Compliance with International Trade Obligations

The Common Market for Eastern and Southern Africa

Henry Kibet Mutai
Table of Contents

About the Author xv
Acknowledgments xvii
Abbreviations and Acronyms xix
Introduction and Overview xxi

Chapter 1
The Role of Law in the Conduct of International Trade Relations 1

1.1. Introduction 1
1.2. International Legal Process 2
1.2.1. Compliance and the Nature of the ‘Managerial Model’ 2
1.2.2. Relative Normativity and Compliance 6
1.3. Central Elements of the Management Strategy 9
1.3.1. Reporting and Data Collection 9
1.3.2. Policy Review, Assessment, Participation and Supervision 10
1.3.3. Capacity Building and Technical Assistance 11
1.3.4. Dispute Settlement 11
1.3.5. The Adaptation and Modification of Treaty Norms 12
1.3.6. The Role of Institutions in Securing Compliance 12
1.4. Factors Influencing Regime Design 13
1.4.1. The Minimization of Transaction Costs 14
1.4.2. The Enhancement of Credibility 15
1.4.3. The Modification of Political Strategies 16
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.4.4.</td>
<td>Incomplete Contracting and Uncertainty</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.4.5.</td>
<td>Safeguarding Sovereignty</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.4.6.</td>
<td>The Promotion of Compromise</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.4.6.1.</td>
<td>Summary</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5.</td>
<td>International Relations Theory, the Creation of Regimes</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5.1.</td>
<td>The Relationship Between IL and IR Approaches</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5.2.</td>
<td>Realism: Agreements as Reflections of Underlying Power Distributions</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5.3.</td>
<td>Institutionalism: Agreements as Contracts for Securing State Interests</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5.4.</td>
<td>Constructivism: Agreements as Covenants for Creating State Identities and Interests</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5.5.</td>
<td>Liberalism: Agreements as Embodiments of Domestic Interests</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.6.</td>
<td>Conclusions</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Chapter 2
Regionalism, Multilateralism and Free Trade – Theoretical Perspectives 29

2.1. Introduction 29
2.2. Regionalism: Regional Integration or Regional Cooperation? 31
2.3. The Economic Justification for Global Free Trade 32
2.4. The Economic Rationale for Regional Integration 35
  2.4.1. Theoretical Models of Integration 35
    2.4.1.1. Market Integration (Customs Union) Theory 35
    2.4.1.2. Development Integration Theory 37
  2.4.2. The Economic Effects of Regional Integration 38
    2.4.2.1. Regional Integration, Market Size and Economies of Scale 38
    2.4.2.2. Integration and Traditional ‘Gains from Trade’ 39
    2.4.2.3. The Effect of Regional Integration on Economic Growth 39
    2.4.2.4. The Effect of Integration on Industry: Agglomeration 40
    2.4.2.5. The Effect of Integration on Incomes 41
    2.4.2.6. The Role of Integration in Stimulating Investment 41
2.5. Factors Affecting Benefits Conferred by Regional Integration 42
  2.5.1. Choice of Partner(s) 43
  2.5.2. Choice of Form of RTA 43
  2.5.3. Number of Trade Agreements Entered Into 44
  2.5.4. External Trade Policy Stance 44
  2.5.5. RTAs and Taxes 45
2.6. The Political Economy of Regionalism (The ‘Multilateralism Versus Regionalism’ Debate) 45
2.6.1. Domino Regionalism 47
2.6.2. Regionalism as Insurance 47
2.6.3. Trade Blocs as Forums for Increasing Negotiating Strength and Facilitating Negotiations 48
2.6.4. Trade Blocs as Forums for Negotiating Tactically 49
2.7. Regionalism as Politics 49
2.7.1. Peaceful Relations 50
2.7.2. Regional Integration and the Nation-State – The Issue of Sovereignty 51
2.7.3. Other Political Factors 52
2.8. Conclusion 53

Chapter 3
The WTO’s Regulatory Regime for Regional Trade Agreements: A Managerial Perspective 55

