Buying Social Justice

Equality, Government Procurement, and Legal Change

CHRISTOPHER McCRUDDEN
Professor of Human Rights Law and Fellow of Lincoln College, University of Oxford

OXFORD UNIVERSITY PRESS
Contents

Table of Cases xxxix
Table of National Legislation xxxiii
Table of International and Regional Treaties and Conventions xxxix
List of Abbreviations xlvii

1. What is This Book About?

I. Introducing Procurement Linkages 4
   Disabled workers 4
   Civil rights movement in the United States and contract compliance 5
   Procurement and anti-discrimination law: the United Kingdom, Canada, Australia, and the EU 6
   'Set-asides' in the United States, Malaysia, South Africa, Canada, and Australia 8
   Selective purchasing and local activism in the United States 9
   Changing role of procurement and linkages 10

II. Themes 12
   Equal status law and social policy 12
   'Economic' versus 'social' approaches to public procurement law and policy 14
   Debates about adaptation to globalization 16
   Role of law 16

III. Outline of the Book 17
   Part I: Preliminaries 17
   Part II: Role of the World Trade Organization and procurement linkages 18
   Part III: European equality developments and the European Community 19
   Part IV: Interpretation 22
   Part V: Conclusions 22

PART I. PRELIMINARIES

2. Roots

I. National Industry Policy Procurement Linkages 25
   Protecting national industry against foreign competition 26
   Goods made by prison labour 28
   Improving the competitiveness of certain industrial sectors 28
Remedying regional disparities 29
Serving as an instrument of general economic policy 31

II. Public Works and Unemployment 31
Some distinctions 31

III. Fair Wages and Procurement 37
The origins 37
Protection from competition and the Davis-Bacon Act of 1931 39
The New Deal and the social uses of procurement 41
Origins of the linkage: fair wages in Britain 42
Why the emphasis on government contracts? 48
Subsequent history 49
Fair Wages Resolution and free trade 51
Procurement and labour clauses in France 53
International Labour Organization and procurement 55

IV. Disability and Procurement 56
Disabled ex-servicemen and procurement in Britain 56
Second World War 59
Disabled workers and federal procurement in the United States 60
Procurement and sheltered workshops for disabled workers in Germany 62

3. Status Equality Law and Policy

I. Ethical Dimensions of Equal Status Law and Policy 63
II. Market and Non-Market Enforcement 65
III. Individual Justice Model 65
Anti-discrimination law at the domestic level 66
International Labour Organization and status equality 67
Enforcement issues 68

IV. Group Justice Model 69
Limits of litigation 70
United States and ‘affirmative action’ 71
Canada 71
Northern Ireland 72
Malaysia 73
South Africa 75
Enforcement issues 76

V. Mainstreaming 77
Aboriginal self-government in Canada 81
Mainstreaming equality in Northern Ireland 83
Mainstreaming equality in Britain 87

VI. Extraterritorial Regulation of Equality 90

VII. Procurement Linkages, Equal Status Law, and Policy 92
4. International and European Procurement Regulation

I. The Origins of International and European Procurement Regulation 95
   Post-Second World War international economic architecture 96
   Development of international and regional norms regulating procurement 97
   Early beginnings 98
   Why procurement reform? 99
   EFTA and procurement 99
   OECD discussions 100

II. Government Procurement Agreement 101
    International procurement reform after 1979 101

III. Early Activities Relating to Procurement by the European Community 104
    Slow beginnings 104

IV. The Growth of Neo-Liberalism and Further European Procurement Reform 106
    Procurement and internal market reforms 107

V. European Procurement Reforms of 2003 109

VI. Procurement Linkages, International and European Procurement Regulation 111

5. Buying Social Justice?

I. Objections to Linkage 114
   Irrelevance to the appropriate functions of purchasing 115
   Costs of linkage 115
   Fairness and discrimination arguments 118
   Direct regulation preferable to procurement linkages 118
   Regulatory capture 119
   Good governance objections 120
   Abuse of power 121

II. Arguments in Favour of Linkage 122
    Inadequacy of other methods of compliance with equality legislation 122
    Mainstreaming requires linkage 123
    Limits of a 'commercial' model of government contracting 123
    Assisting the internalization of externalities 124
    Sustaining and increasing competition 126
    Supplying the 'public good' of equality 127

