Ownership, Community Influence, and Hospital Behavior: An Application of Nonprofit Theory to the Study of Effects of Ownership and Consequences of Conversion

Gerard Edmund Carrino

Submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy under the Executive Committee of the Graduate School of Arts and Sciences

COLUMBIA UNIVERSITY
2005
Table of Contents

Chapter 1: Introduction .................................................. 1

1.1 Hospital Ownership Types: Public, Nonprofit, and For-Profit ........ 4
1.2 Hospital Conversion: Definition, Direction, and Prevalence .......... 9
1.3 Why Hospitals Convert ............................................ 11
1.4 Characteristics of Converted Hospitals ............................. 15
1.5 Contemporary Controversies: Ownership & Conversion ............. 18
1.6 Summary .......................................................... 24

Table 1.1 Ownership by Year ........................................... 25
Table 1.2 Conversions by Year ........................................... 25

Chapter 2: Nonprofit Theory and the Nature of Nonprofit Products ...... 26

2.1 Nonprofit Theory ................................................... 27

2.1.1 Public Goods Theory ........................................... 28
2.1.2 Contract Failure Theory ....................................... 32
2.1.3 Subsidy Theory, Consumer Control Theory, and Management

Incentive Theory ................................................ 35
2.1.4 Models of the Nonprofit Hospital ................................ 40

2.1.4.1 The Nonprofit Hospital as a Physician Cooperative for Income Maximization .... 42
2.1.4.2 The Nonprofit Hospital as a Consumer Cooperative
3.1 Cross-Sectional Comparisons Among the Sectors ............... 87
3.2 The Consequences of Conversion .................................. 100
3.3 Methods, Model, and Hypotheses ............................... 105
3.4 Results ................................................................. 109
3.5 Discussion & Summary ............................................. 122
Table 3.1 Regression Results – Ownership & Behavior (Hospital Perspective) .............................................. 126
Table 3.2 Effects of Including/Excluding Zeroes and Outliers .... 127
Table 3.3 Including vs. Excluding County Dummy Variables ... 129
Table 3.4 Regression Results – Ownership & Behavior (Community Perspective) .............................................. 131

Chapter 4: Community Mediation ........................................ 132

4.0 The Consequences of Conversion & Other Market Perturbations .. 133
4.1 Previous Research on Market Effects and Other Community Influences ................................................... 136
4.2 Mechanisms of Mediation ............................................ 140
4.3 Methods, Model, and Hypotheses ............................... 144
4.4 Results & Discussion ................................................ 148
4.5 Summary ................................................................. 150
Table 4.1 Regression Results – Community Mediation ............... 151