CHALLENGING THE GENDERPARADOX

WOMEN'S COLLECTIVE AGENCY IN
THE TRANSFORMATION OF KERALA POLITICS

MONICA ERWÉR

DEPARTMENT OF PEACE AND DEVELOPMENT RESEARCH
GÖTEBORG UNIVERSITY

2003
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Preface</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledgements</td>
<td>III</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maps</td>
<td>V</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abbreviations</td>
<td>VII</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of Figures and Tables</td>
<td>VIII</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TWO STORIES CHALLENGING THE 'OFFICIAL STORY' ON WOMEN</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A 'MODEL' FOR GENDER EQUALITY?</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>THE CONTEXT</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INVESTIGATING GENDER POLITICS</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PART I: METHODOLOGY AND FRAMEWORK</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER ONE: RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODS</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MULTIPLE STANDPOINT APPROACH</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Investigating Women's Collective Actions</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PREVIOUS RESEARCH</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Women's Collective Agency</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Feminist Research on Kerala</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FIELDWORK</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informants and Respondents</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Positioning of Informants and Respondents</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Difference and Power in the Fieldwork</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Process of Interviewing</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DATA ANALYSIS</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Analysing Political Discourses</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Groups in Focus in the Study</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Left Political Women's Groups</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Autonomous Feminist Network</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER TWO...: FEMINIST VIEWS ON DEVELOPMENT: ISSUES OF POWER AND AGENCY</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FEMINIST DEVELOPMENT THEORY</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Liberalism, Visibility, and Access</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Status of Women</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender Relations, Institutions, and Power</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>From Sex to Gender</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development and Representation in Question</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Feminism and Marxism: An Unhappy Marriage</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EMPOWERMENT: CO-OPTED AND RE-ASSERTED?</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reasserting Power and Agency</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
PART II: WOMEN AND THE STATE:
THE ‘KERALA MODEL’ FROM A FEMINIST PERSPECTIVE

INTRODUCTION: SOME NOTES ON WOMEN AND THE STATE ........................................... 93
STATE DRIVEN DEVELOPMENT STRATEGY ............................................................... 93
FEMINIST CRITIQUE OF THE STATE ................................................................. 94
AGENCY AND STRUCTURE: WOMEN’S MOVEMENTS AND THE STATE .................. 96
AUTONOMY ........................................................................................................... 96
INTEGRATION ....................................................................................................... 97
‘IN AND AGAINST’ ............................................................................................ 98
STRATEGIC COALITIONS ................................................................................ 99
POLITICAL OPPORTUNITIES AND POLITICAL FIELD ........................................ 100

CHAPTER THREE: THE MAKING OF THE ‘KERALA MODEL’ ........................................ 105

GENDER ASPECTS OF THE PRE-INDEPENDENCE KERALA ........................................ 105
MATRILINEAL ASPECTS OF SOCIETY ............................................................... 106
EARLY SOCIAL MOVEMENTS: CASTE AND GENDER ........................................... 108
INSTITUTIONALISATION OF THE “KERALA MODEL”
MARXISM IN KERALA ....................................................................................... 111
MARXIST POLICY .............................................................................................. 112
MOVEMENTS BEHIND THE ‘KERALA MODEL’ ................................................... 114
FRAGMENTATION AND COALITION-BUILDING ................................................. 116
FROM THE BARRICADES TO THE PARLIAMENT ............................................... 117
THE GENDERED OUTCOME OF THE ‘KERALA MODEL’ ............................. 121
HIGH INDEX BUT LIMITED EMPOWERMENT .................................................. 123
CHAPTER SEVEN : STRUCTURE AND ORGANISATION OF WOMEN’S COLLECTIVE AGENCY