III. Theoretical Issues and Legal Form 128
PART II. THE WORLD TRADE ORGANIZATION AND PROCUREMENT LINKAGES

6. Contract Compliance in the United States and Canada

I. Procurement Linkages and Equality for Black Americans  
   Second World War and employment discrimination against black Americans 132  
   Following the Second World War 135  
   Approaches to enforcement 136  
   Civil rights legislation and contract compliance 137  
   Affirmative action under the Executive Order 139  
   Legal challenges unsuccessful 146  
   Revised Order No 4 147  
   Nixon Administration support 149  
   Supreme Court and 'private' affirmative action 151  
   President Reagan's challenge 152  
   Expanding the groups covered 155  
   Disability 155  
   Vietnam veterans 156  

II. Contract Compliance in Canada 157  
   Federal government equality legislation and contract compliance 157  
   Requirements of the Federal Contractors Program 159  
   Provincial programmes 161  

III. Procurement Linkages, the ILO, and Equality 164  

7. Set-asides in the United States and Canada

I. Origin and Development: United States 167  
   Constitutionality of affirmative action set-asides 169  
   Reviewing procurement linkages after Adarand 172  

II. Aboriginal Set-asides in Canada 175  
   Role of procurement linkage in the Aboriginal agreements 175  
   Procurement Strategy for Aboriginal Business 178  


I. Procurement Linkages in the Context of OECD Procurement Reform Discussions 183  
   Initial approach to linkages in the OEEC 183  
   OECD negotiations on procurement begin 185  
   Belgian complaint against the Buy-American Act 186  
   The OECD's general work on government procurement 189
Contents

II. Tokyo Round Negotiations and the GPA's Approach to Linkage 209
   Set-asides and the United States reaction to
   the 1979 Agreement 211

III. GPA 1979 Model as the Basis of Further Regional,
     International, and Bilateral Procurement Regulation 214
     North American Free Trade Agreement
     and procurement linkages 214
     Linkages and the 1994 GPA 216
     Procurement agreements and Aboriginal
     set-asides 219
     Procurement agreements and the Federal
     Contractors Program 221
     Bilateral procurement agreements 222

IV. Assessment of the 'GPA Model' 225
     Epistemic communities 225
     Embedded liberalism 226
     What is procurement reform for, again? 227

9. Procurement Linkages and Developing Countries 232
I. Bumiputera and National Stability in Malaysia
   History and economic context of preferences 233
   Riots and the introduction of procurement set-asides 234
   Subsequent development of set-asides 237
   Operation of preferences in Malaysia 238
   Internal controversy about preferences in Malaysia 240
   The 'administrative law' of government
   procurement in Malaysia 243

II. Procurement Reform in South Africa 245
   Socio-economic functions of public
   procurement in South Africa 247
   Constitutionalizing linkage in South Africa 250
   Equality legislation 251
   Preferential procurement legislation 252
   Recent government initiatives 255
   Broad-based black economic empowerment 256
   Public Private Partnerships and black
   economic empowerment 261
   Redrafting preferential procurement regulations 265

III. Selective Purchasing in the United States Relating to Myanmar 267
   Sullivan and MacBride Principles and
   selective purchasing 268
   Selective purchasing and Myanmar 270

IV. The GPA Model and Procurement Linkages: Reacting to
    Malaysia, South Africa, and Myanmar 273
   Is opting out feasible? South Africa as a test case 273
World Bank procurement policy, development, and linkage 276
Malaysia and international procurement disciplines 280
European Commission, the United States, and Myanmar 291
United States Constitutional arguments 295

PART III. EQUALITY LINKAGES AND THE EUROPEAN COMMUNITY

10. Procurement Linkages and the 1980s Reform of EC Procurement Regulation

I. United Kingdom Initiatives in the 1960s and 1970s 301
   Developing linkages in Britain in the 1960s 301
   Attempts to reform the British scheme 1968–85 302
   Procurement and Northern Ireland anti-discrimination policy 305
   Procurement linkage in Northern Ireland 1973–80 305
   Reformed fair employment legislation and procurement linkage 307

II. Developing Procurement Linkages in Germany 310
   Overview of German procurement law up to the mid-1990s 310
   Use of procurement linkages other than for equal status goals 313
   Use of procurement linkages for equal status goals 315

