The Law of Armed Conflict

INTERNATIONAL HUMANITARIAN LAW IN WAR

Gary D. Solis
United States Military Academy
Contents

Table of Cases ........................................... xv
Table of Treaties ........................................... xxi
Foreword ..................................................... xxv
Preface ....................................................... xxix
Acknowledgments ........................................... xxxi

LAW OF ARMED CONFLICT: INTERNATIONAL HUMANITARIAN LAW IN WAR

1. Rules of War, Laws of War .................................. 3
   1.0. Introduction ......................................... 3
   1.1. The Law of War: A Thumbnail History ................. 3
       1.1.1. The First International War Crime Prosecution? 6
       1.1.2. The Emergence of Battlefield Codes ........... 7
   1.2. Why Regulate Battlefield Conduct? .................... 7
       1.2.1. Difficult Issues ................................ 10
   1.3. Sources of the Law of Armed Conflict ................. 11
       1.3.1. Custom ........................................ 12
       1.3.2. Treaties ....................................... 14
       1.3.3. Legislation and Domestic Law .................. 15
       1.3.4. Judicial Decisions ............................. 15
       1.3.5. Publicists .................................... 17
   1.4. The Language of the Law of Armed Conflict ......... 20
       1.4.2. International Humanitarian Law, and Human Rights Law 22
   1.5. Summary ............................................ 26

Cases and Materials ......................................... 27

Hellenica, Book II, by Xenophon 27
The 1474 Breisach Trial 28
United States v. Plenty Horses 30
In Re Göring and Others 34
Prosecutor v. Kupreškić, et al. 36

2. Codes, Conventions, Declarations, and Regulations .............. 38
   2.0. Introduction ....................................... 38
   2.1. A Basic Rule of Warfare ............................ 38
   2.2. Francis Lieber .................................... 39
2.3. Writing the Lieber Code
   2.3.1. The Combatant's Privilege
   2.3.2. Parsing the Lieber Code
2.4. Lieber's Legacy
2.5. A First Geneva Convention
   2.5.1. A Memory of Solferino and the International Committee of the Red Cross
   2.5.2. The 1864 Geneva Convention
2.6. The 1868 St. Petersburg Declaration
2.7. The 1899 and 1907 Hague Peace Conferences
   2.7.1. The First Hague Peace Conference
   2.7.2. The Second Hague Peace Conference
   2.7.3. Parsing 1907 Hague Regulation IV
   2.7.4. Parsing 1899 Hague Declaration I
   2.7.5. The Peace Conferences' Legacy
2.8. Summary

Cases and Materials

The Trial of Captain Henry Wirz
The Court-Martial of General Jacob H. Smith
United States v. Pvt. Michael A. Schwarz
United States v. Major Edwin F. Glenn

3. Two World Wars and Their Law of Armed Conflict Results

3.0. Introduction
3.1. The 1906 Geneva Convention
3.2. World War I (1914–1918)
   3.2.1. The Leipzig Trials
3.3. The League of Nations
3.4. The 1928 Kellogg-Briand Pact
3.5. The 1929 Geneva Conventions
3.6. The Spanish Civil War (1936–1939)
3.7. World War II (1939–1945)
3.8. The 1949 Geneva Conventions
   3.8.1. A Geneva Conventions Roadmap
      3.8.1.1. Common Articles
   3.8.2. Enact Domestic Penal Legislation for Grave Breaches
      3.8.2.1. Charging One's Own Soldiers: The Uniform Code of Military Justice
   3.8.2.2. Charging Civilians I: The 1996 War Crimes Act
   3.8.2.3. Charging Civilians II: The Military Extraterritorial Jurisdiction Act
      3.8.2.4. Charging Civilians III: Another Route
   3.8.3. Search Out and Try Grave Breaches: aut dedere aut judicare
   3.8.4. "Grave Breaches"
      3.8.4.1. Crimes, War Crimes, and Grave Breaches
   3.8.5. Genocide, Crimes against Humanity, and Crimes against Peace
   3.8.6. Common Article 3
      3.8.6.1. Does Common Article 3 Apply?
   3.8.7. War Crimes in Non-international Armed Conflicts
3.8.8. Deciding When Common Article 3 Applies 102
3.8.9. Are the Geneva Conventions “Quaint” and “Obsolete,” Requiring Change? 104
3.9. Summary 107

