

Can Compensation Prevent Impoverishment?

CONTENTS

<i>List of Tables, Figures, and Boxes</i>	xv
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xvii
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xix
<i>Editors' Preface and Overview</i>	xxiii
Michael M. Cernea and Hari Mohan Mathur	
1. REFORMING THE FOUNDATIONS OF INVOLUNTARY RESETTLEMENT: INTRODUCTION	1
<i>Michael M. Cernea</i>	
1 From Anomie to Policy: Between Achievements and Unevenness	2
2 The Paradox of Impoverishment	4
3 Compensation: How Could So Much Rest on So Little?	5
4 Methodological Bottlenecks to Reforming Resettlement	6
5 Resource Scarcity and Sources for Financing	8
PART I	
THEORETICAL ISSUES IN DEFINING COMPENSATION FOR DISPLACEMENT	11
<i>Editors' Note</i>	
2. COMPENSATION AND INVESTMENT IN RESETTLEMENT: THEORY, PRACTICE, PITFALLS, AND NEEDED POLICY REFORM	15
<i>Michael M. Cernea</i>	
1 An Underlying Fallacy of Present Policies	16

2	A Global Problem and a Shift to Economics	18
3	An Anomaly: The 'Project within a Project'	26
4	Defective Economic Evaluation and Budgeting	31
5	The Limits of Cost-Benefit Analysis	38
6	Compensation in Principle and Compensation in Practice	43
7	The Case for Investment: Pursuing Resettlement with Development	58
8	Economic Rent as Resource for Investing in Resettlement	65
9	Regular Project Benefits as Investment Resource	69
10	Political Will: Financing is not Just a Resource Matter	71
11	Types of Mechanisms for Benefit Sharing	75
12	Novel Compensation Modalities	78
13	A False Objection to Targeted Benefit Sharing	79
14	China's Major Reforms in the Economics of Resettlement	82
3.	THE ECONOMIC EVALUATION OF PROJECTS INVOLVING FORCED POPULATION DISPLACEMENTS	99
	<i>David W. Pearce</i> and <i>Timothy Swanson</i>	
1	The Economic Theory of Project Evaluation: The Compensation Principle	100
2	Problems with the Compensation Principle: Actual versus Hypothetical Compensation and Efficiency Considerations	101
3	The Law of Compensated Takings: Developing States	102
4	Towards a New Economics of Project Appraisal for Forced Displacement	105
5	Measuring Displacement Losses	106
6	The Rights Lost in the Forced Displacement of Individuals and Households	111
7	The Role for Benefit Sharing in Compensation	112
8	The Empirical Literature on Displacement Economics	113
9	Conclusion	116

4. FORCED DISPLACEMENT: ALLOCATIVE EXTERNALITY OR UNJUST REDISTRIBUTION? 121

Herman E. Daly

- | | | |
|---|---|-----|
| 1 | Viewing Displacement through the Lens of Opportunity Cost | 121 |
| 2 | Growth and the Understatement of Opportunity Costs | 123 |
| 3 | Eminent Domain and Property Rights | 124 |
| 4 | From Allocative Efficiency to Distributive Justice | 126 |

5. DEVELOPMENT ECONOMICS AND THE COMPENSATION PRINCIPLE 129

Ravi Kanbur

- | | | |
|---|--|-----|
| 1 | Economics has Struggled within Itself... | 129 |
| 2 | Economics and 'Pareto Improvements' | 130 |
| 3 | Steps to the Compensation Principle | 131 |
| 4 | A Love-Hate Relationship | 133 |
| 5 | Dams, Displacement, and Development | 135 |
| 6 | Safety Nets to the Fore | 138 |
| 7 | An Inescapable Dilemma? | 139 |
| 8 | Conclusion | 140 |

PART II

THE POLICY AND LEGAL FRAMEWORK FOR COMPENSATION 145

Editors' Note

6. COMPENSATION, RESTORATION, AND DEVELOPMENT OPPORTUNITIES: NATIONAL STANDARDS ON INVOLUNTARY RESETTLEMENT 147

Susanna Price

- | | | |
|---|--|-----|
| 1 | Why Address National Standards? Some Conceptual Issues | 148 |
|---|--|-----|

2	Land Acquisition Laws versus Involuntary Resettlement Policies	153
3	Rationale for ADB Involvement	157
4	ADB's Regional Initiative	159
5	What are the Next Steps?	173
7.	INDIA'S FORCED DISPLACEMENT POLICY AND PRACTICE: IS COMPENSATION UP TO ITS FUNCTIONS?	180
	<i>Walter Fernandes</i>	
1	The Policy, Displaced Persons, and Project-Affected Persons	181
2	Status of R&R Policies in India	185
3	The People's Alternative	186
4	NPRR 2003 and the Principles	189
5	Replacement Value	195
6	Benefits to the Victims	197
7	Rethinking Cost-Benefit Analysis	199
8	The Changes Suggested	201
8.	EMINENT DOMAIN, PROTEST, AND THE DISCOURSE ON REHABILITATION	208
	<i>Usha Ramanathan</i>	
1	Eminent Domain and Zamindari Abolition	208
2	Project Displacement and Land Acquisition	211
3	Mass Displacement	215
4	Land Acquisition Act 1894 and Reducing Transaction Costs	217
5	Protest, Resistance, and Transaction Costs	219
6	Two Responses to Protest	220
7	Disenchantment with Rehabilitation	223
8	Does Motive Matter?	226
9	State, Sovereign, and Subject	226

