Contemporary Policy Analysis

MICHAEL MINTROM
University of Auckland

New York Oxford
OXFORD UNIVERSITY PRESS
BRIEF CONTENTS

PREFACE  xxí

1 Introduction  1

OVERVIEW OF POLICY ANALYSIS  13
2 What Policy Analysts Do  15
3 What Governments Do  27
4 Objectives of Government Policy Actions  43
5 Managing Policy Projects  63
6 Presenting Policy Advice  80
7 Doing Ethical Policy Analysis  95

ANALYTICAL STRATEGIES  109
8 Introduction to the Analytical Strategies  111
9 Analysis of Markets  119
10 Analysis of Market Failure  149
11 Analysis of Government Failure  189
12 Comparative Institutional Analysis  209
13 Cost-Benefit Analysis  225
14 Gender Analysis  246
15 Race Analysis  267
16 Implementation Analysis  285

IMPROVING YOUR PRACTICE  305
17 Developing as a Policy Analyst and Advisor  307

BIBLIOGRAPHY  315
INDEX  331
CONTENTS

1 Introduction 1
   The Nature of Policy Analysis 2
   The Rise of Policy Analysis 5
   The Purpose and Organization of This Book 8
   Conclusion 9
   Exercises 10
   Further Reading 11

OVERVIEW OF POLICY ANALYSIS 13

2 What Policy Analysts Do 15
   The Social Function of Policy Analysis 16
   Where Policy Analysts Are Employed 18
   How Policy Analysts Contribute to Public
      Decision Making 20
   Common Competencies and Attributes of
      Successful Policy Analysts 22
   Why Being a Policy Analyst Is an Appealing
      Career Choice 23
   Conclusion 24
   Exercises 25
   Invite a Guest to Class 25
   Further Reading 25

3 What Governments Do 27
   The Role of Government in Society 28
   Achieving Cooperation 29
   A Review of Government Policy Actions 30
      Market Making 30
      Taxes 32
      Subsidies 32
Contents  xi

Constructing Progress Reports  73
Managing Your Time  74
  Make "To Do" Lists  74
  Prioritize Among Activities  75
  Batch Routine Tasks  75
  Think About Opportunity Costs  75
  Think in Marginalist Terms  75
  Take Care of Relations with Others  75
  Manage Your Downtime  75

Working with Policy Literature  76
Conclusion  78
Exercises  79
The Class Project  78
Further Reading  79

6  Presenting Policy Advice  80
Clarifying Audience Needs  81
Structuring a Policy Report  82
  Abstract or Executive Summary  83
  Table of Contents  83
  Introduction  83
  Background  83
  Analytical Strategy  84
  Analysis and Findings  84
  Discussion  84
  Policy Recommendations  85
  Conclusion  86
  Other Items  87

Effective Presentation of Evidence  87
Reflecting on the Contribution  89
The Sign-Off  90
Developing Presentations and Oral Briefings  91
The Importance of Creativity  92
Conclusion  93
Exercises  94
Invite a Guest to Class  94
Further Reading  94

7  Doing Ethical Policy Analysis  95
Policy Analysis and Ethical Practice  96
Ethical Principles for Policy Analysts  100
  Integrity  101
  Competence  101
Responsibility 102
Respect 102
Concern 103
Doing Ethical Policy Analysis 104
  Ethical Problem Definition 104
  Ethical Construction of Alternatives 105
  Ethical Selection of Criteria 105
  Ethical Prediction of Outcomes 106
  Ethical Analysis of Trade-Offs 106
  Ethical Reporting Practices 107
Conclusion 107
Exercises 108
Invite a Guest to Class 108
Further Reading 108

ANALYTICAL STRATEGIES 109

8 Introduction to the Analytical Strategies 111
Policy Analysts in the Policy-Making Process 112
The Analytical Strategy Chapters 113
  Chapter 9: Analysis of Markets 113
  Chapter 10: Analysis of Market Failure 114
  Chapter 11: Analysis of Government Failure 114
  Chapter 12: Comparative Institutional Analysis 114
  Chapter 13: Cost-Benefit Analysis 114
  Chapter 14: Gender Analysis 114
  Chapter 15: Race Analysis 114
  Chapter 16: Implementation Analysis 115
Use of Applied Examples 115
The Analytical Strategies and General Steps in Policy Analysis 116
When to Apply Each Analytical Strategy 118
Conclusion 118