Cases and Materials
The Trial of Lieutenant-General Karl Stenger and Major Benno Crusius 109
The Trial of Heinz Hagendorf 116

4. Protocols and Politics 119
4.0. Introduction 119
4.2. The 1977 Additional Protocols 120
4.2.1. 1977 Additional Protocol I 121
4.2.1.1. New Grave Breaches in Additional Protocol I 121
4.2.1.2. Advances in Additional Protocol I 122
4.2.1.3. Objections to Additional Protocol I 123
4.2.1.3.1. “CARs” 123
4.2.1.3.2. Modification of POW qualifications 125
4.3. 1977 Additional Protocol II 129
4.3.1. Advances in Additional Protocol II 130
4.3.2. Objections to Additional Protocol II 131
4.4. 1977 Additional Protocols I and II in U.S. Practice 132
4.5. 2005 Additional Protocol III 136
4.6. Summary 137

Cases and Materials
The United Kingdom’s Manual of the Law of Armed Conflict 139
Prosecutor v. Tadić 142
Commentary to 1949 Geneva Convention I 142
Letter of Transmittal: 1977 Additional Protocol II 143

LAW OF ARMED CONFLICT AND INTERNATIONAL HUMANITARIAN LAW: A FRAMEWORK 149

5. Conflict Status 149
5.0. Introduction 149
5.1. Determining Conflict Status 149
5.1.1. Common Article 2 International Armed Conflicts 150
5.1.2. Armed Conflicts Short of War 151
5.1.3. Common Article 3 Non-international Armed Conflicts 152
5.1.4. “Transformers”: Common Article 3 Conflict, to Common Article 2, and Back 154
5.1.5. Dual Status Armed Conflicts 156
5.2. Nonstate Actors and Armed Opposition Groups Are Bound by LOAC/IHL 157
5.2.1. Cross-border Terrorist Attacks by Nonstate Actors 159
5.3. Criminal Justice Model or Military Model? 164
5.4. U.S. Military Practice 167
5.5. Summary 167
## 6. Individual Battlefield Status

6.0. Introduction 186

6.1. Individual Status 187

6.2. Lawful Combatants/Prisoners of War 187

6.2.1. Retainees 191

6.3. Others Whose Status upon Capture is POW 195

6.3.1. Members of Other Militias and Members of Other Volunteer Corps 195

6.3.1.1. Additional Conditions for POW Status? 197

6.3.2. Regular Armed Forces Professing Allegiance to an Unrecognized Authority 198

6.3.3. Persons Who Accompany the Armed Forces without Being Members Thereof 198

6.3.4. Merchant Marine and Civilian Aircraft Crews 199

6.3.5. Levée en Masse 200

6.3.6. Demobilized Military Personnel and Military Internees in Neutral Countries 202

6.4. Direct Participation in Hostilities 202

6.4.1. Criteria for Direct Participation in Hostilities 203

6.4.2. Organized Armed Groups 205

6.4.3. Continuous Combat Function 205

6.5. Unlawful Combatants/Unprivileged Belligerents 206

6.5.1. The Status of Taliban Fighters 211

6.5.2. The Status of al Qaeda Fighters 216

6.6. World War II Allied Resistance Fighters: Historical Aside or Modern Preview? 220

6.6.1. Out of Uniform, Out of Status? 220

6.7. Detainee, Enemy Combatant, and Unlawful Enemy Combatant 224

6.7.1. Detainee 225

6.7.2. Enemy Combatant 225

6.7.3. Unlawful Enemy Combatant 227

6.8. Article 5 “Competent Tribunals” 228

6.8.1. U.S. Military Practice 231

6.9. Civilians 232

6.10. Protected Persons 234

6.11. Minimum *jus in bello* Protections Due Captured Individuals 237

6.12. Summary 238

## Cases and Materials

- Determining Conflict Status: An Exercise 170
- *Prosecutor v. Fatmir Limaj* 172
- *Prosecutor v. Dusko Tadić* 174
- *Case Concerning Military and Paramilitary Activities in and Against Nicaragua* 177
- *Hamdan v. Rumsfeld* 179
- Osirak: Armed Conflict? 180
- Security Council Consideration of a Complaint by Iraq 183