THE LEFT WOMEN’S MOVEMENT .......................................................... 211
MEMBERSHIP AND ORGANISATION ...................................................... 211
CENTRALIST DEMOCRACY .............................................................. 212
WOMEN’S PARTICIPATION IN THE LEFT PARTIES
REPRODUCING THE GENDER PARADOX .................................................. 216
GETTING WOMEN INTO THE LEADERSHIP ....................................... 217
RESERVATION WITHIN THE PARTY ...................................................... 220
PARTICIPATION OF WOMEN’S CANDIDATES IN ELECTIONS ............... 222
THE AUTONOMOUS FEMINIST MOVEMENT .......................................... 223
INCENTIVES FOR THE EMERGENCE OF STHREE VEDI ....................... 225
FACILITATED BY THE NATIONAL AND INTERNATIONAL FEMINISM .... 226
WOMEN’S DECREASING SOCIAL STATUS .............................................. 228
DOMINANCE OF PARTY POLITICS AND MALE AUTHORITY .................. 229
CHANGES IN THE POLITICAL FIELD .................................................. 230
THE FORMATION OF STHREE VEDI: TRANSPARENCY AND NETTING .... 231
MEMBERSHIP: FLEXIBILITY AND INCLUSION ....................................... 232
AUTONOMY ......................................................................................... 234
FUNDING AND THE DILEMMAS ............................................................. 236
REPRESENTATION .................................................................................. 238
SAKHI .................................................................................................. 239
ANWESHI .............................................................................................. 241

CHAPTER EIGHT : FRAMING GENDER, POWER AND AGENCY IN WOMEN’S COLLECTIVE AGENCY

THE LEFT WOMEN’S MOVEMENT .......................................................... 247
FRAMING GENDER: THE WOMAN’S QUESTION AND BEYOND ........... 248
FRAMING THE GENDER PARADOX ......................................................... 251
FRAMING AGENCY: THE POLITICAL EXTENDED FAMILY ................. 257
THE LONG ROAD TO LEADERSHIP ....................................................... 260
SECURITY IN THE PUBLIC SPHERE ..................................................... 261
SHARPENING PERSPECTIVE AND ASSERTING INDEPENDENCE AT
NATIONAL LEVEL .................................................................................. 264
BEYOND NUMBERS: RAISING GENDER ISSUES WITHIN THE
LEFT PARTIES .......................................................................................... 266
A SEED OF CHANGE? - THE FIRST WOMEN’S GROUP WITH THE CPI(M) 269
GENDER ISSUES AND PARTY-DOCUMENTS ........................................ 270
THE FEMINIST NETWORK - STHREE VEDI ........................................... 276
Feminist Perspective on Development ........................................ 277
Framing Gender as Power Relations ...................................... 280
Images of Feminism and Feminists........................................... 282
Framing Power: Feminist Authority and Leadership ................. 283
Setting the Agenda: The Second Dimension of Power ............. 285
Shifting Identities and Struggle: United Diversity ................. 286
Framing Agency: Empowerment ............................................. 289
Undoing Internalised Oppression ......................................... 290
Sthree Vedi in Relation to the State .................................... 291
Violence Against Women and the Issue of Sexuality .............. 294
Gendering Political Discourses: Transforming Power through Strategic Agency ........................................ 298

Summary and Conclusions .................................................... 301

Gender Paradox and Gender Politics ..................................... 302
Women and the State: The Kerala Model from a Feminist Perspective .......................................................... 303
Socialism Turns into Women in Development ......................... 304
Institutionalising and Monitoring of Women’s Interests ......... 306
Is a Decentralised State Listening to Women’s Interests? ....... 306
The ‘Why and How’ of Women’s Collective Agency in Kerala ........................................................................ 307
Watching and Watched by the ‘Big Brother’: Democratic Centralism, Cadre and Large Numbers ...................... 307
A New Space: Network, Flexibility and Inclusion ................. 308
Framing Gender, Power and Agency ....................................... 310
Beyond the Woman’s Question and Agency through the Political Extended Family ........................................ 310
The Feminist Network Contesting the ‘Official Story’ ............ 311
Dynamics of Women’s Collective Agency: Proactivity and Reactivity ................................................................. 312
Challenges for Women’s Collective Agency ......................... 314
Politicising Violence Against Women ................................... 315
Building Alliances: Future Possibilities ............................... 317
Theoretical Implications ....................................................... 318
Policy Implications ............................................................... 320
Appendices
References