9 Analysis of Markets 119
An Introduction to Market Analysis 121
  Consumer Choice and the Demand Side of the Market 122
  Firm Behavior and the Supply Side of the Market 131
  Equilibrium in Markets 135
  Comparative Static Equilibrium Analysis 136
  Price Signaling and Interconnected Markets 137
  Assumptions of the Market Model Revisited 138
Using Market Analysis as an Analytical Framework  140
Steps in Market Analysis  141
   Step 1. Identify the phenomenon of interest.  142
   Step 2. Consider the behavior of consumers and producers.  142
   Step 3. Think in terms of comparative statics
equilibrium analysis.  142
   Step 4. Collect and analyze the relevant information.  142
   Step 5. Draw implications for government action.  142
An Applied Example  143
   Step 1. Identify the phenomenon of interest.  144
   Step 2. Consider the behavior of consumers and producers.  144
   Step 3. Think in terms of comparative statics
equilibrium analysis.  144
   Step 4. Collect and analyze the relevant information.  145
   Step 5. Draw implications for government action.  145
Advice for Analytical Practice  145
Analysis of Markets and Other Analytical Strategies  146
Chapter Content Review: A Self-Test  146
Exercises  147
The Policy Research Seminar  147
Further Reading  148

10 Analysis of Market Failure  149
An Overview of Market Failure  151
   Information Asymmetries  151
   Rectifying Information Asymmetries  157
   Positive Externalities  160
   Rectifying Positive Externalities  162
   Negative Externalities  163
   Rectifying Negative Externalities  165
   Public Goods: Common Pool Resources  167
   Rectifying Problems with Common Pool Resources  169
   Pure Public Goods: The Need for Collective Provision  171
   Arranging Collective Provision  173
   Natural Monopolies and How They Can Be Managed  174
   Social Equity Concerns and How They Can Be Addressed  176
Using Market Failure as an Analytical Framework  178
Steps in the Analysis of Market Failure  178
   Step 1. Specify the good or service of interest.  179
   Step 2. Identify the consumers and producers and the
   location of their transactions.  179
   Step 3. Using the tools of market analysis, construct a
   simple model of how an efficient market would
   allocate this good or service.  179
Step 4. State the market failure that you believe is present in this context.  179
Step 5. Analyze the actions of consumers and producers and how those actions contribute to market failure.  179
Step 6. Estimate the financial implications of the market failure, and note any other salient impacts.  180
Step 7. Identify efforts made by consumers, producers, and any other nongovernmental actors to address the market failure.  180
Step 8. Suggest how government use of policy instruments could potentially address the market failure.  180

An Applied Example  180

Step 1. Specify the good or service of interest.  182
Step 2. Identify the consumers and producers and the location of their transactions.  182
Step 3. Using the tools of market analysis, construct a simple model of how an efficient market would allocate this good or service.  182
Step 4. State the market failure that you believe is present in this context.  182
Step 5. Analyze the actions of consumers and producers and how those actions contribute to market failure.  182
Step 6. Estimate the financial implications of the market failure, and note any other salient impacts.  184
Step 7. Identify efforts made by consumers, producers, and any other non-governmental actors to address the market failure.  185
Step 8. Suggest how government use of policy instruments could potentially address the market failure.  185

Advice for Analytical Practice  185
Market Failure and Other Analytical Strategies  186
Exercises  186
The Policy Research Seminar  187
Further Reading  187

11 Analysis of Government Failure  189
An Overview of Government Failure and Its Analysis  191
Government and Coordination Problems  192
Political Control  193
Provider Capture  194
Perverse Incentives  194
Goal Displacement  195
Institutional Inertia  196
Using Government Failure as an Analytical Framework 197
Steps in the Analysis of Government Failure 198
Step 1. Define the area of policy interest. 198
Step 2. Determine the objectives of government action. 198
Step 3. Note the nature of information and coordination problems that can arise through reliance on decentralized, private decision making. 199
Step 4. Contrast the current or favored government actions with possible alternatives. 199
Step 5. Identify opportunities for undue political interference in program management. 199
Step 6. Identify opportunities for provider capture. 200
Step 7. Identify perverse incentives and unintended outcomes. 200
Step 8. Propose changes in policy design to reduce observed government failure. 200
Step 9. Consider ways that reliance on government action could be reduced over time. 201