III. Legislative Reform of the Procurement Directives 1986–92 317
    Some context 317
    Status equality and the Supplies Directive 319
    Status equality and the Works Directive 321
    The Beentjes case 322
    Legislative activity following Beentjes 323
    Status equality and the Services Directive 324
    Status equality and the Utilities Directive 327
    Status equality and the consolidated Supplies Directive 330

11. Domestic Procurement Linkages During the 1990s and the Chilling Effect of European Procurement Regulation

I. Growing European Commission Scepticism Regarding Procurement Linkages 331

II. British Public Sector Management Reform: Contracting Out, Privatization, and Procurement Linkages 334
   Compulsory competitive tendering 335
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Contents</th>
<th>xxiii</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Contract compliance and local authorities 337</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Judicial intervention against linkage 340</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Political intervention: the Local Government Act 1988 340</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other varieties of equality linkage 343</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>European Commission and disability 344</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. Revisiting the Development of Procurement Linkages in Germany 346</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Controversial nature of procurement linkages under German law 346</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Commission infringement action 348</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New domestic legislation and procurement linkages 350</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV. Deciding Against Procurement Linkages in the Netherlands 353</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Policy at national level 355</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Policy at the provincial and local levels 356</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V. Difficulties for Procurement Linkages in France 357</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. Changing Approaches to Procurement Linkages in the Community and Beyond</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I. Integrating the Social, Environmental, and Economic: Some Relevant International Developments 363</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>International public policy 363</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Davos deal 365</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Corporate social responsibility and the rise of corporate codes of conduct 367</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Compliance gap 368</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. Realigning the Economic, Social, and Environmental Goals of the European Community 371</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Corporate social responsibility 371</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Growth of European environmental regulation 372</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. Growth of Procurement Linkages 373</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reacting to developments in the labour market 374</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public procurement and CSR 375</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public procurement as equivalent to private procurement 376</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Responsible public procurement as 'leading by example' 378</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UN procurement policy and linkage 379</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSR and procurement in Europe 382</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSR and procurement in the United Kingdom 385</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opposition to CSR in European public procurement 388</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environmental protection, sustainable development, and procurement linkages 389</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>International developments 389</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Green procurement in Europe 392</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
IVA. Addressing Legal Uncertainties 394

Judicial adaptation: the ECJ adapts EC law to
social justice linkages 394

The Nord-Pas-de-Calais case 395
The Oy Liikenne case 397
The Concordia Bus case 398
The Wienstrom case 401

Clarification from the European Commission 402

13. Expansion of Equality Linkages in the Member States 405

I. Community Equal Status Law and Procurement Linkages 406

Growth of Community equal status law 406
Procurement linkages and European equal
status law and policy 409
Growing sympathy for procurement
linkages at the Community level 409
Equality mainstreaming and
procurement linkages 410

II. Developments in Equality Linkages in the Member States 411

Stages of Development 411

Italy 413
Spain 414
Austria 415
Belgium 415
Sweden 417
Denmark 418
France 418

III. Equality Mainstreaming and Procurement in
England and Wales 420

Equal opportunities and restrictions on
local authorities 420
Prime Minister’s Strategy Unit Report 422
CRE guidance on procurement 424
Jobcentre Plus 425
Supplier diversity 427
Approach of the Welsh Assembly 428
Reform of equality legislation 428

IV. Procurement and Equality Mainstreaming in Northern Ireland 430

Initial discussions of implications of
mainstreaming for procurement 430
Public procurement review
and mainstreaming 432
Unemployment pilot project 439
Executive approval and implementing
the pilot schemes 440

I. Political Context of Legislative Reforms 445
   Role of unions and NGOs 445
   Changing role of the European Parliament 446

II. Commission Procurement Reform Proposals and Linkage, 1996–99 448
    Commission Green Paper 448
    Reactions to the Green Paper 448
    Commission response 451

     Race Directive 453
     Employment Discrimination Directive 454
     Equal Treatment Directive 455

IV. Emergence of Reformed Procurement Legislation, 2000–03 456
     Commission proposal on procurement legislation 456
     Procurement and linkage in the Parliamentary process 458
     Commission's Interpretative Communication 460
     Emergence of Parliament's approach 461
     Commission's amended proposal 462
     Position of the Council 464
     Emerging compromise and the final deal 465

