

Trade Liberalization and Regional Disparity in Pakistan

**Muhammad Shoaib Butt and
Jayatilleke S. Bandara**

Contents

<i>List of figures</i>	xvii
<i>List of tables</i>	xviii
<i>Preface</i>	xix
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xxi
<i>Acronyms and abbreviations</i>	xxiii

1 Introduction 1

<i>Pakistan as a case study</i>	2
<i>Recent developments in Pakistan</i>	4
<i>Scope and objectives of book</i>	9
<i>Outline of book</i>	11

2 Political economy of trade policy regimes in Pakistan 13

<i>Analytical review of trade policies under different political regimes</i>	15
<i>Bureaucracy-led ad hoc trade policies: 1947–52</i>	15
<i>Bureaucracy-controlled highly protected trade regime: 1952–8</i>	17
<i>Trade policy under first military government: 1958–71</i>	18
<i>Gradual trade liberalization during pre-war period: 1958–65</i>	20
<i>Post-war stoppage of trade liberalization: 1965–71</i>	21
<i>One-stage trade liberalization under Bhutto's democratic government: 1971–7</i>	21
<i>Gradual trade liberalization under second military government: 1977–88</i>	22
<i>Trade liberalization attempts by four democratic governments under structural adjustment programs: 1988–99</i>	25
<i>Substantial trade liberalization programs under third military government: 1999 onwards</i>	29

Trade policy areas requiring further reform 34
Conclusion 35

3 Trade regimes, economic performance and structural changes in Pakistan 37

Bureaucracy-led trade regime: 1947–52 37
Bureaucracy-controlled trade regime: 1952–8 38
First military regime: 1958–71 45
Bhutto's democratic government: 1971–7 48
Second military regime: 1977–88 49
Return to democracy: 1988–99 51
Third military regime: 1999 onward 52
Conclusion 55

4 Regional disparities and conflicts in Pakistan 57

Regional disparities leading to secession of East Pakistan 58
Overview of current regions of Pakistan 59
Major regional conflicts 61
Distribution of federal revenue 63
Distribution of water and Kalabagh Dam 64
Exploitation of natural resources of Balochistan 65
Gwadar sea port 66
Expansion of garrisons in Balochistan 66
Issue of 'missing people' 66
Dismissal of chief justice and assassination of Benazir Bhutto 67
Analysis of regional socioeconomic conditions 68
Poverty reduction strategy of Musharraf government 72
Rationale for modelling trade liberalization and regional disparities 73
Interactions between political and trade regimes and regional disparities 74
Conclusion 77

5 Methodology and data 79

Justification for using CGE modelling approach 79
CGE models versus econometric models 80
CGE models versus I-O models 81
CGE studies on Pakistan 82
General characteristics of CGE studies on Pakistan 82
Critical review of major CGE studies on Pakistan 83

<i>Absence of focus on regional disparities</i>	83
<i>Usage of inadequate databases</i>	84
<i>Highly aggregated industry and export results</i>	84
<i>Inadequacy of available CGE models in analysing the effects of trade liberalization</i>	85
<i>Little focus on sensitivity analysis</i>	86
<i>Salient features of proposed CGE study in light of literature review</i>	86
<i>Structure of core CGE model used in this study</i>	87
<i>Dimensions of model</i>	88
<i>Variables</i>	92
<i>Coefficients</i>	92
<i>Equations</i>	93
<i>Block 1 – structure of production</i>	93
<i>Block 2 – final demands for commodities</i>	93
<i>Block 3 – demands for margin</i>	94
<i>Block 4 – market-clearing equations</i>	94
<i>Block 5 – price system enforcing zero pure profit conditions</i>	94
<i>Block 6 – trade balance</i>	95
<i>Block 7 – investment allocation</i>	95
<i>Block 8 – labour market</i>	95
<i>Block 9 – miscellaneous equations</i>	95
<i>Structure of regional approach of PAKREG</i>	96
<i>Selection of most appropriate regional modelling approach</i>	96
<i>Top-down approach</i>	96
<i>Bottom-up approach</i>	98
<i>Selection of top-down approach</i>	100
<i>Dimensions of regional extension</i>	101
<i>Variables and coefficients</i>	101
<i>Equations</i>	102
<i>Block 1 – direct demands by each region</i>	103
<i>Block 2 – demands for margin</i>	103
<i>Block 3 – determining regional share variables</i>	103
<i>Block 4 – three constraints</i>	104
<i>Block 5 – regional wage bills and matrix of contributions</i>	104
<i>Block 6 – regional advantage matrix</i>	104
<i>Closure of model</i>	104
<i>Short-run closure</i>	105
<i>Long-run closure</i>	107
<i>Database of PAKREG</i>	109
<i>Structure of database of core model</i>	109

