

**‘Policing the World’
Accountability Mechanisms for Multilateral Financial
Institutions and Private Financial Institutions**

Proefschrift ter verkrijging van de graad van doctor aan de Universiteit van Tilburg, op gezag van de rector magnificus, prof. dr. F.A. van der Duyn Schouten, in het openbaar te verdedigen ten overstaan van een door het college voor promoties aangewezen commissie in de aula van de Universiteit op woensdag 13 september 2006 om 14.15 uur door Maria Jeanette Anna van Putten, geboren op 5 juli 1951 te Bussum.

Table of Contents

Acknowledgements	vii
Part I Introductory Matters.....	1
Chapter 1 Globalization and the Rise of Accountability Mechanisms	3
<i>Introduction.....</i>	3
<i>Globalization a Challenge or a Risk.....</i>	4
<i>Globalization of the Economy.....</i>	6
<i>The Nation State and Diminishing Control</i>	8
<i>Accountability as a Concept</i>	12
<i>Accountability Global Governance and Multilateral Financial Institutions.....</i>	17
<i>Some Remarks.....</i>	20
<i>Accountability Private Financial Sector Initiatives.....</i>	20
Chapter 2 An Empiric Study: A Justification of Working Method and Reflective Practice.....	27
<i>Limits and Advantages.....</i>	27
<i>Final Thesis.....</i>	28
<i>Empirical and Narrative Methods</i>	30
<i>Interview Technique.....</i>	31
<i>Questionnaire.....</i>	32
<i>Focus Groups.....</i>	33
<i>Mailing the Questionnaire</i>	35
Part II State of Affairs and Matters of Accountability	37
<i>Introduction.....</i>	38

Chapter 3 The World Bank and the History of Accountability39

Articles of Agreement..... 40
World Bank Immunity..... 41
Political Activity Prohibited 42
Human Rights and the World Bank 44
World Bank and Accountability..... 47
Position of the Executive Directors 48
Presidents of the Bank and Relation with the Executive Directors 49
Increase of the World Bank Group..... 51
World Bank Presidents 1963-1986..... 53
Increase of World Bank Staff..... 54
Changing Role of Executive Directors 55
IDA: a Historic Change..... 56
IDA Articles of Agreement..... 57
European Union and the World Bank Group 58
Voting Powers..... 59
World Bank Mission Statement..... 61
Criticism Inside and Outside Leading to Establishment of Inspection Panel 62
Concluding Remarks..... 64

Chapter 4 The Inception of the World Bank Inspection Panel, its Mandate and its Structure 73

The Narmada Dam..... 73
The European Parliament and Narmada..... 74
Narmada Introduced in the World Bank..... 76
The World Bank Leaving Narmada 78
The American Congress and the Inspection Panel..... 79
Discontent of Executive Directors 85
Inspection Function Mentioned 86
President Wolfensohn and General Counsel Shihata..... 90
1996: First Clarification of the Resolution..... 91

<i>Clarifications</i>	94
<i>1999: Second Clarification of the Resolution</i>	96
<i>Panel's Reaction on Recommendations Made</i>	99

Chapter 5 Accountability Mechanisms in other Multilateral Financial Institutions..... 111

<i>Introduction</i>	111
<i>Ombudsman of IFC and MIGA (World Bank)</i>	112
<i>Some Concluding Remarks</i>	115
<i>IMF: Independent Evaluation Office</i>	116
<i>Islamic Development Bank</i>	118
<i>Asian Development Bank (ADB)</i>	119
<i>First Case</i>	120
<i>Consultation</i>	122
<i>A Compliance Review Panel</i>	124
<i>Similarities and Differences with the World Bank Inspection Panel</i>	128
<i>Some First Conclusions</i>	129
<i>Inter-American Development Bank</i>	130
<i>Some General Comments</i>	130
<i>Risk of Conflict of Interest</i>	131
<i>Progressive Steps</i>	132
<i>Questions and Remarks on Structure and Mandate Issues</i>	132
<i>Part II of the Proposed Policy</i>	133
<i>European Bank for Reconstruction and Development</i>	135
<i>Some Remarks</i>	140
<i>European Investment Bank and Accountability</i>	140
<i>Some remarks</i>	143
<i>African Development Bank</i>	143
<i>Japan Bank for International Cooperation</i>	145
Chapter 6 Accountability for the Private Financial Sector... 153	
<i>Introduction</i>	153
<i>Basel II: Setting Regulations and Guidance</i>	154

<i>Implementation of Basel II</i>	156
<i>Guidelines for Compliance and a Compliance function in the Private Financial Sector</i>	157
<i>Similarities and Differences with the World Bank Inspection Panel</i>	158
<i>History of the International Finance Corporation (IFC)</i>	160
<i>IFC Also Under Pressure</i>	162
<i>IFC and Its Relation with Private Banks</i>	164
<i>From Greenwich to Equator</i>	165
<i>The Equator Principles</i>	170
<i>An Industry Approach: Determining, Assessing and Managing Environmental & Social Risk</i>	172
<i>ISO 14001-UNEP FI and Global Reporting Initiative</i>	173
<i>Civil Society Demanding Accountability: The Collevocchio Declaration</i>	173
<i>No U-turn Allowed for Private Banks</i>	175
<i>Why Private Banks Adopted the Equator Principles</i>	177
<i>Reasons for Non-Equator Banks to Disengage</i>	179
<i>The Principles: Soft Law or Hard Law?</i>	181
<i>The First Equator Principles Compliance Complaint</i>	185
<i>Equator Principles II</i>	187
<i>Some Last Remarks</i>	189

Part III A Universal Structure of Accountability

Mechanisms for the Financial Sector	199
<i>Introduction</i>	200
<i>Main Hypothesis</i>	200

Chapter 7 Experiences and Dilemmas in the Daily Work of an Accountability Mechanism.....

<i>Introduction</i>	201
<i>The Inspection Panel, Human Rights, and Changing International Law</i>	201
<i>World Bank, IMF and Human Rights</i>	205

<i>Can the Articles of Agreement be Changed?</i>	206
<i>The Chad-Cameroon case and Liability</i>	207
<i>Request from Chad Lodged with the Inspection Panel</i>	209
<i>Panel Reporting</i>	212
<i>Independence of the Panel</i>	214
<i>Weakening of the Policies</i>	214
<i>Use of 'Country Systems'</i>	216
<i>Access to the Panel</i>	216
<i>Relations between the Inspection Panel and Management</i>	218
<i>Relations between the President and the Panel</i>	219

Chapter 8 Results of an International Survey 227

<i>Introduction</i>	227
<i>Item 1: Accountability Mechanisms: a Response to the Fast Growth of Cross-border Financial Transactions</i>	227
<i>Item 2: An Accountability Mechanism and a Problem Solving Function</i>	237
<i>Item 3: Mandate of an Accountability Mechanism</i>	240
<i>Item 4: Human Rights Included in the Policies and Mandate</i>	245
<i>Item 5: Position of Members of Accountability Mechanisms</i>	248
<i>Item 6: Policies, Procedures and Principles</i>	252
<i>Item 7: Use of Country Systems</i>	258
<i>Item 8: Procedures to be Followed by Requesters Filing a Claim</i>	261
<i>Item 9: Relations between the Accountability Mechanism and the Executive Directors</i>	267
<i>Item 10: Relations between the Accountability Mechanism and Management</i>	273
<i>Item 11: Staff of the Accountability Mechanisms</i>	280
<i>Item 12: Future Developments, State of Affairs and Future Options</i>	282

Chapter 9 A Swan Song and a Major New Development: Final Conclusions and Recommendations for Future Mechanisms.....289