The New Public Leadership Challenge

Edited By

Stephen Brookes
Senior Fellow in Public Policy and Management, Manchester Business School

Keith Grint
Professor of Public Leadership & Management, Institute of Governance and Public Management, Warwick Business School
Contents

List of Tables and Figures xv
List of Abbreviations xvii
Notes on Contributors xix
Acknowledgements xxiv

Chapter 1 A New Public Leadership Challenge? 1
Stephen Brookes and Keith Grint
Introduction 1
New public leadership in context 1
Leadership context 1
Why ‘new’ public leadership? 3
Difference between NPM and NPL 5
Role of leadership 5
Network management 6
Public value as the outcome of effective public leadership 7
Developing a new public leadership framework 7
A form of collective leadership 7
Context is critical 8
The type and scale of the problem 8
Collaborative advantage 9
Performance and public value 9
Reflecting trust 9
Defining new public leadership 11
A final word on public leadership 12

Part I Public Sector Reform and the Impact on Leadership 17

Chapter 2 Central Government Reform and Leadership 19
Colin Talbot
Introduction 19
Departmental capability reviews: Leadership 20
Towards a model of public leadership 24
The counsellor 25
The chief executive 27
The collaborator 28
The conservator 29
Role conflicts 30
Chapter 3  Healthcare Reform and Leadership  33
Kieran Walshe and Naomi Chambers
Introduction  33
Context: A brief history of leadership in the NHS  37
   The clinical dimension: Clinicians as leaders  41
   Senior leaders: The roles of chief executives  43
Going by the board: NHS governance and leadership  46
Leadership development and training in the NHS  48
Conclusions  50

Chapter 4  Education Reform and School Leadership  54
Helen Gunter and Gillian Forrester
Introduction  54
New Labour’s eve  55
New Labour’s decade  57
Researching headteachers  59
Talking heads  60
Educational agenda setters  63
Ambivalent implementers  64
Reform agenda deliverers  64
Conclusion  66

Chapter 5  Policing, New Public Management and Legitimacy  70
Mike Hough
Introduction  70
Legitimacy and criminal justice  70
New public management in Britain  71
NPM and policing in Britain  72
Trends in crime and public perceptions  73
The ‘reassurance gap’  75
The unintended effects of NPM target-setting  75
A changing tide: Reassurance policing and neighbourhood policing  77
The retreat from NPM in policing  78
Conclusions  80
A new approach to performance management?  81

Chapter 6  Local Government Reform and Political Leadership  85
Peter John
Introduction  85
The historical context  86
The salience of party politics  87
The crisis of the 1980s  89
The return to local governance  89
The debate about local political leadership  90
The introduction of mayors into English local government  91
The spread of cabinet government and the potential for organisational change 92
The variation in the leadership role 94
Conclusion 96

Chapter 7 Guns or Gantt Charts? – The Leadership Challenge for UK Defence 99
Mike Dunn
Introduction 99
New Public Management – A review 100
Key writings on NPM 102
UK MOD – A contextual overview 103
NPM and defence 105
Analysis of the impact of NPM on MOD 106
Principal-Agent theory 106
Managerialism 110
Conclusions 113

Part II Essential Features of Public Leadership 119

Chapter 8 What Do We Expect of Public Leaders? 121
Lord Turnbull
Introduction 121
Raising the game of public leadership 121
What kind of leaders do public institutions need? 121
The importance of leadership for successful organisations 121
What leadership is (not) and from where does it (or could it) emerge? 122
How to develop those who lead within public institutions 123
Levels of leadership and degrees of difficulty 123
How do we develop these skills within the public sector? 125
What type of leader do we want? 126
How public leaders can work better together in a complex world 127
Leading a winning team through a collective vision 127
The genetics of public leaders: A case study from the civil service 128
Embedding public leadership 129
Sustaining our leaders 129
Personal reflection on the role of public leadership 130

Chapter 9 Political Leadership 133
Jean Hartley
Political leadership in democratic systems 133
Political leadership 134
The academic literature on political leadership 136
What is formal political leadership? 138
Contents

Contexts, challenges and capabilities of political leadership 140
The contexts of political leadership 140
The challenges of political leadership 141
Capabilities of political leadership 144
Conclusions 146

Chapter 10 Telling the Story of Place: The Role of Community Leadership
Stephen Brookes
Introduction 150
The case for collaboration at the local level 151
Understanding community leadership 151
What is community leadership? 151
Networked governance 153
The value of partnerships 154
Leading places: Local area agreements 155
The context and purpose of local area agreements 155
Telling the story of 'place' – But is it democratic? 156
Leading places: LAA research in the North West 157
Outline of the research 157
Peer review 157
Field research 159
Critical success factor analysis 160
A collective leadership analysis 162
Awareness 162
Focus and prioritisation 163
Working together 163
Clarity of roles 164
Building leadership capacity 164
Towards a collective leadership approach? 165

Chapter 11 Wicked Problems and Clumsy Solutions: The Role of Leadership
Keith Grint
The problem of problems: Tame, wicked & critical 169
Culture, elegance and clumsiness 175
Why elegant approaches don't solve wicked problems but clumsy solutions might 176
Hierarchists 179
Individualist 181
Egalitarians 183
Conclusion 184
Chapter 12   Knowledge and Capabilities for Leadership Across the Whole Public Service System

