Rationality in Economics

Constructivist and Ecological Forms

VERNON L. SMITH
George Mason University
## Contents

**Preface**

*page xiii*

**Acknowledgments**

xix

**Introduction**

1

### PART I  RATIONALITY, MARKETS, AND INSTITUTIONS

1  Rediscovering the Scottish Philosophers

   Exchange in Social and Economic Order

   Lessons from Scotland

2  On Two Forms of Rationality

   Introduction

   Constructivist Rationality

   Limitations and Distractions of Constructivist Rationality

   Ecological Rationality

   Implications

### PART II  IMPERSONAL EXCHANGE: THE EXTENDED ORDER OF THE MARKET

3  Relating the Two Concepts of a Rational Order

   Introduction

   Airline Route Deregulation

   The California Energy Crisis

   Economic Systems Design

   Constructivism as Rational Reconstruction of Emergent Order

4  Market Institutions and Performance

   Knowledge, Institutions, and Markets

   The Iowa Electronic Market
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Contents</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Strategy Proof-ness: Theory and Behavior</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Did Gresham Have a Law?</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Market Power and the Efficacy of Markets</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Equilibrium with a Dominant Firm?</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Ethyl Case and Antitrust Policy</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gasoline Market Behavior and Competition Policy</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Predatory Pricing</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Entry Cost and Competition: Contestable Markets Theory</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Asymmetric Information and Equilibrium without Process</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rationality in Asymmetric Information Markets</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Neoclassical Synthesis</td>
<td>101</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hayek and the Hurwicz Program</td>
<td>104</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Experimental Markets with Asymmetric Information</td>
<td>108</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Markets for Quality</td>
<td>109</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Labor Markets and Efficiency Wages</td>
<td>111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 FCC Spectrum Auctions and Combinatorial Designs:</td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theory and Experiment</td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Auctions: Modeling Institutions</td>
<td>117</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economics of English Auctions</td>
<td>118</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Independent Private Values</td>
<td>121</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Common Values</td>
<td>121</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Review of Relevant Experimental Results</td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Single Object Auctions</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Common Value Auctions</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A “Winner’s Curse” in Private Value English Auctions for Gambles?</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jump Bidding and the Class of Badly Performing</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Multiple-Unit English Auctions</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The English Clock Corrects Bad Performance</td>
<td>130</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Combinatorial Auctions</td>
<td>131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tests of SMR and a Proposed Alternative</td>
<td>133</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The FCC Auction Design Process</td>
<td>137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Auction Design for Complex Environments</td>
<td>140</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Combo Clock: Simple Solutions for Complex Auctions</td>
<td>141</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Implications for the Design of Spectrum Auctions</td>
<td>144</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 Psychology and Markets</td>
<td>149</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Psychology’s Challenge to Constructivist Rationality</td>
<td>149</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Psychology, Economics, and the Two Forms of Rationality</td>
<td>156</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Contents

What Is Fairness? 161
Examples of Fairness 163
Fairness: An Experimental Market Test 166

8 What Is Rationality? 168
Economic Survival versus Maximizing Utility 169
Maximizing the Probability of Survival 169
Maximizing Expected “Profit,” or Discounted Withdrawals 172
Is It Rational to Be “Rational”? 173
Literature Background 176
Modeling Net Subjective Value 177
Examples from Experiments 179
Monetary Incentives: Further Discussion 180
Rationality in Collectives and the Sense of Number 182
Market Rationality: Capital versus Commodity and Service Flow Markets 186

PART III PERSONAL EXCHANGE: THE EXTERNAL ORDER OF SOCIAL EXCHANGE 189

9 Emergent Order without the Law 192
Rules and Order 192
Ellickson Out-Coases Coase 196

10 The Effects of Context on Behavior 199
Introduction and Elementary Theoretical Background 199
Perspectives on Interpreting Results 200
How Does Context Matter? 202
Anonymity as a Treatment Procedure 204
Perception, Context, and the Internal Order of the Mind 206
The Significance of Experimental Procedures 209
Overview of Experimental Procedures 211
The Ultimatum Game Example 212
Dictator Games 220
Appendix. Behavioral Deviation from Prediction: Error, Confusion, or Evidence of Brain Function? 227

11 Investment Trust Games: Effects of Gains from Exchange in Dictator Giving 234
A Celebrated Two-Stage Dictator Game 234
Reciprocity or Other-Regarding Preferences? 237

12 Reciprocity in Trust Games 245
Introduction 245
Trust Games without a Punishment Option  
Why So Much Cooperation?  
Is It the Subjects? Undergraduates versus Graduates  
Machiavelli, Trust, and Cooperation: Mandeville’s Knaves?  
Is It Utility for Other Payoff?  
Reciprocity versus Preferences: Does Own Opportunity Cost Influence Other Choice?  
Extensive versus Normal (Strategic) Form Games  
Trust Games with Punishment Options  
Self-Regarding Cooperation in Repeat Play? Protocols with and without Direct Punishment  
Effect of Matching Protocol on Frequency of Cooperation in Trust Games with and without Punishment  
Comparison of Behavior in the Repeated Play of Extensive and Normal Form Games  
A Matching Protocol Based on Sorting for Cooperative Behavior

PART IV ORDER AND RATIONALITY IN METHOD AND MIND

13 Rationality in Science  
Introduction  
Rational Constructivism in Method  
Can We Derive Theory Directly from Observation?  
Economics: Is It an Experimental Science?  
What Is the Scientists’ qua Experimentalists’ Image of What They Do?  
Auxiliaries and the Ambiguity of Rejecting the “Test” Hypothesis  
A D-Q Example from Physics  
A Proposition and Some Economics Examples  
The Methodology of Positive Economics  
In View of Proposition 2, What Are Experimentalists and Theorists to Do?  
Experimental Knowledge Drives Experimental Method  
The Machine Builders  
Technology and Science  
Technology and Experimental Economics  
In Conclusion

14 Neuroeconomics: The Internal Order of the Mind  
Introduction  
Individual Decision Making
Contents

Rewards and the Brain 316
Strategic Interaction: Moves, Intentions, and Mind Reading 316
What Are the Neuroeconomic Questions? 317

15 A Summary 322

References 329
Index 353