- *In Re Buck and Others* 239
- *Military Prosecutor v. Omar Mahmud Kassem and Others* 240
7. Law of Armed Conflict's Four Core Principles ........................................... 250
  7.0. Introduction ................................................................................................. 250
  7.1. Distinction .................................................................................................. 251
    7.1.1. The Al Firdos Bunker ......................................................................... 257
  7.2. Military Necessity ....................................................................................... 258
    7.2.1. Kriegsraison ......................................................................................... 265
  7.3. Unnecessary Suffering ................................................................................. 269
  7.4. Proportionality ............................................................................................ 272
    7.4.1. What Proportionality Is Not ............................................................... 280
    7.4.2. Proportionality and Force Protection ................................................ 284
  7.5. Summary ..................................................................................................... 285

Cases and Materials ............................................................................................. 286
  The United States v. Wilhelm List, et al. .......................................................... 286
  Shimoda et al. v. State ....................................................................................... 290
  Kupreškić and Others ...................................................................................... 295
  Prosecutor v. Kunarac, et al. ........................................................................... 296
  Prosecutor v. Galić ............................................................................................ 298

8. What Is a “War Crime”? .................................................................................. 301
  8.0. Introduction ................................................................................................ 301
  8.1. Defining War Crimes .................................................................................. 301
  8.2. War Crimes in Recent History .................................................................... 303
  8.3. Grave Breaches and Universal Jurisdiction .............................................. 305
    8.3.1. Prosecuting War Crimes: The Required Nexus .................................. 307
    8.3.2. Prosecuting War Crimes: Who? .......................................................... 309
  8.4. Rape and Other Gender Crimes ................................................................. 310
  8.5. War Crimes or Not? ................................................................................... 313
    8.5.1. Escaping Prisoners of War ................................................................. 314
    8.5.2. Firing on Mosques .............................................................................. 316
    8.5.3. Hostages .............................................................................................. 317
    8.5.4. Human Shields .................................................................................... 319
    8.5.5. Explosive Vests and Burning Bodies .................................................. 321
    8.5.6. Photos of POWs .................................................................................. 323
    8.5.7. Burying the Enemy Alive ................................................................... 325
    8.5.8. Pillage .................................................................................................. 326
    8.5.9. “Double-tapping” ............................................................................... 327
  8.6. U.S. Military Policy ...................................................................................... 330
  8.7. Summary .................................................................................................... 331

Cases and Materials ............................................................................................. 332
  Prosecutor v. Dusko Tadić ............................................................................. 332
  Prosecutor v. Kunarac, et al. ........................................................................... 333
  “The Zyklon B Case” ....................................................................................... 335
  Prosecutor v. Furundžija ............................................................................... 336
  In Re Amberger ............................................................................................... 337
  “Double-tapping” ............................................................................................ 338
# Contents

**LAW OF ARMED CONFLICT AND INTERNATIONAL HUMANITARIAN LAW:**
**BATTLEFIELD ISSUES**

9. Obedience to Orders, the First Defense ........................................... 341

9.0. Introduction 341

9.1. A History of the First Defense 342

9.1.1. The Twentieth Century’s Evolving Standard 345

9.1.2. Genesis of the Current American Standard 349

9.1.3. World War II and an Old “New” Standard 351


9.3. What Orders Should Not Be Obeyed? Manifestly Illegal Orders 358

9.4. Upon Receiving a Manifestly Illegal Order 360

9.5. The First Defense in Foreign and International Forums 362

9.6. Summary 363

Cases and Materials ............................................................. 364

