



A/511096

In Search of the Perfect Citizen?

The Intersection between Integration,
Immigration and Nationality in the EU

By

Sergio Carrera

MARTINUS

NIJHOFF

PUBLISHERS

LEIDEN • BOSTON
2009

Contents

Abbreviations	xiii
Acknowledgements	xv

SECTION I

THE INTERSECTION BETWEEN INTEGRATION, IMMIGRATION AND NATIONALITY IN THE EU: SETTING THE SCENE

Chapter 1 Introduction	3
1. Integration, Immigration and Nationality	3
2. The Legal Framework of Integration of TCNs in the EU	5
3. Outline of the Book and the Questions at Stake	8
4. Scope, Concepts and Methodology	13

SECTION II

THE NORMATIVITY OF INTEGRATION IN EU LAW AND POLICY

Chapter 2 The Relationship between Integration and EU Law and Policy	21
1. Introduction: Mapping Integration in EU Law and Policy before Europeanisation	21
2. From the 1970s to the 1980s: The Roots of European Cooperation on Integration of TCNs	22
3. The Maastricht Era	36
4. Amsterdam, Tampere and the Origins of the Dual Framing on Integration in the EU	47
4.1. A Common Immigration Policy	52
4.2. An Open Method of Coordination	55
5. Conclusion	59

Chapter 3	The EU Framework on Integration	61
1.	The EU Framework on Integration: Origins, Concepts, Tools and Structures	62
1.1.	The Emerging European Integration Strategy	62
1.2.	A Common European Framework and the Linkage between Immigration, Integration and Employment	63
1.3.	The First Annual Report on Migration and Integration	69
1.4.	The First Handbook on Integration	71
1.5.	The Hague Programme and the Common Basic Principles for Immigrant Integration Policy	75
1.6.	Putting Principles into Practice? A Common Agenda for Integration	82
1.7.	The Second Handbook on Integration	86
1.8.	The Second Annual Report on Migration and Integration	89
1.9.	The Third Annual Report on Migration and Integration	90
1.10.	The European Integration Forum and an Integration Website	92
1.11.	The European Integration Fund	94
1.12.	Potsdam and “Promoting Unity within Diversity”	97
1.13.	Latest Developments: Principles, Actions and Tools for a Renewed Agenda	102
2.	Integration and the Treaty of Lisbon	107
3.	The EU Framework on Integration as an Alternative Form of OMC	110
3.1.	Nature, Methods and Tools	110
3.2.	Key Actors in the EU Framework on Integration	114
3.3.	Implications of the Substantive and Institutional Elements of the EU Framework on Integration	116
4.	Benchmarking Integration in the EU	118
4.1.	A State of the Art on Benchmarking Integration in the EU	119
4.1.1.	The Study on Benchmarking Immigrant Integration	119
4.1.2.	The European Civic Citizenship and Inclusion Index	121
4.1.3.	The Migrant Integration Policy Index	124
4.1.4.	Study on Setting up a System of Benchmarking to Measure the Success of Integration Policies in Europe	126
4.2.	Current Deficits of Benchmarking Integration	129
4.2.1.	A Common Approach on Integration in EU Law/ Policy allowing Benchmarking?	130

4.2.2. Benchmarking as Neutral Tool?	131
4.2.3. The Personal and Territorial Scope	133
4.2.4. The Methodology	135
4.2.4.1. Benchmarking and Interdisciplinarity	135
4.2.4.2. Indicators	137
4.2.4.3. Typology and Comparison	139
4.2.4.4. Results of Benchmarking	140
5. Conclusions	141
Chapter 4 European Immigration Law and Integration	145
Introduction	145
1. European Law on Regular Immigration: Processes and Institutional Configurations	146
2. The Directive on the Right to Family Reunification	153
2.1. The Material and Personal Scope	159
2.2. Rights, Criteria and Integration	162
2.2.1. The Rights	162
2.2.2. Conditions and Exceptions	164
2.2.2.1. Integration as a Condition: Article 4.1	166
2.2.2.2. Integration as a Measure: Article 7	169
3. The Directive on Long-Term Residents Status	171
3.1. The Negotiations of the Commission's Proposal and the "Integration Condition Clause"	175
3.2. The Material and Personal Scope	183
3.3. Rights, Conditions and Integration	185
3.3.1. The Rights	185
3.3.2. Conditions for the Acquisition	189
3.3.2.1. Integration as a Condition: Article 5.2	193
3.3.2.2. Integration as a Measure: Article 15.3	194
4. New Legislative Proposals on Regular Immigration	196
4.1. An EU Framework on Highly Qualified Employment and the EU Blue Card	199
4.1.1. The Material and Personal Scope	199
4.1.2. Rights, Conditions and Integration	200
4.1.1.1. The Rights	200
4.1.1.2. The Conditions	202
4.2. Towards a Common Framework of Rights?	206
4.2.1. The Material and Personal Scope	206
4.2.2. Rights, Conditions and Integration	208
4.2.2.1. The Rights	208
4.2.2.2. The Conditions	209

5. The Treaty of Lisbon and the Renewed Institutional Framework of EU Immigration Law	211
6. Conclusions	212
Annex Section II	214

