

SUB Hamburg



A/601569

# HISTORICAL MEMORY AND CRIMINAL JUSTICE IN SPAIN

A Case of Late Transitional Justice

Josep M. TAMARIT SUMALLA

*Collaborators:*

Ana BELTRÁN MONTOLIU

Joan SAGUÉS SAN JOSÉ



intersentia

Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland

# CONTENTS

<b>Chapter 1.</b>	
<b>Introduction</b> .....	1
<b>Chapter 2.</b>	
<b>Transitional Justice and the Spanish Case</b> .....	7
1. Theoretical background: models of transitional justice .....	7
2. Transitional justice and historical memory.....	10
3. Victims' rights .....	14
3.1. The triad of truth, justice and reparation.....	14
3.1.1. Truth.....	14
3.1.2. Justice.....	15
3.1.3. Reparation.....	15
3.2. The development of international law: the basic principles .....	16
3.3. New victims' rights within a transitional context: identity and personal memory.....	18
4. Evaluating the Spanish case.....	19
4.1. Time.....	19
4.2. The symmetry and asymmetry of victimisation.....	20
4.3. The weakness of democratic forces.....	21
4.4. A smooth and non-violent transition.....	21
<b>Chapter 3.</b>	
<b>The Burden of Spain's 20<sup>th</sup> Century History</b> .....	23
1. Introduction .....	23
2. The battle for memory.....	24
3. The democratic experience of the Republic.....	27
4. The denial of democracy leads to war.....	31
5. Dictatorship, repression and memory according to the victors.....	34
6. The difficult relationship between Spanish democracy and its uncomfortable history.....	44

<b>Chapter 4.</b>	
<b>The Repression and Its Legal Structure</b> .....	49
1. Basis of the repression .....	49
2. Depuration .....	50
3. Criminal law under Francoism .....	50
4. Large legislation on criminal matters .....	52
5. The Penal Code of 1944 .....	56
5.1. Moral and religious inspiration .....	57
5.2. A socially insensitive criminal justice system .....	57
5.3. A “criminal law of author” .....	58
5.4. Sexism .....	58
6. Victor’s justice and retaliation: the <i>Causa General</i> .....	59
<b>Chapter 5.</b>	
<b>A Transition without Justice?</b> .....	61
1. The “Spanish model”: rhetoric about reconciliation and a decision not to look back to the past .....	61
2. Amnesty .....	63
3. The Constitution of 1978: rule of law, institutionalisation of the democratic state and legal reform .....	67
4. Repairing the past: gradual and partial measures of reparation .....	68
5. The victim’s policy .....	72
<b>Chapter 6.</b>	
<b>Questioning the Transition: Late Transitional Justice?</b> .....	75
1. A new social and political context .....	75
2. Social activism .....	76
3. The political response .....	79
4. Evaluating the transition .....	81
<b>Chapter 7.</b>	
<b>The Historical Memory Act and Its Implementation</b> .....	83
1. General remarks .....	83
2. Rehabilitation of condemned persons .....	86
3. Reparation .....	98
4. The exhumation and identification of the victims .....	99
5. Social reaction and implementation .....	100
6. The Catalan Mass Graves Act 2009 .....	103
7. New provisions concerning the declaration of death .....	105

**Chapter 8.**

<b>Prosecuting the Crimes of Francoism</b> .....	107
1. Precedents .....	107
1.1. An exceptional case for prosecution .....	107
1.2. Prosecution of crimes committed in other countries .....	109
1.2.1. Universal jurisdiction .....	109
1.2.2. Chile .....	110
1.2.3. Argentina .....	111
1.2.4. Guatemala .....	113
1.2.5. Sahara .....	114
1.2.6. From absolute universal jurisdiction to its legal restriction .....	114
1.2.7. Cases with Spanish victims of on-going prosecution. ....	116
1.2.8. An internal echo: the Paracuellos case .....	117
2. A judicial decision to prosecute the crimes of Francoism and its consequences .....	118
2.1. The Garzón case .....	118
2.2. An overview from the procedural perspective .....	125

**Chapter 9.**

<b>Is Criminal Prosecution Viable? The Theoretical Debate</b> .....	133
1. The legal description of crimes and the problem of retroactivity .....	133
1.1. Crimes against humanity under Spanish criminal law .....	133
1.2. An appeal to natural law .....	134
1.3. An appeal to international criminal law .....	136
1.4. Convictions for other crimes .....	140
1.4.1. An innovative solution? .....	140
1.4.2. Murder .....	142
1.4.3. Forced disappearances .....	142
2. Prescription .....	145
3. The Amnesty Act .....	149
3.1. Amnesty under Spanish law .....	149
3.2. Types of amnesty .....	151
3.2.1. Self-amnesty .....	152
3.2.2. Individualised and conditional amnesties .....	153
3.2.3. General amnesty aimed at peacekeeping .....	154
3.3. The legitimacy of amnesty laws .....	155
3.4. The effects of the Spanish Amnesty Act .....	160
4. The lost children of Francoism .....	163
5. Abduction of minors and unlawful adoptions .....	167

**Chapter 10.**

**Seeking Justice more than Thirty Years after the Transition** ..... 171

1. What kind of justice and for which victims?..... 171
2. Recognising the limits of criminal justice..... 176
3. Why not a truth commission?..... 178

*Bibliography* ..... 185

*Internet resources* ..... 193

*Appendix. Spanish Historical Memory Act* ..... 195