International Trade in Services and Domestic Regulations

Necessity, Transparency, and Regulatory Diversity

PANAGIOTIS DELIMATSIS

OXFORD UNIVERSITY PRESS
Introduction

I The Multilateral Legal Framework Governing Trade in Services
A. The Uruguay Round: A rules-based system for world trade
B. The position of services in world trade
C. Creating the GATS
D. The position of the GATS in the GATT/WTO structure—The boundaries between the GATT and the GATS
   1. The EC approach
   2. The WTO case law—GATT and GATS as two irreconcilable agreements?
      a) The Canada—Periodicals case
      b) The EC—Bananas III case
E. The GATS at a glance
   1. Measures falling within the ambit of the GATS
   2. The structure of the GATS
   3. The mechanics of liberalization commitments under GATS
   4. GATS versus GATT: So similar, so different
F. Dancing in the dark? The GATS' tentative steps towards liberalization of trade in services

II Barriers to Trade in Services
A. Introductory remarks
B. Usual barriers to trade
   1. Few words on trade policy
   2. The determinants of protectionism—The role of special interest groups
      a) Protection of domestic production
      b) Market failures (distortions) and political trade interventions
         (1) Domestic distortions
            i. Optimal tariff
            ii. Strategic trade policy
            iii. Contingent protection (anti-dumping and countervailing measures, and safeguards)
### Contents

3. Forms of protectionism (trade policy instruments)—Barriers to imports 58

C. Protection in services industries 62

D. Regulations as impediments to trade in services 66

E. Typologies of barriers to trade in services 76

F. Possible gains from dismantling barriers to trade in services 80

### III Domestic Regulations and the GATS 84

A. Introductory remarks 84

B. Snipping at the Gordian knot of domestic regulations 87
   1. Why regulate in the first place? 87
   2. Characteristics and types of regulations 91

C. The obligations contained in Article VI GATS 93
   1. Negotiating history and ratio legis 93
   2. Article VI:1—Reasonable, objective, and impartial administration of measures of general application affecting trade in services 96
   3. Article VI:2—Prompt review of, and appropriate remedies for, administrative decisions 104
   4. Article VI:3—Information by the domestic competent authorities and timely decision as regards an application 107
   5. Procedural due process in Article VI GATS 109
   6. Article VI:4—the substantive obligation 112
   7. Article VI:5—The substantive obligation of transitional nature 117
   8. Article VI:6—Adequate procedures for verifying competence of professionals 127

D. The relationship of Article VI with Articles XVI, XVII, and XVIII GATS—A conciliatory approach 130
   1. Introductory remarks 130
   2. The market access obligation of Article XVI 131
   3. The national treatment obligation contained in Article XVII 140
   4. The overlap between Articles XVI and XVII GATS and possible solutions 141
   5. The role of Article XVIII 148
   6. Exploring the relationship between Articles VI, XVI, and XVII 148

E. To regulate, or not to regulate? That is the question—But not the only one: A primer on the tools for evaluating the domestic regulatory regime 154

F. Put the blame on the GATS: liberalization, deregulation, regulatory reform... or something else? 162
### Contents

IV Creating a Horizontal Necessity Test for Services 166

A. Introductory remarks 166

B. The establishment of the WPPS and the development of disciplines on domestic regulation with respect to accountancy services 168

1. The WPPS mandate 168

2. The accountancy disciplines *in concreto*—Strengths and weaknesses 171

3. The necessity test as foreseen under paragraph 2 of the accountancy disciplines 175

C. The establishment of the WPDR 179

1. The WPDR mandate 179

2. Organization of the work within the WPDR relative to the development of horizontal versus sectoral disciplines 181

3. The scope of Article VI:4 as defined within the WPDR 187

   a) Qualification requirements and procedures 192

   b) Licensing requirements and procedures 194

   c) Technical standards 199

D. Towards the development of a horizontal necessity test applicable to all services sectors as foreseen in Article VI:4 GATS 202

1. Legitimate objectives 203

2. Criteria for the necessity test 204

   a) *Not more* burdensome than necessary versus *not more* trade-restrictive than necessary 205

   b) *Third aspect* of the necessity test 210

3. The conceptual issue of necessity as it has been endorsed, applied, and interpreted in other WTO agreements—Possible models for the necessity test envisaged in Article VI:4? 211

   a) *Article XX GATT* 212

   b) *Article XIV GATS and paragraph 5(e) of the Annex on Telecommunications* 219

   c) *Article 2.2 of the TBT Agreement* 223

   d) *Article 5.6 of the SPS Agreement* 227

   e) A tentative conclusion 231

4. The necessity requirement with respect to services trade in regional integration agreements 232

5. Proposals submitted to the WPDR with respect to the creation of a horizontal necessity test 236

   a) *The proposal submitted by Australia* 237

   b) *The proposal submitted by Korea* 237
c) The proposal submitted by the European Union and the concept of proportionality as applied in EC law 238

d) The proposal submitted by Japan 242

e) The proposal submitted by Switzerland 245

f) The proposal submitted by Brazil et al 246

g) The proposal submitted by Australia et al 247

E. The prospects of, and some essential elements for, a horizontal necessity test 248

V Transparency and Domestic Regulations in Services 255

A. Introductory remarks 255

B. The transparency as a general principle of WTO law 259

C. The principle of transparency in the GATS 262

1. Article III GATS 265

2. Article VI GATS 268

D. The issue of transparency as discussed in the WPDR 270

1. Organizing the WPDR work with respect to transparency 270

2. Relevant issues touching upon transparency 271

3. The most controversial issues identified in the proposals that have been submitted—Notifications, prior consultations, and application processes 274

   a) Additional notifications to the WTO 276

   b) Prior consultations (advance notice and comment procedure) 277

   c) Application processes 280

E. Horizontally applicable transparency disciplines and the linkage with necessity 282

Concluding Remarks—Challenges for the Future 286

Bibliography 295

Index 331