SECTION III

THE NORMATIVITY OF INTEGRATION IN
NATIONAL LAW: THE CASES OF SPAIN AND FRANCE

Chapter 5 The Intersection between Integration and the Legal Framework on Nationality and Immigration in Spain	229
Introduction	229
1. The Construction of Immigrant Spain and the Spanish “Non-Model” on Integration	230
1.1. The Spanish Non-National Model on Integration	234
2. Evolution of the Spanish Legislation on Immigration and its Changing Articulation with Integration	240
2.1. The First Phase: Democratic Spain and the 1985 Immigration Law	241
2.2. The Second Phase: The Birth of the Intersection between Immigration and Integration	243
2.3. The Third Phase: Immigration as an Institutional and Structural Issue	247
2.3.1. The Law on the Rights and Liberties of Immigrants and their Social Integration	247
2.3.2. The 2004 and 2008 National Elections	256
3. Integration in the Legal Framework on Nationality and Regular Immigration	259
3.1. The Law on Nationality: Integration as Condition for Naturalisation	259
3.2. Immigration Law and Policy: The Social Integration of Immigrants	267
3.2.1. The “Ley de Extranjería” and Integration	268
3.2.2. The Strategic Plan of Citizenship and Integration	270
3.3. The Autonomous Communities and Integration	276
3.3.1. Redistributing the Competences over Immigration? ...	276
3.3.2. The Integral Plans of Immigration and the Social Integration of Immigrants	278

4. The Directives 2003/109 and 2003/86: Transposing Integration “Measures” and “Conditions” in Spanish Law?	285
5. Conclusions	287
Chapter 6 The Legal Framework on Nationality, Immigration and ‘The Republican Integration’ in France	291
Introduction	291
1. The French Republican Paradigm of Integration: Fundamentals and Implications	292
2. A Historical Overview of Integration in France	303
3. The French Legal System on the Acquisition of Nationality: Naturalisation and Assimilation	321
4. The Normative and Contractual Framing of Integration in French Immigration Law	327
4.1. The Sarkozy Law I: The Birth of the Nexus between Integration and Immigration	328
4.2. The <i>Contrat d’Accueil et d’Intégration</i> : Integration as a Contractual Bond	331
4.3. The Sarkozy Law II: The 2006 Law on Immigration and Integration	336
4.3.1. Integration as a Contractual Mandatory Bond and a Tool of Migration Control	337
4.3.2. The Directives 2003/109 and 2003/86: Transposing Integration Measures and Conditions in French Law?	341
5. Conclusions	347

SECTION IV

THE INTERPLAY BETWEEN EU AND NATIONAL IMMIGRATION LAW: THE GENERAL PRINCIPLES OF EU LAW

Chapter 7 Testing Member States’ Actions against the Principle of Proportionality and Fundamental Rights	353
Introduction	353
1. The General Principles of EU Law and the Rule of Law in EU Immigration Law	355
1.1. The General Principles and Member States’ Actions in the Scope of EU Immigration Law	361

2. The General Principles of Proportionality and Fundamental Rights: The Review of Member States' Actions within EU Immigration Law	364
2.1. The Principle of Proportionality: Protecting TCNs' Rights in the EU	365
2.1.1. The Principle of Proportionality and Member States' Action "within the Scope of EU Law"	368
2.1.2. Legitimising Exceptions by the State: The Free Movement of Persons	371
2.2. Fundamental Rights as General Principles: The Case of Family Life of TCNs	375
2.2.1. Fundamental Rights as General Principles of EU Law	377
2.2.2. Member States' Actions in relation to the Right of Respect for Family Life	379
2.2.3. Exceptions to Fundamental Rights by the State	381
2.2.3.1. The Exception as interpreted by the ECJ	381
2.2.3.2. The Exception as interpreted by the ECtHR	383
2.2.4. Family Life of TCNs: The Case C-540/03 EP v. Council	387
3. The Tests of Fundamental Rights and Proportionality: The Case of France	394
3.1. First Level: The CAI as a Condition for EC Long-Term Resident Status	398
3.1.1. The Principle of Necessity and the CAI	398
3.1.2. The Principle of Proportionality "strict sense" and the CAI	401
3.2. Second Level: Republican Integration Abroad, Family Reunification and Family Life	405
3.2.1. Integrating into the French Republic Abroad? The Suitability Test	405
3.2.2. Reviewing the Necessity of Mandatory Integrating Abroad	406
3.2.3. The Principles of Proportionality "strict sense" and Fundamental Rights: Testing Integration Abroad	407
3.3. Third Level: The CAIF and the Principles of Proportionality and Fundamental Rights	413
3.3.1. The Necessity of the CAIF	413
3.3.2. The Principle of Proportionality "strict sense" and Fundamental Rights	414
4. Conclusions	416

SECTION V
CONCLUSIONS

Chapter 8	The Interplay between the EU and National Levels over Integration: Conclusions and Recommendations	423
1.	The Interplay between the EU and the National Levels over Integration	426
1.1.	The Normativity of Integration in EU Law and Policy	426
1.2.	The Normativity of Integration in National Law	431
1.2.1.	Spain: A 'Non-Model' becoming European?	431
1.2.2.	France: The Normativisation, Expansionism and Externalisation of the Republican Integration	434
1.3.	The Interplay between the EU and National Levels: The EU General Principles and European Immigration Law	436
2.	Reflections on the Normative Framework of Integration in the EU	440
2.1.	In Search of the Perfect Citizen?	441
2.1.1.	The Perfect National Citizen and Nationality Law	441
2.1.2.	The Perfect National Citizen and Immigration Law ...	444
2.1.3.	The Perfect European Citizen	447
3.	Recommendations	449
3.1.	The Normativity of Integration in EU Law and Policy	449
3.1.1.	The EU Framework on Integration	452
3.1.2.	European Immigration Law	454
3.2.	The Normativity of Integration in National Law	454
3.2.1.	Spain	454
3.2.2.	France	456
3.3.	The Intersection of EU and National Law: The General Principles of EU Law	457
Resumen	459
Samenvatting	469
References	481
Table of Cases	505
Legislative and Policy Acts	511
Biography	523
Index	525