PART IV: INTERPRETATION

15. Interpreting the Government Procurement Agreement

I. Interpreting the GPA: Some Basic Points 470
   Human rights treaties and the GPA 472
   Basic structure of GATT 473

II. Prima Facie GPA Obligations 474
    Meaning of discrimination 474
    Process-product distinction 476
    Debate under GATT 476
    Process-product distinction and the GPA 481
    Technical specifications 483
    Qualifications of suppliers 484
    Award criteria 486
    Socio-economic considerations as contract conditions 488

III. Exceptions 491
     Some general considerations 491
Contents

Types of exceptions available 493
  Interpretation of ‘public morals’
    prior to *US-Gambling* 494
  ‘Public order’ prior to *US-Gambling* 495
  ‘Public order’ and ‘public morals’ in the
    light of *US-Gambling* 497
Nexus 498
Unjustified or arbitrary discrimination 504

16. EC Public Procurement Law and Equality Linkages:
    Foundations for Interpretation
I. Some Preliminary Points 508
II. Equal Treatment as the Basis of EU Status Equality Law and
    Procurement Law 510
  Conceptions of equality and non-discrimination 512
    Equality as ‘rationality’ 513
    Equality as protective of other ‘prized public goods’ 513
    Equality as preventing ‘status harms’ arising from
      discrimination on particular grounds 514
    Equality as proactive promotion of equality of
      opportunity between particular groups 515
  Equal treatment in Community law 515
  Status equality and procurement law: the same
    principle of equal treatment? 519
  Obligations to promote status equality in
    the procurement directives 520
  Equal treatment as an interpretative principle 521
III. Freedom of Contract and the Subject Matter of the Contract 522
IV. Overall Limits of the Procurement Directives:
    the Limits of the Treaty 531

17. European Public Procurement Law and Equality Linkages:
    Government as Consumer, Government as Regulator
I. Procurement Linkages: Government as Consumer 538
  Provisions regarding technical specifications 538
  Professional and technical knowledge or ability 543
  Variants 545
  Award criteria 546
  Rejection of ‘abnormally low tenders’ 552
II. True ‘Secondary’ Considerations: Government as Regulator 554
  Disability and technical specifications 554
  Set-asides for sheltered workshops 555
  Compliance with domestic employment laws 556
PART V: CONCLUSIONS

18. Reconciling Social and Economic Approaches to Public Procurement

I. Where Have We Got To? 569
   Preliminaries 569
   The World Trade Organization and procurement linkages 571
   Equality linkages and the European Community 572
   Interpretation 573

II. Role of Law 574

III. 'Economic' Versus 'Social' Approaches to Public Procurement 576
   Law and Policy
   Common principles 577
   Adaptability of the procurement linkage instrument 578
   Procurement regulation as beneficial for status equality 579

IV. Debates About Adaptation to Globalization 580
   Waves of globalization analysis 580
   Models of international and regional legal regulation of procurement linkages 582
   European Community and procurement linkages 583
   Role of adjudication 584
   Regulatory competition 585
   World Trade Organization and procurement linkages 586
   Deeper integration via the WTO? 587
   Realistic alternatives: negotiation, opting out, and interpretation 589
   Renegotiation 590
   Opting out 592
   Adjudication 592

V. Equal Status Law and Social Policy 594
   United States empirical studies 595
   Changes in proportion of employees in studies of contract compliance 595
   United States set-aside programmes: are they successful and at what cost? 600
   Assessments of Canadian procurement linkages 601
   Aboriginal business set-asides 601
   Effectiveness of the Canadian contract compliance programmes 603
United Kingdom procurement linkages 605
Contract compliance in the ILEA and the GLC during the 1980s 605
Adoption of race-related contract compliance policies under the British Local Government Act 1988 606
West Midlands common standard 606
Supplier diversity in Britain 608
Mainstreaming: Northern Ireland pilot project 608
Procurement linkages in the Netherlands 609
Critiques of the operation of preferential procurement in South Africa 611

VI. In Conclusion . . . 615
Are procurement linkages worth it? 615
Empirical issues for the future 616
Engagement 616

Bibliography 619
Index 661