3.1. Introduction 55
3.2. The Status and Function of the MFN Principle in GATT 56
3.2.1. History of the MFN Principle Prior to the Formation of GATT 56
3.2.2. The Incorporation of the MFN Principle into GATT: Compromise 57
3.2.3. Developing Country Grievances: Legitimacy of GATT Rules Called into Question 59
3.2.4. The Impact on Legal Discipline of the Wider Policy Changes 63
3.3. The Substantive Rules for the Establishment of RTAs 66
3.3.1. The Substantive Legal Requirements 66
3.3.2. Interpretation and Clarification of the Substantive Rules 69
3.3.2.1. Substantially all the Trade (SAT) 70
3.3.2.2. General Incidence of the Duties and Regulations of Commerce Applicable 72
3.3.2.3. Interim Agreements and the Meaning of Reasonable Length of Time 74
3.3.3. The Approval of Non-Conforming Agreements 75
3.3.4. Summary 76
3.4. Norm Implementation: The Procedural Rules 76
3.4.1. Data Collection and Reporting: The Notification Requirement 77
3.4.2. Nature of Data to be Provided and Identity of Provider 78
3.4.3. The Examination of Notified Agreements: Forum and Procedure 79
3.4.4. Monitoring and Supervision of Compliance 83
3.5. Dispute Settlement and the Regulation of RTAs 83
3.5.1. Competence and Jurisdiction to Determine Consistency 84
3.5.2. The 'Lex Specialis' Argument in 'Turkey – Restrictions' 86
3.5.3. The EEC's Preferential Arrangements and the Dangers Inherent in Preferences 89
3.5.3.1. Background 89
3.5.3.2. The EC – Conditions for Granting Tariff Preferences Dispute 91
3.5.3.3. The Panel Report 92
3.5.3.4. The Appellate Body Report 93
3.6. Conclusion 93

Chapter 4
Regional Integration and Trade Liberalization in Eastern and Southern Africa: Order or Disorder? 97

4.1. Introduction 97
4.2. The Nature of, and Rationale for African Integration 100
4.2.1. Shared Identity 100
4.2.2. Institutionalist Considerations: Economic Growth and Development 103
4.3. An Overview of Selected Regional Trading Arrangements 104
4.3.1. The African Economic Community (AEC): Supra-Regional Regulation 104
4.3.1.1. History and Nature of the Treaty 104
4.3.1.2. Institutional Framework 106
4.3.1.3. The Liberalization Programme 107
4.3.2. The Southern African Customs Union (SACU): Hegemonic Integration 109
4.3.2.1. History and Nature of the Union 109
4.3.2.2. Institutional Framework 111
4.3.2.3. Trade Liberalization Programme 112
4.3.3. The Southern African Development Community (SADC): Development Integration 112
4.3.3.1. History and Nature of the Organization 112
4.3.3.2. Institutional Framework 114
4.3.3.3. The Liberalization Programme 115
4.3.4. The East African Community (EAC): Aspirations of Federation 116
4.3.4.1. History and Nature of the Organization 116
4.3.4.2. Institutional Framework 118
4.3.4.3. Trade Liberalization Programme 119
4.4. Alternative Approaches to Integration and Trade Liberalization 120
4.4.1. The Regional Integration Facilitation Forum (RIFF) 120
4.4.2. The Cotonou Agreement and its Implications for Trade Liberalization 122

