The Venice Charter Revisited: Modernism, Conservation and Tradition in the 21st Century

Edited by

Matthew Hardy

Cambridge Scholars Publishing
TABLE OF CONTENTS

Foreword .............................................................................................................. xiii
His Royal Highness The Prince of Wales

Editor's Preface ............................................................................................... xv
Matthew Hardy, Secretary of INTBAU

List of Subscribers ............................................................................................ xix

Acknowledgements ........................................................................................... xxi

Section 1 - Why Revisit the Venice Charter

1. Robert Adam, UK .......................................................................................... 3
Heritage

2. A. G. K. Menon, India .................................................................................. 16
The Afterlife of the Venice Charter in Postcolonial India

3. Samir Younés, USA ....................................................................................... 24
The Dominance of Modernist Ideology in the Charters of Athens and Venice

4. Terje Nypan & Sjur Helseth, Norway .......................................................... 37
The Venice Charter of 1964: 40 years of Cultural Heritage policy development, consequences for a professional guideline which needs “to be interpreted over and over again”

Section 2 - Texts and Meanings

5. Luigi Guerriero, Italy .................................................................................... 59
Piero Gazzola and Roberto Pane's contribution to the draft of the Venice Charter
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>6. Boguslaw Szmygin, Poland</th>
<th>Venice Charter – The universal document or burden of the past? A conservator's point of view</th>
<th>71</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>7. W. Brown Morton III, USA</td>
<td>The Influence of the Venice Charter in the United States</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Pance Velkov, Macedonia</td>
<td>Thinking about the Burra Charter</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Section 3 - Reflecting on the Idea of "Charter"

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>10. Naomi Miller, USA</td>
<td>Preservation's Modernist Pioneer: James Marston Fitch</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. Chao-Ching Fu, Taiwan</td>
<td>Validity, Authority and Limitation: Discourses on the application of the Venice Charter in the restoration of monuments and historic buildings in Taiwan</td>
<td>117</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. Alan Blum, Canada</td>
<td>Preserving the Notion of Preservation: The ineradicable perpetuity of me, myself and I</td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Section 4 - Using the Venice Charter

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>13. Ethan Anthony, USA</th>
<th>On Number Nine</th>
<th>139</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>15. Irena Bakule, Latvia</td>
<td>Amendments to the Venice Charter: are they necessary? The experience of Riga</td>
<td>162</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
16. Amund Sinding-Larsen, Norway ................................................................. 172
*Lhasa in the light of 'Venice'*

Section 5 - Authoritarianism's Influence

17. Flavia Marcello, Italy ....................................................................................... 187
*The Norme of 1932 and the Fascist Concept of Monument. Publio Morbiducci's The History of Rome Through Its Built Works*

18. Olivia Muñoz-Rojas-Oscarsson, Spain .......................................................... 198
*Heritage protection and reconstruction during and after the Spanish Civil War: Lessons from the First World War, lessons for the Second World War*

19. Jean-François Lejeune, USA ........................................................................... 207
*The Intellectual Pleasure of Ambiguity: The Reconstruction of Spain in the years of autarky (1939-1956)*

20. Clara Moura Soares & Maria João Neto, Portugal .......................................... 219
*The Conclusion Plans of the Baroque Church of Santa Engrácia (National Pantheon of Portugal) in 1964, and the Venice Charter's principles*

Section 6 - Conservation Challenges

21. Mohammad Al-Shabander, Iraq ....................................................................... 235
*The Iraqi Marshlands Development Plan*

22. Savita Raje, India ............................................................................................. 248
*The Essence of the Built Heritage Through the Concept of “Total Experience”*

23. Mohammadsaeid Izadi & Mahshid Sehizadeh, Iran ....................................... 259
*Modernism and Conservation in Iran: Major transformation periods of Iranian historic cities and the current approach toward city centre regeneration in Iran*

24. John Bliss, USA ............................................................................................... 278
*Looking at Bath, Maine in Respect of the Venice Charter*
Section 7 - Restoration Revisited

25. Attilio Petruccioli, Italy ................................................................. 291
Restoration and Design: Two Faces of the Same Medal

26. Giulia Annalinda Neglia, Italy ....................................................... 302
The Old City of Tartous (Syria): Proposals for urban restoration

27. Alessandra Scarano, Italy ............................................................. 313
Structures of interpretation of the identity of places, for the conservation and transformation of built space

28. Hacer Basarir, Cyprus ................................................................. 321
Reflections of change at the crossroads of different cultures: A 700 year old building, St. Nicholas Cathedral (Lala Mustafa Pasha Mosque), Northern Cyprus

Section 8 - Anastylosis Today

29. Francesco Defilippis, Italy ............................................................. 333
The Restoration of Cut Stone Architecture in the Theory and Practice of the Compagnonnage du Devoir: Case study of the reconstruction of the tympanum of the Church of St Gervais and St Protais in Paris

30. Michele Montemurro, Italy ............................................................. 342
Restoration Theory and Practice of the Compagnons du Devoir. The fabric integrations in the Tour St Jacques in Paris

31. Daniela Catalano, Italy ................................................................. 356
The Replica in the Recovery of Stone Architectures: Technique, art and tradition in relation to contemporary production processes