*John Benington and Jean Hartley*

Introduction 187
The need for new paradigms and practices 187
Leadership across complex polycentric networks 189
Dimensions of whole systems working 190
  Leadership development programmes need to join up to address whole system challenges 191
  Leadership development programmes need to translate individual learning into organisational and inter-organisational action and improvement 193
Taking the plunge: Deep immersion for top civil servants 195
Conclusion 197

Chapter 13   The Challenge of Change for Public Sector Leaders

*Carina Paine Schofield and Mark Pegg*

Introduction 199
  The 'need for leaders' in a complex and challenging public sector 199
The public management index 201
Findings from the public management index 202
  Change in the public sector 202
  Management and leadership 204
  Changing roles 207
  Leadership and career development 209
Conclusion 212

Part III   Public Leadership in Action?

Chapter 14   Testing Adaptive Leadership Theory in Practice: The Policing of the Drumcree Demonstrations in Northern Ireland

*Irwin Turbitt and John Benington*

Introduction 219
Heifetz's framework for adaptive leadership 220
  The adaptive leadership framework 220
Testing the adaptive leadership framework in policing Drumcree 225
Conclusions 233
Chapter 15  Leadership of Change Narratives: An Alternative Voice  
*Mervyn Conroy*  
Introduction 235  
Dominant theories of reform 236  
Narrative understanding of reform 238  
Resistance to reform? 238  
Stories of reform 239  
1. Subversive 241  
2. 'Cuckoo' reform 243  
3. 'I shred it' 245  
4. My staff need me 246  
Conclusion 247  
Implications 248  

Chapter 16  Section 17 Crime and Disorder Act 1998: A Missed Opportunity for Public Leadership?  
*Kate Moss*  
Law, leadership and local action 251  
Public leadership and crime reduction 252  
Responsibility and leadership 253  
Missed opportunities for leadership 254  
Leading from the top: Do as I say, not as I do 257  
Supporting the principle of collective leadership 258  
Collective crime reductive efforts 260  

Chapter 17  Partnerships: Rhetoric or Reality?  
*Sue Goss and Paul Tarplett*  
Introduction 263  
Recent developments in partnership working 264  
Evidence of progress? 265  
The unique qualities of partnerships 267  
Typical problems facing partnerships 268  
  Absence of shared goals 268  
  The wrong people – or the wrong structure 269  
  Governance and accountability 269  
  Management and agency 270  
  Cultural differences and ‘defensive behaviours’ 271  
  Central-local relationships 271  
Leadership in partnerships 273  
Focus on purpose 274  
Getting the best out of multi-agency working 274  
Building relationships with others 275  
Managing self 276  
The way forward: Developing a leadership system 277
### Part IV Outlining a Public Leadership Approach

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter 18</th>
<th>The Challenge for Public Leadership Arising from Mixed Modes of Governance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Dominique Lelièvre-Finch</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>283</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The issues</td>
<td>284</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Conceptualisations of leadership and governance regimes</td>
<td>284</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Changing contexts of public service delivery</td>
<td>285</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- The interface between public and private organisations and public-private partnerships</td>
<td>286</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- The reality of public service delivery chains</td>
<td>287</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public leaders' challenges and dilemmas</td>
<td>289</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Leaders' perception and construction of their roles</td>
<td>289</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Bridging value systems</td>
<td>291</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Developing the network organisational capabilities: Innovation and learning</td>
<td>294</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusions and further research</td>
<td>296</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter 19</th>
<th>The Challenge of Leadership for the Third Sector</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Alex Murdock</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leadership in the third sector</td>
<td>302</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- The founder element in leadership</td>
<td>302</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Size and diversity matters?</td>
<td>303</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leader or leadership?</td>
<td>304</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contracting and public service delivery: The changing environment</td>
<td>305</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- The voluntary sector compact</td>
<td>307</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The issues associated with public service delivery by social enterprise and third sector organisations</td>
<td>307</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Independence</td>
<td>307</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The charity commission – A key player</td>
<td>310</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The provision of service: Quality and the user experience</td>
<td>314</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Does public sector contracting matter if the third sector and public sector share their values?</td>
<td>316</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- So third sector values – Do they differ?</td>
<td>317</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- The relationship with the public sector – Separation</td>
<td>319</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- The relationship – The third sector takes the lead</td>
<td>319</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- The attraction of full cost recovery</td>
<td>320</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>320</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter 20</th>
<th>Can Public Leadership be Evaluated?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Nick Tilley</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>325</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Realist evaluation 326
Applying realist evaluation to public leadership 329
Conclusion 338

Chapter 21  Epilogue  Reform, Realisation and Restoration: 341
Public Leadership and Innovation in Government
Stephen Brookes
Reform – NPM as the nemesis of leadership? 341
Realisation: NPL as the phoenix – Rising from the ashes of NPM? 342
  Purpose 343
  Process 343
  Praxis 343
  Public value 344
Restoration: Public leadership and innovation 345
A time to think differently about public leadership 346
  NPL versus NPM 346
Conclusion 346

Index 350