
 - 3.8 Summing Up: Strengths and Weaknesses of the Current System..... 51
 - 3.8.1 Necessity of a Holistic Assessment..... 51
 - 3.8.2 The Status Quo in the Light of Our Four Groups of Criteria 52

4	Background Analyses	55
4.1	Introduction	55
4.2	Tax System Heterogeneity.....	55
4.2.1	Introduction.....	55
4.2.2	Divergence in Tax-Relevant Value Judgements	56
4.2.3	Convergence of Tax Structure Parameters.....	60
4.2.4	Cluster Analysis: Tax System Classes	63
4.2.5	Conclusion	66
4.3	International Comparison: Financing of International Organisations.....	66
4.3.1	Types of Financing for IO	67
4.3.2	Decision Rules	71
4.3.3	Taking a Closer Look: The Financing of the OECD and the UN ...	71
4.3.4	Conclusion	72
5	Reform Approaches	75
5.1	Link Between Expenditure and Revenue Reform Debates.....	75
5.1.1	Co-Financing of CAP	75
5.1.2	Reformed Structural Policy	77
5.1.3	Reducing the Progression on the Expenditure Side	79
5.2	EU Tax.....	79
5.2.1	Introduction and Frequent Suggestions.....	79
5.2.2	The Pros	81
5.2.3	The Cons	86
5.2.4	A Digression: Distributive Consequences of EU Taxes	91
5.2.5	Conclusion	99
5.3	Parametric Adjustments Within the Status Quo	100
5.3.1	Elimination of VAT Resources.....	100
5.3.2	Adjustment to GNI Resources	102
5.3.3	Adjustments to Traditional Own Resources	105
5.3.4	Declaratory EU Tax.....	109
5.4	Reforming the Correction Mechanism	110
5.4.1	Introduction.....	110
5.4.2	Complete Phasing Out of any Correction	110
5.4.3	Parametric Corrections to the UK Rebate.....	112
5.4.4	A Generalised Correction Mechanism.....	112
5.4.5	Merits and Problems of a Generalised Correction Mechanism.....	120
6	A Reform Proposal	125
6.1	Starting Point	125
6.2	A Reform Proposal	126
6.2.1	Elements of the Reform Proposal	126
6.2.2	Principles of Allocating Policies to Distinct Baskets.....	128
6.2.3	Key Advantages of the Two Basket Approach.....	129
6.2.4	Parametric Specification and Simulation.....	129
6.3	The Sub-National Dimension	135
6.4	Changing the Wording in EU Budgetary Policy.....	137

7 Final Remarks.....	141
8 Appendix.....	143
8.1 Assessment Criteria	143
8.1.1 Introduction - Criteria in the Literature.....	143
8.1.2 Fiscal Federalism	144
8.1.3 Political Economy.....	147
8.1.4 Integration Compatibility.....	148
8.1.5 Further Conventional Principles of Taxation.....	151
8.1.6 Conclusion	153
8.2 History of the System of Own Resources	153
8.2.1 Initial Situation	153
8.2.2 Treaty of Rome, 1958-1970.....	154
8.2.3 First Own Resources Decision, 1971-1985.....	154
8.2.4 Second Own Resources Decision, 1986-1988	155
8.2.5 Third Own Resources Decision (Delors I), 1988-1994.....	156
8.2.6 Fourth Own Resources Decision (Delors II), 1995-2002.....	157
8.2.7 Fifth Own Resources Decision (Agenda 2000), 2002-2006	157
9 Additional Tables.....	159
List of Figures	165
List of Tables.....	167
List of Boxes	169
References	171