Geographical Indications for Food Products: International Legal and Regulatory Perspectives

by

Marsha A. Echols
# Table of Contents

## Chapter One

**Introduction**

## Chapter Two

**Food Labelling for Origin and Tradition**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.1 Introduction</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2 Traditional Knowledge</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3 Cultural Expressions</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4 Locality</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4.1 <em>Terroir</em></td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4.2 Origin</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5 Niche Names</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5.1 Artisanal</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5.2 Farmstead</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5.3 Heritage</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5.4 Heirloom</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5.5 Fair Trade</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6 Trade Usage</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.7 Product Standards</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.8 The Value Added by Origin and Tradition</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.9 Tradition and Innovation</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.10 Conclusion</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bibliography</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Chapter Three
Indications of Origin Prior to the TRIPS Agreement

3.1 Introduction


3.2.1 Appellation of Origin

3.2.2 Indications/Designation of Origin

3.3 The Paris Convention

3.4 The Madrid Agreement

3.5 The 1891 Madrid Agreement Concerning the International Registration of Marks

3.6 The Stresa Convention

3.7 The Lisbon Agreement

3.8 Conclusion

Bibliography

Chapter Four
Geographical Indications for Food Products Under the TRIPS Agreement and Other Recent Agreements

4.1 Introduction

4.2 The TRIPS Agreement

4.2.1 The Article 22.1 Definition of Geographical Indication

4.2.2 The Minimum Standards of Protection

4.2.2.1 Availability of Protection

4.2.2.2 Misleading the Public

4.2.2.3 Unfair Competition

4.2.2.4 Confusing the Public

4.2.2.5 Article 22:2 and the WTO Disputes

4.2.2.6 Article 22:4 and False Representations Concerning Origin

4.2.2.7 National Treatment

4.3 Geographical Indications and...

4.3.1 The Agreement on Technical Barriers to Trade

4.3.2 Trademarks

4.3.3 Generic and Semi-generic Names

4.3.4 Homonyms

4.3.5 Unfair Acts

4.4 Other Multilateral Agreements

4.4.1 Free Trade Agreements

4.4.1.1 Morocco-United States Free Trade Agreement

4.4.1.2 North American Free Trade Agreement
Table of Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4.4.2 Treaty of Asunción (Mercosur/Mercosul)</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4.3 Cotonou Agreement</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5 Conclusion</td>
<td>91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bibliography</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Chapter Five
Geographical Indications Under National Law 99

5.1 Introduction 99
5.2 A Mixed Regional Approach: The Caribbean Community 103
5.3 Sui Generis Systems 105
5.3.1 India 105
5.3.2 European Communities 115
5.3.3 The People’s Republic of China 125
5.4 Systems Based on Trademark and Other Laws 127
5.4.1 Brazil 127
5.4.2 Canada 128
5.4.3 Ethiopia 129
5.4.4 Indonesia 130
5.4.5 The Russian Federation 131
5.4.6 South Africa 132
5.4.7 United States of America 135
5.4.7.1 Certification Marks 137
5.4.7.2 Collective Marks 144
5.4.7.3 Source-Identifying Trademarks 144
5.4.7.4 Common Law Trademarks 145
5.4.7.5 Regional Certification Marks 145
5.4.7.6 USDA and FDA Labelling for Geographical Origin 146
5.4.8 Other Countries 147
5.5 Conclusion 148
Bibliography 150

Chapter Six
Making a Geographical Indications System Work: Administration and Financing 159

6.1 Introduction 159
6.2 Administration 160
6.2.1 The Product Specification and the Processing Rule 160
6.2.2 The Holder and the Users of the Geographical Indication 162
Chapter Seven
Overlapping Institutional Perspectives: Debating an International Standard for Parmesan and Other Cheeses 181

7.1 Introduction 181
7.2 The Codex Alimentarius Commission 182
7.3 The Codex Alimentarius and the WTO Agreements 185
7.4 The Codex Alimentarius and Geographical Names as Standards and Technical Regulations: Parmesan and Other Cheeses 188

7.5 Conclusion 198
Bibliography 199

Chapter Eight
The Geographical Indications Dispute at the World Trade Organization 203

8.1 Introduction 203
8.2 Background 203
8.3 Implications of the Panel’s Report 208
8.3.1 What is Protected? 208
8.3.2 Who is Protected? 210
8.3.3 How are They Protected? 212

8.4 The Report of the Panel 214
8.4.1 Availability of Protection 214
8.4.1.1 National Treatment 215
8.4.1.1.1 Under the TRIPS Agreement 216
8.4.1.2 Most-Favoured-Nation Treatment 224
  8.4.1.2.1 Under the TRIPS Agreement 225
  8.4.1.2.2 Under the GATT 1994 226

8.4.2 Application Procedure 227
  8.4.2.1 National Treatment 227
  8.4.2.1.1 Under the TRIPS Agreement 228
  8.4.2.1.2 Under the GATT 1994 228
  8.4.2.2 Most-Favoured-Nation Treatment 231

8.4.3 Objection Procedures 231
  8.4.3.1 National Treatment 233
  8.4.3.1.1 Under the TRIPS Agreement 233
  8.4.3.1.2 Under the GATT 1994 234
  8.4.3.2 Most-Favoured-Nation Treatment 235

8.4.4 Registration Procedures 235
8.4.5 Inspection Structures 235
8.4.6 Minimum Standards of Protection 238
8.4.7 The Labelling Requirement 239
8.4.8 The Trademark Claim 242
  8.4.8.1 Trademark Rights 244
  8.4.8.2 Prior Trademarks 246
  8.4.8.3 Exceptions to the Exclusive Trademark Rights 248
    8.4.8.3.1 Article 24:5 248
    8.4.8.3.2 Article 17 249
    8.4.8.3.3 Article 24:3 255

8.5 Conclusion 256

Bibliography 257

Chapter Nine
The Council for Trade-Related Intellectual Property 261
9.1 Introduction 261
9.2 The Principal Roles of the TRIPS Council 263
  9.2.1 Monitoring the Operation of the Agreement 264
  9.2.2 Overseeing Compliance 265
  9.2.3 Consultations with and among Members 266
  9.2.4 ‘Such Other Responsibilities’ 266
  9.2.5 Bi-annual Reviews 267
9.3 The TRIPS Council and Other International Institutions 267
9.4 Transparency 268
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>9.5 Technical Cooperation</td>
<td>269</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.6 Technical Assistance</td>
<td>272</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.7 Financial Cooperation</td>
<td>272</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.8 The TRIPS Council and the Doha Development Agenda</td>
<td>273</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.9 Conclusion</td>
<td>274</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bibliography</td>
<td>276</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter Ten</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>**Geographical Indications for Food Products and the Doha Development</td>
<td>279</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agenda**</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.1 Introduction</td>
<td>279</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.2 The TRIPS Texts</td>
<td>280</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.3 The Doha Ministerial Declaration</td>
<td>281</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.4 To Negotiate or Not to Negotiate?</td>
<td>282</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.5 The Proposals</td>
<td>284</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.5.1 Extension: Added GI Protections for Foods</td>
<td>284</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.5.2 An International Register of Geographical Indications for Food</td>
<td>288</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Products</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.5.3 The ‘Clawback’ of Generic and Semi-generic Names</td>
<td>291</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.6 The Forum for Negotiations about Geographical Indications for</td>
<td>293</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Food Products</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.7 Conclusion</td>
<td>293</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bibliography</td>
<td>294</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter Eleven</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusions</td>
<td>297</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Index</td>
<td>309</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>