Trade Liberalization and Regional Disparity in Pakistan

Muhammad Shoaib Butt and Jayatilleke S. Bandara
Contents

List of figures xvii
List of tables xviii
Preface xix
Acknowledgements xxi
Acronyms and abbreviations xxiii

1 Introduction 1
Pakistan as a case study 2
Recent developments in Pakistan 4
Scope and objectives of book 9
Outline of book 11

2 Political economy of trade policy regimes in Pakistan 13
Analytical review of trade policies under different political regimes 15
Bureaucracy-led ad hoc trade policies: 1947–52 15
Bureaucracy-controlled highly protected trade regime: 1952–8 17
Trade policy under first military government: 1958–71 18
Gradual trade liberalization during pre-war period: 1958–65 20
Post-war stoppage of trade liberalization: 1965–71 21
One-stage trade liberalization under Bhutto’s democratic government: 1971–7 21
Gradual trade liberalization under second military government: 1977–88 22
Trade liberalization attempts by four democratic governments under structural adjustment programs: 1988–99 25
Substantial trade liberalization programs under third military government: 1999 onwards 29
Trade policy areas requiring further reform 34
Conclusion 35

3 Trade regimes, economic performance and structural changes in Pakistan 37
Bureaucracy-led trade regime: 1947–52 37
Bureaucracy-controlled trade regime: 1952–8 38
First military regime: 1958–71 45
Bhutto's democratic government: 1971–7 48
Second military regime: 1977–88 49
Return to democracy: 1988–99 51
Third military regime: 1999 onward 52
Conclusion 55

4 Regional disparities and conflicts in Pakistan 57
Regional disparities leading to secession of East Pakistan 58
Overview of current regions of Pakistan 59
Major regional conflicts 61
Distribution of federal revenue 63
Distribution of water and Kalabagh Dam 64
Exploitation of natural resources of Balochistan 65
Gwadar sea port 66
Expansion of garrisons in Balochistan 66
Issue of 'missing people' 66
Dismissal of chief justice and assassination of Benazir Bhutto 67
Analysis of regional socioeconomic conditions 68
Poverty reduction strategy of Musharraf government 72
Rationale for modelling trade liberalization and regional disparities 73
Interactions between political and trade regimes and regional disparities 74
Conclusion 77

5 Methodology and data 79
Justification for using CGE modelling approach 79
CGE models versus econometric models 80
CGE models versus I-O models 81
CGE studies on Pakistan 82
General characteristics of CGE studies on Pakistan 82
Critical review of major CGE studies on Pakistan 83
Absence of focus on regional disparities 83
Usage of inadequate databases 84
Highly aggregated industry and export results 84
Inadequacy of available CGE models in analysing the effects of trade liberalization 85
Little focus on sensitivity analysis 86
Salient features of proposed CGE study in light of literature review 86
Structure of core CGE model used in this study 87
Dimensions of model 88
Variables 92
Coefficients 92
Equations 93
Block 1 - structure of production 93
Block 2 - final demands for commodities 93
Block 3 - demands for margin 94
Block 4 - market-clearing equations 94
Block 5 - price system enforcing zero pure profit conditions 94
Block 6 - trade balance 95
Block 7 - investment allocation 95
Block 8 - labour market 95
Block 9 - miscellaneous equations 95
Structure of regional approach of PAKREG 96
Selection of most appropriate regional modelling approach 96
Top-down approach 96
Bottom-up approach 98
Selection of top-down approach 100
Dimensions of regional extension 101
Variables and coefficients 101
Equations 102
Block 1 - direct demands by each region 103
Block 2 - demands for margin 103
Block 3 - determining regional share variables 103
Block 4 - three constraints 104
Block 5 - regional wage bills and matrix of contributions 104
Block 6 - regional advantage matrix 104
Closure of model 104
Short-run closure 105
Long-run closure 107
Database of PAKREG 109
Structure of database of core model 109
Structure of database of regional extension 112
Development of database of PAKREG 112
Conclusion 113

6 Application of model 114

Simulations and closures 115
National results 116
Macroeconomic results 116
Short run 116
Long run 120
Industry results 122
Impact of trade liberalization on imports 123
Impact of trade liberalization on domestic industry costs 128
Impact of trade liberalization on domestic industry output 132
Impact of trade liberalization on domestic industry employment 139
Regional results 143
Macroeconomic results: short run and long run 144
Determinants of regional output and employment growth in short run 145
Determinants of regional output and employment growth in long run 153
Systematic sensitivity analysis 161
Conclusion 165

7 Conclusion 167

Summary of main findings 167
Policy implications 170
Lessons for other countries 171
Limitations and future research 172

Appendix 1 175

Appendix 2 182

Appendix 3 186

Appendix 4 194

Block 1: Structure of production (industry inputs demands) 194
Demands for primary factors 194
Demands for intermediate inputs 194
Contents

Top production nest 195
Block 2: Final demands for commodities 195
Demands for capital creation 195
Household demands 195
Export demands 196
Government and inventory demands 197
Block 3: Demands for margin 197
Block 4: Market clearing equations 197
Domestic and imported commodities 197
Primary factors 198
Block 5: Price system enforcing zero pure profit conditions 198
Production 198
Capital creation 198
Households 199
Exporting 199
Importing 199
Distribution 199
Block 6: Balance of trade 199
Imports, exports and balance of trade 199
Block 7: Investment allocation 200
Distribution of investment 200
Investment budget constraints 200
Block 8: Labour market 200
Wage setting equations 200
Block 9: Remaining equations 200
Industry costs and the index of production costs 201
Indirect tax 201
Indirect tax revenue aggregates 201
Factor incomes and GDP 201
GDP expenditure aggregates 202
Primary factor aggregates 203
Decomposition of sales change by destination 203
Decomposition of Fan 203
GDP decomposition 204
Other equations 204

Appendix 5 205

Appendix 6 207

Appendix 7 208
Appendix 8
Block 1: Direct demands by each region  210
Block 2: Demands for margin  210
Block 3: Determining regional share variables  211
Block 4: Three constraints  211
Block 5: Regional wage bills and matrix of contributions  212
Block 6: Regional advantage matrix  212

Appendix 9
Data matrices and parameters required for implementation of PAKREG 214
Systematic construction of 36 I-O data matrices required for core model  214
Elasticities and parameters needed for core model  218
Estimates of Frisch parameter and other elasticities  219
Construction of database of regional extension  222
Allocation of commodities/industries to national and local groups  222
Compilation of regional commodity/industry shares  223

Notes  224
Bibliography  230
Index  242