Attorney-General of the Government of Israel v. Adolf Eichmann 364

“The Einsatzgruppen Case,” The United States v. Ohlendorf, et al. 366

United States v. Private Michael A. Schwarz 369

Regina v. Finta 372

Prosecutor v. Erdemović 373

United States v. Staff Sergeant Raymond L. Girouard 378

10. Command Responsibility and Respondeat Superior ......................... 381

10.0. Introduction 381

10.1. Command Responsibility and Respondeat Superior: A Brief History 382

10.1.1. My Lai and Respondeat Superior 388

10.2. Recent Command Responsibility and Respondeat Superior Cases 390

10.3. A Commander’s Seven Routes to Trial 391

10.4. When Officers Disobey 396

10.5. Command Responsibility and Respondeat Superior Today 399

10.5.1. Recent Evolutionary Changes 402

10.6. Summary 404

Cases and Materials ............................................................. 405

Yamashita v. Styer 405


Prosecutor v. Halilović 410


Prosecutor v. Blaškić 413

Prosecutor v. Hadžihasanović 415

Prosecutor v. Kristić 417

11. Ruses and Perfidy ............................................................. 420

11.0. Introduction 420

11.1. Perfidy 420

11.1.1. The Trial of Captain Jack 425

11.2. Ruses 426

11.3. Perfidy Problems 429
# 11.4. Summary

**Cases and Materials**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Trial of Otto Skorzeny and Others</td>
<td>432</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medal of Honor Citation: Thomas R. Norris</td>
<td>434</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## 12. Torture

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>12.0. Introduction</td>
<td>436</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.1. Torture Background</td>
<td>439</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.2. Defining Torture</td>
<td>441</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.2.1. Defining Torture as a LOAC Violation</td>
<td>446</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.3. Why Torture?</td>
<td>448</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.3.1. Torture Does Not Produce Actionable Intelligence</td>
<td>449</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.3.2. Intelligence Gained through Torture Is Unreliable</td>
<td>452</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.3.3. Torture Can Accompany and Promote Other Battlefield Misconduct</td>
<td>454</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.3.4. Torture Is Counterproductive on an International Level</td>
<td>456</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.3.5. Torture Endangers Warfighters</td>
<td>461</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.4. Waterboarding Is Torture</td>
<td>461</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.5. The Ticking Time Bomb</td>
<td>466</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.6. Torture: Never, or Sometimes, Maybe?</td>
<td>468</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.7. U.S. Military Practice</td>
<td>469</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.8. Summary</td>
<td>473</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Cases and Materials**

- *Prosecutor v. Vasiljevic*                                      | 474  |
- The Lieutenant Colonel and the Mock Execution                     | 483  |
- From a "Top Secret" CIA Torture Memorandum                       | 485  |

## 13. Rules of Engagement

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>13.0. Introduction</td>
<td>490</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.1. A Brief History of ROE</td>
<td>491</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.1.1. Standing Rules of Force (SRUF)</td>
<td>494</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.2. What Are “Rules of Engagement”?</td>
<td>495</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.3. When SROE/ROE Apply</td>
<td>498</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.4. Formulating Mission-Specific ROE</td>
<td>499</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.5. ROE Content</td>
<td>501</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.5.1. The Right to Self-Defense</td>
<td>502</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.5.1.1. A Legal Fine Point: Self-Defense in Human Rights Law and in LOAC/IHL</td>
<td>503</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.5.2. Escalation of Force</td>
<td>504</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.5.3. Hostile Act</td>
<td>505</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.5.4. Hostile Intent</td>
<td>506</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.5.5. Declared Hostile</td>
<td>507</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.5.6. Positive Identification</td>
<td>508</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.6. ROE Issues</td>
<td>510</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.7. Summary</td>
<td>512</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Cases and Materials**

- The Death of Mr. Esequiel Hernandez                                 | 512  |
# Contents