An Applied Example 201
Step 1. Define the area of policy interest. 202
Step 2. Determine the objectives of government action. 203
Step 3. Note the nature of information and coordination problems that can arise through reliance on decentralized, private decision making. 203
Step 4. Contrast the current or favored government actions with possible alternatives. 203
Step 5. Identify opportunities for undue political interference in program management. 204
Step 6. Identify opportunities for provider capture. 204
Step 7. Identify perverse incentives and unintended outcomes. 204
Step 8. Propose changes in policy design to reduce observed government failure. 205
Step 9. Consider ways that reliance on government action could be reduced over time. 205

Advice for Analytical Practice 206
Analysis of Government Failure and Other Analytical Strategies 206
Exercises 207
The Policy Research Seminar 207
Further Reading 208

12 Comparative Institutional Analysis 209
An Overview of Comparative Institutional Analysis 211
Using Comparative Institutional Analysis as an Analytical Framework 213
Steps in Comparative Institutional Analysis  215
   Step 1. Select and refine the analytical questions.  215
   Step 2. Develop a research design, and select cases.  215
   Step 3. Collect and analyze the relevant information.  215
   Step 4. Isolate the relationships between institutional
          choice and observed outcomes.  216
   Step 5. Present your findings, and make recommendations.  216

An Applied Example  217
   Step 1. Select and refine the analytical questions.  217
   Step 2. Develop a research design, and select cases.  218
   Step 3. Collect and analyze the relevant information.  218
   Step 4. Isolate the relationships between institutional
          choice and observed outcomes.  219
   Step 5. Present your findings, and make recommendations.  219

Advice for Analytical Practice  220
Comparative Institutional Analysis and Other
Analytical Strategies  220
Exercises  221
Invite a Guest to Class  222
The Class Project  222
The Policy Research Seminar  223
Further Reading  224

13 Cost-Benefit Analysis  225
An Overview of Cost-Benefit Analysis  226
Using Cost-Benefit Analysis as an Analytical Framework  227
Steps in Cost-Benefit Analysis  228
   Step 1. Define the scope of the study.  229
   Step 2. Identify all negative and positive effects of the policy.  229
   Step 3. Estimate the monetary costs and benefits of the policy.  230
   Step 4. Take account of opportunity costs.  232
   Step 5. Calculate net present value.  232
   Step 6. Reflect on the value of human life and
          quality-of-life issues.  233
   Step 7. Report study assumptions and limitations.  234
   Step 8. Present results using several scenarios.  235
An Applied Example  235
   Step 1. Define the scope of the study.  236
   Step 2. Identify all negative and positive effects of the policy.  237
   Step 3. Estimate the monetary costs and
          benefits of the policy.  238
   Step 4. Take account of opportunity costs.  239
   Step 5. Calculate net present value.  239
Step 6. Reflect on the value of human life and quality-of-life issues. 240
Step 7. Report study assumptions and limitations. 240
Step 8. Present results using several scenarios. 240

Advice for Analytical Practice 240
Cost-Benefit Analysis and Other Analytical Strategies 241
Exercises 242
The Class Project 242
The Policy Research Seminar 244
Further Reading 245

14 Gender Analysis 246
Gender and Race Analysis 247
Policy Motives 248
Policy Actions 249

An Overview of Gender Analysis 250
Analysis of Aggregate Statistics 251
Process Tracing 252
Tests for Discriminatory Practices 254

Using Gender Analysis as an Analytical Framework 256
Gender Analysis and Problem Definition 257
Gender Analysis and Construction of Alternatives 257
Gender Analysis and Selection of Criteria 257
Gender Analysis and Prediction of Outcomes 258
Reporting Gender Analysis 258

Steps in Gender Analysis 258
Step 1. Select a specific context in which women appear significantly disadvantaged relative to men. 259
Step 2. Assemble evidence allowing you to illustrate differences in men's and women's experiences in similar contexts. 259
Step 3. Develop a process-tracing method to show how specific institutional arrangements, social practices, or decision making are discriminatory. 259
Step 4. Highlight discriminatory policies or practices, and show how they disadvantage women compared with men. 260
Step 5. Propose policy actions to rectify the discrimination and disadvantage. 260
Step 6. Address the view that gains for women spell losses for men. 260