4.5. Summary 123

Chapter 5
The COMESA Treaty: A Managerial Perspective 127

5.1. Introduction 127
5.2. Background: Nature and Objectives 128
  5.2.1. Historical Development of COMESA: From Preferential Trade Area to Common Market 129
  5.2.2. Nature and Objectives of COMESA 131
  5.2.3. Membership 133
5.3. The Institutional Framework of the Common Market 135
  5.3.1. COMESA Organs 135
  5.3.2. Norm Formulation in COMESA 136
    5.3.2.1. Source of Law 136
    5.3.2.2. Law making with in COMESA 137
5.4. Norm Implementation and Dispute Resolution in COMESA 141
  5.4.1. The Supervision of Implementation and Compliance 141
  5.4.2. The Role of the Secretariat in Securing Compliance 141
  5.4.3. Dispute Resolution and the COMESA Court of Justice 144
  5.4.4. The Relationship between COMESA Law and National Law 145
5.5. The COMESA Economic Integration and Trade Liberalization Agenda 146
  5.5.1. The Intra-Regional Trade Liberalization Strategy 148
    5.5.1.1. The Most-Favoured-Nation Principle in COMESA 148
    5.5.1.2. The Elimination of Customs Duties on Intra-Regional Trade 149
    5.5.1.3. The COMESA Rules of Origin 152
    5.5.1.4. The Elimination of Non-Tariff Barriers (NTBs) to Trade 154
  5.5.2. Establishing a COMESA Customs Union 155
    5.5.2.1. The Customs Union Roadmap 156
    5.5.2.2. The Common External Tariff (CET) 156
    5.5.2.3. Developing a Framework for the Administration of the CU 159
  5.5.3. National Treatment 160
  5.5.4. Unfair Trade Practices: Anti-Dumping and Countervailing Duties 161
  5.5.5. Serious Disturbances and Safeguard Measures 162
  5.5.6. Derogations 163
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter 5</th>
<th>Relations with Third Parties: Institutional Linkages</th>
<th>164</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5.6.1.</td>
<td>Relations with the WTO</td>
<td>165</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.6.2.</td>
<td>Relations with Neighbouring Trade Blocs</td>
<td>166</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.6.3.</td>
<td>Relations with the EU: Economic Partnership Agreement Negotiations</td>
<td>169</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 5</td>
<td>Constraints to Integration</td>
<td>171</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.7.1.</td>
<td>Legal Shortcomings of the Treaties</td>
<td>171</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.7.2.</td>
<td>Lack of Capacity</td>
<td>172</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.7.3.</td>
<td>Inappropriate Integration Strategy</td>
<td>173</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.7.4.</td>
<td>Structural factor</td>
<td>174</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.7.5.</td>
<td>Multiple Overlapping Organizations</td>
<td>174</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.7.6.</td>
<td>The Dominance of Politics</td>
<td>175</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.7.7.</td>
<td>Institutional Shortcomings</td>
<td>175</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 5</td>
<td>Summary and Conclusion</td>
<td>176</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Chapter 6
Improving the Effectiveness of the WTO: An Assessment of the Doha Development Round Proposals 177

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter 6</th>
<th>Introduction</th>
<th>177</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6.1.</td>
<td>Modalities for, and State of, Negotiations on Rules</td>
<td>178</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3.</td>
<td>The Relationship Between Regionalism and Multilateralism</td>
<td>180</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4.</td>
<td>'Developmental Aspects' of the Negotiations</td>
<td>181</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.5.</td>
<td>Proposals Aimed at Increased Transparency</td>
<td>183</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.5.1.</td>
<td>Time of Notification</td>
<td>183</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.5.2.</td>
<td>Purpose of Examination</td>
<td>185</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.5.3.</td>
<td>Forum for Notification and Examination</td>
<td>186</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.5.4.</td>
<td>Provision of Information</td>
<td>186</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.6.</td>
<td>Normative Requirements: The Definition of 'Substantially all the Trade (SAT)'</td>
<td>189</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.7.</td>
<td>Summary</td>
<td>191</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Chapter 7
The Regulation of Regional Trade Agreements:
Enhancing the Effectiveness of the COMESA Legal Regime 193

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter 7</th>
<th>Introduction</th>
<th>193</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>7.1.</td>
<td>Norm Formulation and Treaty Adaptation</td>
<td>194</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2.</td>
<td>The Necessity for Consensus</td>
<td>194</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2.1.</td>
<td>Consent and Treaty Adaptation: Holding Parties</td>
<td>195</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 7</td>
<td>The Adoption of Appropriate Integration Strategies</td>
<td>196</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 7</td>
<td>Capacity Building and Technical Assistance to Enhance Compliance</td>
<td>197</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.4.1.</td>
<td>The Alleviation of Member State Capacity Constraints</td>
<td>197</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.4.2.</td>
<td>The Alleviation of Institutional Capacity Constraints</td>
<td>198</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 7</td>
<td>The Management of Compliance with COMESA Obligations</td>
<td>199</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.5.1.</td>
<td>Enhancing Transparency</td>
<td>199</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.5.2.</td>
<td>Dispute Settlement</td>
<td>199</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 7</td>
<td>The Issue of Membership and RTA Configuration</td>
<td>199</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 7</td>
<td>Summary</td>
<td>202</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Chapter 8**

Summary and Conclusion | 203 |

**Appendix I**

Article XXIV, GATT 1947 | 207 |

**Appendix II**

The Enabling Clause | 211 |

**Appendix III**

Understanding on the Interpretation of Article XXIV of the General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade 1994 | 215 |

**Appendix IV**

Dates and Summary Reports of the Meetings of the Negotiating Group on Rules | 219 |

**Appendix V**

Submissions on Regional Trade Agreements to the Negotiating Group on Rules | 221 |

Bibliography | 223 |

COMESA Materials | 241 |

GATT/WTO Materials | 243 |

Table of Treaties | 247 |

Table of Cases | 249 |

Index | 251 |