ROE Cards 515
MNC-I ROE CARD 516
Desert Storm ROE 517

## 14. Targeting

14.0. Introduction 519
14.1. Defining a Lawful Objective 519
14.2. Interpreting “Military Objective” 520
14.3. Targets by Virtue of Nature, Location, Purpose, or Use
   14.3.1. Military Objectives Are Limited to Objects Which, by Their Nature . . . 524
   14.3.2. Military Objectives Are Limited to Objects Which, by Their Location . . . 525
   14.3.3. Military Objectives Are Limited to Objects Which, by Their Purpose . . . 525
   14.3.4. Military Objectives are Limited to Objects Which, by Their Use . . . 526
14.4. Dangerous Forces 528
14.5. Making Targeting Decisions 530
14.6. Dual-Use Targets 534
14.7. Indiscriminate Attacks 536
14.8. Targeted Killing
   14.8.2. Direct Participation in Hostilities 543
   14.8.3. Does Targeted Killing Broaden the Meaning of “Direct Participation”? 544
14.9. Summary 547

### Cases and Materials 547

“The Einsatzgruppen Case,” The United States v. Otto Ohlendorf, et al. 547
ICTY Committee Report on NATO Bombing of the Federal Republic of Yugoslavia
Prosecutor v. Kordić and Čerkez 552
Wired for War 554

## 15. Attacks on Cultural Property

15.0. Introduction 556
15.2. The 1954 Hague Convention for Protection of Cultural Property
   15.2.1. First Protocol to the 1954 Cultural Property Convention 559
   15.2.2. Second Protocol to the 1954 Cultural Property Convention 563
15.3. Protected Cultural Property in the 1977 Additional Protocols 565
15.4. Summary 567

### Cases and Materials 568

Property versus Combatant Lives 568
Prosecutor v. Jokić 569
Prosecutor v. Prlić, et al. 572
Prosecutor v. Strugar 574

16.0. Introduction 577
16.1.1. CCW Protocol I, Concerning Nondetectable Fragments 580
16.1.2. CCW Protocol II, Concerning Mines and Booby-Traps 581
16.1.2.1. CCW Amended Mines Protocol II 583
16.1.2.2. The 1997 Ottawa Convention 584
16.1.2.3. U.S. Antipersonnel Landmines Policy 584
16.1.3. CCW Protocol III, Concerning Incendiary Weapons 585
16.1.4. CCW Protocol IV, Concerning Blinding Laser Weapons 586
16.1.5. CCW Protocol V, Concerning Explosive Remnants of War 588
16.2. Cluster Munitions 590
16.2.1. 2008 Convention on Cluster Munitions 592
16.2.2. U.S. Cluster Munitions Policy 593
16.3. A Legal Review of Weapons 594
16.4. Summary 595

Cases and Materials ................................................................. 595
  Prosecutor v. Martić 595
  White Phosphorus Munitions 597

17. Gas, Biological, and Chemical Weapons Treaties ............................................ 600

17.0. Introduction 600
17.1. The 1925 Geneva Protocol for the Prohibition of Poisonous Gases and
  Bacteriological Methods of Warfare 601
17.1.1. Parsing the 1925 Gas Protocol 602
17.2. The 1971 UN Convention on the Prohibition of the Development,
  Production and Stockpiling of Bacteriological (Biological) and Toxin
  Weapons and on Their Destruction 605
17.2.1. Parsing the 1971 BWC 607
17.2.2. Negotiating the BWC 610
17.3. The 1993 Convention on the Prohibition of the Development,
  Production, Stockpiling and Use of Chemical Weapons 611
17.3.1. Parsing the 1993 CWC 611
17.4. CS Gas 615
17.5 Summary 616

Cases and Materials ................................................................. 616
  The United Kingdom’s Manual of the Law of Armed Conflict 616
  Prosecutor v. Tadić 618
  The Moscow Theater Hostage Crisis and the Chemical Weapons
  Convention 619

References 623
Index 653