An Applied Example 261
Step 1. Select a specific context in which women appear significantly disadvantaged relative to men. 261
Step 2. Assemble evidence allowing you to illustrate differences in men's and women's experiences in similar contexts. 262
Step 3. Develop a process-tracing method to show how specific institutional arrangements, social practices, or decision making are discriminatory. 262
Step 4. Highlight discriminatory policies or practices, and show how they disadvantage women compared with men. 262
Step 5. Propose policy actions to rectify the discrimination and disadvantage. 263
Step 6. Address the view that gains for women spell losses for men. 263
Advice for Analytical Practice 263
Gender Analysis and Other Analytical Strategies 264
Exercises 265
The Policy Research Seminar 265
Further Reading 266

15 Race Analysis 267
An Overview of Race Analysis 268
Testing for Statistical Discrimination versus Racial Prejudice 269
Confronting Misattribution Problems 271
Tracing Complex Processes 273
Using Race Analysis as an Analytical Strategy 274
Race Analysis and Problem Definition 275
Race Analysis and Construction of Alternatives 275
Race Analysis and Selection of Criteria 275
Race Analysis and Prediction of Outcomes 275
Reporting Race Analysis 275
Steps in Race Analysis 276
Step 1. Select a specific context in which significant racial disparities are known or expected to exist. 276
Step 2. Assemble evidence allowing you to confirm the existence of racial disparities. 276
Step 3. Develop a process-tracing method to show how specific institutional arrangements, social practices, or decision making are discriminatory. 276
Step 4. Highlight discriminatory policies or practices, and show how they disadvantage specific racial groups. 277
Step 5. Propose policy actions to rectify the discrimination and disadvantage. 277
Step 6. Scrutinize the proposed policy actions to avoid unintended negative effects. 277
Step 7. Estimate the gains for all groups that would result from effective policy change. 277
An Applied Example 278

Step 1. Select a specific context in which significant racial disparities are known or expected to exist. 279

Step 2. Assemble evidence allowing you to confirm the existence of racial disparities. 279

Step 3. Develop a process-tracing method to show how specific institutional arrangements, social practices, or decision making are discriminatory. 280

Step 4. Highlight discriminatory policies or practices, and show how they disadvantage specific racial groups. 280

Step 5. Propose policy actions to rectify the discrimination and disadvantage. 280

Step 6. Scrutinize the proposed policy actions to avoid unintended negative effects. 280

Step 7. Estimate the gains for all groups that would result from effective policy change. 281

Advice for Analytical Practice 281

Race Analysis and Other Analytical Strategies 281

Exercises 283

Further Reading 284

16 Implementation Analysis 285

An Overview of Implementation Analysis 286

Envisioning Policy Success 287
Identifying Tasks and Task Dependencies 288
Identifying Threats to Successful Implementation 289
Closing Knowing-Doing Gaps 290
Planning for Evaluation 291

Using Implementation Analysis as an Analytical Framework 292

Steps in Implementation Analysis 293

Step 1. Identify the overall purpose of the new policy, where it will be implemented, and how success has been defined. 293

Step 2. Identify who will be responsible for policy implementation and the behavioral changes that implementation is expected to produce. 293

Step 3. Specify the institutional, organizational, and procedural changes required to support the new policy. 294

Step 4. Treating implementation as a project, note the key tasks required to establish the new policy context. 294

Step 5. Identify any significant threats to successful implementation and how they can be addressed. 294
Step 6. Consider how institutional inertia might hinder change and how it can be overcome. 294
Step 7. Ensure provisions have been made for evaluation of the new policy and associated programs. 294

An Applied Example 295
Step 1. Identify the overall purpose of the new policy, where it will be implemented, and how success has been defined. 295
Step 2. Identify who will be responsible for policy implementation and the behavioral changes that implementation is expected to produce. 296
Step 3. Specify the institutional, organizational, and procedural changes required to support the new policy. 296
Step 4. Treating implementation as a project, note the key tasks required to establish the new policy context. 297
Step 5. Identify any significant threats to successful implementation and how they can be addressed. 297
Step 6. Consider how institutional inertia might hinder change and how it can be overcome. 298
Step 7. Ensure provisions have been made for evaluation of the new policy and associated programs. 298

Advice for Analytical Practice 299
Implementation Analysis and Other Analytical Strategies 299
Exercises 300
Invite a Guest to Class 301
The Class Project 301
The Policy Research Seminar 303
Further Reading 303

IMPROVING YOUR PRACTICE 305

17 Developing as a Policy Analyst and Advisor 307
The Power of Positive Thinking 308
Developing Openness and Creativity 309
Skill Building through Deliberate Practice 311
Becoming a Change Leader 312
Further Reading 313

BIBLIOGRAPHY 315
INDEX 331