Good Intentions, Bad Outcomes

Social Policy, Informality, and Economic Growth in Mexico

Santiago Levy

BROOKINGS INSTITUTION PRESS
Washington, D.C.
Contents

Foreword ix
Strobe Talbott

Acknowledgments xv

Introduction 1
Main Hypothesis 6
Organization 9

1 Institutions, Workers, and Social Programs 11
Salaried and Nonsalaried Labor 11
Labor Status and Social Programs 16
Resources for Social Programs from 1998 to 2007 26

2 Formality and Informality 33
Definitions 33
Interpretation and Implications 40

3 Workers' Valuation of Social Programs 47
Determinants of Workers' Valuation of Social Security 47
Determinants of Workers' Valuation of Social Protection 61
Wages and Social Benefits 63
An Assessment 66
4 Social Programs and Poor Workers 71
   Households and Workers in Progresa-Oportunidades 71
   Poor Workers' Valuation of Social Programs 79

5 Mobility of Workers in the Labor Market 85
   Labor Force 85
   Mobility of Workers: Some Examples 91
   Evidence of Mobility from Social Security Registries 96
   Evidence of Mobility from Employment Surveys 111
   Mobility and Wage Rates 114
   Implications of Mobility for Social Policy 129

6 Social Programs, Welfare, and Productivity 134
   Demand for Salaried and Nonsalaried Labor 136
   The Labor Market with Formal and Informal Sectors 142
   The Static Efficiency Costs of the Formal-Informal Dichotomy 155
   Empirical Estimates of Static Efficiency Costs 160
   The Labor Market with Different Valuations for Poor Workers 163

7 Productivity and Illegal Firms 166
   The Labor Market When Social Security Is Evaded 166
   Illegal and Legal Firms 177
   Informality and the Size Distribution of Firms 179
   Informality and the Demand for Legal and Illegal Labor 193
   Informality and the Composition of Output 199

8 Investment and Growth under Informality 208
   Investment in the Formal and Informal Sectors 208
   Social Programs and the Allocation of Aggregate Investment 211
   Investments in Labor Training and Technology Adoption 214
   Remarks on Saving under Informality 216
   Growth and Job Creation under Persistent Informality 219
   Static and Dynamic Efficiency Losses under Informality 223
   Implications for Poverty Reduction and Progresa-Oportunidades 225

9 Social Programs and the Fiscal Accounts 234
   Government Subsidies for Social Security 234
   Feedback from Social Programs to the Fiscal Accounts 240
   Is Social Policy Redistributive? 243
## CONTENTS

### 10 Can Social Policy Increase Welfare and Growth?
- The Case for Reform 253
- A Reference Equilibrium: Universal Social Entitlements 256
- What Should Universal Social Entitlements Be? 269
- How Much Would Universal Social Entitlements Cost? 276
- Implications for Noncontributory Pensions 280
- From Here to There: Isolated Reforms versus Step-by-Step Reform 283
- A Final Word 288

### Appendixes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Resources for Social Programs</td>
<td>293</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Regional Coverage of Social Programs</td>
<td>298</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Land Holdings of Progresa-Oportunidades Households</td>
<td>304</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Estimation of Mexico's Economically Active Population</td>
<td>306</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Mean Wage-Rate Comparisons by Matching Methods</td>
<td>313</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Equilibrium in the Labor Market with Differences in Workers' Valuations</td>
<td>317</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Equilibrium in the Labor Market with Evasion of Social Security</td>
<td>327</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Profit Maximization under Informality</td>
<td>329</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Further Remarks on Retirement Pensions as a Social Entitlement</td>
<td>336</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

References 343

Index 349