Can Compensation Prevent Impoverishment?
CONTENTS

List of Tables, Figures, and Boxes xv
Acknowledgements xvii
List of Abbreviations xix
Editors' Preface and Overview xxiii
   Michael M. Cernea and Hari Mohan Mathur

1. REFORMING THE FOUNDATIONS OF INVOLUNTARY RESETTLEMENT: INTRODUCTION 1
   Michael M. Cernea
   1 From Anomie to Policy: Between Achievements and Unevenness 2
   2 The Paradox of Impoverishment 4
   3 Compensation: How Could So Much Rest on So Little? 5
   4 Methodological Bottlenecks to Reforming Resettlement 6
   5 Resource Scarcity and Sources for Financing 8

PART I
THEORETICAL ISSUES IN DEFINING COMPENSATION FOR DISPLACEMENT 11
Editors' Note

2. COMPENSATION AND INVESTMENT IN RESETTLEMENT: 15
   THEORY, PRACTICE, PITFALLS, AND NEEDED POLICY REFORM
   Michael M. Cernea
   1 An Underlying Fallacy of Present Policies 16
CONTENTS

2 A Global Problem and a Shift to Economics 18
3 An Anomaly: The 'Project within a Project' 26
4 Defective Economic Evaluation and Budgeting 31
5 The Limits of Cost-Benefit Analysis 38
6 Compensation in Principle and Compensation in Practice 43
7 The Case for Investment: Pursuing Resettlement with Development 58
8 Economic Rent as Resource for Investing in Resettlement 65
9 Regular Project Benefits as Investment Resource 69
10 Political Will: Financing is not Just a Resource Matter 71
11 Types of Mechanisms for Benefit Sharing 75
12 Novel Compensation Modalities 78
13 A False Objection to Targeted Benefit Sharing 79
14 China's Major Reforms in the Economics of Resettlement 82

3. THE ECONOMIC EVALUATION OF PROJECTS INVOLVING FORCED POPULATION DISPLACEMENTS 99

David W. Reade and Timothy Swanson

1 The Economic Theory of Project Evaluation: The Compensation Principle 100
2 Problems with the Compensation Principle: Actual versus Hypothetical Compensation and Efficiency Considerations 101
3 The Law of Compensated Takings: Developing States 102
4 Towards a New Economics of Project Appraisal for Forced Displacement 105
5 Measuring Displacement Losses 106
6 The Rights Lost in the Forced Displacement of Individuals and Households 111
7 The Role for Benefit Sharing in Compensation 112
8 The Empirical Literature on Displacement Economics 113
9 Conclusion 116
4. FORCED DISPLACEMENT: ALLOCATIVE EXTERNALITY OR UNJUST REDISTRIBUTION?  
Herman E. Daly  
1 Viewing Displacement through the Lens of Opportunity Cost 121  
2 Growth and the Understatement of Opportunity Costs 123  
3 Eminent Domain and Property Rights 124  
4 From Allocative Efficiency to Distributive Justice 126  

5. DEVELOPMENT ECONOMICS AND THE COMPENSATION PRINCIPLE  
Ravi Kanbur  
1 Economics has Struggled within Itself… 129  
2 Economics and ‘Pareto Improvements’ 130  
3 Steps to the Compensation Principle 131  
4 A Love–Hate Relationship 133  
5 Dams, Displacement, and Development 135  
6 Safety Nets to the Fore 138  
7 ‘An Inescapable Dilemma? 139  
8 Conclusion 140  

PART II  
THE POLICY AND LEGAL FRAMEWORK FOR COMPENSATION  
Editors’ Note  

6. COMPENSATION, RESTORATION, AND DEVELOPMENT OPPORTUNITIES: NATIONAL STANDARDS ON INVOLUNTARY RESETTLEMENT  
Susanna Price  
1 Why Address National Standards? Some Conceptual Issues 148
## Contents

2 Land Acquisition Laws versus Involuntary Resettlement Policies 153
3 Rationale for ADB Involvement 157
4 ADB's Regional Initiative 159
5 What are the Next Steps? 173

7. **India's Forced Displacement Policy and Practice: Is Compensation Up to Its Functions?**
   Walter Fernandes
   1 The Policy, Displaced Persons, and Project-Affected Persons 181
   2 Status of R&R Policies in India 185
   3 The People's Alternative 186
   4 NPRR 2003 and the Principles 189
   5 Replacement Value 195
   6 Benefits to the Victims 197
   7 Rethinking Cost-Benefit Analysis 199
   8 The Changes Suggested 201

