Circumvention and Anti-Circumvention Measures

The Impact on Anti-Dumping Practice in International Trade

Yanning Yu
Table of Contents

Preface and Acknowledgements xiii
List of Abbreviations and Contractions xvii
Table of Cases xix
Table of National Statutes and International Conventions xxiii

Chapter 1
Introduction: Dumping, Anti-Dumping, Circumvention and Anti-Circumvention in International Trade 1
1.1 Dumping and Anti-dumping Measures 1
1.2 The Dilemma in Anti-dumping Practice: Conflicts, Challenges and Choices – Circumvention and Anti-circumvention 5
1.3 Organization of this Book 10

Chapter 2
Anti-Circumvention Measures in Anti-Dumping Practice: An Overview 13
2.1 Introduction 13
2.2 The Definition of Circumvention in the Context of Anti-dumping Law 14
  2.2.1 A Theme to Be Developed: What Is Circumvention? 14
  2.2.1.1 Different Approaches to the Definition of Circumvention 15
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.2.1.1.1</td>
<td>The WTO Ministerial Decision on Anti-Circumvention</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.1.1.2</td>
<td>Identifying Circumvention: Two Major Approaches</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>a. The US Approach</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>b. The EU Approach</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.1.2</td>
<td>A Middle Way</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.1.3</td>
<td>A Theme to Be Developed</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.2</td>
<td>Circumvention: Tax Evasion or Tax Avoidance?</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.2.1</td>
<td>The Question of Expression</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.2.2</td>
<td>The Puzzle: An Alternative Expression</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.2.3</td>
<td>The Line between Tax Avoidance and Tax Planning</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2.2.2.3.1 The Value-added Rule</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2.2.2.3.2 The Material Modification Rule</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>Forms of Circumvention</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.1</td>
<td>The Classification of Circumvention</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.2</td>
<td>Types of Circumvention</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.2.1</td>
<td>Simple Circumvention</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2.3.2.1.1 Transhipment</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2.3.2.1.2 Incorrect Customs Declarations and Other Fraudulent Means</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.2.2</td>
<td>Complex Circumvention</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2.3.2.2.1 Upstream Circumvention</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2.3.2.2.2 Side-stream Circumvention</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2.3.2.2.3 Downstream Circumvention</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2.3.2.2.4 Third-country Circumvention</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2.3.2.2.5 Country-hopping</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2.3.2.2.6 Repeat Corporate Offenders</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2.3.2.2.7 Fictitious Markets</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4</td>
<td>The History of Anti-circumvention Measures in Anti-dumping Practice</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>Anti-circumvention Measures in Anti-dumping Practice:</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A Critical Appraisal</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5.1</td>
<td>Anti-circumvention Measures: The Grease of Anti-dumping Laws</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5.2</td>
<td>Globalization, Protectionism and Anti-circumvention Measures</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Chapter 3

Anti-Circumvention Measures in Anti-Dumping Practice of Some Selected Regional Trading Blocs and National Jurisdictions 59

3.1 Introduction 59
# 3.2 The Anti-circumvention Legislation in Anti-dumping Practice of Major Jurisdictions

## 3.2.1 The EU

- **3.2.1.1 Legislative History**
- **3.2.1.2 Legal Framework**
  - 3.2.1.2.1 What Constitutes Circumvention?
    - a. Article 13:1 of Regulation 461/2004
    - b. Article 13:2 of Regulation 384/96
  - 3.2.1.2.2 Procedural Provisions
    - a. General Procedures
      - i. Complaint
      - ii. Investigating
    - b. Unique Procedures
    - c. Anti-circumvention Measures
- **3.2.1.3 Evaluation**

## 3.2.2 NAFTA Countries

- **3.2.2.1 The US**
  - **3.2.2.1.1 Legislative History**
  - **3.2.2.1.2 Legal Framework**
    - a. What Constitutes Circumvention?
      - (i) Section 1319 in the 1988 Trade Act
      - (ii) Section 1320 in the 1988 Trade Act
      - (iii) Section 1321 in the 1988 Trade Act
      - (iv) Section 1323 in the 1988 Trade Act
      - (i) General Procedures
      - (ii) Unique Procedures
- **3.2.2.1.3 Evaluation: A Comparative Analysis on Anti-circumvention Provisions in the US and the EU**
  - a. A Warp: The Common Characteristics Shared by the Two Systems
  - b. A Woof: The Differences between the Two Systems
  - c. Some Observations

