

KLUWER LAW INTERNATIONAL

EUROPEAN MONOGRAPHS

**External Relations Law of the
European Community**

Legal Reasoning and Legal Discourses

Rass Holdgaard



Wolters Kluwer

Law & Business

AUSTIN BOSTON CHICAGO NEW YORK THE NETHERLANDS

Contents

Table of Figures	xiii
Preface	xv
Chapter 1	
Introduction	1
1.1 The Subject Matter	2
1.2 Approaches	4
1.2.1 The Framework Approach in Legal Dogmatics	4
1.2.2 Analysing Legal Discourses	7
1.3 Structure	10
PART I	
EXTERNAL RELATIONS AUTHORITY	
IN THE COMMUNITY AREA	
Chapter 2	
The Dual Federal Perspective	15
2.1 Mapping the Perspective	15
2.2 Structure of Part I	18
Chapter 3	
The Community's Express External Relations Authority	21
3.1 Introduction and Structure: The Case of the Common Commercial Policy	22
3.1.1 The Growth of Express Treaty-Making Competences in the EC Treaty	22
3.1.2 The Case of the Common Commercial Policy	24
3.2 The EC Treaty: Objectives and Competence Conferral	25

3.3	Four Basic Conceptions of the CCP	28
3.3.1	Opinion 1/75: The State Analogy	28
3.3.2	Opinion 1/78: Developments in International Trade Relations. Effects on the Common Market	29
3.3.3	Opinion 1/94: The Structure of the EC Treaty	34
3.3.4	In Sum	40
3.4	The Four Conceptions at Work: The Method for Determining the Legal Basis of a Measure	41
3.4.1	The 'Essential Objective' Doctrine	41
3.4.2	A Case Study: CCP vis-à-vis Environmental Policy	43
3.4.2.1	Chernobyl	43
3.4.2.2	Cartagena Protocol	44
3.4.2.3	The Energy Star Agreement	46
3.4.2.4	The Rotterdam Convention	48
3.5	Conclusions	50
Chapter 4		
The Community's Implied External Relations Authority		53
4.1	Introduction and Structure	53
4.2	The AETR Principle: The Affect Ratio	55
4.3	Opinion 1/76: The Necessity Ratio	56
4.3.1	Establishing the 'Necessity Ratio': Opinion 1/76	56
4.3.2	Necessity as Subsidiary (Complementary) Competence	58
4.3.3	Necessity as Political Discretion: Parallelism	59
4.3.4	Necessity as an Inextricable Linkage	61
4.4	Concluding Remarks	67
Chapter 5		
Restraints on the Community's Exercise of External Competence		69
5.1	Introduction and Structure	69
5.2	Community Objectives	70
5.2.1	The Objective of Trade Liberalization	71
5.2.2	The 'Community Preference'	73
5.3	General Rules and Principles of Community Law	74
5.3.1	'Extension' of Principles of Non-Discrimination	75
5.3.2	A 'Dedicated' Restraint on the Community's External Relations: The Principle of Autonomy	79
5.3.2.1	Opinion 1/76	80
5.3.2.2	The EEA Agreement Opinions	82
5.3.2.3	Opinion 1/00	85
5.3.2.4	In Sum	87
5.4	Concluding Remarks	89

Chapter 6		
Exclusion of Member States' External Competence		91
6.1	Introduction and Structure	91
6.2	Types of Exclusivity	92
6.3	A Priori Exclusivity	93
6.3.1	The Common Commercial Policy	93
6.3.2	Fisheries Conservation Measures	96
6.4	AETR Exclusivity	97
6.4.1	Meaning and Rationale: The Affect Ratio	97
6.4.2	The Scope of Application of AETR Exclusivity: The AETR Test	101
6.4.2.1	The Scope of the Internal Community System	101
6.4.2.2	When are Internal Community Measures 'Affected'?	108
6.4.3	In Sum	115
6.5	Opinion 1/76 and Exclusivity	116
6.6	Exceptions to Exclusivity and Concluding Remarks	119
6.6.1	Common Commercial Policy	119
6.6.2	Fisheries Conservation	121
6.6.3	The AETR Case	122
6.7	Concluding Remarks – Bridging the Gap between Legal Language and Its Context	122
Chapter 7		
Restraints on Member States' Exercise of External Competence		125
7.1	Introduction and Structure	125
7.2	'Extended' External Relations Restraints	127
7.2.1	Extension of the Temporal Scope of the Duty of Loyal Co-operation, Article 10 EC	128
7.2.2	Extension of Principles of Non-Discrimination	131
7.3	A 'Dedicated' External Relations Restraint: Article 307(2)	136
7.4	Concluding Observations	144
Chapter 8		
Mixed Agreements before the ECJ		147
8.1	Introduction	147
8.2	A Community Law Definition of Mixity	149
8.3	Gradual Acceptance of Mixity Subject to the Duty of Close Co-operation	153
8.3.1	Scepticism: Mixity is Incompatible with the Treaty	153
8.3.2	Cautious Acceptance and Introduction of a Duty of Close Co-operation	154

