

# Distributive Justice and the New Medicine

# Contents

---

<i>About the author</i>	ix
<i>List of abbreviations</i>	xi
1 Introduction	1
QALYs	2
The American ideal	3
Science and politics	4
Participatory democracy	9
2 Normative standards and health care resource management	17
Introduction	17
Individual or communitarian rights?	18
A societal shift?	18
Hues or standards of justice	19
Distributive justice in a just society	20
Theoretical weaknesses	20
Foundations of the just society	21
Social justice in practice	22
Justice and the new medicine	22
Conflicts in distribution (economic issues)	23
Rationing as a fact	25
Specific decisional frameworks	26
A case in point	28
Artificial hearts	29
Prioritization	30
Necessary health care need variables	31
Ethics of rationing health care	31
Intergenerational justice	32
Patterns of modern rationing	33
The value of life	34
Measuring quality of life	35
Risk–benefit or cost–benefit analysis?	36
An ethical dilemma and the Americans with Disabilities Act	36
Structuring a decisional framework	37
Restoring trust	37

	Balancing needs within the democratic process	38
	Conclusions	40
3	The new medicine and scientific research	48
	Introduction	48
	Asexual reproduction: cloning	49
	Statistical uncertainties	50
	Legislative blueprints	51
	Two specific approaches	52
	Congressional “action” and inaction	53
	Administrative uncertainties	54
	Market strategies for control?	55
	The new eugenics	56
	A dual relationship	57
	The scope of scientific review	58
	Encouraging experimentation	59
	A further innovative application	60
	Congressional direction	61
	Continuing concerns	62
	The federal position	63
	Presidential direction (the Bush administration extension)	64
	The Clinton action	65
	Toward a standard of reasonableness	65
	Structuring responses (federal guidelines)	66
	A political dilemma	67
	The Bush compromise	68
	Resolutions and continuing political conflicts (new guidelines for research)	69
	Bush v. Congress: the summers of 2006, 2007	70
	Regulating reproduction in the United States	71
	Legislative positions among the states	71
	Preserving genetic integrity	72
	The Human Genome Initiative: more promises and perils	74
	Genetic knowledge	76
	Genetic engineering forms	77
	Toward a principle of biological determinism	78
	Judicially derived privacy interests	79
	Legislative efforts to resolve conflicts	80
	Conclusions	81
4	Human experimentation: conflicts and confluences	103
	Introduction	103

Informed decision making	104
Malpractice and informed consent (professional or lay standards)	107
The foundational paradigm	108
Alternative treatment	109
Future treatment	111
Developing normative standards	112
The Common Rule	113
Institutional review boards	114
An ineffective system	115
The ethics of human subject research (consent in human experimentation)	116
Fetal consent	118
Proxy consent	119
Informed refusal	120
Religiously motivated refusals (parental actions)	121
Adult decisions	121
Vulnerable populations (coercive environments and forced medications)	122
The prison setting	123
Prison research	125
Pharmaceutical strategies	126
Commonalities of concern	128
New directions—new dilemmas (the California precedent)	129
Conclusions	131
5 Organ and tissue transplantation: a case study in distributive justice	143
Introduction	143
Contemporary issues	143
An historical overview: organ transplants	144
Federal oversight	146
Tissues	147
The flow of commerce	148
The Common Law approach	150
Legislative initiatives and disappointments	151
NOTA ambiguities	152
Advancing public awareness (the federal effort)	153
State action	154
Living donors	155
An extra-familial alternative	156
Other schemes and procedures	157

Mandated choice	158
Additional mechanisms	159
Cadaveric organ markets: further considerations	161
Clinical options (the Pittsburgh protocol)	162
Cardiac death	164
Ethical, moral and religious concerns	165
Utilitarian v. egalitarian allocative standards	165
Rules of exclusion and final selection	167
Conclusions	168
<i>Index</i>	181