FOUR ESSAYS ON THE THEORY OF LIABILITY RULES

BY

JEONGHYUN KIM

B.A. SEOUL NATIONAL UNIVERSITY, 1994
A.M. BROWN UNIVERSITY, 1998

A DISSERTATION SUBMITTED IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT OF THE
REQUIREMENTS FOR THE DEGREE OF DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY
IN THE DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMICS AT BROWN UNIVERSITY

PROVIDENCE, RHODE ISLAND

MAY 2003
# Table of Contents

**Chapter 1: The Learned Hand Rule Revisited: Can a Reasonable Person Presume a Reasonable Counterpart?**

1. Introduction .................................................. 2
2. Methodology: How to Apply the Hand Formula .............. 6
   2.1 Binary Choice Model: Precaution vs. Untaken Precaution 6
   2.2 Independent vs. Conditional-Based-On-Efficient-Behavior Application of the Hand Formula 10
   2.3 Conditional-Based-On-Actual-Behavior Application of the Hand Formula 12
   2.4 Case Study ................................................. 14
3. The Analysis of the Game: Binary Choice Model .......... 18
   3.1 Alternative Care Case: \(\min(c_1, c_2) < (p_1 - p_2)L\) and \(\max(c_1, c_2) > (p_1 - p_2)L\) 19
   3.2 Joint Care Case: \(\max(c_1, c_2) < (p_1 - p_2)L\) and \(c_1 + c_2 < (p_1 - p_2)L\) 30
   3.3 No Care Case: \(\min(c_1, c_2) > (p_1 - p_2)L\) and \(c_1 + c_2 > (p_1 - p_2)L\) 34
4. The Analysis of the Game: Continuous Care Model ....... 37
   4.1 Simultaneous Move Game .................................. 38
   4.2 Sequential Move Game ..................................... 46
5. Conclusion ..................................................... 49
6. References .................................................... 51

**Chapter 2: The Hand Rule and United States v. Carroll Towing Co. Reconsidered** (with Allan M. Feldman) 55

1. Introduction .................................................. 56
2. Structure of the Case ......................................... 57
3. Three Ways to Apply Judge Hand's Test ..................... 59
   3.1 Independent Application .................................. 60
   3.2 Conditional Application, Contingent on the Other Party's Actual Behavior 61
   3.3 Conditional Application, Contingent on the Other Party's Efficient Behavior 62
4. A Game Theoretic Analysis of United States v. Carroll Towing Co. 64
   4.1 Structure of the Game: Dichotomous Choice, Partly Alternative Care Technology 64