8.3.3	Full Acceptance and Reinforcement of the Duty of Close Co-operation	156
8.4	Legal Obligations Derived from the Duty of Close Co-operation	158
8.4.1	The Legal Basis, Scope and Nature of the Duty	158
8.4.2	Legal Consequences at the Different Stages in the Life of a Mixed Agreement	160
8.5	Concluding Remarks	163

PART II INTERNATIONAL LAW IN COMMUNITY LAW

Chapter 9 The Community's International Law Filter 167

9.1	Mapping the Perspective	167
9.2	Structure of Part II – the European Community's International Law Filter	169
9.3	Segregation of Legal Orders: Distinguishability and Hierarchy	172

Chapter 10 General Principles of Reception: Kupferberg and Racke 177

10.1	The Community's Responsibility under International Law	177
10.1.1	International Agreements Concluded by the Community	177
10.1.2	Other Instruments of International Law	179
10.2	International Law Invalidated by Primary Community Law	181
10.3	Conclusions	183

Chapter 11 The Legal Consequence of Reception: The Requirement of Uniform Application 185

11.1	Establishing the Requirement of Uniform Application	185
11.2	The (Vertical) Limits of the Requirement of Uniform Application	187
11.3	The Rationale for Uniform Application (I): The Two-fold Community Interest	189
11.4	The Rationale for Uniform Application (II): Proper Compliance with International Obligations	191
11.5	Conclusions	193

Chapter 12 Reception of International Law (II): Alternatives 195

12.1	Introduction	195
------	--------------	-----

12.2	Substitution and Delegation	195
12.2.1	International Fruit: The Doctrine of Substitution	195
12.2.2	Libor Cipra: The Doctrine of Delegation	202
12.2.3	Concluding Remarks	204
12.3	Mixity: The Community Sphere of Mixed Agreements	205
12.3.1	Preliminary Rulings	206
12.3.1.1	Demirel	206
12.3.1.2	Hermès	208
12.3.1.3	Dior/Assco	213
12.3.2	Direct Actions	219
12.3.2.1	The Berne Convention Case	219
12.3.2.2	Étang de Berre	222
12.3.2.3	MOX Plant	224
12.3.3	Synthesis	227
12.3.3.1	General Considerations	228
12.3.3.2	General Principles	230
Chapter 13		
Conclusions to Chapters 10–12 and Introduction to Chapters 14–16		235
13.1	Principles of Reception of International Law in Community Law	235
13.2	The Legal Effects of International Law in Community Law	239
Chapter 14		
A Framework for Direct Invocability		243
14.1	The Notion of Direct Invocability	243
14.2	Direct Invocability of International Agreements	245
14.2.1	Individuals Invoking International Agreements	245
14.2.1.1	The General Conditions for Direct Effect	245
14.2.1.2	Modifications?	249
14.2.2	Privileged Litigants Invoking International Agreements	253
14.2.2.1	Privileged Litigants Invoking International Agreements against Community Acts	254
14.2.2.2	Privileged Litigants Invoking International Agreements against Member State Acts	259
14.3	Direct Invocability of Other Instruments of International Law	263
14.4	A General Framework for Analysis of Direct Invocability	269
Chapter 15		
The Substantive Analysis of International Agreements' Direct Invocability		273
15.1	The Agreement of the Parties	274