PART III

EMPIRICAL EVIDENCE ON THE LIMITS OF
COMPENSATION 231*Editors' Note*9. CAN DISPLACEMENT BE TURNED INTO DEVELOPMENT
BY COMPENSATION ALONE? THE SOUTH ASIAN
EXPERIENCE 233*Ruwani A. Jayewardene*

- | | | |
|---|--|-----|
| 1 | Laws, Policies, and Procedures | 235 |
| 2 | Who is a Resettler? | 241 |
| 3 | Compensation and its Practice | 243 |
| 4 | Replacement Value | 250 |
| 5 | What is the Objective? Distributive Justice and
Adequate Legal Instruments for Re-establishing
Livelihoods | 251 |
| 6 | Conclusion | 255 |

10. MINING COAL, UNDERMINING PEOPLE:
COMPENSATION POLICIES AND
PRACTICES OF COAL INDIA 260*Hari Mohan Mathur*

- | | | |
|---|--|-----|
| 1 | Coal India Limited | 261 |
| 2 | Approaches to Compensation | 263 |
| 3 | Limitations of Job-Centred Compensation | 265 |
| 4 | Coal Sector Environmental and Social
Mitigation Project | 266 |
| 5 | The New CIL Resettlement Policy | 268 |
| 6 | Implementing New Policy Focused on
Self-employment | 269 |
| 7 | Self-Employment as Compensation and its
Failure | 271 |
| 8 | What Went Wrong? | 272 |

9	Complaint to the Inspection Panel	276
10	Conclusion	278
II.	CONSERVATION, DISPLACEMENT, AND COMPENSATION	286
	<i>Frances J. Seymour</i>	
1	Costs Imposed on Displaced Communities	287
2	Assumptions Underlying Decisions to Displace	290
3	Who is Targeted for Displacement? Who is Eligible for Compensation?	292
4	A Range of Approaches to Displacement	295
5	Reasons Advanced for Denying Compensation	297
6	Estimating the Cost of Compensation	299
7	Obstacles to Providing Compensation	301
8	Conservation Impacts of Displacement	305
9	Implications for the International Conservation Community	306
PART IV		
	CONSTRUCTIVE SOLUTIONS: SUPPLEMENTING COMPENSATION WITH INVESTMENT AND BENEFIT SHARING	315
	<i>Editors' Note</i>	
12.	BENEFIT SHARING TO SUPPLEMENT COMPENSATION IN RESOURCE EXTRACTIVE ACTIVITIES: THE CASE OF DAMS	317
	<i>Dominique Égré, Vincent Roquet, and Carine Durocher</i>	
1	Definition and Objectives of Benefit Sharing	318
2	The Rationale for Benefit Sharing in Dam Projects	321
3	Types of Benefit-Sharing Mechanisms	330
4	Criteria to Evaluate Types of Benefit-Sharing Mechanisms	337
5	Preliminary Evaluation of Benefit Sharing	340

6	Practicalities and Processes in Implementing Benefit Sharing	343
7	Assessing the Likelihood of an Agreement	345
8	Conclusion	348
	Appendix Examples of Economic Rent Measurement	350
A.1	The Columbia River Basin Development in Canada	350
A.2	The Lesotho Highlands Water Project	351
13.	FROM EXPROPRIATION TO LAND RENTING: JAPAN'S INNOVATIONS IN COMPENSATING RESETTLERS <i>Mikiyasu Nakayama and Kumi Furuyashiki</i>	357
1	Searching for Innovative Approaches	357
2	Innovative Resettlement Schemes Proposed	361
3	Sharing of Existing Farmland with Present Owners by Increasing Productivity	362
4	Creating Capacity: The Tone River Development Agency	364
5	Previous Case of Compensation through a 'Rent' Scheme	366
6	Rent Scheme Adopted for Jintsu-Gawa Dams	367
7	Merits of the Rent Scheme	369
8	Issues to be Considered for Large Dam Projects	370
9	Conclusion	372
14.	BEYOND COMPENSATION: SHARING OF RENTS ARISING FROM HYDROPOWER PROJECTS <i>Barry P. Trembath</i>	375
1	Resettlement as a Development Opportunity	376
2	Benefit Sharing and its Theoretical Basis	379
3	Magnitude of Economic Rents	381
4	Types and Experiences of Rent Sharing with Affected Communities	383
5	Conclusion	390

15. CAN IMPROVED RESETTLEMENT REDUCE POVERTY?	394
<i>Susan D. Tamondong</i>	
1 Are All Displacements Bad?	396
2 Case Studies of Success	399
3 Using Compensation to Provide Shareholding in Project-Created Assets	401
4 Risks of Impoverishment and Development Potential in Resettlement	403
5 ADB's Poverty Reduction Initiative vis-à-vis Resettlement	406
6 Conclusion	410
<i>Notes on Contributors</i>	418
<i>Index</i>	423