32. Christian Nitti & Gianluca Caramia, Italy .................................... 364
A Project of Anastylosis: The temple of Rome and Augustus at Leptis Magna

Section 9 - Lessons from India

33. Vikas Dilawari, India ................................................................. 375
Process vs Product: Scientific Conservation vs Traditional Conservation
34. Navin Piplani, India................................................................................................. 382
Interpreting the Venice Charter: Case study of the Taj Mahal and its environs, India

35. Michele Moschini, Italy............................................................................................. 393
The Restoration of Hindu Temples and the Venice Charter

36. Jhilmil Kishore, UK................................................................................................. 401
Creating a Charter for the Indian Sub-Continent

Section 10 - Lessons from Italy

37. Ettore Mazzola, Italy................................................................................................. 411
Monuments and Environment are not Separable

38. Giovanni Fatta, Italy................................................................................................. 422
Traditional Architecture in the Re-qualification of Palermo Historical Centre

39. Donatella Diolaiti, Italy............................................................................................. 437
A New Traditional Urban Neighbourhood Within the Historical Centre: The Case of the Contini addition in Ferrara

40. Giuseppe Amoruso, Italy........................................................................................... 447
A Code for the Lost City

Section 11 - Reconstruct and Re-Use

41. Arne Sødal, Norway................................................................................................. 455
A Tale of Reconstruction in Two Cities: Oslo and Berlin

42. Rand Carter, USA..................................................................................................... 463
The Project to Rebuild Karl Friedrich Schinkels’ Bauakademie, Berlin

43. Krupali Uplekar, India............................................................................................... 471
Historic Preservation and its Relevance Today: An examination of Dresden’s Frauenkirche in the light of the Venice Charter

44. Tamara Rogić, Netherlands....................................................................................... 488
Reuse of Historic Buildings: Minimal Intervention formally defined
Table of Contents

Section 12 - The Pleasures of Imitation, Revival, Pastiche and Nostalgia

45. Gabriele Tagliaventi, Italy ................................................................. 503
   The Eternal Youth of Imitation in Architecture: From Viollet-Le-Duc to
   Maurice Culot

46. Maria Rita Campa, Italy ................................................................. 512
   E.E. Viollet-le-Duc, between theory and practice of conservation:
   The case of Carcassonne town

47. Michael Mehaffy, USA ................................................................. 525
   Pastiche Versus Revival: Toward a modern understanding of collective
   intelligence in architecture

48. Susan Parham, UK ................................................................. 533
   The Relationship Between Approaches to Conservation and the Idea
   of Nostalgia: Looking at food-centred spaces within cities

Section 13 - New Traditional Architecture in Conservation Areas

49. Anton Glikin, Russia/USA ................................................................. 547
   The Venice Charter and the Current Development of St Petersburg

50. Nicholas Patricios, Greece ................................................................. 561
   The Re-Emergence of Traditional Architecture in Greece: Kefalonia
   and Ithaki

51. John Smylie, Northern Ireland ................................................................. 570
   New Interventions in Conservation Areas: Preserving character
   through visio-structural reinforcement

52. Anne Fairfax, USA ................................................................. 581
   A Vision for Marion Square, Charleston, South Carolina: A case study
   for future development within an established historic district
Section 14 - Sustainable Management of Cultural Heritage

53. Jessica Douglas-Home, UK ............................................................... 599
The Work of the Mihai Eminescu Trust in the Saxon Villages of Transylvania, Romania

54. Chris Landorf, Australia ............................................................... 606
The impact of the Venice Charter on cultural heritage sustainability

55. Steven Bee, UK ................................................................. 624
Conservation Principles for Constructive Conservation

56. Dinh Quoc Phuong & Derham Groves, Vietnam & Australia ........ 633
Towards Maintaining Hanoi's Sense of Place

Section 15 - New Ideas About Authenticity

57. Iuliana Ciotoiu, Romania ........................................................... 645
Monuments of Rural Vernacular Architecture in the 21st Century in the Context of the Venice Charter

58. Olakunle Makinde, Nigeria .......................................................... 651
M.O.T.N.A: The National Commission for Museums and Monuments' project on the legacy of traditional architecture in Nigeria

59. Jurate Markeviciene, Lithuania ..................................................... 669
From Physical to Virtual Authenticity, and Whither: Are the answers of the Venice Charter still relevant?

60. Stephen Frith, Australia ............................................................... 682
Ise and Ngunnhu: Intangible memoria and the authentic copy

Section 16 - Changing the Way We Think About Conservation

61. Steven Semes, USA .......................................................... 697
Updating the Venice Charter Forty Years On

62. Paolo Marconi, Italy .......................................................... 706
2006: An Updated Venice Charter
### Table of Contents

63. Richard Sammons, USA ........................................................................................................... 714  
*The Value of Restoration, Reconstruction, and Creative Additions to Historic Fabric*

64. Jaap Dawson, Netherlands ..................................................................................................... 719  
*Making Friends with the World We Build*

#### Appendices

**Appendix I** ................................................................................................................................. 729  
The ICOMOS Venice Charter, 1964

**Appendix II** ............................................................................................................................... 734  
The INTBAU Venice Declaration, 2007

**Contributors** .............................................................................................................................. 741

**Index** .......................................................................................................................................... 755