The Spiral of 'Anti-Other Rhetoric'
Discourses of identity
and the international media echo

Elisabeth Le
University of Alberta

John Benjamins Publishing Company
Amsterdam/Philadelphia
# Table of contents

Foreword xi

**CHAPTER 1**

Media, international relations, collective memories, and Critical Discourse Analysis 1

1.1 Media and international relations 1

1.1.1 Theoretical approaches 2

1.1.2 The "international media echo" 6

1.1.3 Interacting cascading networks model 7

1.2 Media and collective memories 10

1.3 Critical Discourse Analysis 12

1.4 Empirical study of the international media echo: Presentation 15

**CHAPTER 2**

National and international contexts for the international media echo 17

2.1 Russian society 17

2.1.1 Russia in the 1990s 18

2.1.2 Russia and the West 25

2.2 French society 28

2.2.1 French foreign policy 28

2.2.2 Public opinion 31

2.2.3 Intellectuals 32

2.2.4 Human rights and "Liberté, égalité, fraternité" 34

2.3 American society 36

2.3.1 American foreign policy 36

2.3.2 Public opinion 38

2.3.3 The American concept of liberal democracy 38

2.4 Print elite media 42

2.4.1 *Le Monde* 42

2.4.2 *The New York Times* 45

2.4.3 Russian print elite media 47

2.5 General context at the end of the 1990s 51
CHAPTER 3
Russia in *Le Monde* and *The New York Times*

3.1 Linguistic methodology 55
   3.1.1 Coherence analysis 56
   3.1.2 Coding at the macrostructural level 59
   3.1.3 Coding at the all-sentence level 61
   3.1.4 Coding complementarity 62
   3.1.5 Verification of the analyses 64

3.2 *Le Monde*’s and *The New York Times*’ perspectives 65
   3.2.1 Main trends 65
   3.2.2 Lines of argumentation 66
   3.2.3 Construction of the debate 68
   3.2.4 Representation of Russia 83
   3.2.5 Representation of Us 93
   3.2.6 *Le Monde*’s and *The New York Times*’ positions 98

3.3 Different conceptual frameworks 102

CHAPTER 4
*Le Monde*’s and *The New York Times*’ editorials in their national societies 107

4.1 French society 107
   4.1.1 French foreign policy 107
   4.1.2 Intellectuals 111
   4.1.3 French public opinion 112
   4.1.4 *Le Monde*’s editorials on Russia and French society 113

4.2 American society 115
   4.2.1 American foreign policy 115
   4.2.2 Elites 117
   4.2.3 Public opinion 123
   4.2.4 *The New York Times*’ editorials on Russia and American society 124

4.3 Significance of *Le Monde*’s and *The New York Times*’ editorials on Russia 126

CHAPTER 5
Russian reactions to the West 129

5.1 Russian print elite media and the West in 1999–2001 129
   5.1.1 *Izvestija* 129
   5.1.2 *Nezavisimaja Gazeta* 132
   5.1.3 *Segodnja* 134
   5.1.4 Media coverage of Western and Russian intellectuals 138
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5.1.5 Representation of a turning point in the relations between Russia and France</td>
<td>140</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1.6 An example of “international media echo” stricto sensu: Izvestija and Le Monde</td>
<td>144</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2 Russian official position</td>
<td>147</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2.1 Russian foreign policy in 1999–2002</td>
<td>147</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2.2 Russian government and media</td>
<td>148</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3 Russian public opinion</td>
<td>152</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3.1 Relation to the West in connection to the second Chechen war</td>
<td>153</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3.2 Attitude towards France and the USA</td>
<td>154</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3.3 Relations to the West from the societal / economic point of view</td>
<td>156</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3.4 Impact of the West</td>
<td>156</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3.5 Russia's place in the world</td>
<td>157</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4 Russia and the West in 1999–2001</td>
<td>158</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER 6</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Crossing cultural and disciplinary boundaries</td>
<td>161</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1 The spiral of “anti-Other rhetoric”</td>
<td>162</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1.1 Its source</td>
<td>163</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1.2 Its development</td>
<td>164</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1.3 Its weakening</td>
<td>164</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1.4 Its long-time effects</td>
<td>165</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1.5 Can it be avoided?</td>
<td>167</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.2 Social identity theory and the international media echo</td>
<td>167</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3 Realism, constructivism and public spheres</td>
<td>169</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3.1 Realism</td>
<td>169</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3.2 Constructivism</td>
<td>170</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3.3 Realism and constructivism as complementary approaches</td>
<td>172</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3.4 France, the USA and Russia in 1999–2001</td>
<td>173</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4 Media identities on the international stage</td>
<td>176</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.5 Crossing boundaries</td>
<td>179</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APPENDIX 1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Editorials</td>
<td>183</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APPENDIX 2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chronology</td>
<td>187</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
APPENDIX 3
Coherence analysis 197
A3.1 Relations of coherence 197
A3.2 Definitions 200
   A3.2.1 Macrostructural basis and text division 200
   A3.2.2 Theme 201
   A3.2.3 Macrostructure 202
A3.3 Hierarchical structure of a text 203
A3.4 Coding 203
A3.5 Example: “The Truth About a Hero’s Death”
   (NYT, 29 November 2000) 203

APPENDIX 4
Content coding 211
A4.1 Ideological square at the macrostructural level 211
A4.2 Parties appearing in the argumentation 213
   A4.2.1 Writers’ voices 216
   A4.2.2 Other voices 221
   A4.2.3 Specific addressees 227
   A4.2.4 Interactions at the macrostructural level 232
A4.3 Representation of Russia in terms of its history 234

APPENDIX 5
Negative representation of Russia 237
A5.1 Le Monde 237
A5.2 The New York Times 240

Notes 245
References 269
Index 279