Structure of database of regional extension 112

Development of database of PAKREG 112

Conclusion 113

6 Application of model 114

Simulations and closures 115

National results 116

Macroeconomic results 116

Short run 116

Long run 120

Industry results 122

Impact of trade liberalization on imports 123

Impact of trade liberalization on domestic industry costs 128

Impact of trade liberalization on domestic industry output 132

Impact of trade liberalization on domestic industry employment 139

Regional results 143

Macroeconomic results: short run and long run 144

Determinants of regional output and employment growth in short run 145

Determinants of regional output and employment growth in long run 153

Systematic sensitivity analysis 161

Conclusion 165

7 Conclusion 167

Summary of main findings 167

Policy implications 170

Lessons for other countries 171

Limitations and future research 172

Appendix 1 175

Appendix 2 182

Appendix 3 186

Appendix 4 194

Block 1: Structure of production (industry inputs demands) 194

Demands for primary factors 194

Demands for intermediate inputs 194

<i>Top production nest</i>	195
<i>Block 2: Final demands for commodities</i>	195
<i>Demands for capital creation</i>	195
<i>Household demands</i>	195
<i>Export demands</i>	196
<i>Government and inventory demands</i>	197
<i>Block 3: Demands for margin</i>	197
<i>Block 4: Market clearing equations</i>	197
<i>Domestic and imported commodities</i>	197
<i>Primary factors</i>	198
<i>Block 5: Price system enforcing zero pure profit conditions</i>	198
<i>Production</i>	198
<i>Capital creation</i>	198
<i>Households</i>	199
<i>Exporting</i>	199
<i>Importing</i>	199
<i>Distribution</i>	199
<i>Block 6: Balance of trade</i>	199
<i>Imports, exports and balance of trade</i>	199
<i>Block 7: Investment allocation</i>	200
<i>Distribution of investment</i>	200
<i>Investment budget constraints</i>	200
<i>Block 8: Labour market</i>	200
<i>Wage setting equations</i>	200
<i>Block 9: Remaining equations</i>	200
<i>Industry costs and the index of production costs</i>	201
<i>Indirect tax</i>	201
<i>Indirect tax revenue aggregates</i>	201
<i>Factor incomes and GDP</i>	201
<i>GDP expenditure aggregates</i>	202
<i>Primary factor aggregates</i>	203
<i>Decomposition of sales change by destination</i>	203
<i>Decomposition of Fan</i>	203
<i>GDP decomposition</i>	204
<i>Other equations</i>	204
Appendix 5	205
Appendix 6	207
Appendix 7	208

Appendix 8	210
<i>Block 1: Direct demands by each region</i>	210
<i>Block 2: Demands for margin</i>	210
<i>Block 3: Determining regional share variables</i>	211
<i>Block 4: Three constraints</i>	211
<i>Block 5: Regional wage bills and matrix of contributions</i>	212
<i>Block 6: Regional advantage matrix</i>	212
Appendix 9	214
<i>Data matrices and parameters required for implementation of PAKREG</i>	214
<i>Systematic construction of 36 I-O data matrices required for core model</i>	214
<i>Elasticities and parameters needed for core model</i>	218
<i>Estimates of Frisch parameter and other elasticities</i>	219
<i>Construction of database of regional extension</i>	222
<i>Allocation of commodities/industries to national and local groups</i>	222
<i>Compilation of regional commodity/industry shares</i>	223
<i>Notes</i>	224
<i>Bibliography</i>	230
<i>Index</i>	242