## 3.2.3 The Asia-Pacific Region

- **3.2.3.1 Australia**
- **3.2.3.2 New Zealand**
3.2.3.3 Korea 105
3.2.3.4 Japan 107
3.2.3.5 China 110
   3.2.3.5.1 People’s Republic of China (Mainland) 110
   3.2.3.5.2 Hong Kong, China 113
3.2.3.6 India 115
3.3 A Comparative Appraisal 117
   3.3.1 Anti-circumvention Measures in Anti-dumping Practice and Regional Trading Blocs 117
   3.3.2 Anti-circumvention Measures in Anti-dumping Practice and Developing Countries: Lessons from China 120
   3.3.3 Chapter Remarks – Some Observations 125

Chapter 4
International Legal Framework of Anti-Circumvention Measures in Anti-Dumping Practice 127

4.1 Introduction 127
4.2 Anti-circumvention in the Uruguay Round 128
   4.2.1 The Uruguay Round Negotiations 128
   4.2.2 The Draft Texts of the Uruguay Round Relating to Anti-circumvention Measures 129
      4.2.2.1 The Carlisle Draft Text I 129
      4.2.2.2 The Carlisle Draft Text II 132
      4.2.2.3 The New Zealand Draft Text 134
      4.2.2.4 The Dunkel Draft Text 135
4.3 Case Study: The Screwdriver Case (Japan V. EU) 142
   4.3.1 Statement of the Case 143
      4.3.1.1 Facts of the Case 143
         4.3.1.1.1 The Council Regulation (EEC) No. 1761/87 of 22 June 1987 and Its Application 143
         4.3.1.1.2 Consultation Request and the Establishment of the Panel 144
      4.3.1.2 Issues and Findings of the Case 145
         4.3.1.2.1 General 145
         4.3.1.2.2 Issues 145
            a. GATT Article VI 145
               (i) The Background Law 145
               (ii) Arguments 146
               (iii) The Panel’s Report – Findings and Reasoning 148
               (iv) Evaluation 148
b. GATT Article XX(d)
   (i) The Background Law 151
   (ii) Arguments 151
   (iii) The Panel’s Report – Findings and Reasoning 153
   (iv) Evaluation 154

c. GATT Articles I, II, III and X 155
   (i) The Background Law 155
   (ii) Arguments 156
   (iii) The Panel’s Report – Findings and Reasoning 158
   (iv) Evaluation 159

4.4 The Conflicting Anti-circumvention Measures in Anti-dumping Practice within the International Legal Framework: Some Observations 161

Chapter 5
A Critical Analysis of Anti-Circumvention Measures in Anti-Dumping Practice of International Trade 167

5.1 A New Legal Weapon or a Weapon of Protectionism? 167
5.1.1 Anti-circumvention Measures and Comparative Advantage: A Critical Analysis of the Arguments of Foreign Exporters or Producers 168
5.1.2 Anti-circumvention Measures and Prisoner’s Dilemma: The Choices for Governments 174
5.1.3 The Protectionist Implications of Anti-circumvention Measures in Anti-dumping Practice: How Do They Work? 177
5.1.4 Protectionism: Old Wine in a New Bottle – The Interests of Domestic Industries 182

5.2 Anti-circumvention Measures in Anti-dumping Practice and Foreign Direct Investment: Promotion or Prevention? 186
5.2.1 Foreign Direct Investment and the Recent Trend 187
5.2.2 Foreign Direct Investment, Circumvention and Protectionism 187
5.2.3 Foreign Direct Investment and Anti-circumvention Measures in Anti-dumping Practice 189

5.3 Anti-Circumvention Measures in Anti-dumping Practice and the WTO 194
5.3.1 Anti-circumvention Measures in the WTO Rules: Is There Any Basis? 195
Table of Contents

5.3.1.1 The Ministerial Decision on Anti-Circumvention 195
5.3.1.2 GATT Article VI and Anti-dumping Agreement of the WTO 196

5.3.2 Anti-Circumvention Measures in Anti-dumping Practice and the WTO Rules: Conflicting? 202
5.3.2.1 Like Product 203
5.3.2.2 The Country of Origin or the Country of Export? 206
5.3.2.3 Dumping Finding and Injury Finding 211

5.3.3 Complementing Anti-circumvention Measures and the WTO Rules: Some Observations 212

Chapter 6
Anti-Circumvention Measures in the Future: Suggestions and Conclusions 213

6.2 Some Suggestions toward Designing Anti-circumvention Measures in Anti-dumping Practice 216
6.3 Conclusions 220

Annexes

Annex 1
Decision on Anti-Circumvention 223

Annex 2

Annex 3

Annex 4
Omnibus Trade and Competitiveness Act of 1988 (United States Public Law) 233

Annex 5
Uruguay Round Agreements Act (United States Public Law) 245

Selected References 249

Index 261