8. **Eminent Domain, Protest, and the Discourse on Rehabilitation**
   Usha Ramanathan
   1 Eminent Domain and Zamindari Abolition 208
   2 Project Displacement and Land Acquisition 211
   3 Mass Displacement 215
   4 Land Acquisition Act 1894 and Reducing Transaction Costs 217
   5 Protest, Resistance, and Transaction Costs 219
   6 Two Responses to Protest 220
   7 Disenchantment with Rehabilitation 223
   8 Does Motive Matter? 226
   9 State, Sovereign, and Subject 226
PART III

EMPIRICAL EVIDENCE ON THE LIMITS OF COMPENSATION 231

Editors' Note

9. CAN DISPLACEMENT BE TURNED INTO DEVELOPMENT BY COMPENSATION ALONE? THE SOUTH ASIAN EXPERIENCE 233

Ruwani A. Jayewardene

1 Laws, Policies, and Procedures 235
2 Who is a Resettler? 241
3 Compensation and its Practice 243
4 Replacement Value 250
5 What is the Objective? Distributive Justice and Adequate Legal Instruments for Re-establishing Livelihoods 251
6 Conclusion 255

10. MINING COAL, UNDERMINING PEOPLE: COMPENSATION POLICIES AND PRACTICES OF COAL INDIA 260

Hari Mohan Mathur

1 Coal India Limited 261
2 Approaches to Compensation 263
3 Limitations of Job-Centred Compensation 265
4 Coal Sector Environmental and Social Mitigation Project 266
5 The New CIL Resettlement Policy 268
6 Implementing New Policy Focused on Self-employment 269
7 Self-Employment as Compensation and its Failure 271
8 What Went Wrong? 272
## 9. Complaint to the Inspection Panel
276

## 10. Conclusion
278

### 11. CONSERVATION, DISPLACEMENT, AND COMPENSATION
286

*Frances J. Seymour*

1. Costs Imposed on Displaced Communities 287
2. Assumptions Underlying Decisions to Displace 290
3. Who is Targeted for Displacement? Who is Eligible for Compensation? 292
4. A Range of Approaches to Displacement 295
5. Reasons Advanced for Denying Compensation 297
6. Estimating the Cost of Compensation 299
7. Obstacles to Providing Compensation 301
8. Conservation Impacts of Displacement 305
9. Implications for the International Conservation Community 306

### PART IV

### CONSTRUCTIVE SOLUTIONS: SUPPLEMENTING COMPENSATION WITH INVESTMENT AND BENEFIT SHARING

*Editors' Note*

### 12. BENEFIT SHARING TO SUPPLEMENT COMPENSATION IN RESOURCE EXTRACTIVE ACTIVITIES: THE CASE OF DAMS

*Dominique Égré, Vincent Roquet, and Carine Durocher*

1. Definition and Objectives of Benefit Sharing 318
2. The Rationale for Benefit Sharing in Dam Projects 321
3. Types of Benefit-Sharing Mechanisms 330
4. Criteria to Evaluate Types of Benefit-Sharing Mechanisms 337
5. Preliminary Evaluation of Benefit Sharing 340
6 Practicalities and Processes in Implementing Benefit Sharing 343
7 Assessing the Likelihood of an Agreement 345
8 Conclusion 348
Appendix Examples of Economic Rent Measurement 350
A.1 The Columbia River Basin Development in Canada 350
A.2 The Lesotho Highlands Water Project 351

13. FROM EXPROPRIATION TO LAND RENTING:
JAPAN'S INNOVATIONS IN COMPENSATING RESETTLERS
Mikiyasu Nakayama and Kumi Furuyashiki
1 Searching for Innovative Approaches 357
2 Innovative Resettlement Schemes Proposed 361
3 Sharing of Existing Farmland with Present Owners by Increasing Productivity 362
4 Creating Capacity: The Tone River Development Agency 364
5 Previous Case of Compensation through a 'Rent' Scheme 366
6 Rent Scheme Adopted for Jintsu-Gawa Dams 367
7 Merits of the Rent Scheme 369
8 Issues to be Considered for Large Dam Projects 370
9 Conclusion 372

14. BEYOND COMPENSATION: SHARING OF RENTS ARISING FROM HYDROPOWER PROJECTS
Barry P. Trembath
1 Resettlement as a Development Opportunity 376
2 Benefit Sharing and its Theoretical Basis 379
3 Magnitude of Economic Rents 381
4 Types and Experiences of Rent Sharing with Affected Communities 383
5 Conclusion 390
15. CAN IMPROVED RESETTLEMENT REDUCE POVERTY? 394

Susan D. Tamondong

1. Are All Displacements Bad? 396
2. Case Studies of Success 399
3. Using Compensation to Provide Shareholding in Project-Created Assets 401
4. Risks of Impoverishment and Development Potential in Resettlement 403
5. ADB's Poverty Reduction Initiative vis-à-vis Resettlement 406
6. Conclusion 410

Notes on Contributors 418

Index 423