15.2	The Purpose and Nature of Agreements	275
15.2.1	The GATT and WTO Agreements	276
15.2.1.1	GATT 1947	276
15.2.1.2	The WTO Agreements	280
15.2.2	Other International Agreements	288
15.2.2.1	ACP-EC Conventions	288
15.2.2.2	Early European Association Agreements Envisaging Accession	290
15.2.2.3	Free Trade Agreements etc. with European Countries	292
15.2.2.4	Euro-Mediterranean Co-operation and Association Agreements	295
15.2.2.5	The Europe Agreements	296
15.2.2.6	Other Directly Invocable International Agreements	297
15.2.3	Synthesis?	298
Chapter 16		
Other Effects of International Law		305
16.1	Introduction	305
16.2	Indirect Effects of International Law	305
16.2.1	Introduction	305
16.2.2	The External Duty of Constructive Interpretation	306
16.2.2.1	A Dual Legal Basis	307
16.2.2.2	Scope: Which Rules are Covered?	309
16.2.2.3	Content: What Does the Duty Require?	310
16.2.2.4	Concluding Remarks	312
16.2.3	The Implementation Doctrines – Fediol and Nakajima	313
16.2.3.1	Fediol: The ‘Express Reference’ Doctrine	314
16.2.3.2	Nakajima: The Legislator’s Intent	315
16.2.3.3	Unresolved Issues	318
16.2.4	Concluding Remarks	321
16.3	Community or Member State Liability for Breach of International Obligations	322
16.3.1	Introduction	322
16.3.2	Scope	323
16.3.3	Content: The Three Conditions for Liability	324
16.3.4	Non-Fault Liability – Compensation in the Absence of Unlawful Action	332
16.3.5	Concluding Remarks	334
16.4	Interpretative Techniques	334

**PART III
DOCTRINES AND DISCOURSES IN EC EXTERNAL
RELATIONS LAW**

Chapter 17	
Introduction	343
Chapter 18	
Social Constructivism and Discourse Analysis	347
18.1 Law as a Social Construction	347
18.2 The Role of Language in the Construction of Social Ontologies	348
18.2.1 Structure and Change: Structuralism and Post-structuralism	350
18.2.2 Structure and Agency (Discourse and Discursive Event)	353
Chapter 19	
Analytical Tools for a Discourse Analysis in EC External Relations Law	357
19.1 Introduction	357
19.2 The Level of Discourse: What is (in) a Discourse?	360
19.2.1 Foucault: Rules for the Formation of Discourse	362
19.2.2 Laclau & Mouffe: Competing Discourses and Floating Signifiers	364
19.3 The Level of Discursive Event: Strategies to Construct or Deconstruct Discourses	366
Chapter 20	
Legal Discourses in EC External Relations	369
20.1 Demarcating and Distinguishing	369
20.1.1 EC External Relations Law as an 'Order of Discourse' and 'Legal Issues' as Floating Signifiers	370
20.1.2 Three Guiding Distinctions	371
20.2 An Outline of Five Sub-Discourses in EC External Relations Law	373
20.2.1 The Discourse of Internal Integration	374
20.2.2 The Discourse of External Actorness	377
20.2.3 The Discourse of International Co-operation	381
20.2.4 The Discourse of Internal Constitutionality	385
20.2.5 A Discourse of Individual Rights?	388
20.2.6 Conclusions	391
20.3 The Level of Discursive Event	395
20.3.1 Discursive Struggles: Strategies to Strengthen or Dismantle Discourses	395
20.3.2 Interdiscursivity: Mixing Discourses in Discursive Events	398

Chapter 21	
Legal Analysis in EC External Relations Law	401
21.1	Introduction 401
21.2	The Janus Head of Dogmatic Legal Analysis: Flexibility Versus Rationalization 403
21.3	Orthodox Legal Analysis 407
21.4	EC External Relations Law and Its Contexts 409
21.4.1	Law and Legal Reasoning as a Distinguishable Domain 409
21.4.2	Interaction between Law and Context 409
21.5	Coherence 414
21.5.1	Coherence as an Ideal in Legal Reasoning 414
21.5.2	Intra-Systemic Coherence 418
21.5.3	Extra-Systemic Coherence 420
21.6	Coherence in a Discursively Constructed Domain 423
21.6.1	The Dogmatic Lawyer's Dilemma 423
21.6.2	Intra-Discursive and Inter-Discursive Coherence in Legal Reasoning 424
Chapter 22	
Analyzing the Direction and Reach of EC External Relations Law	427
22.1	Introduction 427
22.2	The Example of Direct Invocability of WTO 428
22.2.1	A Discursive Divide on Direct Invocability: External Actorhood vis-à-vis International Co-operation 428
22.2.2	Alternative (I): The Discourse of International Co-operation 431
22.2.2.1	A Narrow Focus on WTO Law 432
22.2.2.2	A Broader Focus on the WTO System 433
22.2.3	Alternative (II): An Individual Rights Discourse 438
22.2.3.1	The Intention of the WTO Members 438
22.2.3.2	WTO Law from a Community Perspective 438
22.3	Discursive Readings of Other Legal Issues 441
22.4	Concluding remarks 446
Chapter 23	
Conclusions	449
23.1	Legal Framework Analysis of the Vertical Aspects of EC External Relations Law 450
23.2	Doctrines and Discourses in EC External Relations Law 452
Table of Cases (Numerical)	455
Bibliography	467
Table of Abbreviations	495
Index	499