The Economics of Antitrust Injury and Firm-Specific Damages

Edited by
Kevin S. Marshall

Contributors
Stephen H. Kalos
Lawrence Kolbe
Christopher R. Leslie
John E. Loptka
Kevin S. Marshall
Michele Molyneaux
William H. Page
William B. Tye
# Table of Contents

Acknowledgments ........................................................................................................... xiii  
Preface ............................................................................................................................. xv  

Chapter 1: The Economics of Competitive Injury ............................................................. 1  
   Kevin S. Marshall, J.D., M.P.A., Ph.D.  
1.1 Introduction ............................................................................................................. 1  
1.2 Antitrust Injury—Brunswick and its Progeny ......................................................... 2  
1.3 The Perfectly Competitive Model—A Paradigm for Identifying Conduct Injurious to Competition ................................................................. 5  
   A. Efficiency—The Objective of Perfect Competition and the U.S. Antitrust Laws .... 7  
   B. The Perfectly Competitive Model and Its Condition of Rationality ............... 9  
   C. The Perfectly Competitive Model and Its Condition of Numerous, Price-Taking Buyers and Sellers ............................................................. 12  
   D. The Perfectly Competitive Model and Its Condition of Independence .......... 16  
   E. The Perfectly Competitive Model and Its Condition of No Entry or Exit Barriers ........................................... 18  
   F. The Perfectly Competitive Model and Its Condition of Product Homogeneity ..... 20  
   G. The Perfectly Competitive Model and Its Unrestricted Forces of Supply and Demand—Maximizing Output at Minimum (Competitive) Prices ......................................... 21  
1.4 An Analytical Paradigm ......................................................................................... 25  
1.5 Conclusion ............................................................................................................. 27  

Chapter 2: Antitrust Damages and Deadweight Loss ......................................................... 45  
   Christopher R. Leslie, M.P.P., J.D.  
2.1 Monopolies, Cartels, and Deadweight Loss .......................................................... 46  
2.2 Antitrust Law Fails to Award Damages Based on Deadweight Loss ................. 49  
2.3 The Harms of Not Providing a Remedy for Deadweight Loss ......................... 52  
2.4 Issues in Incorporating Deadweight Loss Concerns into Antitrust Litigation ....... 54  
   A. Measuring Deadweight Loss ............................................................................ 54  
   B. Who Should Recover Deadweight Loss Damages ........................................... 59
Chapter 3: Quality Control of Economic Expert Testimony: The Fundamental Methods of Proving Antitrust Damages

Michele Molyneaux, J.D.

3.1 Introduction
3.2 Methods of Proving Amount of Damages
A. Yardstick Method
B. Before-and-After Method
C. Market-Share Method
D. Going-Concern Method
3.3 Analysis Must be Based on Sufficient Facts
3.4 Analysis Must be Tailored to Antitrust Injury ("Fit")
A. Antitrust Injury
B. Disaggregation
3.5 Conclusion

Chapter 4: Antitrust Damages from Lost Opportunities
William B. Tye, Ph.D. and Stephen H. Kalos, Ph.D.

4.1 Introduction
4.2 Objectives in Formulating Principles for Determining Damages
4.3 Basic Principles for Estimating Damages
4.4 Common Examples of Methodological Errors in Damage Studies
A. Sunk Costs and Market Imperfections as Sources of Damages
B. Case Study: Pennzoil v. Texaco
4.5 Considerations of the Lag Between the Offenses and Damages: The Role of Hindsight
4.6 Special Consideration of Antitrust Damages
4.7 Conclusions

Chapter 5: How to Value a Lost Opportunity: Defining and Measuring Damages from Market Foreclosure
William B. Tye, Ph.D. Stephen H. Kalos, Ph.D. and A. Lawrence Kolbe, Ph.D.

5.1 Introduction
A. Objectives of this [Chapter]
B. Preliminary Ground Rules
C. Summary of Conclusions
5.2 A Framework for Estimating the Value of Lost Opportunities
A. Damages when Hindsight is Irrelevant
B. Damages when Hindsight is Relevant
5.3 Consideration of the Lag Between the Offense and Damages: The Role of Hindsight ................................................................. 153
5.4 Prejudgment Interest on Post-Trial Lost Profits in the Ex Ante Approach ................................................................. 158
   A. Considerations Based on Principles of Finance ......................... 160
   B. Considerations Based on Nature of Risk ................................... 160
5.5 Prejudgment Interest on Post-Trial Lost Profits in the Ex Post Method ................................................................. 163
5.6 Prejudgment Interest for Pretrial Lost Profits ............................. 167
5.7 An Integrated Approach to Prejudgment Interest and Damage Methodology ................................................................. 169
5.8 Should Damages Seek to Make the Victim “Whole” as of the Offense or as of the Trial? ................................................................. 171
   A. Purging the Ex Post Method of Bias ........................................... 171
   B. Difficulties in Accurately Applying the Ex Ante and Ex Post Methods ................................................................. 173
   C. Opportunism in the Choice of Methodology ................................. 173
   D. A Summing Up ...................................................................... 174
5.9 Special Consideration of Antitrust Damages ................................... 176
5.10 Conclusion ............................................................................ 176

Chapter 6: Economic Authority and the Limits of Expertise in Antitrust Cases ................................................................................. 195

   John E. Loptka, J.D., L.L.M. and William H. Page, J.D., L.L.M.
6.1 Introduction ............................................................................ 196
6.2 Conceptual Models, Expert Testimony, and the Process of Adjudication .................................................................................. 197
   A. Models, Evidence, and Adjudication ........................................... 198
   B. Expert Testimony and Daubert .................................................. 199
6.3 Economic Authority and Expertise in Antitrust Cases ................. 202
   A. Economic Authority and Antitrust: Models, Rules, and the Domain of Fact ................................................................. 202
   B. Economic Authority and Expert Testimony in Antitrust Cases .................................................................................. 208
6.4 Judicial Control of Expert Testimony in Critical Contexts .......... 213
   A. Predatory Pricing ................................................................... 214
   B. Markets and Market Power ....................................................... 218
   C. Cartels ................................................................................ 224
   D. Damages ............................................................................ 231
6.5 Evaluating the Primacy of Economic Authority Over Expertise ...... 236
   A. Comparing Institutional Characteristics ..................................... 237
   B. Implications for the Confrontation Between Chicago and Post-Chicago Economics ................................................................. 240
6.6 Conclusion ............................................................................ 242